

# Cofnod y Trafodion

## The Record of Proceedings

### 19/02/2014

Cynnwys Contents

[Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid](#)  
[Questions to the Minister for Finance](#)

[Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Busnes y Llywodraeth](#)  
[Questions to the Minister for Local Government and Government Business](#)

[Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad](#)  
[Questions to the Assembly Commission](#)

[Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar Ddyfodol Masnachfrait Rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r Gororau](#)  
[The Enterprise and Business Committee's Report on the Future of the Wales and Borders Rail Franchise](#)

[Dadl Plaid Cymru: Y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin](#)  
[Plaid Cymru Debate: Common Agricultural Policy](#)

[Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Gofal Plant](#)  
[Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: Childcare](#)

[Cyfnod Pleidleisio](#)  
[Voting Time](#)

[Dadl Fer: Agor y Porth i Gymru](#)  
[Short Debate: Opening the Gateway to Wales](#)

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 13:30 gyda'r Llywydd (Y Fonesig Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.*

*The Assembly met at 13:30 with the Presiding Officer (Dame Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

13:30 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Prynhawn da. Galwaf Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i drefn.

Good afternoon. I call the National Assembly for Wales to order.

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid

## Questions to the Minister for Finance

### Treth Dir y Dreth Stamp

### Stamp Duty Land Tax

13:30 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*1. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddatganoli Treth Dir y Dreth Stamp? OAQ(4)0364(FIN)*

*1. Will the Minister make a statement on the devolution of Stamp Duty Land Tax? OAQ(4)0364(FIN)*

13:30 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*Y Gweinidog Cyllid / The Minister for Finance*

Stamp duty land tax is ripe for reform. I welcome the UK Government's intention to devolve the tax so that we can seek to reshape it, to better meet the needs of Wales.

Mae'n hen bryd diwygio treth dir y dreth stamp. Croesawaf fwriad Llywodraeth y DU i ddatganoli'r dreth fel y gallwn geisio ei hail-lunio, er mwyn diwallu anghenion Cymru yn well.

13:30 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

First of all, I welcome the decision to set up a tax advisory group to look at this tax and I would be grateful for any further information that you could give on the group's terms of reference. With stamp duty being currently worth just over £100 million a year in Wales, do you agree with me that it is vital that we have a fully costed policy on this tax, unlike that of some opposition parties that have just come up with a view of something that will only end up inflating the price of houses?

Yn gyntaf oll, croesawaf y penderfyniad i sefydlu grŵp cynghori ar dreth i edrych ar y dreth hon a byddwn yn ddiolchgar am unrhyw wybodaeth bellach y gallech ei rhoi am gyloch gorchwyl y grŵp. Gan fod y dreth stamp yn werth ychydig dros £100 miliwn y flwyddyn yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, a gytunwch â mi ei bod yn hollbwysig bod gennym bolisi wedi'i gostio'n llawn ar y dreth hon, yn wahanol i rai o'r gwrthbleidiau sydd wedi cynnig barn ar rywbeth na fydd yn gwneud dim ond codi pris tai?

13:31

**Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

I thank Mike Hedges for his question. I am glad that you welcome the tax advisory group for Wales. In terms of the remit of that group, it will be providing advice and support in the development of tax policy and administration in Wales; it will give advice on the wider impact of Welsh tax policy on stakeholders, the economy and social fabric of Wales; and it will improve communication across a range of stakeholders with regard to tax policy and administration to better inform Welsh Government tax consultations and legislation. Last week, we heard about the Welsh Conservatives' plans for stamp duty, but I do not think that they have done their sums right, or if they have, then they are prepared, of course, for what they propose to have a major adverse impact on the housing needs of Wales. If they are suggesting that they would abolish stamp duty on residential properties worth up to £250,000, it would cost at least £25 million in revenue, based on the housing market at present. It is likely to cost considerably more if the housing market picks up. So, how would you pay for those measures, because if you did that, it could mean 500 fewer homes per year or more than 10,000 fewer people supported through the Supporting People programme?

Diolch i Mike Hedges am ei gwestiwn. Rwy'n falch eich bod wedi croesawu'r grŵp cynghori ar dreth i Gymru. O ran cylch gwaith y grŵp hwnnw, bydd yn rhoi cyngor a chymorth i ddatblygu polisi a gweinyddiaeth treth yng Nghymru; bydd yn rhoi cyngor ar effaith ehangach polisi treth Cymru ar randdeiliaid, yr economi a gwead cymdeithasol Cymru; a bydd yn gwella'r dulliau cyfathrebu ymhlith amrywiaeth o randdeiliaid o ran polisi a gweinyddiaeth treth er mwyn llywio ymgynghoriadau a deddfwriaeth treth Llywodraeth Cymru yn well. Yr wythnos diwethaf, clywsom am gynlluniau'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ar gyfer y dreth stamp, ond nid yw'r symiau'n iawn ganddynt, fe gredaf, neu os ydynt, yna maent yn barod, wrth gwrs, i'r hyn a gynigiant gael effaith andwyol fawr ar anghenion tai Cymru. Os ydynt yn awgrymu y byddent yn diddymu'r dreth stamp ar eiddo preswyl gwerth hyd at £250,000, byddai'n costio o leiaf £25 miliwn mewn refeniw, yn seiliedig ar y farchnad dai ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n debygol o gostio cryn dipyn yn fwy os bydd y farchnad dai yn gwella. Felly, sut byddech yn talu am y mesurau hynny, oherwydd pe baech yn gwneud hynny, gallai olygu 500 yn llai o gartrefi bob blwyddyn neu fwy na 10,000 yn llai o bobl yn cael eu cefnogi drwy raglen Cefnogi Pobl?

13:32

**Paul Davies** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Minister, I am glad that you are taking a very keen interest in our policies. This morning you made it clear in your evidence session to the Finance Committee that discussions are still ongoing with regard to how the Welsh Government will administer stamp duty land tax. Could I press you to give us an indication of what timescales we are looking at in terms of when these decisions will be made?

Weinidog, rwy'n falch eich bod yn cymryd diddordeb mawr iawn yn ein polisiau. Y bore yma gwnaethoch egluro yn eich sesiwn dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid fod trafodaethau'n parhau i fynd rhagddynt o ran sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gweinyddu treth dir y dreth stamp. A allaf bwyso arnoch i roi amcan inni pa bryd y caiff y penderfyniadau hyn eu gwneud?

13:33

**Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Clearly, we need a Bill and we look forward to that in the Queen's Speech. Royal Assent will be forthcoming next year. Then, of course, we can move forward in terms of developing our own legislation to reform stamp duty land tax. However, I am not waiting for that. As you know, and as I said in the committee this morning, we are already starting work. We have the tax advisory group and consultations on reform of stamp duty took place pre the response from the UK Government to the Silk commission, as a result of two consultations that we held with house builders and tax experts in the field.

Yn amlwg, mae angen Bil arnom ac edrychwn ymlaen at hynny yn Araith y Frenhines. Daw Cydsyniad Brenhinol y flwyddyn nesaf. Yna, wrth gwrs, gallwn symud ymlaen o ran datblygu ein deddfwriaeth ein hunain i ddiwygio treth dir y dreth stamp. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn aros am hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, ac fel y dywedais yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, rydym eisoes yn dechrau ar y gwaith. Mae gennym y grŵp cynghori ar dreth a chynhaliwyd ymgynghoriadau ar ddiwygio'r dreth stamp cyn yr ymateb gan Lywodraeth y DU i gomisiwn Silk, o ganlyniad i ddau ymgynghoriad a gynhaliwyd gennym gydag adeiladwyr tai ac arbenigwyr treth yn y maes.

13:33

**Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

I call on the Plaid Cymru spokesperson, Alun Ffred Jones.

Galwaf ar lefarydd Plaid Cymru, Alun Ffred Jones.

13:33

**Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Bydd Bil Cymru wedi cwblhau'i daith trwy San Steffan, gobeithio, erbyn mis Ebrill 2015. A ydych yn bwriadu cyflwyno deddfwriaeth cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 2016 i weithredu'r hawl hon sy'n ymwneud â threth dir y dreth stamp?

The Wales Bill will have completed its journey through Westminster, hopefully, by April 2015. Do you intend to bring forward legislation before the Assembly elections in 2016 to implement this right on stamp duty land tax?

13:34 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Clearly, we need to look at the legislation that we need—we discussed this in the committee this morning—not just in terms of stamp duty land tax and landfill tax but also in terms of tax management. We need three pieces of legislation to take us forward. Of course, we have our own election in 2016, which, in relation to the timescales to take us through to ensure that we can have this legislation on the statute book, will have an impact. I am certainly looking at those timelines but I am not stopping in terms of the first principles of looking to how we can best reform our stamp duty land tax. Of course, that work is under way with my tax advisory group.

Yn amlwg, mae angen inni edrych ar y ddeddfwriaeth sydd ei hangen arnom—trafodwyd hyn yn y pwyllgor y bore yma—nid yn unig o ran treth dir y dreth stamp a threth dirlenwi ond hefyd o ran rheoli treth. Mae angen i ni fwrw ymlaen â thri darn o ddeddfwriaeth. Wrth gwrs, mae gennym ein hetholiad ein hunain yn 2016, a fydd, mewn perthynas â'r amserlen a fydd ar waith i sicrhau y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth hon ar y llyfr statud, yn cael effaith. Yn sicr, rwy'n edrych ar yr amserlenni hynny ond nid wyf yn oedi o ran egwyddorion sylfaenol wrth ystyried beth yw'r ffordd orau o ddiwygio treth dir y dreth stamp. Wrth gwrs, mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo gyda'm grŵp cynghori ar dreth.

13:34 **Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Yr hyn nad wyf yn glir eto yn ei glych yw a ydych yn barod i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth—a chymryd bod Bil Cymru wedi mynd trwodd cyn etholiadau San Steffan—ynghlŷn â hyn cyn inni gael etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 2016. Os nad ydych, pam? Beth yw'r broblem, a pham yr oedi?

What I am not yet clear about is whether you are ready to bring forward legislation—assuming that the Wales Bill will have gone through before the Westminster elections—on this before the Assembly elections in 2016. If not, why not? What is the problem, and why the delay?

13:35 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I think that we will certainly be in the phase of considering consultations around prospective legislation in terms of stamp duty land tax. Clearly, we want to get this right. However, we have to have our legislation first—we have to have the Bill, which needs to go through the Houses of Parliament—and then we need to make sure that we are ready with our legislative proposals.

Credaf y byddwn yn sicr yn y cyfnod o ystyried ymgynghoriadau ar ddeddfwriaeth bosibl o ran treth dir y dreth stamp. Yn amlwg, rydym am sicrhau y gwneir hyn yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cael y ddeddfwriaeth yn gyntaf—rhaid cael y Bil, sy'n gorfod mynd drwy ddau Dŷ'r Senedd—ac yna rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn barod gyda'n cynigion deddfwriaethol.

13:35 **William Powell** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Minister, turning to what can be achieved once Wales has secured control of stamp duty for itself, will you please make an undertaking to work with Cabinet colleagues to undertake an assessment of the potential that it would then unlock for new home owners to secure a rebate on their own stamp duty, if they were prepared to invest in home energy-saving measures?

Weinidog, gan droi at yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni pan fydd Cymru wedi sicrhau rheolaeth ar dreth stamp ar ei chyfer ei hun, a fyddech cystal â gwneud ymrwymiad i weithio gyda chyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet i gynnal asesiad o'r potensial y byddai wedyn yn ei greu i berchnogion cartrefi newydd er mwyn sicrhau ad-daliad ar eu treth stamp eu hunain, pe baent yn barod i fuddsoddi mewn mesurau arbed ynni yn y cartref?

13:36 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I thank William Powell for that. Those are very much the questions that we are putting in terms of developing initial proposals, not just working with my colleagues in the Welsh Government, but with wider stakeholders, and, indeed, with Assembly Members, and, particularly, I am sure, with the Finance Committee, in this respect.

Diolch i William Powell am hynny. Dyna'r union gwestiynau yr ydym yn eu gofyn o ran datblygu cynigion cychwynnol, nid dim ond gweithio gyda fy nghyd-Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth Cymru, ond gyda rhanddeiliaid ehangach, ac, yn wir, gydag Aelodau Cynulliad, ac, yn enwedig, rwy'n siŵr, gyda'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, yn hyn o beth.

## Caffael Technoleg Gwybodaeth

## Procuring Information Technology

13:36 **Leighton Andrews** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

2. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y broses ar gyfer caffael technoleg gwybodaeth gan sefydliadau'r sector cyhoeddus? OAQ(4)0370(FIN)

2. Will the Minister make a statement on the process for procuring information technology by public sector organisations? OAQ(4)0370(FIN)

- 13:36 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Currently, information technology procurement across Wales is devolved to each individual public sector body. The creation of the National Procurement Service has provided a vehicle to pull together common and repetitive spend on an incremental basis, including ICT.
- Ar hyn o bryd, datganolir caffael technoleg gwybodaeth ledled Cymru i bob corff unigol yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae creu'r Gwasanaeth Caffael Cenedlaethol wedi darparu cyfrwng i ddwyn ynghyd wariant cyffredin ac ailadroddus ar sail gynyddrannol, gan gynnwys TGCh.
- 13:37 **Leighton Andrews** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Now that the starting gun has been fired on local government reorganisation, will the Minister give consideration to ways in which we might ensure that no large-scale information technology projects are entered into by local government that might subsequently become white elephants?
- Nawr bod y gwaith o ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol wedi dechrau, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried ffyrdd y gellid sicrhau nad yw llywodraeth leol yn ymgymryd â phrosiectau technoleg gwybodaeth ar raddfa fawr a allai wedyn fynd yn drafferthus a chostus?
- 13:37 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I thank the Member for the Rhondda for that question. Obviously, as the Minister for Finance, I am concerned with safeguarding public finances across the board. Local government should clearly consider the long-term decisions that it makes, as the landscape changes. Just in terms of IT procurement, there are cycles of course for IT procurement decision making, in relation to hardware refresh, software licensing, maintenance and support, and infrastructure replacement. It is an important point that has been made today on this matter.
- Diolch i'r Aelod dros y Rhondda am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Yn amlwg, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, rwy'n ymwneud â diogelu arian cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol. Dylai llywodraeth leol ystyried y penderfyniadau hirdymor a wna, gan fod y dirwedd yn newid. O ran caffael TG, mae cylchoedd wrth gwrs ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau o ran caffael TG, mewn perthynas ag adnewyddu caledwedd, trwyddedu meddalwedd, cynnal a chadw a chymorth, a chael seilwaith newydd. Mae'n bwynt pwysig a wnaed heddiw ar y mater hwn.
- 13:37 **Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, will you recognise that there are huge problems in terms of the ability of the IT infrastructure within the NHS, and different parts of the NHS, to communicate with each other, and that they are, potentially, barriers to improving patient care? What guidance will you consider issuing to NHS organisations to overcome that as an obstacle to improving patient care in the future?
- Weinidog, a wnewch chi gydnabod bod problemau enfawr o ran gallu'r seilwaith TG o fewn y GIG, a gwahanol rannau o'r GIG, i gyfathrebu â'i gilydd, a'u bod, o bosibl, yn rhwystrau i wella gofal i gleifion? Pa ganllawiau yr ystyriwch eu rhoi i sefydliadau'r GIG i oresgyn y rhwystr hwnnw i wella gofal cleifion yn y dyfodol?
- 13:38 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I think that we have a very good record in terms of the development of a strategic IT approach that supports patient care in Wales—it is certainly ahead of that in England—in terms of the health service. Of course, this is a real opportunity in terms of securing that strategic approach to patient care information.
- Credaf fod gennym hanes da iawn o ran datblygu dull gweithredu TG strategol sy'n cefnogi gofal cleifion yng Nghymru—mae'n sicr ar y blaen i Loegr—o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd. Wrth gwrs, mae hwn yn gyfle gwirioneddol o ran sicrhau'r dull strategol hwnnw o ymdrin â gwybodaeth am ofal cleifion.
- 13:38 **Rhodri Glyn Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Weinidog, ceisiais gael gafeal ar adroddiad McClelland ar gaffael cyhoeddus ar safle we'r Llywodraeth cyn dod i lawr i'r sesiwn gwestiynau hon. Yn anffodus, mae safle we'r Llywodraeth wedi dymchwel, ac nid oes modd mynd i mewn iddi o gwbl. Tybed a fyddai'n syniad da i'r Llywodraeth ddilyn arweiniad Comisiwn y Cynulliad trwy sicrhau bod ganddi system dechnoleg gwybodaeth sy'n cael ei rheoli'n uniongyrchol ganddi?
- Minister, I tried to get hold of the McClelland report on public procurement on the Government's website before coming down to this question session. Unfortunately, the Government's website has crashed, and you cannot get into it at all. Would it be a good idea for the Government to follow the lead of the Assembly Commission by ensuring that it has an IT system that is controlled directly by it?
- 13:39 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I am very surprised at this, Rhodri Glyn Thomas. I am sure that this will be sorted immediately.
- Mae hyn yn fy synnu'n fawr, Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Rwy'n siŵr y caiff ei ddatrys ar unwaith.

13:39

**Peter Black** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, one problem with ICT procurement in the public sector is that, often, new systems are being sold to public sector bodies as part of a change management programme, and many local authorities, and other public sector bodies, do not have the sufficient knowledge and expertise to properly evaluate that, with the result that promised benefits are often not met, or are very difficult to meet. What consideration has the Welsh Government given to providing a pool of expertise that public sector organisations can draw on to try to properly evaluate those systems that are offered to them on that basis? I think that that is particularly relevant, given the Williams commission report into the possible reorganisation of local government.

Weinidog, un broblem gyda chaffael TGCh yn y sector cyhoeddus yw bod systemau newydd yn aml yn cael eu gwerthu i gyrff y sector cyhoeddus fel rhan o raglen rheoli newid, ac nid oes gan lawer o awdurdodau lleol, na chyrrff eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus, ddigon o wybodaeth na phrofiad i werthuso hynny'n briodol, ac o ganlyniad ni chaiff y buddiannau a addawyd eu gwireddu'n aml, neu maent yn anodd i'w gwireddu. Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd Llywodraeth Cymru i ddarparu cronfa o arbenigedd y gall sefydliadau yn y sector cyhoeddus fanteisio arni i geisio gwerthuso'r systemau hynny a gynigir iddynt ar y sail honno yn briodol? Credaf fod hynny'n arbennig o berthnasol, o gofio adroddiad comisiwn Williams ar ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol o bosibl.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:40

**Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Of course, the John McClelland review is very pertinent as far as this is concerned, particularly his analysis and evaluation of the fitness of local government in terms of public procurement and the importance also of the Home-grown Talent programme, which is engaging expertise and training people in procurement across the public sector. I will be making an oral statement in a couple of weeks' time on progress in terms of my Wales procurement policy statement and I will be able to respond to these points again at that stage.

Wrth gwrs, mae adolygiad John McClelland yn berthnasol iawn yn hyn o beth, yn enwedig ei ddadansoddiad a'i werthusiad o addasrwydd llywodraeth leol o ran caffael cyhoeddus a phwysigrwydd hefyd y rhaglen Defnyddio Doniau Cymru, sy'n cyflogi arbenigwyr ac yn hyfforddi pobl ym maes caffael ym mhob rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus. Gwnaf ddatganiad llafar ymhen ychydig wythnosau ar gynnydd o ran fy natganiad ar bolisi caffael Cymru a byddaf yn gallu ymateb i'r pwyntiau hyn eto bryd hynny.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Fformiwla Barnett**

**Barnett Formula**

13:40

**Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*3. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gyda Gweinidogion Cyllid y DU ynghylch fformiwla Barnett? OAQ(4)0377(FIN)*

*3. What discussions has the Minister had with UK Finance Ministers with regards to the Barnett formula? OAQ(4)0377(FIN)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:41

**Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Rwyf yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd â Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys i drafod amryw o faterion cyllidol.

I meet regularly with the Chief Secretary to the Treasury to discuss a range of fiscal issues.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:41

**Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog am gywirdeb yr ateb a'i Chymraeg. Tra'n derbyn ei bod yn hollol annhebygol bod Gweinidogion y Deyrnas Unedig yn mynd i ddiwygio'r fformiwla cyn y refferendwm yn yr Alban, os bydd y canlyniad yn agos, naill ffordd, mae'n debygol y bydd y fformiwla yma yn ddi-waith beth bynnag. Felly, onid yw hi yn amser i Lywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth Gogledd Iwerddon i drafod y materion yma o ddifrif yn uniongyrchol gyda Thrysorlys y Deyrnas Unedig?

Thank you very much to the Minister for the accuracy of her answer and for delivering it in Welsh. While accepting that it is very unlikely that UK Government Ministers are going to reform the formula before the referendum in Scotland, if the outcome is close, either way, it is likely that this formula will be redundant in any case. Therefore, is it not time for the Welsh Government and the Northern Ireland Government to discuss these issues in earnest directly with the UK Treasury?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:41

**Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Mae ariannu teg yn bwysig iawn i Gymru.

Fair funding is very important for Wales.

Clearly, these are discussions that I am engaged with, and often lead, at finance quadrilaterals with my colleagues. It is very clear for us, as fair funding is our Welsh Government's long-term aim, that the Barnett formula needs to be reformed. Not only are we working on that, but Gerry Holtham clearly led the way in providing the evidence for this.

Yn amlwg, trafodaethau yw'r rhain a gaf gyda'm cyd-Aelodau mewn cyfarfodydd cyllid pedairochog ac yr wyf yn aml yn eu harwain. Mae'n amlwg iawn inni, gan mai ariannu teg yw nod hirdymor Llywodraeth Cymru, fod angen diwygio fformiwla Barnett. Nid yn unig rydym yn gweithio ar hynny, ond gwnaeth Gerry Holtham yn amlwg arwain y ffordd o ran darparu tystiolaeth ar gyfer hyn.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:42 **Andrew R.T. Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
*Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid / The Leader of the Opposition* [Fideo Video](#)

Minister, one important part of this equation is the view of the Scottish National Party, as it is the party in Government in Scotland. I heard the comments from the Member about Northern Ireland and yourselves speaking to the UK Treasury. In your endeavours with the SNP Government in Scotland, what progress have you made to develop a model that can be brought forward that would reform the Barnett formula, and is there any desire from the Scottish Government to reform the Barnett formula?

Weinidog, un rhan bwysig o'r hafaliad hwn yw barn Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban, gan mai hi yw'r blaid sydd mewn grym yn yr Alban. Clywais y sylwadau gan yr Aelod ynglŷn â Gogledd Iwerddon a chi yn siarad â Thrysorlys y DU. Yn eich ymdrechion gyda Llywodraeth yr SNP, pa gynnydd rydych wedi'i wneud i ddatblygu model y gellir ei gyflwyno a fyddai'n diwygio fformiwla Barnett, ac a oes unrhyw awydd gan Lywodraeth yr Alban i ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett?

13:42 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Well, the finance quadrilateral meetings are for the Ministers for finance of Scotland, Northern Ireland and Wales, with the Chief Secretary to the Treasury. We had extensive discussions during the period when we were looking towards the possibility, which I believe is clearly secured now, of having a funding floor to halt convergence in relation to the Barnett formula. We had a very constructive discussion with my colleagues in Scotland, as well as colleagues in Northern Ireland, about the opportunities and the importance of that floor, which is the first step for us in Wales in terms of the Barnett formula and delivering fairer funding.

Wel, cyfarfodydd ar gyfer Gweinidogion cyllid yr Alban, Gogledd Iwerddon a Chymru, gyda Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys yw cyfarfodydd cyllid pedairochrog. Cawsom drafodaethau helaeth yn ystod y cyfnod pan oeddem yn ystyried y posibilrwydd, sydd bellach yn eithaf sicr yn fy marn i, o gael arian gwaelodol i atal cydgyfeirio mewn perthynas â fformiwla Barnett. Cawsom drafodaeth adeiladol iawn â'm cyd-Weinidogion yn yr Alban, yn ogystal â chyd-Weinidogion yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, am y cyfleoedd a phwysigrwydd yr arian gwaelodol hwnnw, sef y cam cyntaf inni yng Nghymru o ran fformiwla Barnett a sicrhau system ariannu decach.

## Blaenoriaethau Gwariant

13:43 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

4. A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu'r amserlen ar gyfer adolygu blaenoriaethau gwariant yn ystod y Pedwerydd Cynulliad? OAQ(4)0374(FIN)

4. Will the Minister outline the timetable for reviewing spending priorities during the Fourth Assembly? OAQ(4)0374(FIN)

13:43 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Our commitment to growth and jobs has underpinned our last three budgets. In advance of the UK Government's budget, I am stressing the importance of infrastructure investment and arguing that increased investment cannot be at the cost of revenue budgets.

Mae ein hymrwymiad i dwf a swyddi wedi ategu ein tair cyllideb ddiwethaf. Cyn cyllideb Llywodraeth y DU, pwysleisïaf pa mor bwysig yw buddsoddi mewn seilwaith a dadleuaf na all mwy o fuddsoddi fod ar draul cyllidebau refeniw.

13:44 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

I understand that there is always a degree of flexibility in budgets, but in the last few weeks alone, there have been substantial sums of money for various services in disarray, whether it is the £50 million to help plug the forecasted deficit of £76 million in the NHS, or the £20 million for Schools Challenge Cymru. That is welcome, but that is from Barnett consequentials that are as yet unsighted and unconfirmed. Minister, this does not seem to me like a robust investment strategy, but rather more like the story of Peter and the dyke. I wonder whether you can elucidate as to where this money is actually coming from.

Deallaf fod rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd mewn cyllidebau bob amser, ond yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf yn unig, bu dryswch ynghylch symiau sylweddol o arian ar gyfer gwahanol wasanaethau, p'un a ydym yn sôn am yr £50 miliwn i helpu i lenwi'r diffyg a ragwelir o £76 miliwn yn y GIG, neu'r £20 miliwn ar gyfer Her Ysgolion Cymru. Mae hynny i'w groesawu, ond daw hynny o symiau canlyniadol Barnett nas gwelwyd ac nas cadarnhawyd eto. Weinidog, nid yw hyn yn ymddangos yn strategaeth fuddsoddi gadarn i mi, ond yn hytrach yn rhywbeth sy'n fwy tebyg i stori Pedr a'r ffos. Tybed a allwch egluro o ble y daw'r arian hwn mewn gwirionedd.



- 13:44 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I think that you would have benefitted from, if not enjoyed, the Finance Committee this morning where I was scrutinised very effectively on the supplementary budget, and where I made it very clear that effective financial management does not end when we publish our budget proposals. The importance of a supplementary budget, which we have published and will be debating in due course, is to ensure that we can reflect our programme for government objectives and respond to pressures and developments. Our response to the Francis review, with £150 million announced in October, was key to that.
- Credaf y byddech wedi cael budd o'r Pwyllgor Cyllid y bore yma os nad ei fwynhau, lle y craffwyd arnaf yn effeithiol iawn o ran y gyllideb atodol, a lle yr eglurais na ddaw rheolaeth ariannol effeithiol i ben pan gyhoeddwn ein cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb. Pwysigrwydd cyllideb atodol, yr ydym wedi ei chyhoeddi ac y byddwn yn cynnal trafodaeth arni maes o law, yw sicrhau y gallwn adlewyrchu ein rhaglen ar gyfer amcanion y llywodraeth ac ymateb i bwysau a datblygiadau. Roedd ein hymateb i adolygiaid Francis, gyda £150 miliwn wedi ei gyhoeddi ym mis Hydref, yn allweddol i hynny.
- 13:45 **Elin Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Weinidog, diolch i chi ac i Weinidog yr economi am ymweld ag Aberystwyth i weld y difrod a achoswyd gan y stormydd yn y dref. Un mater y tynnwyd sylw ato gan Gyngor Sir Ceredigion y bore hwnnw oedd y difrod i lwybr yr arfordir yn dilyn y stormydd. O ran eich blaenoriaethau ariannol chi yn y pedwerydd Cynulliad hwn, a ydych yn cytuno bod angen cefnogaeth ychwanegol ar gynghorau sir i adfer y llwybr arfordir pwysig yma a'i roi ar sail gadarn i'r dyfodol?
- I thank you, Minister, and the Minister for economy for visiting Aberystwyth to see the damage caused in the town by the recent storms. A matter that was drawn to your attention by Ceredigion County Council that morning was the damage to the coastal path following the storms. In terms of your financial priorities in this fourth Assembly, would you agree that additional support needs to be provided to county councils so that they can restore this important coastal path and to put it on a firm footing for the future?
- 13:45 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I was delighted to join the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport with you, Elin Jones, in Ceredigion and in Aberystwyth, meeting businesses and viewing the damage. I have to say, as Ministers have said, how impressed we were with the way in which Ceredigion County Council had responded so swiftly to the damage that was caused in terms of the immediate clear up. We also met with businesses to hear that the message was that Aberystwyth is open for business now. It means that we have to look to the tourism impacts, which the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport was responding to in announcing, on that day, £1.6 million specifically to tackle the repairs that were needed to prepare for the tourist season. I am also glad that the Minister and I have met with the Minister for Culture and Sport to talk about the coast path. I can say that this is a key priority leading up not only to the Easter season, but through to May, in terms of ensuring that the work is undertaken for those repairs. Let us also remember that we have put £4.6 million into flood relief as a result of the situation that has occurred in terms of the high winds and the high tides in coastal areas.
- Roeddwn yn falch iawn o ymuno â Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth a chi, Elin Jones, yng Ngheredigion ac yn Aberystwyth, i gyfarfod â busnesau a gweld y difrod. Rhaid imi ddweud, fel y dywedodd Gweinidogion, fod y ffordd gyflym yr ymatebodd Cyngor Sir Ceredigion i'r difrod a achoswyd drwy drefnu i'r gwaith glanhau gael ei wneud ar unwaith, wedi creu argraff arnom. Cawsom gyfarfod hefyd â busnesau i glywed mai'r neges oedd bod Aberystwyth ar agor i fusnes bellach. Mae'n golygu bod yn rhaid inni edrych ar yr effeithiau o ran twristiaeth, yr oedd Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth yn ymateb iddynt wrth gyhoeddi, ar y diwrnod hwnnw, £1.6 miliwn yn benodol i fynd i'r afael â'r gwaith atgyweirio yr oedd angen ei wneud i baratoi ar gyfer tymor yr ymwelwyr. Rwyf hefyd yn falch bod y Gweinidog a minnau wedi cyfarfod â'r Gweinidog Diwylliant a Chwaraeon i siarad am lwybr yr arfordir. Gallaf ddweud bod hyn yn flaenoriaeth allweddol nid yn unig yn ystod y cyfnod cyn tymor y Pasg, ond drwy gydol mis Mai, o ran sicrhau yr ymgymeryd â'r gwaith atgyweirio hwnnw. Gadewch inni gofio hefyd ein bod wedi neilltuo £4.6 miliwn ar gyfer system lleddfu llifogydd o ganlyniad i'r gwyntoedd uchel a'r llanw uchel a gafwyd mewn ardaloedd arfordirol.
- 13:47 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I call the opposition spokesperson, Paul Davies. Galwaf ar lefarydd yr wrthblaid, Paul Davies.
- 13:47 **Paul Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you, Presiding Officer. Minister, last year you accepted a Finance Committee report recommendation that stated that the Welsh Government should make greater efforts to evidence the value-for-money considerations that go into its funding decisions. Minister, can you tell us what work the Welsh Government has done in relation to this particular recommendation?
- Diolch ichi, Lywydd. Weinidog, y llynedd gwnaethoch dderbyn argymhelliad adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid a nododd y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru wneud mwy o ymdrech i ddangos tystiolaeth o'r ystyriaethau gwerth am arian a wneir o ran ei benderfyniadau ariannu. Weinidog, a allwch ddweud wrthym pa waith y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei wneud mewn perthynas â'r argymhelliad penodol hwn?

13:47 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

It is very important, in terms of the issues around value for money, that we look at this not only in terms of the monitoring and delivery of the budget, but in terms of the ways in which the public sector as a whole responds to value-for-money considerations. This is something that underpins all our work in terms of budgetary management and monitoring.

Mae'n bwysig iawn, o ran y materion sy'n ymwneud â gwerth am arian, ein bod yn edrych ar hyn nid yn unig o ran monitro a chyflwyno'r gyllideb, ond o ran y ffyrdd y mae'r sector cyhoeddus yn ei gyfanrwydd yn ymateb i ystyriaethau gwerth am arian. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth sy'n sail i'n holl waith o ran rheoli a monitro cyllidebau.

13:48 **Paul Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I am grateful to the Minister for that response. The second 2013-14 supplementary budget shows that the health budget has received £12.2 million from the invest-to-save fund. Can you tell us, Minister, exactly how this funding will provide value for money for the taxpayer?

Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw. Mae ail gyllideb atodol 2013-14 yn dangos bod y gyllideb iechyd wedi cael £12.2 miliwn o'r gronfa buddsoddi i arbed. A allwch ddweud wrthym, Weinidog, sut yn union y bydd y cyllid hwn yn rhoi gwerth am arian i'r trethdalwr?

13:48 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Quite clearly, it will provide value for money as not only is it about improving public service delivery, but it is about cost-releasing savings and the allocation of funding that we have made in relation to the invest-to-save fund, which includes radical change in terms of support. The Betsi Cadwaladr care home, which has released savings in terms of enabling people to be supported in a home and not in hospital, is one clear example of that. There are also savings as a result of the pioneering linen tagging initiative in Torfaen, which has already recognised savings across three or four health boards. All of these are examples of cash-releasing savings as a result of invest to save.

Yn amlwg, bydd yn darparu gwerth am arian gan ei fod, nid yn unig yn ymwneud â gwella'r modd y darperir gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond yn ymwneud hefyd ag arbedion rhyddhau costau a'r dyraniad cyllid a wnaethom mewn perthynas â'r gronfa buddsoddi i arbed, sy'n cynnwys newid radical o ran cefnogaeth. Mae cartref gofal Betsi Cadwaladr, sydd wedi rhyddhau arbedion fel y gall pobl gael eu cefnogi mewn cartref ac nid yn yr ysbyty, yn un enghraifft amlwg o hynny. Mae arbedion hefyd o ganlyniad i'r fenter tagio dillad gwely arloesol yn Nhorfaen, sydd eisoes wedi cydnabod arbedion ar draws tri neu bedwar bwrdd iechyd. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn enghreifftiau o arbedion sy'n rhyddhau arian parod o ganlyniad i'r gronfa buddsoddi i arbed.

## Portffolio Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth

## Economy, Science and Transport Portfolio

13:49 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*5. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y dyraniad cyllid cyffredinol i'r portffolio Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth? OAQ(4)0373(FIN)*

*5. Will the Minister make a statement on the overall funding allocation to the Economy, Science and Transport portfolio? OAQ(4)0373(FIN)*

13:49 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Y gyllideb ar gyfer prif grŵp gwariant yr economi, gwyddoniaeth a thrafnidiaeth yn 2014-15 yw £933.3 miliwn.

The budget for the economy, science and transport main expenditure group for 2014-15 is £933.3 million.

13:49 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Diolch. Rydym yn gwybod mai portffolio economi, gwyddoniaeth a thrafnidiaeth yw'r ffynhonnell bwysicaf o gyllid o ran ymyrraeth y Llywodraeth i hybu'r economi. Tra ydym yn croesawu'n fawr, yn amlwg, y cwmp mewn ffigurau diweithdra heddiw, rydym yn gwybod ein bod yn wynebu her hirdymor o ran cynyddu GVA Cymru. O ystyried y cwmp yng nghyllidebau cyfalaf pob portffolio, a allwch chi ddweud wrthym pryd fydd y pwerau benthyg o £500 miliwn—y pwerau newydd hyn—ar gael i'w defnyddio. Tra bod hi'n bwysig iawn, wrth gwrs, inni fod yn ofalus wrth ddefnyddio'r pwerau, beth yw eich strategaeth chi maes o law ar gyfer ceisio cynyddu'r pwerau sydd ar eu ffordd?

Thank you. We know that the economy, science and transport portfolio is the most important in terms of Government intervention in promoting the economy. While we warmly welcome the fall in unemployment today, we know that we are facing a long-term challenge in increasing Welsh GVA. Given the fall in the capital budgets across portfolios, can you tell us when borrowing powers of £500 million—these new powers—will be available? While it is very important that we are careful in using those new powers, what will your strategy be in due course to increase the powers that are on their way?



13:50

**Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I welcome your question, and I think it is worth noting again—it is important and worth putting on the record—that unemployment is now lower in Wales than in the UK as a whole. Youth unemployment is also below the UK average, with a dramatic 22.5% reduction in the number of 16 to 17-year-olds without work in Wales over the past year, compared with a drop of just 1.2% in the rest of the UK. So, those figures clearly evidence that our policies are working in Wales and that they are stronger than in the rest of the UK. However, I would say that borrowing powers are important in terms of the opportunities we have to invest in infrastructure, with a reducing capital programme, as you say, and we would wish to have early access to those borrowing powers. We do not need legislation for that early access, and I am consulting with the Treasury to deliver on that early access.

Croesawaf eich cwestiwn, a chredaf ei fod yn werth nodi eto—mae'n bwysig ac yn werth ei gofnodi—fod diweithdra bellach yn is yng Nghymru nag yn y DU yn gyffredinol. Mae diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc hefyd yn is na chyfartaledd y DU, gyda lleihad dramatig o 22.5% yn nifer y bobl ifanc 16 i 17 oed heb waith yng Nghymru dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, o gymharu â lleihad o ddim ond 1.2% yng ngweddill y DU. Felly, mae'r ffigurau hynny yn dangos yn glir bod ein polisiau yn gweithio yng Nghymru a'u bod yn gryfach nag yng ngweddill y DU. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ddweud bod pwerau benthyca yn bwysig o ran y cyfleoedd sydd gennym i fuddsoddi mewn seilwaith, gyda rhaglen gyfalaf sy'n lleihau, fel y dywedwch, a byddem am gael mynediad cynnar i'r pwerau benthyca hynny. Nid oes angen deddfwriaeth ar gyfer y mynediad cynnar hwnnw, ac rwy'n ymgynghori â'r Trysorlys i sicrhau'r mynediad cynnar hwnnw.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:51

**Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, while I welcome the arrival of Pinewood Studios in Wales, I hope that you will tell us where the Welsh Government money has come from and how you have calculated the financial and employment benefits of the investment. The supplementary budget showed that £32 million was transferred from Government reserves into the sector's capital MEG. So, is this the capital funding for the project? Does the deal include a further option to Pinewood beyond the five-year commitment? Will you be publishing your cost-benefit analysis?

Weinidog, er fy mod yn croesawu dyfodiad Pinewood Studios yng Nghymru, gobeithio y dywedwch wrthym o bely daeth yr arian hwnnw gan Lywodraeth Cymru a sut rydych wedi cyfrifo buddiannau ariannol a chyflogaeth y buddsoddiad. Dangosodd y gyllideb atodol i £32 miliwn gael ei drosglwyddo o gronfeydd wrth gefn y Llywodraeth i gyfalaf Prif Grŵp Gwariant y sector. Felly, ai hwn yw'r arian cyfalaf ar gyfer y prosiect? A yw'r cytundeb yn cynnwys opsiwn pellach i Pinewood y tu hwnt i'r ymrwymiad o bum mlynedd? A fyddwch yn cyhoeddi eich dadansoddiad cost a budd?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:52

**Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Well, of course, no-one is going to question the announcement by Pinewood Studios earlier this week. Of course, we will continue to build on that success. The investment, again, I am sure, is about astute financial management by this Welsh Labour Government to enable us to respond to these opportunities.

Wel, wrth gwrs, nid oes neb yn mynd i gwestiynu'r cyhoeddiad gan Pinewood Studios yn gynharach yr wythnos hon. Wrth gwrs, byddwn yn parhau i adeiladu ar y llwyddiant hwnnw. Mae a wnelo'r buddsoddiad, unwaith eto, â rheolaeth ariannol craff gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru i'n galluogi i ymateb i'r cyfleoedd hyn.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:52

**Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, on large capital investments—and, for example, 1 Capital Quarter in Cardiff's enterprise zone was bought at a cost of £50 million—can you confirm for us, if and when that kind of investment is capitalised again, whether the additional money recouped will go into the economy, science and transport portfolio budget, given the importance of raising Wales's GVA above 74% of the national average?

Weinidog, o ran buddsoddiadau cyfalaf mawr—ac, er enghraifft, prynwyd Rhif 1 Capital Quarter yn ardal fenter Caerdydd am gost o £50 miliwn—a allwch gadarnhau inni, os a phryd y caiff y math hwnnw o fuddsoddiad ei gyfalafu eto, a fydd yr arian ychwanegol a ddigolledir yn mynd i gyllideb portffolio'r economi, gwyddoniaeth a thrafnidiaeth, o gofio pwysigrwydd codi GYC Cymru yn uwch na 74% o'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:53

**Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Well, clearly, that is the purpose and objective of all our investments. I would say that the investments we are making in the economy, science and transport are delivering, as we can see in the figures today.

Wel, yn amlwg, dyna yw pwrpas ac amcan pob un o'n buddsoddiadau. Byddwn yn dweud bod y buddsoddiadau yr ydym yn eu gwneud o ran yr economi, gwyddoniaeth a thrafnidiaeth yn cael eu cyflawni, fel y gallwn weld yn y ffigurau heddiw.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Portffolio Tai ac Adfywio

## Housing and Regeneration Portfolio

13:53	<b>Mark Isherwood</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> <i>6. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y dyraniad cyllid cyffredinol i'r portffolio Tai ac Adfywio? OAQ(4)0367(FIN)</i>	<i>6. Will the Minister make a statement on the overall budget allocation to the Housing and Regeneration portfolio? OAQ(4)0367(FIN)</i>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:53	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> The additional allocation included in the second supplementary budget means that the allocation to housing and regeneration has increased by 8.2% this year.	Mae'r dyraniad ychwanegol a gynhwysir yn yr ail gyllideb atodol yn golygu bod y dyraniad i dai ac adfywio wedi cynyddu 8.2% eleni.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:53	<b>Mark Isherwood</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Thank you for that answer. Given that Labour's housing spokesperson in the London Assembly has said that Labour should apologise because Margaret Thatcher's Government built more council and housing association homes in a single year than Tony Blair and Gordon Brown did in 13 years—it was in the London Assembly; check the record—will the Welsh Government apologise for cutting by almost 75% the supply of new homes for social rent in Wales, for cutting the number of units for social rent in Wales by almost 30,000, for presiding, last year, over a 12% cut in the number of new homes registered as it increased by 28% across the UK, and join the Welsh Conservatives in pledging to give housing a greater priority in future budgets, recognising the negative impact on wellbeing, health and education of not doing so?	Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. O ystyried bod llefarydd Llafur ar dai yng Nghynulliad Llundain wedi dweud y dylai Llafur ymddiheuro oherwydd adeiladodd Llywodraeth Margaret Thatcher fwy o gartrefi cyngor a chymdeithasau tai mewn un flwyddyn nag y gwnaeth Tony Blair a Gordon Brown mewn 13 blynedd—roedd yng Nghynulliad Llundain; edrychwch ar y cofnod—a wnaiff Llywodraeth Cymru ymddiheuro am dorri bron 75% oddi ar gyflenwad y tai cymdeithasol ar rent yng Nghymru, am leihau nifer yr unedau cymdeithasol ar rent yng Nghymru bron 30,000, am lywyddu, y llynedd, dros leihad o 12% yn nifer y cartrefi newydd a gofrestrwyd wrth iddo gynyddu i 28% ledled y DU, ac ymuno â'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig i addo rhoi mwy o flaenoriaeth i dai yng nghyllidebau'r dyfodol, gan gydnabod yr effaith negyddol ar les, iechyd ac addysg os na wneir hynny?	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:54	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Well, we heard last week that your proposals to abolish stamp duty on properties up to the value of £250,000 could cost £25 million, which would of course mean 500 fewer homes per year, Mark Isherwood—[Interruption.]	Wel, clywsom yr wythnos diwethaf y gallai eich cynigion i ddiddymu'r dreth stamp ar eiddo gwerth hyd at £250,000 gostio £25 miliwn, a fyddai, wrth gwrs, yn golygu 500 yn llai o gartrefi bob blwyddyn, Mark Isherwood—[Torri ar draws.]	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:54	<b>Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Mark Isherwood, thank you; you have already had the opportunity. Minister, I beg your pardon.	Mark Isherwood, diolch ichi, rydych eisoes wedi cael y cyfle. Weinidog, mae'n ddrwg gennyf.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:54	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> The current social housing grant budget is £48 million a year. Conservative proposals could all but wipe out this budget, massively reducing if not entirely removing the Welsh Government's ability to provide social housing for the most needy. Boosting the supply of housing is a key priority and that is why we have invested an additional £600 million since 2012.	Cyllideb y grant tai cymdeithasol ar hyn o bryd yw £48 miliwn y flwyddyn. Gallai cynigion y Ceidwadwyr fwy neu lai ddileu'r gyllideb hon, gan leihau gallu Llywodraeth Cymru i raddau helaeth iawn, os nad yn llwyr, i ddarparu tai cymdeithasol i'r rhai mwyaf anghenus. Mae hybu'r cyflenwad o dai yn flaenoriaeth allweddol a dyna pam rydym wedi buddsoddi £600 miliwn ychwanegol ers 2012.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:55	<b>Jocelyn Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Minister, obviously, the help for first-time buyers is very welcome, but we know that there is a danger of first-time buyers overstretching themselves, especially at a time of very low interest rates. Could you tell us why your help-to-buy scheme is restricted to new build only, when, of course, first-time buyers could find cheaper properties within the existing stock that they would prefer to buy?	Weinidog, yn amlwg, mae'r help ar gyfer prynwyr tro cyntaf i'w groesawu'n fawr, ond gwyddom fod perygl y bydd prynwyr tro cyntaf yn gorwario ar dai, yn enwedig pan fo cyfraddau llog mor isel. A allech ddweud wrthym pam fod eich cynllun cymorth i brynu wedi'i gyfyngu i adeiladau newydd yn unig, pan y gallai prynwyr tro cyntaf, wrth gwrs, ddod o hyd i eiddo rhatach o fewn y stoc bresennol y byddai'n well ganddynt eu prynu?	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>

13:55	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> I thank the Member for that question. There was careful consultation leading up to our adoption of Help to Buy-Wales, which was a consultation with not just housing providers and those in the housing sector, but house builders. This scheme is designed to offer excellent value for buyers, to make home ownership more affordable and to support home ownership in Wales.	Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Bu cyfnod ymgynghori gofalus cyn inni fabwysiadu Cymorth i Brynu Cymru, a ymgynghorodd nid yn unig â darparwyr tai a'r rhai yn y sector tai ond ag adeiladwyr tai. Bwriad y cynllun hwn yw cynnig gwerth rhagorol i brynwyr, i wneud perchentaeth yn fwy fforddiadwy ac i gefnogi perchentaeth yng Nghymru.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:56	<b>Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> I call on the Welsh Liberal Democrat spokesperson, Peter Black.	Galwaf ar lefarydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, Peter Black.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:56	<b>Peter Black</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Thank you, Presiding Officer. Minister, you will be aware of the figures today, which show that new house registrations in England have gone up by 28%, but have gone down in Wales by 12%, largely down to the economic circumstances and the differences between England and Wales. In terms of the Welsh Government's budget, how are you able to make use of the money that you have put into housing to try to pull in additional resources that will increase the number of units being built in this country?	Diolch ichi, Lywydd. Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ffigurau heddiw, sy'n dangos bod cofrestriadau tai newydd yn Lloegr wedi cynyddu 28%, ond wedi gostwng 12% yng Nghymru, yn bennaf oherwydd yr amgylchiadau economaidd a'r gwahaniaethau rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. O ran cyllideb Llywodraeth Cymru, sut y gallwch ddefnyddio'r arian yr ydych wedi ei neilltuo ar gyfer tai er mwyn ceisio denu adnoddau ychwanegol a fydd yn cynyddu nifer yr unedau sy'n cael eu hadeiladu yn y wlad hon?	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:56	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> I thank Peter Black for his recognition of the particular economic circumstances in Wales, and, indeed, to the major cut to our capital budget of up to 40% by the UK Government. That is why we swiftly moved to innovative finance routes, including the Welsh housing finance scheme, which is already boosting the supply of housing.  I have already said that we have invested an additional £600 million since 2012 in housing, as a result of these initiatives.	Diolch i Peter Black am gydnabod yr amgylchiadau economaidd penodol yng Nghymru, ac, yn wir, y toriad mawr i'n cyllideb cyfalaf o hyd at 40% gan Lywodraeth y DU. Dyna pam yr aethom ati'n gyflym i gynnig llwybrau cyllid arloesol, gan gynnwys cynllun cyllid tai Cymru, sydd eisoes yn hybu'r cyflenwad o dai.  Rwyf eisoes wedi dweud ein bod wedi buddsoddi £600 miliwn ychwanegol ers 2012 ym maes tai, o ganlyniad i'r mentrau hyn.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:57	<b>Peter Black</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Thank you for that answer, Minister. My reference to Wales's economic situation was not meant to be complimentary of the Welsh Government.  In terms of the money that you have put in, I understand that you have innovative finance, but, surely, you should also be looking at the way that you are conventionally financing houses to see how you can add value to that by bringing money in as well, in addition to the other routes that you already have.	Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Nid fy mwriad wrth gyfeirio at sefyllfa economaidd Cymru oedd canmol Llywodraeth Cymru.  O ran yr arian yr ydych wedi'i neilltuo, deallaf fod gennych gyllid arloesol, ond oni ddylech hefyd fod yn edrych ar y ffordd rydych yn ariannu tai yn gonfensiynol i weld sut y gallwch ychwanegu gwerth at hynny drwy gyflwyno arian hefyd, yn ogystal â'r llwybrau eraill sydd gennych eisoes.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
13:57	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> In response to your point, I know that you recognise that your Government has cut our capital budget by nearly 40%. That is why we have been in difficult economic circumstances. I also know that you will recognise that, as a result of careful financial management, we put another £5 million into the social housing grant in the supplementary budget, which, of course, results in houses for people who need them and jobs in the construction industry.	Mewn ymateb i'ch pwynt, gwn eich bod yn cydnabod i'ch Llywodraeth leihau ein cyllideb cyfalaf bron 40%. Dyna pam rydym wedi wynebu amgylchiadau economaidd anodd. Gwn hefyd y byddwch yn cydnabod, o ganlyniad i reolaeth ariannol ofalus, inni neilltuo £5 miliwn arall yn y grant tai cymdeithasol yn y gyllideb atodol, sydd, wrth gwrs, yn arwain at dai i bobl sydd eu hangen a swyddi yn y diwydiant adeiladu.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>

- 13:57 **Paul Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 7. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ail gyllideb atodol 2013-14? OAQ(4)0371(FIN) 7. Will the Minister make a statement on the second supplementary budget 2013-14? OAQ(4)0371(FIN)
- 13:58 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 The supplementary budget reflects our priorities for Wales and was shaped in the context of the most difficult financial times since devolution. Mae'r gyllideb atodol yn adlewyrchu ein blaenoriaethau ar gyfer Cymru a chafodd ei llunio yng nghyd-destun y cyfnod ariannol anoddaf ers datganoli.
- 13:58 **Paul Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 Minister, you made it clear in your evidence session to the Finance Committee this morning that no further funds would be made available to further bail out health boards in this financial year. However, given the latest figures that show a deficit of just under £77 million, are you confident that local health boards will actually break even? Weinidog, gwnaethoch nodi'n glir yn eich sesiwn dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid y bore yma na fyddai arian pellach ar gael i achub rhagor o fyrddau iechyd yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried y ffigurau diweddaraf sy'n dangos diffyg o ychydig o dan £77 miliwn, a ydych yn hyderus y bydd byrddau iechyd lleol yn adennill costau?
- 13:58 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 The £50 million that I announced in the supplementary budget is an important allocation. It is for the Minister for Health and Social Services to hold within his main expenditure group, as a contingency measure. Of course, the Minister fully expects local health boards to do everything in their power to meet their statutory duty to break even. Mae'r £50 miliwn a gyhoeddais yn y gyllideb atodol yn ddyraniad pwysig. Cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yw ei gadw yn ei brif grŵp gwariant, fel mesur wrth gefn. Wrth gwrs, mae'r Gweinidog yn llwyr ddisgwyl i fyrddau iechyd lleol wneud popeth o fewn eu gallu i gyflawni eu dyletswydd statudol i adennill costau.
- 13:58 **Llyr Gruffydd** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 Minister, I note in the supplementary budget the movement into reserves of £900,000 earned by Natural Resources Wales as windfarm income. Obviously, I welcome a financial return on the use of public land for energy development, but, may I ask about the budgetary outlook for Natural Resources Wales more generally, and whether you believe that it is actually maximising its income streams in order to make more money available for the work that it does as an organisation? Weinidog, nodaf yn y gyllideb atodol fod £900,000 a enillwyd gan Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru fel incwm fferm wynt wedi'i symud i'r cronfeydd wrth gefn. Yn amlwg, croesawaf elw ariannol o'r defnydd o dir cyhoeddus ar gyfer datblygiadau ynni, ond, a gaf i ofyn am y rhagolygon cyllidebol ar gyfer Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru yn fwy cyffredinol, ac a ydych yn credu ei fod mewn gwirionedd yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar ei ffrydiau incwm er mwyn sicrhau bod mwy o arian ar gael ar gyfer y gwaith y mae'n ei wneud fel sefydliad?
- 13:59 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 There is clear evidence that it is maximising income streams, and I am glad that you welcome that income from windfarm receipts. As we conclude this first year of Natural Resources Wales, it is very clear that it has responded very effectively in terms of the response to flood damage and coastal erosion. Mae tystiolaeth glir ei fod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar ffrydiau incwm, ac rwy'n falch eich bod yn croesawu'r incwm hwnnw o dderbyniadau ffermydd gwynt. Wrth i flwyddyn gyntaf Cyfoeth Naturiol Cymru ddod i ben, mae'n amlwg iawn ei fod wedi ymateb yn effeithiol iawn o ran yr ymateb i ddifrod llifogydd ac erydu arfordirol.
- 13:59 **Aled Roberts** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
 Weinidog, mae'r ail gyllideb atodol hefyd yn cynnwys trosglwyddiad o £2.5 miliwn i Athrofa Prifysgolion Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Ar ba sail y mae'r brifysgol honno'n derbyn arian ychwanegol gan y Llywodraeth, o ystyried y pwysau sydd ar bob sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd? Minister, the second supplementary budget also includes a transfer of £2.5 million to the Universities Heads of the Valleys Institute. On what basis does this university receive additional funding from the Government, considering the pressure that is in on every higher educational institution in Wales at present?

14:00	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Clearly, these are decisions that Ministers need to make in terms of prioritisation, reprioritisation and management of resources within their budgets.	Yn amlwg, mae'r rhain yn benderfyniadau y mae angen i Weinidogion eu gwneud o ran blaenoriaethu, ail-flaenoriaethu a rheoli adnoddau o fewn eu cyllidebau.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
<b>Cyllid Ychwanegol o £55 miliwn</b>		<b>Additional £55 million Funding</b>	
14:00	<b>Bethan Jenkins</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> <i>8. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cyllid ychwanegol o £55m a gyhoeddwyd yn ail gyllideb atodol 2013-14 Llywodraeth Cymru? OAQ(4)0375(FIN)</i>	<i>8. Will the Minister make a statement on the additional £55m funding announced in the Welsh Government's second supplementary budget 2013-14? OAQ(4)0375(FIN)</i>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:00	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> The additional £55 million that I announced in the second supplementary budget last week reflects our commitment to protect the Welsh NHS and to boost economic growth and create jobs.	Mae'r £55 miliwn ychwanegol a gyhoeddais yn yr ail gyllideb atodol yr wythnos diwethaf yn adlewyrchu ein hymrwymiad i amddiffyn y GIG yng Nghymru a hybu twf economaidd a chreu swyddi.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:00	<b>Bethan Jenkins</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. Ai dyma'r cyntaf o nifer o becynnau trawsariannu y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn bwriadu eu gwneud sydd yn darparu cyllid i un neu fwy o feysydd gwariant o'r un pot? Sut y byddwn ni fel Cynulliad yn deall sut y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn y dyfodol?	Thank you for that response. Is this the first of a number of packages that this Government intends to put in place that will provide funding for one or more areas of expenditure from the same pot? How can we as an Assembly understand how that is going to happen in the future?	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:01	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Clearly, scrutiny of the supplementary budgets takes place throughout the year. We have a forthcoming debate next month. This is standard practice in terms of managing, at a difficult time, in terms of our resource and to meet our priorities.	Yn amlwg, creffir ar y cyllidebau atodol drwy gydol y flwyddyn. Cynhelir dadl y mis nesaf. Mae hyn yn arfer safonol o ran rheoli, ar adeg anodd, o ran ein hadnoddau ac i fodloni ein blaenoriaethau.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:01	<b>Darren Millar</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Thank you for that response, Minister. In terms of the additional £55 million, a good proportion of that was allocated to the NHS, and different NHS bodies find themselves in different financial situations, with some estimated to have significant shortfalls in funding? Can you give us an assurance that that £50 million will be targeted at the greatest pressures within the national health service across Wales and that those parts of the NHS that appear to be coping better with their financial circumstances will not get extra cash, as they have done in previous years?	Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. O ran y £55 miliwn ychwanegol, dyrannwyd cyfran dda ohono i'r GIG, ac mae cyrff gwahanol y GIG mewn sefyllfaoedd ariannol gwahanol, ac amcangyfrifir y bydd gan rai ddiffygion sylweddol o ran cyllid. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni y caiff y £50 miliwn hwnnw ei dargedu at y rhannau o'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ledled Cymru lle mae'r pwysau mwyaf ac na fydd y rhannau hynny o'r GIG yr ymddengys eu bod yn ymdopi'n well â'u hamgylchiadau ariannol yn cael arian ychwanegol, fel y cawsant mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol?	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:02	<b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> The Minister for Health and Social Services clearly worked very closely with local health boards to enable an improved financial outturn. He kept their health budgets under close review and monitored pressures across the health and social services MEG and, indeed, across Wales in terms of the LHBs. That is why I have allocated the £50 million, so that it can be held by the Minister as a contingency measure, to look towards an improved position as we reach the end of the financial year.	Yn amlwg, gweithiodd y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn agos iawn gyda byrddau iechyd lleol er mwyn sicrhau alldro ariannol gwell. Adolygodd eu cyllidebau iechyd yn ofalus gan fonitro'r pwysau ar brif grŵp gwariant iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac, yn wir ledled Cymru o ran y BILLau. Dyna pam rwyf wedi dyrannu'r £50 miliwn, fel y gall y Gweinidog ei gadw fel mesur wrth gefn, er mwyn gobeithio am well sefyllfa wrth inni ddod i ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>

14:02 **Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru / The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats*  
In coming to that agreement with the Minister for health, Minister, what assurances did you receive from him and what is the nature of the reserve funds that will be held? In past years, we have been told that there are no bail-outs, there is only brokerage that is to be paid back by the LHBS. Have you given the money to the Minister for health on a similar understanding or do you expect that the money that he will have to use from reserves to bail out NHS trusts will not be on a brokerage basis, but will be a one-off payment?  
Wrth ddod i'r cytundeb hwnnw gyda'r Gweinidog iechyd, Weinidog, pa sicrwydd a gawsoch ganddo a beth yw natur y cronfeydd wrth gefn a gedwir? Mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol, rydym wedi cael gwybod na chaiff neb ei achub, dim ond broceriaeth a ad-delir gan y BILlau. A ydych wedi rhoi'r arian i'r Gweinidog iechyd gydag amod tebyg neu a ydych yn disgwyl na fydd yr arian y bydd yn rhaid iddo ei ddefnyddio o gronfeydd wrth gefn i achub ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG ar sail broceriaeth, ond y bydd yn daliad untro?

14:03 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Clearly, brokerage and the facilities that we have made available in past times will be available to the health service, and any funding that is made available to it will have to be repaid. I would say that we now have—thanks to the support of the whole Assembly—the new National Health Service Finance (Wales) Act 2014, which will be implemented from 1 April this year, which will also help, as we now have three-year plans being developed by the health boards. Health has to move forward in terms of managing the very pressurised situations of some of those health boards in Wales.  
Yn amlwg, bydd broceriaeth a'r cyfleusterau yr ydym wedi'u darparu mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol ar gael i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, a bydd unrhyw arian a roddir iddo yn gorfod cael ei ad-dalu. Byddwn yn dweud bod gennym bellach—diolch i gefnogaeth y Cynulliad cyfan—ddeddf newydd, sef Deddf Cyllid y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Cymru) 2014, a ddaw i rym o 1 Ebrill eleni, a fydd hefyd yn helpu, gan fod gennym bellach gynlluniau tair blynedd sy'n cael eu datblygu gan y byrddau iechyd. Mae iechyd yn gorfod datblygu o ran rheoli'r sefyllfaoedd anodd iawn a wynebir gan rai o'r byrddau iechyd hynny yng Nghymru.

## Cronfa Gymdeithasol Ewrop

## European Social Fund

14:03 **Mick Antoniw** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*9. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fanteision Cronfa Gymdeithasol Ewrop i bobl yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ(4)0372(FIN)*  
*9. Will the Minister make a statement on the benefits of the European Social Fund to people in Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ(4)0372(FIN)*

14:03 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
European social fund projects have assisted over 59,000 people in Rhondda Cynon Taf, of whom over 21,000 have gained qualifications, over 5,100 entered further learning and 6,760 entered work.  
Mae prosiectau cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop wedi helpu dros 59,000 o bobl yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, ac o blith y rhain mae dros 21,000 wedi ennill cymwysterau, mae dros 5,100 wedi mynd ymlaen i addysg bellach ac mae 6,760 wedi dechrau gweithio.

14:04 **Mick Antoniw** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
The point that I was going to make out of this question, and you have kindly given the statistics, which means that I avoid having to repeat them and getting in trouble with the Presiding Officer, is that Rhondda Cynon Taf, in all the four indicators on European social funding, has the highest performance of any local authority in Wales. Does the Minister agree that European social funding is a vital, life-changing source for the people of Rhondda Cynon Taf and many other parts of Wales and that disengagement from Europe and the loss of this sort of support and funding would be an absolute disaster for the Welsh economy?  
Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn mynd i'w wneud o ran y cwestiwn hwn, ac rydych yn garedig iawn wedi rhoi'r ystadegau, sy'n golygu fy mod yn osgoi gorfod eu hailadrodd a mynd i drafferth gyda'r Llywydd, yw mai Rhondda Cynon Taf, ym mhob un o'r pedwar dangosydd ar gyllid cymdeithsaol Ewrop, sy'n perfformio orau o blith unrhyw awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod cyllid cymdeithasol Ewrop yn hollbwysig, yn ffynhonnell sy'n newid bywyd i bobl Rhondda Cynon Taf a sawl rhan arall o Gymru ac y byddai ymddieithrio o Ewrop a cholli'r math hwn o gymorth a chyllid yn drychineb llwyr i economi Cymru?



- 14:04 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I was very glad that Mick Antoniw, the Member for Pontypridd, was able to join me in meeting Commissioner Andor, who is responsible for the European social fund, last week, with other colleagues from across the Assembly. I was also pleased to show him at first hand the impact of the European social fund in the pupil project, which includes Rhondda Cynon Taf, and also Admiral Insurance, where he met young people who had benefited from Jobs Growth Wales.
- Rwy'n falch iawn bod Mick Antoniw, yr Aelod dros Bontypridd, yn gallu ymuno â mi i gwrrdd â'r Comisiynydd Andor, sy'n gyfrifol am gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop, yr wythnos diwethaf, gyda chyd-Aelodau eraill o bob rhan o'r Cynulliad. Roeddwn yn falch hefyd o allu dangos yn uniongyrchol iddo effaith cronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop yn y prosiect disgyblion, sy'n cynnwys Rhondda Cynon Taf, a hefyd Admiral Insurance, lle y cyfarfu â phobl ifanc sydd wedi cael budd o Twf Swyddi Cymru.
- 14:05 **Andrew R.T. Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, there are many forms of European funding that come into Wales. One aspect of the new rural development plan looks at social factors and, in particular in the South Wales Central area, how that money can be used to improve social outcomes. Have you concluded your negotiations with the Minister for Natural Resources and Food as to the level of commitment that the Welsh Government will be putting in to match the modulated money that is going to be taken out of the pillar 1 European funding that goes into Welsh agriculture?
- Weinidog, daw sawl math o gyllid Ewropeaidd i mewn i Gymru. Mae un agwedd ar y cynllun datblygu gwledig newydd yn edrych ar ffactorau cymdeithasol ac, yn enwedig yn ardal Canol De Cymru, sut y gall yr arian hwnnw gael ei ddefnyddio i wella canlyniadau cymdeithasol. A ydych wedi cwblhau eich trafodaethau â'r Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol a Bwyd ynghylch pa ymrwymiad y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i gyfateb yr arian wedi'i fodiweiddio a gaiff ei dynnu allan o gyllid Ewropeaidd colofn 1 a gaiff ei wario ar amaethyddiaeth Cymru?
- 14:05 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Those discussions are ongoing with the Minister for Natural Resources and Food.
- Mae'r trafodaethau hynny'n mynd rhagddynt gyda'r Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol a Bwyd.
- 14:06 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, Rhondda Cynon Taf has some of the highest levels of youth unemployment in Wales. According to the latest figures, in Rhondda it is nearly 40%, in Pontypridd it is just under 35% and in Cynon Valley it is nearly 50%. Clearly, that is bad news for the Welsh economy and for those young people who face very bleak futures unless something radically changes. What assessments have you made of the use of ESF in the past to identify what has been effective and what has not worked so well? Can you also guarantee that lessons have been learned from the previous rounds to make sure that, in the next round of ESF, we will get more value for money?
- Weinidog, mae gan Rhondda Cynon Taf rai o'r lefelau uchaf o ddiweithdra ymysg pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf, mae bron 40% yn Rhondda, ychydig o dan 35% ym Mhontypridd ac mae bron 50% yng Nghwm Cynon. Yn amlwg, mae hynny'n newyddion gwael i economi Cymru ac i'r bobl ifanc hynny sy'n wynebu dyfodol llwm iawn oni bai fod rhywbeth yn newid yn sylweddol. Pa asesiadau a wnaethoch o'r defnydd o Gronfa Gymdeithasol Ewrop yn y gorffennol i nodi'r hyn a fu'n effeithiol a'r hyn na weithiodd gystal? A allwch hefyd warantu bod gwersi wedi'u dysgu o'r cylchoedd blaenorol er mwyn sicrhau, yng nghylch nesaf Cronfa Gymdeithasol Ewrop, y cawn well gwerth am arian?
- 14:06 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- It is important to report on the outcomes of EU investment in Rhondda Cynon Taf. Jobs Growth Wales created just over 980 job opportunities, with 780 young people filling those jobs. EU funds are also helping businesses in Rhondda Cynon Taf. EU projects delivering in the area are assisting over 900 enterprises and have created 540 enterprises. That has had an impact on the employment rate in Rhondda Cynon Taf.
- Mae'n bwysig nodi canlyniadau buddsoddiad yr UE yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Crëodd Twf Swyddi Cymru ychydig dros 980 o gyfleoedd gwaith, gyda 780 o bobl ifanc yn llenwi'r swyddi hynny. Mae arian yr UE hefyd yn helpu busnesau yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae prosiectau'r UE sydd ar waith yn yr ardal yn cynorthwyo dros 900 o fusnesau ac wedi creu 540 o fusnesau. Mae hynny wedi cael effaith ar y gyfradd gyflogaeth yn Rhondda Cynon Taf.
- Caffael Cyhoeddus** **Public Procurement**
- 14:07 **Janet Finch-Saunders** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- 10. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gaffael cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? OAQ(4)0378(FIN)*
- 10. Will the Minister make a statement on public procurement in Wales? OAQ(4)0378(FIN)*

14:07	<p><b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>The Wales procurement policy statement that I issued in 2012 has been widely adopted across Wales. I will deliver an oral statement on 11 March to provide an update on progress on improving public procurement.</p>	<p>Mae datganiad polisi caffael Cymru a gyhoeddais yn 2012 wedi cael ei fabwysiadu'n gyffredinol ledled Cymru. Byddaf yn cyflwyno datganiad llafar ar 11 Mawrth i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd a wnaed o ran gwella caffael cyhoeddus.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:07	<p><b>Janet Finch-Saunders</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>What steps are you taking to encourage local authorities and health boards, within the regional procurement framework, to procure local quality Welsh produce for our schools and hospitals?</p>	<p>Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i annog awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd, o fewn y fframwaith caffael rhanbarthol, i gaffael cynnyrch Cymreig o ansawdd lleol ar gyfer ein hysgolion a'n hysbytai?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:07	<p><b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>A clear objective, particularly of our community benefits approach, is to apply social clauses and ensure that local supply chains are fully engaged in public procurement.</p>	<p>Amcan clir, yn enwedig o ran ein cynllun budd i'r gymuned, yw cymhwyso cymalau cymdeithasol a sicrhau bod cadwyni cyflenwi lleol yn cael eu cynnwys yn llawn ym maes caffael cyhoeddus.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:08	<p><b>Lindsay Whittle</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Minister, as you know, as part of the McClelland review, the Government set up the national procurement service, but all that that has done is make public sector purchasing cheaper. That does not help Welsh businesses in any serious way. How can you be confident that the national procurement service is helping Welsh businesses when its board does not even include any actual suppliers or a single Welsh business?</p>	<p>Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, fel rhan o adolygiad McClelland, sefydlodd y Llywodraeth y gwasanaeth caffael cenedlaethol, ond y cyfan a wnaeth hynny oedd gwneud prynu yn y sector cyhoeddus yn rhatach. Nid yw hynny'n helpu busnesau Cymru mewn unrhyw ffordd ddifrifol. Sut y gallwch fod yn hyderus bod y gwasanaeth caffael cenedlaethol yn helpu busnesau Cymru pan nad yw ei fwrdd hyd yn oed yn cynnwys unrhyw gyflenwyr gwirioneddol nac un busnes Cymreig?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:08	<p><b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>I will be reporting back on progress with the national procurement service, which the public sector has signed up to across the board, with the appropriate expertise to support them to ensure that Welsh businesses do benefit from the NPS.</p>	<p>Byddaf yn adrodd yn ôl ar gynnydd gyda'r gwasanaeth caffael cenedlaethol, y mae'r sector cyhoeddus wedi ymrwymo iddo yn gyffredinol, gyda'r arbenigedd priodol i'w gefnogi er mwyn sicrhau bod busnesau Cymru yn elwa ar y gwasanaeth caffael cenedlaethol.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
	<p><b>Gwerth am Arian</b></p>	<p><b>Value for Money</b></p>	
14:08	<p><b>Paul Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p><i>11. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn eu cymryd i gyflawni gwerth am arian ar draws pob un o adrannau Llywodraeth Cymru? OAQ(4)0363(FIN)</i></p>	<p><i>11. Will the Minister make a statement on what action the Welsh Government is taking to deliver value for money across all Welsh Government departments? OAQ(4)0363(FIN)</i></p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:08	<p><b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>We are committed to ensuring that we secure value for money for every £1 that we spend.</p>	<p>Rydym wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwerth am arian am bob £1 a wariwn.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

14:09	<p><b>Paul Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Minister, you will be aware that the Wales Audit Office report into higher education finances says that estimated costs have increased since the time the tuition fee grant policy was announced in November 2010, and that it is now expected to be substantially higher than the original forecast. Given the substantial annual cost, do you believe that the tuition fee grant provides good value for money? What mechanisms have you put in place to ensure that this policy is delivering value for money, given that this policy will now continue until 2016?</p>	<p>Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru i gyllid addysg uwch yn dweud bod costau amcangyfrifedig wedi cynyddu ers i'r polisi grant ffioedd dysgu gael ei gyhoeddi ym mis Tachwedd 2010, a bod disgwyl iddo bellach fod yn sylweddol uwch na'r amcangyfrif gwreiddiol. O gofio'r gost flynyddol sylweddol, a gredwch fod y grant ffioedd dysgu yn darparu gwerth da am arian? Pa ddulliau sydd ar waith gennych i sicrhau bod y polisi hwn yn rhoi gwerth am arian, o gofio y bydd y polisi hwn yn parhau yn awr tan 2016?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:09	<p><b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>We are very clear about the value for money of our fees policy. We are also clear about the responsibilities of the higher education sector and the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales. The Minister is clear about those opportunities.</p>	<p>Rydym yn glir iawn ynghylch gwerth am arian ein polisi ffioedd. Rydym hefyd yn glir ynghylch cyfrifoldebau'r sector addysg uwch a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru. Mae'r Gweinidog yn glir am y cyfleoedd hynny.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
<p><b>Cyllid Ewropeaidd</b></p>		<p><b>European Funding</b></p>	
14:09	<p><b>Leighton Andrews</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p><i>12. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y rownd nesaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd? OAQ(4)0365(FIN)</i></p>	<p><i>12. Will the Minister make a statement on the next round of European funding? OAQ(4)0365(FIN)</i></p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:10	<p><b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>The new European structural fund programmes for 2014-20 will continue to support economic growth and jobs across Wales, and they are currently being considered by the European Commission.</p>	<p>Bydd y rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd newydd ar gyfer 2014-20 yn parhau i gefnogi twf economaidd a swyddi ledled Cymru, ac maent yn cael eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:10	<p><b>Leighton Andrews</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Is the Minister aware of concerns that have been expressed to me that there may be delays at the UK Government end in terms of the processing of the next round of European funding, and can she comment on that?</p>	<p>A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o bryderon a fynegwyd i mi y gall Llywodraeth y DU ohirio prosesu'r rownd nesaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd, ac a all roi sylwadau ar hynny?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:10	<p><b>Jane Hutt</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>I thank the Member for Rhondda for that question. It is an important point. I have made statements to the Chamber updating it about the formal agreement that we are seeking for our structural funds programme. We are very close to that, in terms of approval by the European Commission, but we have to await the UK Government submission of the UK partnership agreement. It has been delayed until mid-March of this year, at the earliest. I think that Members will be aware of the reasons for those delays and finalising the English chapter to the partnership agreement. There is also the issue of the recent judicial review ruling on the financial allocations, and an appeal by two regions—Liverpool and Sheffield city. I have written to the UK Minister, Michael Fallon, on these issues, because we have to ensure that we have this UK partnership agreement to deliver those current and new programmes.</p>	<p>Diolch i'r Aelod dros y Rhondda am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'n bwynt pwysig. Rwyf wedi gwneud datganiadau i'r Siambr gan roi'r newyddion diweddaraf am y cytundeb ffurfiol yr ydym yn ei geisio ar gyfer ein rhaglen cronfeydd strwythurol. Rydym yn agos iawn at hynny, o ran cymeradwyaeth gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, ond rhaid inni aros i Lywodraeth y DU gyflwyno cytundeb partneriaeth y DU. Mae wedi cael ei ohirio tan ganol mis Mawrth eleni, ar y cynharaf. Rwy'n credu y bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol o'r rhesymau dros yr oedi hwnnw a chwblhau rhan Lloegr yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Cyfyd y mater ynghylch dyfarniad yr adolygiad barnwrol diweddar hefyd ar y dyraniadau ariannol, ac apêl gan ddau ranbarth—Lerpwl a dinas Sheffield. Rwyf wedi ysgrifennu at Weinidog y DU, Michael Fallon, ar y materion hyn, oherwydd rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael cytundeb partneriaeth y DU i gyflawni'r rhaglenni cyfredol hynny a rhai newydd.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

- 14:11 **Byron Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, the Williams commission took future rounds of convergence funding into consideration when putting together the new local authorities. In 2000, Rhodri Morgan called this a 'once-in-a-generation opportunity'. This would, of course, add at least a fourth round of funding. Do you think that it is a sensible approach, or is it not a damning endorsement of this Government's ability to improve the conditions of life and employment opportunities in Wales?
- Weinidog, ystyriodd comisiwn Williams gylchoedd arian cydgyfeirio yn y dyfodol wrth greu'r awdurdodau lleol newydd. Yn 2000, galwodd Rhodri Morgan hyn yn gyfle unwaith mewn cenhedlaeth. Byddai hyn, wrth gwrs, yn ychwanegu o leiaf pedwerydd cylch o gyllid. A ydych yn credu ei fod yn ymagwedd synhwyr, neu a yw'n gymeradwyaeth ddamniol o allu'r Llywodraeth hon i wella amodau bywyd a chyfluoedd cyflogaeth yng Nghymru?
- 14:11 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I am not quite sure what point Byron Davies is trying to make here. I hope that he is saying that he recognises that we do need to take full advantage of the European structural fund. I was glad that he was able to join me last week to meet Commissioner Andor, and to hear our clearly expressed view, cross-party and round table, about the importance of these structural funds, so that we can ensure that our economy is fit and in a place where we will not need structural funds in the future.
- Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr pa bwynt y mae Byron Davies yn ceisio ei wneud yma. Rwy'n gobeithio ei fod yn dweud ei fod yn cydnabod bod angen inni fanteisio'n llawn ar y cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Rwy'n falch ei fod wedi gallu ymuno â mi yr wythnos diwethaf i gwrdd â Chomisynydd Andor, ac i wrando ar ein barn drawsbleidiol ni a fynegwyd yn glir, o amgylch y bwrdd, ynghylch pwysigrwydd y cronfeydd strwythurol hyn, fel y gallwn sicrhau bod ein heconomi yn addas ac yn golygu na fydd angen cronfeydd strwythurol arnom yn y dyfodol.
- 14:12 **Rhodri Glyn Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Weinidog, rwy'n falch eich bod yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd y cylch nesaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd i Gymru. Rwy'n mawr obeithio y byddwch yn pwysio'n drwm iawn ar y glymblaid yn San Steffan i sicrhau bod unrhyw rwystrau yn cael eu symud cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Byddai unrhyw oedi yn cael effaith andwyol ar economi Cymru. Ond, beth mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod Cymru yn manteisio'n llawn ar y cyllid hwn sydd ar gael o Ewrop?
- Minister, I am pleased that you emphasise the importance of the next round of European funding for Wales. I greatly hope that you will be pressing heavily on the coalition in Westminster to ensure that any barriers are moved as soon as possible. Any delay would have a detrimental effect on the Welsh economy. However, what are you, as a Government, doing to ensure that Wales takes full advantage of this funding that is available from Europe?
- 14:12 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Clearly, we are ensuring that the next round is focused, targeted and strategic, and the draft operational programmes are already on the WEFO website for all to see. I shall be appearing before the Enterprise and Business Committee shortly to discuss them. They are clearly focused on the key strategic economic priorities that Grahame Guilford very helpfully steered us towards with his economic prioritisation framework.
- Yn amlwg, rydym yn sicrhau bod y cylch nesaf yn strategol, wedi'i dargedu ac â ffocws, a bod y rhaglenni gweithredol drafft eisoes ar wefan WEFO i bawb eu gweld. Byddaf yn ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes yn fuan i'w trafod. Maent yn canolbwyntio'n glir ar y blaenoriaethau economaidd strategol allweddol y gwnaeth Grahame Guilford ein harwain yn ddefnyddiol tuag atynt gyda'i fframwaith blaenoriaethu economaidd.
- Pwerau Ariannol** **Financial Powers**
- 14:13 **Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- 13. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddatganoli pwerau ariannol? OAQ(4)0368(FIN)*
- 13. Will the Minister make a statement on the devolution of financial powers? OAQ(4)0368(FIN)*
- 14:13 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I welcome the new financial powers set out in the draft Wales Bill. I continue to press for the Silk 1 recommendations to be implemented in their entirety.
- Croesawaf y pwerau ariannol newydd a nodir ym Mil drafft Cymru. Rydw i'n parhau i bwyso am i argymhellion Silk 1 gael eu rhoi ar waith yn gyfan gwbl.

14:13 **Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Mae gan y dreth dir botensial i ddod â thua £100 miliwn mewn incwm, a phe bai Llywodraeth yn y dyfodol yn dewis defnyddio'r arian hwnnw er mwyn benthycu arian, tua faint o fenthyciad fyddai'r £100 miliwn hwnnw yn gallu ei gynnal yn flynyddol?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Land tax has the potential to bring in about £100 million in income, and if a future Government was to choose to use that funding as a means to borrow money, how much borrowing would that £100 million be able to service?

14:14 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Clearly, we need to use all sources available to us in terms of revenues for borrowing. We have the ability, I believe, to go beyond the £500 million borrowing ceiling that, at this point in time, the UK Government has delivered in the draft Bill and the response to the Silk commission. We will need to use all revenues, including that from stamp duty land tax, in terms of potential borrowing routes.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Yn amlwg, mae angen inni ddefnyddio'r holl ffynonellau sydd ar gael inni o ran refeniw ar gyfer benthycu. Mae gennym y gallu, fe gredaf, i fynd y tu hwnt i'r terfyn benthycu o £500 miliwn y mae Llywodraeth y DU, ar yr adeg benodol hon, wedi ei gyflwyno yn y Bil drafft a'r ymateb i gomisiwn Silk. Byddwn yn defnyddio'r holl refeniw, gan gynnwys y refeniw o dreth dir y dreth stamp, o ran llwybrau benthycu posibl.

## Gwasanaeth Caffael Cenedlaethol i Gymru

## National Procurement Service for Wales

14:14 **Julie James** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
*14. Pa gynnydd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei wneud o ran annog y defnydd o'r Gwasanaeth Caffael Cenedlaethol i Gymru? OAQ(4)0369(FIN)*

*14. What progress has the Minister made in encouraging the use of the National Procurement Service for Wales? OAQ(4)0369(FIN)*

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:14 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
In total, 73 organisations, including local government, health, education, Welsh Government, sponsored bodies, the Assembly Commission and emergency services, have signed up to use NPS contracts and services.

At ei gilydd, mae 73 o sefydliadau, gan gynnwys llywodraeth leol, iechyd, addysg, Llywodraeth Cymru, cyrff a noddir, Comisiwn y Cynulliad a'r gwasanaethau brys, wedi ymrwymo i ddefnyddio contractau a gwasanaethau'r gwasanaeth caffael cenedlaethol.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:15 **Julie James** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
If the number of local authorities and public bodies in Wales is reduced, as might be expected in the near future, and given that the three new procurement directives in Europe have just been passed by the general affairs council and the council of ministers, giving them the green light for opening up SME procurement for Welsh companies across Europe—another benefit of being in the European Union—what thoughts do you have on ensuring that SMEs in Wales can continue to be competitive in this new environment?

Os caiff nifer yr awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ei leihau, fel y gellid ei ddisgwyl yn y dyfodol agos, ac o ystyried bod y tri chyfarwyddeb caffael newydd yn Ewrop newydd gael eu pasio gan y cyngor materion cyffredinol a'r cyngor gweinidogion, gan roi'r caniatâd iddynt fynd ati i agor y broses gaffael ar gyfer BBaChau yng Nghymru ledled Ewrop—un o fanteision eraill bod yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd—beth ydych yn ei feddwl am sicrhau y gall BBaChau yng Nghymru barhau i fod yn gystadleuol yn yr amgylchedd newydd hwn?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:15 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
We have real opportunities and the Williams review on restructuring and the possible reduction in the number of councils, promoting what will be a shared-platform culture —[Inaudible.]—SME policy and frameworks in relation to EU regulations will give us the scope for this.

Mae gennym gyfleoedd gwirioneddol ac adolygiad Williams ar ailstrwythuro a'r gostyngiad posibl yn nifer y cynghorau, gan hyrwyddo'r hyn a fydd yn ddiwylliant llwyfan a rennir [Anghlywadwy.]—Bydd polisi BBaChau a fframweithiau mewn perthynas â rheoliadau'r UE yn rhoi'r cyfle inni wneud hyn.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Portffolio Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol

## Health and Social Services Portfolio

14:16 **Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*15. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y dyraniad cyllido ychwanegol i'r portffolio Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ail gyllideb atodol 2013-14? OAQ(4)0376(FIN)* *15. Will the Minister make a statement on the additional funding allocation to the Health and Social Services portfolio in the second supplementary budget 2013-14? OAQ(4)0376(FIN)*

14:16 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
The additional funding allocated in the second supplementary budget demonstrates our commitment to protecting the Welsh NHS in these challenging times. Mae'r arian ychwanegol a ddyranwyd yn yr ail gyllideb atodol yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i ddiogelu'r GIG yng Nghymru yn y cyfnod heriol hwn.

14:16 **Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Thank you very much for that, Minister. In the statement that accompanied the secondary budget, it said that some of the allocation would be used to ensure that the Welsh NHS was responding to the findings of the Francis review, emanating out of the scandal in Stafford. Could you give an understanding of your expectations of how the health service will use that money to ensure that there can be no similar scandal in the Welsh NHS? Diolch yn fawr iawn am hynny, Weinidog. Yn y datganiad a ddaeth gyda'r gyllideb eilaidd, dywedodd y byddai rhywfaint o'r dyraniad yn cael ei ddefnyddio i sicrhau bod GIG Cymru yn ymateb i ganfyddiadau adolygiad Francis, a ddeilliodd o'r sgandal yn Stafford. A allech egluro eich disgwyliadau o sut y bydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yn defnyddio'r arian hwnnw i sicrhau na fydd sgandal debyg yn GIG Cymru?

14:16 **Jane Hutt** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
This is why we announced that additional funding in October. The Minister for Health and Social Services responded in July and announced £10 million towards nursing staff numbers across Wales, and throughout the summer he worked, with my support, to come up with the analysis of what we needed in terms of funding to meet the standards and quality expectations from Francis. The Minister reported on this in October and I am sure that he will be reporting again in due course. Dyma pam y cyhoeddwyd y cyllid ychwanegol hwnnw gennym ym mis Hydref. Ymatebodd y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ym mis Gorffennaf a chyhoeddwyd y byddai £10 miliwn ar gael ar gyfer nyrsys ledled Cymru, a thrwy gydol yr haf gweithiodd, gyda'm cefnogaeth i, i lunio dadansoddiad o'r hyn yr oedd ei angen arnom o ran cyllid i gyflawni'r safonau a'r disgwyliadau o ran ansawdd gan Francis. Cyflwynodd y Gweinidog adroddiad ar hyn ym mis Hydref ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd yn cyflwyno adroddiad arall eto maes o law.

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Busnes y Llywodraeth

### Parthau Dim Galw Diwahoddiad

## Questions to the Minister for Local Government and Government Business

### No-Cold-Calling Zones

14:17 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*1. A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu faint o Barthau Dim Galw Diwahoddiad sy'n cael eu gweithredu ledled Cymru? OAQ(4)0375(LG)* *1. Will the Minister outline how many No-Cold Calling Zones are in operation throughout Wales? OAQ(4)0375(LG)*

14:17 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Busnes y Llywodraeth / The Minister for Local Government and Government Business*  
The programme for government includes a commitment to extend the coverage of no-cold-calling zones in Wales and this remains a priority for me, as Minister. Data collected from local authorities in March 2013 showed 1,568 no-cold-calling zones operating across Wales, covering 38,537 households. I have made funding available to increase the number of homes covered by zones by 10,000. Mae'r rhaglen lywodraethu yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i ymestyn cwmpas ardaloedd dim galw diwahoddiad yng Nghymru ac mae hyn yn parhau i fod yn flaenoriaeth i mi, fel Gweinidog. Dangosodd data a gasglwyd gan awdurdodau lleol ym mis Mawrth 2013 fod 1,568 o ardaloedd dim galw diwahoddiad yn gweithredu ledled Cymru, yn cwmpasu 38,537 o gartrefi. Rwyf wedi sicrhau bod arian ar gael i sicrhau bod 10,000 yn fwy o gartrefi yn cael eu cwmpasu gan yr ardaloedd.



- 14:17 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- There seems to be no consistency across Wales when it comes to no-cold-calling zones. Only three Welsh councils have zones in operation that cover more than 5,000 properties, and four Welsh councils do not have any zones in operation at all. We know that such zones are popular with members of the public and can act as a crime deterrent. Will the Minister raise the policy with local government leaders and the WLGA at the earliest possible opportunity?
- Ymddengys nad oes cysondeb ar draws Cymru pan ddaw i ardaloedd dim galw diwahoddiad. Dim ond mewn tri chynngor yng Nghymru y ceir ardaloedd ar waith sy'n cwmpasu mwy na 5,000 o gartrefi, ac nid oes gan bedwar cynngor yng Nghymru unrhyw ardaloedd ar waith. Gwyddom fod ardaloedd o'r fath yn boblogaidd gydag aelodau o'r cyhoedd ac y gallant helpu i atal troseddau. A wnaiff y Gweinidog godi'r polisi gydag arweinwyr llywodraeth leol a CLILC ar y cyfle cyntaf posibl?
- 14:18 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I have just raised it with the WLGA and had a response yesterday. I think that you are quite right: it is patchy. Even though I removed the barrier of funding by making funding available, only 12 authorities submitted bids for funding. Some of the authorities that did not submit a bid do not have any no-cold-calling zones at all. I am trying to find out what the barriers are. Something that was raised with me was that resident surveys had to be undertaken. That is a reserved issue and I have written to the relevant Minister in Westminster to see if that can be overcome.
- Rwyf newydd ei godi gyda CLILC a chefais ymateb ddoe. Credaf eich bod yn hollol iawn: mae'n anghyson. Er imi ddileu'r rhwystr ariannol drwy sicrhau bod arian ar gael, dim ond 12 o awdurdodau a gyflwynodd geisiadau am arian. Nid oes gan rai o'r awdurdodau na wnaethant gyflwyno cais unrhyw ardaloedd dim galw diwahoddiad. Rwy'n ceisio darganfod beth yw'r rhwystrau. Un peth a godwyd gyda mi oedd bod yn rhaid cynnal arolygon preswylwyr. Mae hynny'n fater a gadwyd yn ôl ac rwyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog perthnasol yn San Steffan i weld a ellir goresgyn hynny.
- 14:18 **Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Age Cymru identified huge variations in the no-cold-calling zones of councils across Wales to keep out rogue traders and door-step scammers. For example, it identified that only 1.04% of homes in Flintshire were covered. Flintshire and Wrexham Watch Association contacted me with the good news that it is due to 'ignite' or create a further 111 zones, supporting over 1,800 properties, so that is good news. How will the Welsh Government monitor progress across the local authorities of Wales and report back to the Assembly?
- Nododd Age Cymru amrywiadau enfawr yn yr ardaloedd dim galw diwahoddiad a geir mewn cynghorau ledled Cymru er mwyn cadw masnachwyr twyllodrus a sgamwyr steppen drws i ffwrdd. Er enghraifft, nododd mai dim ond 1.04% o gartrefi yn Sir y Fflint a gwmpesir. Cysylltodd Cymdeithas Gwarchod Cymdogaeth Sir y Fflint a Wrecsam â mi gyda'r newyddion da ei fod ar fin 'tanio' neu greu 111 o ardaloedd ychwanegol, gan gefnogi dros 1,800 o gartrefi, felly mae hynny'n newyddion da. Sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn monitro'r cynnydd ar draws yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ac yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad?
- 14:19 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I will monitor it because reporting on the number of zones is a condition of local authorities having the funding. I will publish the data, as well as the updated figures for local authorities across Wales, in April of this year.
- Byddaf yn monitro hyn oherwydd mae adrodd ar nifer yr ardaloedd yn un o'r amodau y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol eu bodloni er mwyn cael arian. Byddaf yn cyhoeddi'r data, yn ogystal â'r ffigurau diweddaraf ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru, ym mis Ebrill eleni.
- 14:19 **Lindsay Whittle** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, I am sure that you are aware that, as it stands, no-cold-calling zones are not legally enforceable. It is not breaking any civil or criminal law to disregard the zone and attempt to sell door to door regardless. I understand that criminal justice is not devolved, but have you looked into what actions are available for local authorities to enforce the zones via a fine, or perhaps by working with the police and neighbourhood watch schemes to ensure that cold callers do not come into an area that is a no-cold-call zone?
- Weinidog, rwy'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol, fel y mae, na ellir gorfodi ardaloedd dim galw diwahoddiad yn gyfreithiol. Nid yw achosion o ddiystyru'r ardal a cheisio gwerthu o ddrws i ddrws beth bynnag yn torri unrhyw gyfraith sifil na throseddol. Rwy'n deall nad yw cyfiawnder troseddol wedi'i ddatganoli, ond a ydych wedi ystyried pa gamau sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol i orfodi'r ardaloedd drwy ddirwy, neu efallai drwy weithio gyda'r heddlu a chynlluniau gwarchod cymdogaeth i sicrhau nad yw galwyr diwahoddiad yn dod i rywle a elwir yn ardal dim galw diwahoddiad?

14:20 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

You highlight a bit of a loophole, but certainly the work that we are undertaking with local authorities is increasing the number of zones, and we are seeing fewer rogue traders, for instance. It is not just about safety. If you think about somebody who has been the victim of a rogue trader, that can lead to difficulties with health, so there are lots of issues that we need to look at within that. It is certainly something that we need to look at within the context that you have described.

Rydych yn tynnu sylw at dipyn o fwllch, ond yn sicr, mae'r gwaith a wnawn gydag awdurdodau lleol yn cynyddu nifer yr ardaloedd, ac rydym yn gweld llai o fasnachwyr twyllodrus, er enghraifft. Mae mwy i hyn na diogelwch. Os byddwch yn meddwl am rywun sydd wedi dioddef oherwydd masnachwr twyllodrus, gall hynny arwain at anawsterau iechyd, felly mae llawer o faterion y mae angen inni edrych arnynt mewn perthynas â hynny. Mae'n sicr yn rhywbeth y mae angen inni edrych arno yng nghyd-destun yr hyn a ddisgrifiwyd gennych.

14:20 **Joyce Watson** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Minister, one way to combat scams, scares and unwanted doorstep calls is to provide households with alternative services and better information. A good example of that is Tai Ceredigion housing association's caretaking and handyperson service, available to older and vulnerable tenants, delivered by vetted tradespeople at a fixed cost. It means that they can be sure that they are getting a good, reliable, trustworthy service for a fair price. Would you take up my offer to look at the gwasanaethau medra services with a view to developing best practices for other parts of Wales?

Weinidog, un ffordd o drechu sgamiau, achosion o ddychryn a galwyr diwahoddiad ar stepen y drws yw cynnig gwasanaethau amgen a gwybodaeth well i aelwydydd. Mae gwasanaeth gofalwr a thasgmon cymdeithas Tai Ceredigion yn enghraifft dda o hyn, sydd ar gael i denantiaid hŷn a thenantiaid sy'n agored i niwed, a ddarperir gan grefftwyr sydd wedi'u harchwilio am gost sefydlog. Mae'n golygu y gallant fod yn sicr eu bod yn cael gwasanaeth da, dibynadwy, y gellir ymddiried ynddo, am bris teg. A dderbyniwch fy nghynnig i edrych ar wasanaethau medra gyda'r bwriad o ddatblygu arferion gorau ar gyfer rhannau eraill o Gymru?

14:21 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

The service to which you refer, which Tai Ceredigion launched, is an example of best practice. It is at a very reasonable cost—I think that it is £7.50 an hour—and it provides caretaking and handyperson services for older and vulnerable tenants and leaseholders. I very much welcome any local initiative such as you described to help to protect people.

Mae'r gwasanaeth y cyfeiriwch ato, a lanswyd gan Tai Ceredigion, yn enghraifft o arfer gorau. Mae'n rhesymol iawn—£7.50 yr awr rwy'n credu—ac mae'n darparu gwasanaethau gofalwr a thasgmon i denantiaid a lesdeiliaid hŷn ac sy'n agored i niwed. Croesawaf yn fawr iawn unrhyw fenter leol fel yr un a ddisgrifiwyd gennych sy'n helpu i amddiffyn pobl.

## Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol

## Local Government Funding

14:21 **Keith Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*2. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gyllid Llywodraeth Leol yng Nghymru? OAQ(4)0391(LG)*

*2. Will the Minister provide an update on Local Government funding in Wales? OAQ(4)0391(LG)*

14:21 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

The local government settlement for 2014-15 was approved by the Assembly on 14 January 2014 and provided authorities with the funding details needed to set their budgets. Authorities are at various stages in setting their budgets for the next financial year.

Cymeradwywyd y setliad llywodraeth leol ar gyfer 2014-15 gan y Cynulliad ar 14 Ionawr 2014, a rhoddodd y manylion cyllido sydd ei angen ar awdurdodau i bennu eu cyllidebau. Mae awdurdodau ar wahanol gamau o ran pennu eu cyllidebau ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

- 14:22 **Keith Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- In Carmarthenshire, there has been much concern over massive increases for sports facilities managed by the council, including pitch fees, with increases set out for the next three years. We all appreciate that difficult choices are ahead with regard to the local government budget. However, I believe that it is essential that access to sport is available to all ages and financial backgrounds. Sports clubs and—[Inaudible.]—must be consulted when changes are planned. Minister, we all share concerns about obesity, and the Welsh Government seeks to create a healthier Wales. Do you agree that local authorities should recognise the importance of sports, and not just for exercise? For older people, it is a social activity; it nurtures the talent of young players; it offers recreation for all; and it combats obesity.
- Yn Sir Gaerfyrddin, bu llawer o bryder ynghylch y cynnydd enfawr ym mhrisiau cyfleusterau chwaraeon a reolir gan y cyngor, gan gynnwys ffioedd cae, a rhagwelir y byddant yn parhau i godi dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae pawb ohonom yn sylweddoli bod dewisiadau anodd o'n blaen o ran cyllideb llywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei bod yn hanfodol bod mynediad i chwaraeon ar gael i bobl o bob oed a chefnidir ariannol. Rhaid ymgynghori â chlybiau chwaraeon a—[Anghlywadwy.]—pan gaiff cynlluniau eu newid. Weinidog, mae pob un ohonom fel chi yn pryderu am ordewdra, ac mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ceisio creu Cymru iachach. A gytunwch y dylai awdurdodau lleol gydnabod pwysigrwydd chwaraeon, ac nid ar gyfer ymarfer corff yn unig? I bobl hŷn, mae'n weithgarwch cymdeithasol; mae'n meithrin talent chwaraewyr ifanc; mae'n cynnig difyrwch i bawb; ac mae'n trechu gordewdra.
- 14:22 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I certainly agree with that, and I know that the Minister for Culture and Sport has also written to local authorities, asking them to consider carefully how they provide leisure provision and encouraging them to have consultation with users of the facilities. I have also stressed to local authorities that they must look very carefully at the services. We do not want to see salami-slicing, and they must take that approach when they are looking at their local services.
- Rwy'n sicr yn cytuno â hynny, a gwn fod y Gweinidog Diwylliant a Chwaraeon hefyd wedi ysgrifennu at awdurdodau lleol, gan ofyn iddynt ystyried yn ofalus sut y maent yn cynnig darpariaeth hamdden a'u hannog i ymgynghori â defnyddwyr y cyfleusterau. Rwyf hefyd wedi pwysleisio i awdurdodau lleol bod yn rhaid iddynt edrych yn ofalus iawn ar y gwasanaethau. Nid ydym am weld toriadau tameidiog, a rhaid iddynt gymryd yr agwedd honno pan fyddant yn edrych ar eu gwasanaethau lleol.
- 14:23 **Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, all Welsh councils clearly have to make tough decisions at the moment surrounding where savings can be made following the drop in funding from the Welsh Government. I am sure that you are aware that Monmouthshire County Council has embarked upon a comprehensive public consultation process that has actually worked. If you ask people where they think savings should be made, then they are quite willing to tell you, and then they will accept the savings more at the end of that. Taking a leaf out of Joyce Watson's book on best practice, will you see that this sort of best practice is spread out across Wales? Perhaps you could look at making it statutory.
- Weinidog, mae'n amlwg bod yn rhaid i bob cyngor yng Nghymru wneud penderfyniadau anodd ar hyn o bryd ynghylch lle y gellir gwneud arbedion yn dilyn y gostyngiad mewn cyllid gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Rwy'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod Cyngor Sir Fynwy wedi sefydlu proses ymgynghori gyhoeddus gynhwysfawr sydd wedi gweithio. Os gofynnwch i bobl ble maent yn credu y dylid gwneud arbedion, yna maent yn eithaf parod i ddweud wrthy, ac yna byddant yn fwy parod i dderbyn yr arbedion yn y pen draw. Gan ddilyn esiampl Joyce Watson ar arfer gorau, a wnewch sicrhau y caiff y math hwn o arfer gorau ei ledaenu ledled Cymru? Efallai y gallech ystyried ei wneud yn statudol.
- 14:24 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Certainly, I am happy to make sure that local authorities are aware when best practice is occurring. I certainly agree with you; I do think that Monmouthshire has undertaken a very good public consultation, as have other local authorities. I agree that if you engage with members of the public about the services that they want, understanding the difficult financial situation that local authorities are in, then they are more likely to accept those changes.
- Yn sicr, rwy'n hapus i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn ymwybodol pan fydd arfer gorau yn digwydd. Rwy'n sicr yn cytuno â chi; credaf fod Sir Fynwy wedi cynnal ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus da iawn, yn ogystal ag awdurdodau lleol eraill. Rwy'n cytuno os byddwch yn ymgysylltu ag aelodau o'r cyhoedd am y gwasanaethau y maent am eu cael, gan ddeall y sefyllfa ariannol anodd y mae awdurdodau lleol ynnddi, yna maent yn fwy tebygol o dderbyn y newidiadau hynny.
- 14:24 **Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Mae llywodraeth leol yn wynebu toriadau, yn sicr yn ei grant refereniw, yn ystod y pum mlynedd nesaf. A ydych yn disgwyl i gynghorau sir gynnal y gwasanaethau presennol a'r lefelau cyflogaeth yn wyneb y cwtogi llym hwn?
- Local government is facing cuts, certainly in terms of its revenue grant, over the next five years. Do you expect county councils to maintain current services and employment levels in the face of these swingeing cuts?

14:24	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I certainly think that local authorities are taking the approach that they want to maintain jobs and services as best they can, but clearly they are in very difficult financial circumstances. They have had their funding protected for the previous three years—knowing that these funding reductions were likely to come—in the hope that they would make transformational changes during those three years, ready for when the difficult financial settlements came.</p>	<p>Rwyf yn sicr yn credu bod awdurdodau lleol yn cymryd yr agwedd eu bod am gynnal swyddi a gwasanaethau hyd eithaf eu gallu, ond mae'n amlwg eu bod mewn amgylchiadau ariannol anodd iawn. Roedd eu cyllid wedi'i ddiogelu dros y tair blynedd flaenorol—gan wybod bod y gostyngiadau cyllido hyn yn debygol o ddod—yn y gobaith y byddent yn gwneud newidiadau trawsnewidiol yn ystod y tair blynedd hynny, yn barod ar gyfer adeg gwneud y setliadau ariannol anodd.</p>
	<b>Gweithredu Polisi Llywodraeth Cymru</b>	<b>Implementation of Welsh Government Policy</b>
14:25	<b>Angela Burns</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p><i>3. A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu sut y mae awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu monitro o ran gweithredu polisi Llywodraeth Cymru? OAQ(4)0383(LG)</i></p>	<p><i>3. Will the Minister outline how local authorities are monitored with regard to the implementation of Welsh Government policy? OAQ(4)0383(LG)</i></p>
14:25	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Regulation, inspection and audit bodies assess the compliance of local authorities with legislation and guidance. Where they are found not to comply, those bodies and I will take the appropriate action.</p>	<p>Mae cyrff rheoleiddio, arolygu ac archwilio yn asesu cydymffurfiaeth awdurdodau lleol â deddfwriaeth a chanllawiau. Lle y canfyddir nad ydynt yn cydymffurfio, bydd y cyrff hynny a minnau yn cymryd y camau priodol.</p>
14:25	<b>Angela Burns</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Minister, that was an interesting answer. Certainly from the two areas that I represent—two different county councils: Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire—there are deep concerns over the variable implementation and application of policies, from some of the technical advice notes all the way through to how hypothecated grants are used. I am very interested to understand in more detail how they are truly monitored and held to account, otherwise how else can the general public expect to have transparency, but above all fairness?</p>	<p>Weinidog, roedd hwnnw'n ateb diddorol. Yn sicr yn y ddwy ardal a gynrychiolaf i—dau gyngor sir gwahanol: Sir Benfro a Sir Gaerfyrddin—mae pryderon dwfn ynghylch y ffyrdd gwahanol o weithredu a chymhwysu polisiâu, o rai o'r nodiadau cyngor technegol yr holl ffordd i'r modd y caiff grantiau wedi'u neilltuo eu defnyddio. Byddai'n dda gennyf ddeall yn fanylach sut y cânt eu monitro a'u dwyn i gyfrif, neu fel arall, sut y gall y cyhoedd ddisgwyl cael tryloywder, ond yn anad dim, degwch?</p>
14:26	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Each department has arrangements in place to effect and monitor the implementation of Welsh Government policies as appropriate. Incidents of significant failure to follow the law are highlighted in public reports from the Auditor General for Wales and other regulators. If the auditor general sees room for improvement, he recommends action; if none is taken by that council, he would report that in follow-up assessments. You will be aware that my Cabinet colleagues and I can intervene where a local authority patently cannot or will not discharge its duties, and that we have done so on occasion.</p>	<p>Mae gan bob adran drefniadau ar waith i weithredu polisiâu Llywodraeth Cymru a'u monitro fel y bo'n briodol. Amlygir achosion o fethiant sylweddol i ddilyn y gyfraith mewn adroddiadau cyhoeddus gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru a rheoleiddwyr eraill. Os gwêl yr archwilydd cyffredinol bod lle i wella, bydd yn argymhell cam gweithredu; os na fydd y cyngor hwnnw'n gweithredu, byddai'n adrodd ar hynny mewn asesiadau dilynol. Byddwch yn ymwybodol y gall fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet a minnau ymyrryd pan fydd yn amlwg na all awdurdod lleol gyflawni ei ddyletswyddau neu lle nad yw'n fodlon gwneud hynny, a'n bod wedi gwneud hynny ar sawl achlysur.</p>
14:26	<b>Llyr Gruffydd</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Minister, local government has told the Williams commission that it wants more of a focus on outcomes and less on how things are done. It would like the Welsh Government to provide funding and specify the outcomes that it is looking for, and then let local government get on with it. Would you indicate whether the Welsh Government is considering giving local government more unhypothecated funding?</p>	<p>Weinidog, mae llywodraeth leol wedi dweud wrth gomisiwn Williams ei bod am weld mwy o ffocws ar ganlyniadau a llai ar sut y gwneir pethau. Byddai'n hoffi i Lywodraeth Cymru ddarparu cyllid a nodi'r canlyniadau y mae am eu gweld, ac yna adael i lywodraeth leol fwrw ati. A nodwch a yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried rhoi mwy o gyllid heb ei neilltuo i lywodraeth leol?</p>

- 14:27 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Just last year, I think that we unhypothecated £39 million. Within my own portfolio, I have now unhypothecated most of the specific grants that I had. I am also working with local authorities to look at flexible funding—not just specific grants. That is a piece of work that we are taking forward over the coming weeks.
- Y llynedd, credaf ein bod wedi rhoi £39 miliwn heb ei neilltuo. Yn fy mhortffolio fy hun, rwyf bellach wedi peidio â neilltuo'r rhan fwyaf o'r grantiau penodol a gefais. Rwyf hefyd yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i edrych ar gyllid hyblyg—nid dim ond grantiau penodol. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn ei ddatblygu dros yr wythnosau nesaf.
- 14:27 **Aled Roberts** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Weinidog, mae'r cynghorau ar hyn o bryd yn setlo eu cyllidebau. Rwyf yn derbyn bod ganddynt yr hawl i wneud penderfyniadau lleol yn ôl y gyfundrefn ddemocratig sydd gennym, ond mae rhai ohonynt yn gwneud eu hawgrymiadau ar y sail eu bod yn dweud eu bod yn methu â chyflawni safonau Llywodraeth Cymru mewn meysydd fel hamdden a llyfrgelloedd wrth iddynt gwtogi. Pa gamau a fydd y Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd pan fydd ymgynghoriad swyddogol y cyngor yn dweud nad yw'n mynd i gyflawni safonau Llywodraeth Cymru o hynny ymlaen?
- Minister, the councils at present are settling their budgets. I accept that they have the right to make local decisions according to the democratic arrangements that we have, however, some of them are making their suggestions on the basis that they are saying that they cannot maintain the standards of the Welsh Government in areas such as leisure and libraries as they make their cuts. What steps will you take as a Government when an official consultation by a council shows that it is not going to maintain the standards of the Welsh Government from then on?
- 14:28 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- You will have heard my answer to Angela Burns, when I set out what action we can take. It is something that we will have to look at as local authorities are in the process of setting their budgets at the current time.
- Byddwch wedi clywed fy ateb i Angela Burns, pan nodais pa gamau y gallwn eu cymryd. Mae'n rhywbeth y bydd yn rhaid inni edrych arno gan fod awdurdodau lleol wrthi'n pennu eu cyllidebau ar hyn o bryd.
- Dadansoddiad Cost a Budd** **Cost-Benefit Analysis**
- 14:28 **Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- 4. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gynnal dadansoddiad cost a budd o argymhellion Comisiwn Williams?*  
OAQ(4)0381(LG)
- 4. Will the Minister undertake a cost-benefit analysis of the recommendations of the Williams Commission?*  
OAQ(4)0381(LG)
- 14:28 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- The Welsh Government is currently considering the commission's proposals, but we should not reduce the commission's wide-ranging proposals to a single arithmetic calculation as this would be neither practicable nor meaningful.
- Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wrthi'n ystyried cynigion y comisiwn, ond ni ddylem leihau cynigion eang y comisiwn i un cyfrifiad rhifyddol gan na fyddai hyn yn ymarferol nac yn ystyrlon.
- 14:28 **Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Roedd hwnnw'n ateb diddorol, Weinidog. A gaf i roi persbectif arall ichi? Dywedodd comisiwn Williams yn benodol bod cost a budd y tu hwnt i'w gylch gorchwyl—mae hynny wedi ei ddweud yn blwmp ac yn blaen. Serch hynny, mae'r comisiwn yn rhoi amcangyfrif o tua £100 miliwn ac yn dweud y bydd arbedion yn y pen draw, ond nad oes mesur o'r arbedion hynny. Ar y llaw arall, mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi comisiynu Deloitte i ddweud y bydd cost o £200 miliwn ac, yn rhyfedd iawn, nid yw'n gweld unrhyw arbedion sylweddol yn y broses hon. Rwyf yn cynnig persbectif arall ichi, sef nad oes modd inni symud ymlaen at ddiwygio llywodraeth leol—y diwygio y mae pawb yn gytûn bod angen ei weld yng Nghymru—oni bai bod llywodraeth leol a'r cyhoedd yn deall beth yw cost a budd hynny, a beth yw'r goblygiadau tymor hir o ran y pwrw cyhoeddus.
- Minister, that was an interesting answer. May I give you another perspective? The Williams commission said specifically that costs and benefits were outwith its remit—that has been stated clearly. However, the commission does provide an estimate of some £100 million and states that there will ultimately be savings, but that they are not measurable. On the other hand, the WLGA has commissioned Deloitte, which has said that the cost will be £200 million and, strangely, that it does not see any significant savings from this particular process. I give you another perspective, that is, that we cannot progress the local government reform that everyone is agreed is required in Wales unless local government and the public understand what the costs and benefits of that will be and what the long-term implications will be for the public purse.

- 14:29 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- In relation to your point about the piece of work by Deloitte, the WLGA has stated that while it is a useful analysis, no detailed information was really done around it. I think it was quite a quick piece of work. The WLGA has now written to the First Minister suggesting that it is going to have another look at this and have its own working group—I think, really, to repeat the consideration that the commission has undertaken. So, there will obviously be costing work. We, as a Government, are now looking at the report, as you are aware, working up our response, and it is something that we will have to look at too.
- Mewn perthynas â'ch pwynt am y darn o waith gan Deloitte, mae CLILC wedi datgan, er ei fod yn ddadansoddiad defnyddiol, na luniwyd gwybodaeth fanwl o'i gwmpas mewn gwirionedd. Credaf ei fod yn waith a wnaed yn gymharol gyflym. Mae CLILC bellach wedi ysgrifennu at y Prif Weinidog yn awgrymu y bydd yn cymryd golwg arall ar hyn gan sefydlu ei weithgor ei hun—a hynny mewn gwirionedd er mwyn ailadrodd ystyriaeth y comisiwn. Felly, yn amlwg, bydd gwaith costio. Rydym ni, fel Llywodraeth, yn edrych ar yr adroddiad yn awr, fel y gwyddoch, gan lunio ein hymateb, ac mae'n rhywbeth y bydd yn rhaid inni edrych arno hefyd.
- 14:30 **Mick Antoniw** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, fewer councils and fewer councillors obviously create accountability issues. Will the Government be giving consideration to the role of community councils as a possible mechanism for resolving that democratic deficit?
- Weinidog, mae llai o gynghorau a llai o gynghorwyr yn amlwg yn arwain at broblemau atebolrwydd. A fydd y Llywodraeth yn ystyried rôl cynghorau cymuned fel dull posibl o ddatrys y diffyg democrataidd hwnnw?
- 14:30 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Certainly, I believe that town and community councils should be part of the debate looking at public service delivery. The role of town and community councils was not part of the commission's core remit, but it did make some recommendations around town and community councils and that will obviously have some implications for them.
- Yn sicr, credaf y dylai cynghorau tref a chymuned fod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth sy'n edrych ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid oedd rôl cynghorau tref a chymuned yn rhan o gyloch gwaith craidd y comisiwn, ond gwnaeth rai argymhellion ynghylch cynghorau tref a chymuned a bydd hynny'n amlwg yn arwain at rywfaint o oblygiadau iddynt.
- 14:31 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I call on Peter Black, the Welsh Liberal Democrats' spokesperson.
- Galwaf ar Peter Black, llefarydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru.
- 14:31 **Peter Black** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you, Presiding Officer. Minister, thank you for acknowledging that the Welsh Government will have to do some work on the costings of this. A recent YouGov poll indicated that the public is still not convinced of the benefits of local government reorganisation. Most of them think that they will have to pay more council tax as a result of that happening. Do you not accept that, if the Welsh Government is to carry any form of majority or consensus on this issue, that there will have to be a full cost-benefit analysis before we start getting down to the nitty-gritty of how this is going to be implemented?
- Diolch ichi, Lywydd. Weinidog, diolch ichi am gydnabod y bydd yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru wneud rhywfaint o waith ar gyfrifo costau hyn. Nododd arolwg barn diweddar gan YouGov nad yw'r cyhoedd yn dal yn argyhoeddedig o fanteision ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn credu y bydd yn rhaid iddynt dalu mwy o dreth gyngor o ganlyniad i hynny. Oni dderbyniwch, er mwyn i Lywodraeth Cymru gael unrhyw fath o fwyafriaf neu gonsensws ar y mater hwn, y bydd yn rhaid cynnal dadansoddiad cost a budd llawn cyn inni ddechrau mynd i'r afael â'r manylion o ran sut y caiff hyn ei weithredu?
- 14:31 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Again, I am not really sure what you mean by a full cost-benefit analysis. The recommendations and the proposals are so wide ranging that I really do not think a simple calculation would be that meaningful. I do not think we should be focusing just on pounds and pence. It is not just about that. There are some recommendations that have the most obvious financial implications, which are probably those relating to the mergers, but the costs of responding to the full report would go beyond that.
- Unwaith eto, nid wyf yn siŵr beth rydych yn ei olygu wrth ddadansoddiad cost a budd llawn. Mae'r argymhellion a'r cynigion mor eang eu cwmpas fel na chredaf yn wir y byddai cyfrifiad syml mor ystyrion â hynny. Ni chredaf y dylem ganolbwyntio ar bunnoedd a cheiniogau yn unig. Mae'n ymwneud â mwy na hynny. Mae gan rai argymhellion oblygiadau ariannol amlwg iawn, sef y rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r prosesau uno mae'n debyg, ond byddai costau ymateb i'r adroddiad llawn yn mynd tu hwnt i hynny.



14:32	<b>Peter Black</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> Thank you for that answer, Minister. I have been on the Finance Committee long enough to know that most Ministers do understand what a full cost-benefit analysis is. However, in this particular instance I understand that what you are saying is that the Williams commission's report is very wide ranging and in fact very long. I will just narrow down the question, therefore. If the Welsh Government produces a response to this, will it contain a full cost-benefit analysis of what you want to do in response to that commission?	Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Rwyf wedi bod ar y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ddigon hir i wybod bod y rhan fwyaf o Weinidogion yn deall beth yw dadansoddiad cost a budd llawn. Fodd bynnag, yn yr achos penodol hwn deallaf mai'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud yw bod adroddiad y comisiwn Williams yn eang iawn ei gwmpas ac yn wir, yn hir iawn. Byddaf yn cyfyngu'r cwestiwn, felly. Os bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn llunio ymateb i hyn, a fydd yn cynnwys dadansoddiad cost a budd llawn o'r hyn yr ydych am ei wneud mewn ymateb i'r comisiwn hwnnw?	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:32	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> We are looking at our response at the current time and we will present a robust regulatory impact assessment of any legislative proposals that we bring forward.	Rydym yn edrych ar ein hymateb ar hyn o bryd a byddwn yn cyflwyno asesiad effaith rheoleidiol cadarn o unrhyw gynigion deddfwriaethol a gyflwynir gennym.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:32	<b>Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> I call on the opposition spokesperson, Mark Isherwood, with two concise questions, please.	Galwaf ar lefarydd yr wrthblaid, Mark Isherwood, gyda dau gwestiwn cryno, os gwelwch yn dda.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:33	<b>Mark Isherwood</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> It takes many years to cover the cost of merger and, as you will be aware, there are several legal safeguards regarding expenditure by local authorities, as Blaenau Gwent and Caerphilly discovered when they were about to merge social services last year and found that this would have placed Caerphilly at significant risk of cross-subsidising services in another authority. This is not legal. How, therefore, is the Welsh Government considering the law relating to mergers where it would be unlawful to merge with risk of financial deficit and voluntary mergers would not be an option under Williams unless the Welsh Government bought out any deficits resulting?	Mae'n cymryd blynyddoedd lawer i dalu am gost y broses uno ac, fel y gwyddoch, mae nifer o fesurau diogelu cyfreithiol o ran gwariant gan awdurdodau lleol, fel y darganfu Blaenau Gwent a Chaerffili pan oeddent ar fin uno gwasanaethau cymdeithasol y llynedd a gweld y byddai hyn yn golygu y byddai Caerffili mewn perygl mawr o drosglwyddo cymorthdaliadau gwasanaethau mewn awdurdod arall. Nid yw hyn yn gyfreithiol. Sut, felly, y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried y gyfraith sy'n ymwneud ag achosion o uno lle y byddai'n anghyfreithlon uno os oes risg o ddiffyg ariannol ac na fyddai uno'n wirfoddol yn opsiwn o dan Williams oni bai bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn prynu unrhyw ddiffygion sy'n weddill?	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:33	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> You are right in saying that voluntary mergers would need legislation also. That, certainly, as we are looking at the report now and coming forward with our proposals, is something that I think is the case. So, it is a big piece of work that we are currently undertaking and we will be looking at those issues.	Rydych yn iawn wrth ddweud y byddai angen deddfwriaeth ar gyfer achosion o uno gwirfoddol hefyd. Mae hynny, yn sicr, wrth inni edrych ar yr adroddiad yn awr a chyflwyno ein cynigion, yn rhywbeth y credaf ei fod yn wir. Felly, rydym yn ymgymryd â gwaith mawr ar hyn o bryd a byddwn yn edrych ar y materion hynny.	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
14:33	<b>Mark Isherwood</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a> You mentioned the WLGA. In its evidence to the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee inquiry into progress with local government collaboration, the report of which was published only at the end of December, the WLGA said it was important to undertake a cost-benefit analysis before proceeding with collaborative projects. It said that it is important that	Soniasoch am CLILC. Yn ei thystiolaeth i ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Cymunedau, Cydraddoldeb a Llywodraeth Leol i gynnwys gyda chydweithredu â llywodraeth leol, y cyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad dim ond ddiwedd mis Rhagfyr, dywedodd CLILC ei bod yn bwysig cynnal dadansoddiad cost a budd cyn bwrw ymlaen â phrosiectau cydweithredol. Dywedodd ei bod yn bwysig	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	'you have properly thought through the measures that you are about to take and worked out the costs of collaboration and the risks.'	eich bod wedi ystyried y mesurau yr ydych ar fin ymgymryd â hwy a chyfrifo'r costau cydweithredu a'r risgiau.	

It has called for a properly costed financial analysis and has asked for urgent discussions with the First Minister. You said only that it had written to the First Minister. Has the First Minister agreed to meet WLGA representatives or will you and/or the First Minister be meeting them to discuss their concerns and agree a way forward?

Mae wedi galw am ddadansoddiad ariannol wedi'i gostio'n briodol ac wedi gofyn am drafodaethau brys gyda'r Prif Weinidog. Dim ond dweud ei fod wedi ysgrifennu at y Prif Weinidog wnaethoch chi. A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cytuno i gwrdd â chynrychiolwyr CLILC, neu a fyddwch chi a/neu'r Prif Weinidog yn cwrdd â nhw i drafod eu pryderon a chytuno ar ffordd ymlaen?

14:34

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I met with the WLGA executive last week and have discussed various issues it. The WLGA met with the First Minister after that. It has now written to the First Minister regarding convening its own working group. I think the First Minister has either responded or is awaiting a further response from the WLGA.

Cyfarfûm â phwyllgor gweithredol CLILC yr wythnos diwethaf a thrafod amrywiol faterion ag ef. Cyfarfu CLILC â'r Prif Weinidog ar ôl hynny. Mae bellach wedi ysgrifennu at y Prif Weinidog ynghylch cynnull ei weithgor ei hun. Credaf fod y Prif Weinidog naill ai wedi ymateb neu yn aros am ymateb pellach gan CLILC.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

## Prosesau Archwilio

## Audit Processes

14:35

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*5. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gydag arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol ynghylch eu prosesau archwilio? OAQ(4)0385(LG)*

*5. What discussions has the Minister had with local authority leaders regarding their audit processes? OAQ(4)0385(LG)*

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:35

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you. I have regular meetings with the local authority leaders, at which I discuss a wide range of matters, including issues in relation to audit, inspection and regulation.

Diolch. Caf gyfarfodydd rheolaidd ag arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol, lle byddaf yn trafod amrywiaeth eang o faterion, gan gynnwys materion mewn perthynas ag archwilio, arolygu a rheoleiddio.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:35

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Weinidog, yn wyneb y ffaith bod amrywiaeth fawr wedi bod yn y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi ymateb i ganfyddiadau'r archwilydd dosbarth o daliadau sydd yn groes i'r ddeddf, a ydych yn meddwl bod angen protocol yn y fan hon, lle bod uwch swyddogion neu aelodau etholedig sy'n gyfrifol am daliadau sy'n groes i'r ddeddf, neu sydd wedi manteisio o'r taliadau hynny, yn sefyll o'r neilltu o'u swyddi yn syth tra bod ymchwiliad?

Minister, given that there has been great variation in the way that local authorities have responded to the findings of the district auditor in relation to unlawful payments, do we need a protocol here whereby senior officers or elected members who are responsible for payments that are unlawful, or who have benefited from such payments, should stand aside from their post while an inquiry takes place?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:35

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

You will be aware of the written statement that I put out regarding looking at the issue of senior officer pay, which I know most parties in this Chamber have welcomed. I know that you will be referring to issues in your own area, and you will be aware of the work that has been undertaken by the police in that respect. However, I think that I have gone on record as saying that senior officer pay must be very transparent, and I am going to issue guidance in April around senior officer pay.

Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyhoeddais ynghylch edrych ar gyflog uwch swyddogion, a gwn fod y rhan fwyaf o bleidiau yn y Siambr hon yn ei groesawu. Gwn y byddwch yn cyfeirio at faterion yn eich ardal eich hun, a byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith a wnaed gan yr heddlu yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, credaf y cofnodwyd imi ddweud bod yn rhaid i gyflog uwch swyddogion fod yn dryloyw iawn, ac rwyf am gyhoeddi canllawiau ym mis Ebrill ynghylch cyflog uwch swyddog.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

14:36	<b>Rhodri Glyn Thomas</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Roeddwn yn cyfeirio, Weinidog, at brotocol cenedlaethol ar sut i ymateb i adroddiadau yr archwilydd dosbarth, oherwydd mae'n amlwg bod awdurdodau lleol yn ymateb mewn ffyrdd gwahanol. A gaf ofyn cwestiwn cyffredinol i chi? Pan fo adroddiad ar awdurdod lleol a phan fo cyfarfod arbennig yn cael ei gynnal i drafod yr adroddiad hwnnw, a ydych yn credu ei bod yn bwysig bod pob cynghorydd yn cael y cyfle i leisio barn ar yr adroddiad ac ar ganfyddiadau'r archwilydd, a'i bod yn gwbl annerbyniol pan fo awdurdodau lleol yn talu miloedd o bunnau i fargyfreithwyr ddod i geisio atal cynghorwyr rhag mynegi barn?</p>	<p>I was referring, Minister, to a national protocol on how to respond to reports by the district auditor, because it is clear that local authorities respond in different ways. May I ask you a general question? When there is a report on a local authority and when a meeting takes place to discuss that report, do you believe that it is important that every councillor has an opportunity to express a view on the report and the findings of the auditor, and that it is quite unacceptable when local authorities pay thousands of pounds to barristers to come to try to prevent councillors from expressing their views?</p>
14:37	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Yes, I think that it is very important that members are not prevented from expressing preliminary views in advance of meetings. We have guidance on the code of conduct, which is issued by the ombudsman, which makes that point very clear. They must take care, however, not to give the impression that they have closed their minds to any of the merits of the arguments, and they must take those into consideration.</p>	<p>Ydw, credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn na chaiff aelodau eu hatal rhag mynegi safbwyntiau rhagarweiniol cyn cyfarfodydd. Mae gennym ganllawiau ar y cod ymddygiad, a gyhoeddir gan yr ombudsmon, sy'n egluro'r pwynt hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddynt ofalu nad ydynt yn rhoi'r argraff eu bod yn anwybyddu unrhyw un o rinweddau'r dadleuon, a rhaid iddynt ystyried y rhain.</p>
14:37	<b>Angela Burns</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Minister, it seems to me that one of the key impediments to clear audit process in councils is the cabinet system. I wondered whether you might be considering whether or not the cabinet system is a suitable way of running councils. In at least a number of councils that I know of, the cabinet system appears to prevent other councillors from being able to audit and to act as check and balance on officers, and on a small and overly influential group of councillors.</p>	<p>Weinidog, mae'n ymddangos i mi mai un o'r ffactorau allweddol sy'n atal prosesau archwilio clir mewn cynghorau yw'r system gabinet. Tybed a ydych yn ystyried a yw'r system gabinet yn ffordd addas o redeg cynghorau. Mewn sawl cyngor y gwn i amdanynt, mae'n ymddangos bod y system gabinet yn atal cynghorwyr eraill rhag gallu archwilio a chynnal prosesau gwirio a gwrthbwysio ar swyddogion, ac ar grŵp bach a gorddylanwadol o gynghorwyr.</p>
14:38	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I have not made a decision on looking at the cabinet system since I have been in portfolio, last March. However, I think that it is something that perhaps we could look at as we take the commission's recommendations forward.</p>	<p>Nid wyf wedi gwneud penderfyniad ar ystyried system y cabinet ers imi gael cyfrifoldebau'r portffolio, fis Mawrth diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei fod yn rhywbeth y gallem ei ystyried wrth inni ddatblygu argymhellion y comisiwn.</p>
	<b>Gwerth am Arian</b>	<b>Value for Money</b>
14:38	<b>Rhun ap Iorwerth</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>6. <i>A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyflawni gwerth am arian ar draws llywodraeth leol? OAQ(4)0382(LG)</i></p>	<p>6. <i>Will the Minister make a statement on delivering value for money across local government? OAQ(4)0382(LG)</i></p>
	<b>Bethan Jenkins</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	
	<p>9. <i>Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn sicrhau'r gwerth gorau am arian o'r cyllid y maent yn ei gael? OAQ(4)0376(LG)</i></p>	<p>9. <i>How does the Welsh Government ensure local authorities achieve maximum value for money from the funding they receive? OAQ(4)0376(LG)</i></p>
14:38	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Presiding Officer, I understand that you have given your permission for questions 6 and 9 to be grouped.</p>	<p>Lywydd, deallaf eich bod wedi rhoi eich caniatâd i gwestiynau 6 a 9 gael eu grwpio.</p>

There are clear duties upon local authorities to achieve best value for money in delivering and improving the services for which they are responsible. To support this, we have provided a fair and realistic settlement in difficult financial circumstances.

Mae dyletswyddau pendant ar awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau'r gwerth gorau am arian wrth ddarparu a gwella'r gwasanaethau y maent yn gyfrifol amdanynt. I gefnogi hyn, rydym wedi darparu setliad teg a realistig mewn amgylchiadau ariannol anodd.

14:38 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you. I also want to ask a question on a matter that others, I think, have failed to get an adequate response to. One of the main strands of the case for change made by the Williams commission is the issue of value for money. The commission report argues that value for money, and economies of scale, can be achieved through sharing back-office functions, through collaboration, and, ultimately, through merging authorities. There are several options on the table. May I ask the Minister when the Welsh Government expects to bring forward its comprehensive opinion on the different options for local government structures, and whether or not you will bring forward a full value-for-money study of the implications of the different options?

Diolch. Rwyf hefyd am ofyn cwestiwn ar fater y mae eraill, credaf, wedi methu â chael ymateb digonol iddo. Un o brif elfennau'r achos dros newid a wnaed gan gomisiwn Williams yw gwerth am arian. Mae adroddiad y comisiwn yn dadlau y gellir cyflawni gwerth am arian, ac arbedion maint, drwy rannu swyddogaethau cefn swyddfa, drwy gydweithio, ac, yn y pen draw, drwy uno awdurdodau. Mae nifer o opsiynau ar y bwrdd. A gaf i ofyn i'r Gweinidog pryd y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn disgwyl cyflwyno ei barn gynhwysfawr ar y gwahanol opsiynau ar gyfer strwythurau llywodraeth leol, ac a fyddwch yn cyflwyno astudiaeth gwerth am arian llawn o oblygiadau'r gwahanol opsiynau?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:39 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

As a Welsh Government, we are looking at our response at the present time. We will bring it forward when we finish that, which I would imagine will be within the next couple of months.

Fel Llywodraeth Cymru, rydym yn ystyried ein hymateb ar hyn o bryd. Byddwn yn ei gyflwyno pan fyddwn yn gorffen y broses honno, yr wyf yn dychmygu a fydd o fewn yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:39 **Bethan Jenkins** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Weinidog, mae gennyf etholwr yn fy ardal i a oedd eisiau cael darn o dir yng Nghwm Nedd tua 10 mlynedd yn ôl er mwyn iddo adeiladu tŷ cynaliadwy, ac wedyn redeg busnes yn gwneud dodrefn cynaliadwy. Nid yw'r cwestiwn am y ffaith ei fod wedi cael ei wrthod gan y cyngor lleol, ond y ffaith ei fod e'n honni bod y cyngor lleol wedi defnyddio arian gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd oedd i fod ar gyfer ardaloedd y Cymoedd yng Nghastell-nedd ar gyfer ardaloedd coridor arfordirol. Gofynnaf felly os ydych chi fel Gweinidog yn edrych ar sut mae arian fel hyn yn cael ei brosesu a'i fonitro ar lefel llywodraeth leol.

Minister, I have a constituent in my area who wanted to find a piece of land in the Neath valley about 10 years ago in order to build a sustainable house and then run a business making sustainable furniture. The question is not about the fact that that was rejected by the local authority, but the fact that he alleges that the local authority used funding from the European Union that was meant to be for the Valleys areas in Neath for coastal corridor areas. So, I am asking, therefore, whether you, Minister, are looking at how funding such as this is processed and monitored at a local authority level.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:40 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Obviously, I cannot comment on that specific individual case, but that would be part of the monitoring process.

Yn amlwg, ni allaf roi sylwadau ar yr achos unigol penodol hwnnw, ond byddai hynny'n rhan o'r broses fonitro.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:40 **Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

As the Minister will know, the Williams proposals recommend a merger between Powys local health board and the local authority, which is intended to not only generate savings and cost-benefits, but improve the integration of public services. When I questioned you three weeks ago on the key challenges, namely financial and governance issues, you said that you were due to meet with the Minister for Health and Social Services to discuss this issue in more detail. Could you please provide an update of that meeting and what decisions were made?

Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, mae cynigion Williams yn argymhell uno bwrdd iechyd lleol Powys a'r awdurdod lleol, ac yn ogystal â chreu arbedion a buddiannau o ran costau, bwriedir i hyn hefyd wella'r broses o integreiddio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Pan holais i chi dair wythnos yn ôl ar yr heriau allweddol, sef materion ariannol a llywodraethu, dywedasoed eich bod ar fin cwrrd â'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i drafod y mater hwn yn fanylach. A fydddech cystal â rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cyfarfod hwnnw a pha benderfyniadau a wnaed?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

- 14:41 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I cannot provide an update at the current time. We know that there are significant issues of finance and governance that need to be considered in detail before we respond to that recommendation and those discussions are ongoing.
- Ni allaf roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ar hyn o bryd. Gwyddom fod materion pwysig y mae angen eu hystyried yn fanwl o ran cyllid a llywodraethu, cyn inni ymateb i'r argymhelliad hwnnw ac mae'r trafodaethau hynny'n parhau.
- 14:41 **Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- What discussions has the Welsh Government had with the Wales Council for Voluntary Action regarding its report on citizen-directed support for vulnerable groups, which highlighted scope for local authorities, health boards and the third sector to work much more imaginatively to develop better services that are closer to the people, more responsive to needs, and that add value for money by drawing on community resources?
- Pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u cael gyda Chyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru ynghylch ei adroddiad ar gymorth a gyfarwyddir gan ddinasyddion ar gyfer grwpiau sy'n agored i niwed, a dynnodd sylw at y cyfle a geir i awdurdodau lleol, byrddau iechyd a'r trydydd sector weithio'n llawer mwy dychmygus i ddatblygu gwasanaethau gwell sy'n agosach at y bobl, yn fwy ymatebol i anghenion, ac sy'n ychwanegu gwerth am arian drwy ddefnyddio adnoddau cymunedol?
- 14:41 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I cannot answer the Member's question about all Ministers' meetings with the WCVA. I have certainly met with the third sector to discuss the issues you mention. It is absolutely vital that we do get value for money, which is not just about operational savings, but about added value benefits, if you like, community benefits, which, obviously, the third sector has a role to play in.
- Ni allaf ateb cwestiwn yr Aelod am gyfarfodydd pob Gweinidog gyda CGGC. Rwy'n sicr wedi cwrrdd â'r trydydd sector i drafod y materion y soniwyd amdanynt. Mae'n gwbl hanfodol ein bod yn cael gwerth am arian, sy'n ymwneud â mwy nag arbedion gweithredol, ond â buddiannau gwerth ychwanegol, neu fanteision cymunedol os dymunwch, y mae gan y trydydd sector ran i'w chwarae ynddo, yn amlwg.

## Anffurfio Organau Rhywiol Menywod

## Female Genital Mutilation

- 14:42 **Jenny Rathbone** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- 7. Pa gamau y gall Llywodraeth Cymru eu cymryd i ddiogelu merched rhag anffurfio organau rhywiol menywod? OAQ(4)0380(LG)*
- 7. What action can the Welsh Government take to protect girls from Female Genital Mutilation? OAQ(4)0380(LG)*
- 14:42 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- The Welsh Government is working with partner organisations to support survivors of this serious crime and to make Wales a place where female genital mutilation is not tolerated. FGM is a horrific form of abuse that has devastating consequences for girls and women.
- Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gweithio gyda sefydliadau partner i gefnogi goroeswyr y drosedd ddifrifol hon ac i sicrhau bod Cymru yn wlad nad yw'n goddef anffurfio organau rhywiol menywod. Mae hwn yn fath erchyll o gam-drin sy'n cael effaith aruthrol ar ferched a menywod.
- 14:42 **Jenny Rathbone** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, people have been campaigning in this country for nearly 90 years to outlaw this process. At that time, it happened abroad. Now that there are many more people moving around the world, the latest report estimates that 65,000 girls currently living in the UK are at risk of female genital mutilation. That would equate to over 3,000 girls in Wales. What can be done to ensure that those who are best able to protect them, that is, people who work in schools and youth clubs, are in a position to identify when a girl is at risk, and what can the Government do to ensure that the training is there so that people who work in schools are aware of these issues and how to look out for them? It is always the families who are organising it.
- Weinidog, mae pobl wedi bod yn ymgyrchu yn y wlad hon ers bron i 90 mlynedd i wahardd y broses hon. Ar y pryd, dramor yr oedd yn digwydd. Nawr bod llawer mwy o bobl yn symud o gwmpas y byd, mae'r adroddiad diweddaraf yn amcangyfrif bod anffurfio organau rhywiol menywod yn risg sy'n wynebu 65,000 o ferched sy'n byw yn y DU ar hyn o bryd. Byddai hynny'n cyfateb i fwy na 3,000 o ferched yng Nghymru. Beth y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau bod y rhai sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i'w diogelu, hynny yw, pobl sy'n gweithio mewn ysgolion a chlybiau ieuencid, mewn sefyllfa i nodi pan fydd merch mewn perygl, a beth y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud i sicrhau bod yr hyfforddiant yno er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl sy'n gweithio mewn ysgolion yn ymwybodol o'r materion hyn a sut i edrych allan amdanynt? Y teuluoedd sy'n trefnu hyn bob amser.

14:43

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Supporting front-line professionals in identifying and intervening to protect girls at risk of FGM requires leadership across all relevant agencies. You mentioned education in particular; I am meeting the Minister for Education and Skills later this afternoon to discuss that issue, and I have also written recently to the Minister for Health and Social Services about the matter. As a Government, we are providing leadership and policy support to the all-Wales FGM health and safeguarding forum, which is made up of professionals from health, education and other public services and non-governmental organisations.

Er mwyn cefnogi gweithwyr rheng flaen proffesiynol i nodi ac ymyrryd er mwyn diogelu merched y mae anffurfio organau rhywiol menywod yn risg sy'n eu hwynebu, mae gofyn am arweinyddiaeth ar draws yr holl asiantaethau perthnasol. Soniasoch am addysg yn benodol; rwy'n cyfarfod â'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau nes ymlaen y prynhawn yma i drafod y mater hwnnw, ac rwyf hefyd wedi ysgrifennu yn ddiweddar at y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghylch y mater. Fel Llywodraeth, rydym yn rhoi arweiniad a chefnogaeth polisi i'r fforwm iechyd a diogelu ar anffurfio organau rhywiol menywod, sy'n cynnwys gweithwyr proffesiynol o'r gwasanaethau iechyd, addysg a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill a sefydliadau anllywodraethol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:44

**William Graham** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

You will know that FGM has been a criminal offence in the United Kingdom for nearly 30 years. Yet, I cannot find a single trace of a prosecution. I note that, in September 2013, the Crown Prosecution Service was considering whether to bring charges in five cases. As the Minister will know, this is an assault on a young child using physical force, it is a violation of a child's rights, it is a serious crime and it is condemned worldwide. It has no religious obligation; it is the relic of the slave trade and has no presence in a modern Wales. May I ask the Minister to redouble her efforts with her counterpart in the United Kingdom Government to prevent this abuse?

Gwyddoch fod anffurfio organau rhywiol menywod wedi bod yn drosedd yn y Deyrnas Unedig ers bron i 30 mlynedd. Eto i gyd, ni welaf arwydd o erlyn unrhyw un. Nodaf, ym mis Medi 2013, fod Gwasanaeth Erlyn y Goron yn ystyried a ddylid dwyn cyhuddiadau mewn pum achos. Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, ymosodiad yw hwn ar blentyn ifanc gan ddefnyddio grym corfforol, sy'n groes i hawliau plentyn, yn drosedd ddifrifol a gaiff ei chondemnio ledled y byd. Nid oes ganddo unrhyw rwymedigaeth grefyddol; rhywbeth sydd wedi goroesi o'r fasnach gaethweision ydyw ac nid oes lle iddo yn y Gymru fodern. A gaf i ofyn i'r Gweinidog ddyblu ei hymdrechion gyda'i Gweinidog cyfatebol yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i atal y cam-drin hwn?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:44

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yes, I think it is very disappointing that there have been no prosecutions since legislation was put in place to make FGM a crime back in 1985. Our priority must be to prevent this crime from occurring in the first place. I was very pleased that the International Day of Zero Tolerance to Female Genital Mutilation was held recently on 6 February. Stephen Chapman, the Welsh anti-slavery co-ordinator, found out that nothing was occurring across the UK in relation to this day, so we organised a conference here in Cardiff, the only place in the UK that recognised it. We had over 100 practitioners there, and that was a point that was raised. It is certainly something that we need to continue to raise with practitioners so that we can stop this terrible crime occurring, as you say.

Mae'n siomedig iawn na fu unrhyw erlyniadau ers creu'r ddeddfwriaeth i wneud anffurfio organau rhywiol menywod yn drosedd yn ôl yn 1985. Rhaid inni roi blaenoriaeth i atal y troseddau hyn rhag digwydd yn y lle cyntaf. Roeddwn yn falch iawn bod y Diwrnod Rhyngwladol Dim Goddefgarwch i Anffurfio Organau Rhywiol Menywod wedi cael ei gynnal yn ddiweddar ar 6 Chwefror. Canfu Stephen Chapman, y cydgysylltydd gwrth-gaethwasiaeth yng Nghymru, nad oedd unrhyw beth yn digwydd ar draws y DU mewn perthynas â'r diwrnod hwn, felly gwnaethom drefnu cynhadledd yma yng Nghaerdydd, yr unig le yn y DU a nododd y diwrnod. Daeth dros 100 o ymarferwyr i'r gynhadledd, ac roedd hwnnw'n bwynt a godwyd. Mae'n sicr yn rhywbeth y mae angen inni barhau i'w godi ag ymarferwyr er mwyn rhoi diwedd ar y drosedd ofnadwy hon, fel y dywedwch.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Goleuo Strydoedd Preswyl

## Residential Street Lighting

14:45

**Bethan Jenkins** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*8. Pa gyngor y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ei roi i awdurdodau lleol ynghylch lleihau lefelau goleuo strydoedd preswyl fel mesur i arbed arian?*  
OAQ(4)0390(LG)

*8. What advice has the Welsh Government issued to local authorities regarding the reduction of residential street lighting levels as a cost saving measure?* OAQ(4)0390(LG)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)



14:45	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>It is for each local authority to decide its approach to residential street lighting, having regard to its statutory responsibilities towards the safety of communities.</p>	<p>Mater i bob awdurdod lleol yw penderfynu ar ei ddull o oleuo strydoedd preswyl, gan ystyried ei gyfrifoldebau statudol tuag at ddiogelwch cymunedau.</p>
14:46	<b>Bethan Jenkins</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Diolch am yr ateb. Mae lot o bobl leol yn dangos consyrn mawr ynglŷn â'r toriadau sy'n cael eu gwneud, nid yn unig o ran ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a diogelwch personol, ond hefyd o ran cynorthwyo traffig yn yr ardal. A fyddai modd i chi edrych a oes ffyrdd mwy cost-effeithiol o roi goleuadau yn ein cymunedau lleol mewn ardaloedd lle mae problemau, megis y rhai yr wyf wedi eu tanlinellu eisoes?</p>	<p>Thank you for that answer. A lot of people locally are showing a great deal of concern about the cuts that are being made, not only in terms of anti-social behaviour and personal safety, but in terms of supporting traffic in the area as well. Will you look at whether there are more cost-effective ways of lighting our local communities in areas where there are problems, such as those that I have previously outlined?</p>
14:46	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>That is for each local authority to decide; it is up to them whether they switch the lights off or whether they dim the lights. However, they need to ensure that there is sufficient street lighting in sensitive areas, particularly those covered by closed-circuit television cameras, pedestrian and zebra crossings and where there are known anti-social behaviour problems.</p>	<p>Mater i bob awdurdod lleol yw penderfynu ar hynny; eu penderfyniad hwy yw a ydynt am ddiffodd y goleuadau neu eu pylu. Fodd bynnag, mae angen iddynt sicrhau bod digon o oleuadau stryd mewn ardaloedd sensitif, yn enwedig y rhai a gwmpesir gan gamerâu teledu cylch cyfng, croesfannau cerddwyr a sebra a lle y gwyddys bod problemau ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.</p>
14:47	<b>Byron Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Minister, leading on from the answer that you just gave, in most people's minds there is a simple and direct relationship between a lack of street lighting and crime. Better lighting will deter offenders who benefit from the cover of darkness. This is even more true when you talk about reassurance and tackling the fear of crime. Will you outline what research you have undertaken to look at the impact of reducing street lighting on the accessibility of areas and crime levels?</p>	<p>Weinidog, yn dilyn yr ateb yr ydych newydd ei roi, ym meddyliau'r rhan fwyaf o bobl mae perthynas syml ac uniongyrchol rhwng diffyg goleuadau stryd a throedd. Bydd goleuadau gwell yn atal troseddwr sy'n manteisio ar y tywyllwch. Mae hyn hyd yn oed yn fwy gwir pan sonnir am dawelu meddyliau a mynd i'r afael ag ofn troseddau. A amlinellwch pa ymchwiliad yr ydych wedi ei chynnal i edrych ar effaith lleihau goleuadau stryd ar hygyrchedd ardaloedd a lefelau troseddu?</p>
14:47	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I have not undertaken any research into that area, but I would hope that if a local authority was proposing to do that, it would do so, and that it would also have proper engagement and consultation with local residents before any decisions were made.</p>	<p>Nid wyf wedi cynnal unrhyw ymchwiliad yn y maes hwnnw, ond byddwn yn gobeithio, pe byddai awdurdod lleol yn bwriadu gwneud hynny, y byddai'n cynnal ymchwiliad, ac y byddai hefyd yn ymgysylltu ac yn ymgynghori'n briodol â thrigolion lleol cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniadau.</p>
	<b>Pwysau Ariannol</b>	<b>Financial Pressures</b>
14:47	<b>Elin Jones</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p><i>10. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael ynglŷn â phwysau ariannol ar awdurdodau lleol gwledig? OAQ(4)0386(LG)</i></p>	<p><i>10. What discussions has the Minister had regarding financial pressures on rural local authorities? OAQ(4)0386(LG)</i></p>
14:47	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>I hold regular discussions with council leaders, including those from rural authorities, on a range of financial matters.</p>	<p>Rwy'n cynnal trafodaethau rheolaidd gydag arweinwyr cyngor, gan gynnwys y rhai o awdurdodau gwledig, ar ystod o faterion ariannol.</p>

14:48

**Elin Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Weinidog, mae Cyngor Sir Ceredigion yn wynebu un o'r toriadau canran uchaf yng Nghymru, a byddwch yn gwybod bod costau ychwanegol i'r cyngor hwnnw yn dilyn y stormydd diweddar. Ar ben hyn i gyd, mae'r cyngor yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd o uno, yn dilyn Williams, gyda chynghorau sir Benfro a sir Gâr—dau gyngor sydd â phroblemau arweinyddiaeth difrifol iawn, fel y clywsom eisoes y prynhawn yma, a phroblemau hefyd gydag ansawdd rhai o'u gwasanaethau. Felly, yn gyntaf, Weinidog, a wnewch chi longyfarch Cyngor Sir Ceredigion, yng nghanol hyn i gyd, ar ei ddyfarnu yr unig gyngor sir yng Nghymru gyda gwasanaeth addysg ardderchog? Yn ail, a wnewch awgrymu i mi sut y gellid perswadio pobl Ceredigion bod uno gyda dau gyngor sir fel Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin a Chyngor Sir Penfro mewn unrhyw ffordd yn gam ymlaen iddynt?

Minister, Ceredigion County Council is facing one of the highest percentage cuts in Wales, and you will know that there are additional costs to the council following the recent storms. On top of all of this, the council is facing the possibility of merging, following Williams, with Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire councils—two councils that have very serious leadership problems, as we have already heard this afternoon, and problems in terms of the quality of some of their services as well. Therefore, Minister, will you, first, congratulate Ceredigion County Council on being judged, in the middle all of this, the only county council in Wales with an excellent education service? Secondly, will you suggest to me how the people of Ceredigion could be persuaded that merging with two councils such as Carmarthenshire County Council and Pembrokeshire County Council would, in any way, be a step forward for them?

14:48

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I am very happy to congratulate Ceredigion County Council on an excellent education report, and I referred to it in my meeting with Welsh Local Government Association leaders. You will know how keen I have been to champion best practice, and they can look to Ceredigion in relation to that.

Rwy'n hapus iawn i longyfarch Cyngor Sir Ceredigion ar adroddiad addysg rhagorol, a chyfeiriais ato yn fy nghyfarfod ag arweinwyr Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Byddwch yn gwybod pa mor awyddus y bûm i hyrwyddo arfer gorau, a gallant edrych ar Geredigion mewn perthynas â hynny.

In relation to your question about a merger, a consultation will have to be undertaken with Ceredigion and the local authorities to which you referred.

Mewn perthynas â'ch cwestiwn am uno, bydd yn rhaid cynnal ymgynghoriad â Ceredigion a'r awdurdodau lleol y cyfeiriasoch atynt.

14:49

**Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Minister, you will be aware that rural communities and rural local authorities have a challenge in terms of being able to provide public services because of the sparsity of the population very often. What consideration have you given as Minister to looking at the local government revenue support grant formula to ensure that rural communities get the spending that they need to maintain those public services at a level that is acceptable?

Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod cymunedau gwledig ac awdurdodau lleol gwledig yn wynebu her o ran gallu darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus oherwydd prinder y boblogaeth yn aml iawn. Pa ystyriaeth yr ydych wedi'i rhoi fel Gweinidog i edrych ar fformiwla grant cynnal refeniw llywodraeth leol er mwyn sicrhau bod cymunedau gwledig yn cael y gwariant sydd ei angen arnynt i gynnal y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hynny ar lefel sy'n dderbyniol?

14:49

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

The additional cost of providing services in rural areas is accounted for by incorporating measures of population dispersion and sparsity into the formula. You will be aware that the local government settlement is distributed according to a formula based on relative need. The formula is developed in partnership with local government each year through the distribution sub-group; it has a role to play in this. That is what we do to ensure that that happens.

Cwmpesir cost ychwanegol darparu gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig drwy ymgorffori mesurau gwasgariad a phrinder poblogaeth yn y fformiwla. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y setliad llywodraeth leol yn cael ei ddosbarthu gan ddilyn fformiwla sy'n seiliedig ar angen cymharol. Datblygir y fformiwla mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol bob blwyddyn drwy'r is-grŵp dosbarthu; mae ganddo rôl i'w chwarae yn hyn o beth. Dyna beth a wnawn i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

14:50

**Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, Powys County Council is one of those rural authorities where the nature of the formula and the vagaries of moving from hypothecated ring-fenced funding for some grants into the general revenue support grant can lead to significant problems. Would you agree with me that, whatever those problems are, the council has to deal appropriately with its citizens? Yesterday, the cabinet of Powys County Council agreed to the closure of all the additional learning needs centres throughout the county, despite the fact that there is an ongoing consultation being conducted by the education department, which will run to the middle of March. How can a local authority cabinet make a decision to cut services on one day when its own local authority is consulting on the very same proposals with the parents of our most vulnerable children, who are set to be affected by those changes?

Weinidog, mae Cyngor Sir Powys yn un o'r awdurdodau gwledig hynny lle gall natur y fformiwla a'r amrywiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â symud oddi wrth arian wedi'i glustnodi a'i neilltuo ar gyfer rhai grantiau i'r grant cynnal refeniw cyffredinol arwain at broblemau sylweddol. A fydddech yn cytuno â mi, beth bynnag fo'r problemau hynny, bod yn rhaid i'r cyngor ymdrin yn briodol â'i ddinasyddion? Ddoe, cytunodd cabinet Cyngor Sir Powys i gau'r holl ganolfannau anghenion dysgu ychwanegol ledled y sir, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod ymgynghoriad parhaus yn cael ei gynnal gan yr adran addysg, a fydd yn rhedeg hyd at ganol mis Mawrth. Sut y gall cabinet awdurdod lleol benderfynu torri ar wasanaethau ar yr un diwrnod ag y bydd ei awdurdod lleol ei hun yn ymgynghori ar yr union gynigion hynny gyda rhieni ein plant sydd fwyaf agored i niwed, y mae'n debygol y bydd y newidiadau hynny yn effeithio arnynt?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:51

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

That is certainly very disappointing to hear; just salami-slicing an entire service and not waiting for the consultation. I always think that consultation should be meaningful, and clearly that has not been the case in Powys. That is very disappointing to hear.

Mae hynny'n sicr yn siomedig iawn i glywed; sef cyflwyno toriadau tameidiog i wasanaeth cyfan heb aros am yr ymgynghoriad. Credaf bob amser y dylai prosesau ymgynghori fod yn ystyrlon, ac yn amlwg nid yw hynny wedi bod yn wir ym Mhowys. Mae hynny'n siomedig iawn i glywed.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

## Ad-drefnu Llywodraeth Leol

## Local Government Reorganisation

14:51

**Leighton Andrews** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*11. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol? OAQ(4)0377(LG)*

*11. Will the Minister make a statement on local government reorganisation? OAQ(4)0377(LG)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:51

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The recent report of the Commission on Public Service Governance and Delivery proposes the merger of existing local authorities, not reorganisation. The Welsh Government is considering the commission's proposals and will respond in due course.

Mae adroddiad diweddar y Comisiwn ar Lywodraethu a Darparu Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn cynnig mai uno awdurdodau lleol sy'n bodoli eisoes, nid ad-drefnu y dylid ei wneud. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried cynigion y comisiwn a bydd yn ymateb maes o law.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:51

**Leighton Andrews** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I was encouraged that, earlier this afternoon, the Minister said she was open to looking at the role of the cabinet structure within local government. Can I encourage her to do that? Can I also encourage her to look at the councillors' code of conduct and, in particular, the application of the predetermination rule, which, in some circumstances, may be being abused by council cabinets and their bureaucracies?

Roeddwn yn falch, yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, i'r Gweinidog ddweud ei bod yn barod i edrych ar rôl y strwythur cabinet o fewn llywodraeth leol. A allaf ei hannog i wneud hynny? A allaf hefyd ei hannog i edrych ar god ymddygiad cynghorwyr ac, yn benodol, y modd y cymhwysir y rheol rhagderfynu, y gall fod yn cael ei thorri gan gabinetau cyngor a'u prosesau biwrocraidd mewn rhai amgylchiadau?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:52

**Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yes. I mentioned in an earlier answer that the code of conduct does not prevent members from raising issues that are of concern to them or their constituents. I have asked my officials to review the code of conduct and I will certainly ask them to take that point into consideration.

Cewch. Soniais mewn ateb cynharach nad oedd y cod ymddygiad yn atal aelodau rhag codi materion sydd o bryder iddynt hwy neu eu hetholwyr. Rwyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion adolygu'r cod ymddygiad a byddaf yn sicr yn gofyn iddynt ystyried y pwynt hwnnw.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:52	<b>Andrew R.T. Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Minister, with the proposed actions of the Williams commission, if put into action, there is the risk, in my view, that large rural areas will be taken into the urban conurbations that we have here in south Wales, such as Cardiff and Newport. Do you not see that risk? Do you think that it is important that the integrity of the large urban areas is maintained and that the rural areas do not suffer a big impact by having a democratic deficit by having greater urban representation, rather than rural representation in larger authorities?</p>	<p>Weinidog, o ran camau gweithredu arfaethedig comisiwn Williams, os cânt eu rhoi ar waith, mae perygl, yn fy marn i, y caiff ardaloedd gwledig mawr eu cynnwys o fewn y cytreff trefol sydd gennym yma yn y de, fel Caerdydd a Chasnewydd. Oni welwch y perygl hwnnw? A gredwch ei bod yn bwysig bod cyfanwydd yr ardaloedd trefol mawr yn cael ei gynnal ac na fydd y diffyg democrataidd a ddaw yn sgil cael mwy o gynrychiolaeth drefol, yn hytrach na chynrychiolaeth wledig mewn awdurdodau mwy, yn cael effaith fawr ar yr ardaloedd gwledig?</p>
14:53	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>No. What I see is an opportunity to really seize this chance to improve local authority governance and to improve how our public services are delivered. I hope that Members will see that, too.</p>	<p>Na. Yr hyn a welaf yw cyfle i achub go iawn ar y cyfle hwn i wella prosesau llywodraethu awdurdodau lleol ac i wella'r ffordd y darperir ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd yr Aelodau'n gweld hynny, hefyd.</p>
	<b>Gwell Gwasanaethau</b>	<b>Improved Services</b>
14:53	<b>Eluned Parrott</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p><i>12. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i sicrhau bod cynghorau lleol yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau dros y blynyddoedd nesaf? OAQ(4)0387(LG)</i></p>	<p><i>12. What plans does the Minister have to ensure that local councils work together to deliver improved services over the next few years? OAQ(4)0387(LG)</i></p>
14:53	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>The Welsh Government has a comprehensive programme, supporting and encouraging collaboration between public service partners. We expect local authorities to work together and with other public services across Wales to protect and improve their services.</p>	<p>Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru raglen gynhwysfawr, yn cefnogi ac annog cydweithredu rhwng partneriaid gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Rydym yn disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol weithio gyda'i gilydd a gyda gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill ledled Cymru er mwyn amddiffyn a gwella eu gwasanaethau.</p>
14:53	<b>Eluned Parrott</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>Thank you for that answer, Minister. Transport is an area where local authorities may have to collaborate in new ways following the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport's recent withdrawal of funding from the regional transport consortia in favour of a more direct funding mechanism. What discussions has the Minister had with local authorities outside the city regions to encourage joined-up transport planning, now that this funding is going directly to them?</p>	<p>Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae trafniadaeth yn faes lle y gallai fod yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol gydweithredu mewn ffyrdd newydd ar ôl i Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth dynnu arian yn ôl yn ddiweddar o'r consortia trafniadaeth rhanbarthol o blaid dull ariannu mwy uniongyrchol. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ag awdurdodau lleol y tu allan i'r dinas-ranbarthau er mwyn hyrwyddo prosesau cynllunio trafniadaeth cydgysylltiedig, nawr bod yr arian hwn yn mynd yn uniongyrchol iddynt hwy?</p>
14:54	<b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a>	<a href="#">Senedd.tv</a> <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a>
	<p>That would be a question for the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport.</p>	<p>Cwestiwn i Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth fyddai hwnnw.</p>

14:54 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Minister, as well as local authority collaboration, Ministers routinely talk up the role of partnerships between local authorities and the third sector in improving the delivery of services. However, when local authorities act as banker and lead partner in those arrangements, third sector organisations can be wary of challenging their decisions for fear of losing funding in the future. How can the Welsh Government help secure a fair balance of power in those partnership arrangements?

Weinidog, yn ogystal â chydweithio ag awdurdodau lleol, mae Gweinidogion yn aml yn canmol rôl partneriaethau rhwng awdurdodau lleol a'r trydydd sector wrth wella'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd awdurdodau lleol yn gweithredu fel bancwr a phartner arweiniol yn y trefniadau hynny, gall mudiadau trydydd sector fod ofn herio eu penderfyniadau rhag ofn iddynt gollu cyllid yn y dyfodol. Sut y gall Llywodraeth Cymru helpu i sicrhau cydbwysedd teg o rym yn y trefniadau partneriaeth hynny?

14:54 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

That is very disappointing to hear and it is certainly not my understanding of the situation. If there is anything specific that you would like to raise with me on that, I would be very happy to look into it.

Mae hynny'n siomedig iawn i'w glywed ac yn sicr, nid dyna fy nealltwriaeth i o'r sefyllfa. Os oes unrhyw beth penodol y bydddech yn hoffi ei godi â mi o ran hynny, byddwn yn hapus iawn i edrych i mewn iddo.

### Cydweithio mewn Llywodraeth Leol

### Local Government Collaboration

14:54 **Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*13. A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu cymorth Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer cydweithio mewn llywodraeth leol? OAQ(4)0378(LG)*

*13. Will the Minister outline Welsh Government support for local government collaboration? OAQ(4)0378(LG)*

14:55 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

The Welsh Government has a comprehensive programme to support and encourage collaboration between public service partners, including local government.

Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru raglen gynhwysfawr i gefnogi ac annog cydweithredu rhwng partneriaid gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys llywodraeth leol.

14:55 **Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

In the context of the Williams commission recommendations, how do you respond to the evidence from Joe Simpson, the author of the Simpson review of local government commissioned by the Welsh Government, to the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee inquiry into local government collaboration that,

Yng nghyd-destun argymhellion comisiwn Williams, sut rydych yn ymateb i'r dystiolaeth gan Joe Simpson, awdur adolygiad Simpson o lywodraeth leol a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru, i ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Cymunedau, Cydraddoldeb a Llywodraeth Leol ar gydweithredu mewn llywodraeth leol sy'n nodi,

'What there is not is a right size for everything'

Nad oes un ateb sy'n briodol i bopeth

and that he did not believe that reorganisation was the answer, suggesting that the solution lay in authorities combining and collaborating but that you cannot just do it by prescription?

ac nad oedd yn credu mai ad-drefnu oedd yr ateb, sy'n awgrymu mai'r ateb yw bod awdurdodau yn cyfuno ac yn cydweithredu ond na ellir eu gorchymyn i wneud hynny?

14:55	<p><b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Well, he is obviously entitled to his opinion. The Simpson report is something that I have read since I have had this portfolio. We have done everything we can to encourage collaboration. We still need to see collaboration as we go forward, along with best practice. Again, I have championed best practice since I have had this portfolio. I think it is really important that, as a Government, we set a very clear direction for collaboration. We have established the collaborative footprint for regional service delivery and I have made it very clear to local authorities that, in a difficult financial situation, it is even more important that the collaboration works.</p>	<p>Wel, yn amlwg, mae ganddo hawl i'w farn. Mae adroddiad Simpson yn rhywbeth yr wyf wedi ei ddarllen ers imi gael y portffolio hwn. Rydym wedi gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i annog cydweithrediad. Mae angen inni barhau i well cydweithrediad wrth inni symud ymlaen, ynghyd ag arfer gorau. Unwaith eto, yr wyf wedi hyrwyddo arfer gorau ers imi gael y portffolio hwn. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn ein bod, fel Llywodraeth, yn gosod cyfeiriad clir iawn ar gyfer cydweithredu. Rydym wedi sefydlu'r ôl-troed cydweithredu ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau rhanbarthol ac rwyf wedi egluro i awdurdodau lleol, mewn sefyllfa ariannol anodd, ei bod hyd yn oed yn bwysicach bod y cydweithredu yn gweithio.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
<b>Awdurdodau Lleol Gwledig</b>		<b>Rural Local Authorities</b>	
14:56	<p><b>William Powell</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p><i>14. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y materion sy'n wynebu awdurdodau lleol gwledig yng Nghymru OAQ(4)0388(LG)</i></p>	<p><i>14. Will the Minister make a statement on the issues facing rural local authorities in Wales? OAQ(4)0388(LG)</i></p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:56	<p><b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>All local authorities in Wales face challenges reflecting their own particular characteristics and circumstances.</p>	<p>Mae pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn wynebu heriau sy'n adlewyrchu eu nodweddion a'u hamgylchiadau penodol eu hunain.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:56	<p><b>William Powell</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Minister, I would like to thank you very much for that answer. Public toilets might not be a particularly glamorous topic, but, nonetheless, they provide a very important public service in ensuring the maintenance of public health but also in providing the appropriate backdrop for a growing tourist economy. In that context, Minister, will you please outline what steps the Welsh Government is prepared to take to promote a partnership approach between local authorities, town and community councils and, crucially, the third sector and the business community to make that network of toilets robust in times to come?</p>	<p>Weinidog, hoffwn ddiolch yn fawr ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. Efallai nad yw toiledau cyhoeddus yn bwnc arbennig o ddeniadol, ond, serch hynny, maent yn darparu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus pwysig iawn o ran sicrhau y cynhelir iechyd y cyhoedd, ond hefyd o ran rhoi'r cefndir priodol ar gyfer economi twristiaeth sy'n tyfu. Yn y cyddestun hwnnw, Weinidog, a wnewch chi amlinellu pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn barod i'w cymryd i hyrwyddo dull o weithio mewn partneriaeth rhwng awdurdodau lleol, cynghorau tref a chymuned ac, yn hollbwysig, y trydydd sector a'r gymuned fusnes er mwyn sicrhau bod y rhwydwaith hwnnw o doiledau yn gadarn yn y dyfodol?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:57	<p><b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>You raise a very important point. Public toilets are very important. For so many people, whether they can even leave the house is a decision they have to make on the basis of whether they know there is a public toilet that they can access. What is really important is that we have that partnership approach between all our public services. I have had discussions with the Minister for Health and Social Services because I know that he is looking at innovative ways of making other public toilets available. For example, if there is a public toilet in the library, people need to realise that they do not need to use the library to use the toilet. There should be a very clear sign that that is not necessarily the case.</p>	<p>Rydych yn codi mater pwysig iawn. Mae toiledau cyhoeddus yn bwysig iawn. I gynifer o bobl, mae p'un a allant hyd yn oed adael y tŷ yn benderfyniad y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei wneud gan ystyried a ydynt yn gwybod bod toiled cyhoeddus ar gael iddynt. Yr hyn sy'n wirioneddol bwysig yw bod gennym y dull partneriaeth hwnnw rhwng ein holl wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Rwyf wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol oherwydd fy mod yn gwybod ei fod yn edrych ar ffyrdd arloesol o sicrhau bod toiledau cyhoeddus eraill ar gael. Er enghraifft, os oes toiled cyhoeddus yn y llyfrgell, mae angen i bobl sylweddoli nad oes angen iddynt ddefnyddio'r llyfrgell er mwyn defnyddio'r toiled. Dylai fod arwydd clir iawn nad yw hynny'n wir o reidrydd.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>



14:57	<p><b>Russell George</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>The delivery of the UK Government's mobile infrastructure project in Wales is clearly going to make a significant contribution to reducing complete notspots in rural Wales. Arqiva is delivering the project, and it has told Assembly Members that the success of this project is down to local authorities' co-operation with the company to assist in areas of land acquisition and planning. What is the Welsh Government is doing to encourage local authorities to engage with Arqiva and to facilitate good working relations? What can you do as the Minister if councils fail to co-operate?</p>	<p>Mae'n amlwg y bydd cyflwyno prosiect seilwaith symudol Llywodraeth y DU yng Nghymru yn gwneud cyfraniad mawr at leihau mannau cwbl wan yng Nghymru wledig. Arqiva sy'n cyflwyno'r prosiect, ac mae wedi dweud wrth Aelodau'r Cynulliad y gellir priodoli llwyddiant y prosiect hwn i gydweithrediad awdurdodau lleol gyda'r cwmni er mwyn cynorthwyo ym meysydd caffael tir a chynllunio. Beth mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i annog awdurdodau lleol i ymgysylltu ag Arqiva ac i hwyluso cydberthynas waith dda? Beth allwch chi ei wneud fel y Gweinidog os bydd cynghorau yn methu â chydweithredu?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:58	<p><b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>I know that my colleague the Deputy Minister for Skills and Technology, who has responsibility for this, is having discussions with local authorities.</p>	<p>Gwn fod fy nghydwethiwr, y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau a Thechnoleg, sydd â chyfrifoldeb am hyn, yn cael trafodaethau ag awdurdodau lleol.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
<p><b>Darlledu Trafodion Awdurdodau Lleol Cymru</b></p>		<p><b>Broadcasting Welsh Local Authority Proceedings</b></p>	
14:58	<p><b>William Powell</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p><i>15. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ddarlledu trafodion awdurdodau lleol Cymru yn fyw ar y we? OAQ(4)0389(LG)</i></p>	<p><i>15. Will the Minister provide an update on the live internet broadcasting of Welsh local authority proceedings? OAQ(4)0389(LG)</i></p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:58	<p><b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Nine local authorities plus the Brecon Beacons National Park Authority now broadcast their meetings. Newport City Council is due to start during the coming quarter.</p>	<p>Mae naw awdurdod lleol yn ogystal ag Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog bellach yn darlledu eu cyfarfodydd. Bydd Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd yn dechrau yn ystod y chwarter nesaf.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:58	<p><b>William Powell</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Minister, I would like to thank you very much for that response. I think that we are all aware of the current difficulties that surround Carmarthenshire County Council, but I wonder whether you agree with me that it is making some positive steps in the direction of openness and transparency with regard to its meetings by webcasting its budget meeting today. My own home local authority of Powys County Council is doing the same next Tuesday. In that context, Minister, will you outline, please, what can be done to share their good practice and to encourage the development of a much more open approach to local government meetings throughout the whole of this country?</p>	<p>Weinidog, hoffwn ddiolch yn fawr iawn ichi am yr ymateb hwnnw. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn ymwybodol o anawsterau presennol Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, ond tybed a gytunwch â mi ei fod yn cymryd camau cadarnhaol tuag at fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw o ran ei gyfarfodydd drwy we-ddarlledu ei gyfarfod cyllideb heddiw. Bydd fy awdurdod lleol i gartref sef Cyngor Sir Powys yn gwneud yr un peth ddydd Mawrth nesaf. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, Weinidog, a amlinellwch, os gwelwch yn dda, beth y gellir ei wneud i rannu eu harfer da ac i annog y gwaith o ddatblygu dull llawer mwy agored o gynnal cyfarfodydd llywodraeth leol ledled y wlad hon?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:59	<p><b>Lesley Griffiths</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>It is very pleasing to see local authorities broadcasting their meetings. You will be aware that the Welsh Government announced £1.25 million of funding to councils to ensure that democracy becomes much more open and transparent. I am very pleased that it will soon be half of Welsh councils that are broadcasting their meetings. That compares with only 20% in England, so I think that that is a good start. I want to see all 22 doing it—although there is one local authority that does not wish to do it at the moment. So, I want to see the other 21 doing it in the very near future and I am sure that that will be the case.</p>	<p>Mae'n braf iawn gweld awdurdodau lleol yn darlledu eu cyfarfodydd. Byddwch yn ymwybodol i Lywodraeth Cymru gyhoeddi £1.25 miliwn o gyllid i gynghorau er mwyn sicrhau bod democratiaeth yn dod yn llawer mwy agored a thryloyw. Rwy'n falch iawn y bydd hanner y cynghorau yng Nghymru yn darlledu eu cyfarfodydd cyn hir. Mae hynny'n cymharu â dim ond 20% yn Lloegr, felly credaf ei fod yn ddechrau da. Rwyf am weld pob un o'r 22 yn gwneud hynny—er bod un awdurdod lleol nad yw'n dymuno gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Felly, rwyf am weld y 21 arall yn ei wneud yn y dyfodol agos iawn, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd hynny'n digwydd.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

15:00 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo Video](#)

Minister, you might remember my support for citizen broadcasting of council proceedings, and I am pleased that some councils are looking at in-house broadcasting of those proceedings. That, of course, will always have cost implications, but I am sure that you will agree that that was not the green light for extravagance. The preparatory work to allow the City and County of Swansea to stream its meetings has already cost in excess of £0.5 million at a time when residents are looking at a 5% council tax rise. How are you ensuring value for money from those councils that have gone down the in-house broadcasting route?

Weinidog, efallai y byddwch yn cofio fy nghefnogaeth ar gyfer darlledu gweithdrefnau'r cyngor i ddinasyddion, ac rwy'n falch bod rhai cyngorau yn ystyried darlledu'r trafodion hynny yn fewnol. Bydd hynny, wrth gwrs, bob amser yn golygu goblygiadau o ran cost, ond rwy'n siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno nad oedd hynny'n cyfiawnhau afradlondeb. Mae'r gwaith paratoi i alluogi Dinas a Sir Abertawe i ffrydio ei gyfarfodydd eisoes wedi costio mwy na £0.5 miliwn ar adeg lle mae'r trigolion yn wynebu cynnydd o 5% yn y dreth gyngor. Sut rydych yn sicrhau gwerth am arian gan y cyngorau hynny sydd wedi dilyn y llwybr darlledu yn fewnol?

15:00 **Lesley Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo Video](#)

We monitor the funding that we gave to local authorities to broadcast their meetings. The next assessment of that will be in April this year, so it is something that we can look at.

Rydym yn monitro'r cyllid y gwnaethom ei roi i awdurdodau lleol i ddarlledu eu cyfarfodydd. Bydd yr asesiad nesaf ym mis Ebrill eleni, felly mae'n rhywbeth y gallwn edrych arno.

## Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad

## Questions to the Assembly Commission

### Pwmp Gwres o'r Ddaear

### Ground Source Heat Pump

15:00 **Jenny Rathbone** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo Video](#)

*1. Pa werthusiad sydd wedi ei wneud o berfformiad y pwmp gwres o'r ddaear sy'n gwasanaethu adeilad y Senedd? OAQ(4)0079(AC)*

*1. What evaluation has been made of the performance of the ground source heat pump which serves the Senedd building? OAQ(4)0079(AC)*

15:01 **Peter Black** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo Video](#)

*Comisiynydd y Cynulliad / Assembly Commissioner*

Thank you for that question. The three ground source heat pumps are part of the sustainable design of the Senedd, providing low-grade underfloor heating and cooling. The controls that activate the ground source heat pumps have been integrated into the building management control system so that they support the other heating and cooling systems efficiently.

Diolch am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae'r tri phwmp gwres o'r ddaear yn rhan o ddyluniad cynaliadwy y Senedd, gan roi gwres ac oeriad gradd isel o dan y llawr. Mae'r rheolyddion sy'n gweithredu'r pypiau gwres o'r ddaear wedi'u hintegreiddio i mewn i system reoli'r adeilad fel eu bod yn cefnogi'r systemau gwresogi ac oeri eraill yn effeithlon.

The pumps have limited provision for performance evaluation, but we have been working on this with the Carbon Trust and are investigating the feasibility of installing monitoring tools so that we can be sure that the system is contributing as effectively as possible to the Senedd's sustainability performance.

Darpariaeth gyfyngedig sydd gan y pypiau ar gyfer gwerthuso perfformiad, ond rydym wedi bod yn gweithio ar hyn gyda'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon ac rydym yn ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o osod offer monitro fel y gallwn fod yn sicr bod y system yn cyfrannu mor effeithiol â phosibl i berfformiad cynaliadwyedd y Senedd.

15:01 **Jenny Rathbone** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo Video](#)

As this technology is still in development, it is vital that we are able to understand how well these systems are working, so that we can improve them. So, I am disappointed that it would appear that, to date, we have not actually done any evaluation of the system, because there are lots of experts out there who would be very keen to understand exactly how well this system is functioning, so that we can then use that information to improve the systems of the future. When exactly is this evaluation going to start?

Gan fod y dechnoleg hon yn dal i gael ei datblygu, mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn gallu deall pa mor dda y mae'r systemau hyn yn gweithio, fel y gallwn eu gwella. Felly, rwy'n siomedig ei bod yn ymddangos, hyd yma, nad ydym wedi gwerthuso'r system o gwbl mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd mae llawer o arbenigwyr ar gael a fyddai'n awyddus iawn i ddeall yn union pa mor dda y mae'r system hon yn gweithio, fel y gallwn wedyn ddefnyddio'r wybodaeth honno i wella systemau'r dyfodol. Pryd yn union y bydd y gwerthusiad hwn yn dechrau?

15:02

**Peter Black** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

As I indicated, we are working with the Carbon Trust on this at the moment. The ground source heat pump is part of the sustainable design of the Senedd that works in tandem with the biomass boiler for heating in the winter and with the chillers for cooling in the summer. So, accordingly, the system is operational as designed. However, we will be commissioning further control modifications to ensure its efficient performance. Performance monitoring capability was not installed as part of the ground source heat system. We have recognised this emission and we will address it in due course.

Fel y nodais, rydym yn gweithio gyda'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r pwmp gwres o'r ddaear yn rhan o ddyluniad cynaliadwy y Senedd sy'n gweithio ochr yn ochr â'r boeler biomas ar gyfer gwresogi yn y gaeaf a'r peiriannau ar gyfer oeri yn yr haf. Felly, yn unol â hynny, mae'r system yn gweithio fel y'i cynlluniwyd. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn comisiynu addasiadau rheoli pellach i sicrhau ei bod yn gweithio'n effeithlon. Ni osodwyd cyfleuster i allu monitro perfformiad fel rhan o'r system gwres o'r ddaear. Rydym wedi cydnabod hyn a byddwn yn mynd i'r afael ag ef maes o law.

15:02

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar Ddyfodol Masnachfrait Rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r Gororau**

**The Enterprise and Business Committee's Report on the Future of the Wales and Borders Rail Franchise**

**Y** Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call on the Chair of the Enterprise and Business Committee, William Graham, to move the motion in the name of Nick Ramsay.

Galwaf ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes, William Graham, i gynnig y cynnig yn enw Nick Ramsay.

Cynnig NDM5437 Nick Ramsay

Motion NDM5437 Nick Ramsay

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar yr Ymchwiliad i Ddyfodol Masnachfrait Rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r Gororau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Rhagfyr 2013.

Notes the report of the Enterprise and Business Committee's Report on the Inquiry into the Future of the Wales and Borders Rail Franchise, which was laid in the Table Office on 11 December 2013.

15:02

**William Graham** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you very much, Presiding Officer. I move the motion in the name of Nick Ramsay.

Diolch yn fawr iawn, Lywydd. Cynigiau y cynnig yn enw Nick Ramsay.

I am privileged to open today's debate on the report by the Enterprise and Business Committee on the future of the Wales and borders rail franchise. May I pay public tribute to Nick Ramsay, who contributed well to the fruition of this report? Thank you very much, Nick.

Mae'n ffrwyth i mi agor y ddatl heddiw ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar ddyfodol masnachfrait rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r gororau. A gaf dalu teyrnged yn gyhoeddus i Nick Ramsay, a gyfrannodd yn dda i ffrwyth yr adroddiad hwn? Diolch yn fawr iawn, Nick.

May I thank all the people who contributed to the inquiry? We collected a significant amount of written and oral evidence on what was, at times, a complex subject. In particular, I am grateful to the rail user groups that contributed to our stakeholder discussions in the Pierhead last October. Passenger Focus was a huge help to us in co-ordinating that event and putting us in touch with some really knowledgeable people.

Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a gyfrannodd i'r ymchwiliad. Casglwyd cryn dipyn o dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a llafar ar yr hyn a fu, ar adegau, yn bwnc cymhleth. Yn benodol, rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r grwpiau defnyddwyr rheilffyrdd a gyfrannodd at ein trafodaethau â rhanddeiliaid yn adeilad y Pierhead fis Hydref diwethaf. Bu Passenger Focus yn help mawr inni yn y gwaith o gyd-drefnu'r digwyddiad hwnnw a'n rhoi mewn cysylltiad â rhai pobl wybodus iawn.

I would also like to thank those stalwart rail users who either travelled with us on the train to Hereford to launch our report, or who met us in the waiting room at Hereford station to receive our charter for the next franchise. Our journey there and back was made all the easier by Arriva Trains Wales, and our communications and outreach teams played a key role in organising the event and in generating a significant amount of interest among the media and other stakeholder groups.

Hoffwn hefyd ddiolch i'r defnyddwyr rheilffyrdd pybyr hynny a deithiodd gyda ni naill ai ar y trên i Henffordd i lansio ein hadroddiad, neu a gyfarfu â ni yn yr ystafell aros yng ngorsaf Henffordd i dderbyn ein siarter ar gyfer y fasnachfrait nesaf. Cafodd ein taith yno ac yn ôl ein hwyluso gan Drenau Arriva Cymru, a chwaraeodd ein timau cyfathrebu ac allgymorth ran allweddol yn y gwaith o drefnu'r digwyddiad ac ennyn cyn ddi-ddordeb ymhlith y cyfryngau a grwpiau rhanddeiliaid eraill.

I do not think that any Assembly committee has ever launched a report over the border before. Why did we do it? We wanted to highlight that cross-border routes and services are vital for rail passengers in both the Welsh and English domains of the franchise, and are key to the integrity and viability of the next franchise agreement, which is due to take effect from 2018. This might seem like a long time away, however, our inquiry revealed the importance of starting to plan now to ensure that Wales is well prepared and resourced to deliver an effective new franchise.

I believe there are five key areas where we want to see prompt action. First, we recommended that the powers and funds for specifying and procuring the next franchise should be devolved to Wales. The exact roles of the Welsh Government and the UK Department for Transport need to be clarified soon, so that the whole franchising process can be set in motion and on the right track.

Secondly, regardless of whether the Department for Transport or Welsh Government is the franchising authority, there needs to be an early and wide consultation with all stakeholder groups on both sides of the border on the identification of the key outputs and outcomes required from the next franchise, and how those will be monitored and evaluated.

Thirdly, there needs to be early action to decide on the appropriate rolling stock that will deliver the next franchise as well as services in the longer term. There are complex issues regarding disability regulations and electrification; those are two examples that need to be resolved. That means that the Welsh Government will need more staff with the necessary experience and expertise in this important area, as well as in franchise procurement more generally. I am glad that, in her response to our report, the Minister has kindly identified that there is currently a skills gap.

Fourthly, we have no fixed view on any one management model for the next franchise. There are pros and cons to adopting various approaches, but, at the end of the day, the overriding factor will be for whichever model chosen to deliver the best outcomes for passengers and for taxpayers. A decision on this will also need to be made swiftly so that potential bidders can start to prepare. We believe that the new arrangement will need to include an enhanced role for community rail and a closer alliance between the chosen operator and Network Rail.

Finally, building on the committee's recent work, the next rail franchise has to be framed within policies for better integration of our public transport network. That will mean the next franchise helping to encourage and support active travel, and integrating with wider policies for Wales's social and economic development.

Ni chredaf fod unrhyw un o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad erioed wedi lansio adroddiad dros y ffin o'r blaen. Pam y gwnaethom hynny? Roeddem yn awyddus i dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod llwybrau a gwasanaethau trawsffiniol yn hanfodol i deithwyr rheilffyrdd ym mharthau Cymru a Lloegr o'r fasnachfaint, ac maent yn allweddol i gyfanrwydd a hyfywedd cytundeb y fasnachfaint nesaf, a ddaw i rym o 2018 yn ôl yr arfaeth. Efallai fod hyn yn ymddangos fel amser maith i ffwrdd, fodd bynnag, datgelodd ein hymchwiliad bwysigrwydd dechrau cynllunio yn awr er mwyn sicrhau bod Cymru yn barod iawn ac wedi cael adnoddau da i ddarparu masnachfaint newydd yn effeithiol.

Credaf fod pum maes allweddol lle rydym am weld camau yn ddi-oed. Yn gyntaf, argymhellwyd y dylai'r pwerau a'r arian ar gyfer nodi a chaffael y fasnachfaint nesaf gael eu datganoli i Gymru. Mae angen egluro union rolau Llywodraeth Cymru ac Adran Drafnidiaeth y DU yn fuan, fel y gall holl broses y fasnachfaint gychwyn ar y trywydd iawn.

Yn ail, ni waeth pa un ai'r Adran Drafnidiaeth ynteu Llywodraeth Cymru yw'r awdurdod masnachfreinio, mae angen ymgynghoriad cynnar ac eang â'r holl grwpiau rhanddeiliaid ar bob ochr i'r ffin ar nodi'r allbynnau a'r canlyniadau allweddol a fydd yn angenrheidiol yn y fasnachfaint nesaf, a sut y bydd y rheini yn cael eu monitro a'u gwerthuso.

Yn drydydd, mae angen cymryd camau yn gynnar i benderfynu ar y cerbydau priodol a fydd yn cyflawni'r fasnachfaint nesaf yn ogystal â gwasanaethau yn y tymor hwy. Cyfyd materion cymhleth ynghylch rheoliadau anabled a thrydaneiddio; dyna ddwy enghraifft y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy. Mae hynny'n golygu y bydd angen mwy o staff sydd â'r profiad a'r arbenigedd angenrheidiol yn y maes pwysig hwn ar Lywodraeth Cymru, yn ogystal â maes caffael masnachfaint yn fwy cyffredinol. Rwy'n falch bod y Gweinidog, yn ei hymateb i'n hadroddiad, wedi bod cystal â nodi bod bwlch sgiliau ar hyn o bryd.

Yn bedwerydd, nid oes gennym farn bendant ar unrhyw fodel rheoli penodol ar gyfer y fasnachfaint nesaf. Mae i wahanol ddulliau gweithredu fanteision ac anfanteision, ond, yn y pen draw, y ffactor hollbwysig yw bod pa fodel bynnag a ddewisir yn sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau i deithwyr ac i drethdalwyr. Bydd angen penderfynu ar hyn yn ddi-oed hefyd fel y gall cynigwyr posibl ddechrau paratoi. Credwn y bydd angen i'r trefniant newydd gynnwys rôl ehangach i'r gymuned reilffyrdd a chysylltiad agosach rhwng y dewis weithredwr a Network Rail.

Yn olaf, gan adeiladu ar waith diweddar y pwyllgor, rhaid i'r fasnachfaint rheilffyrdd nesaf gael ei llunio o fewn polisiâu ar gyfer integreiddio ein rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn well. Bydd hynny'n golygu y dylai'r fasnachfaint nesaf helpu i annog a chefnogi teithio llesol, ac integreiddio â pholisiâu ehangach ar gyfer datblygiad cyrffdeithasol ac economaidd Cymru.

The culmination of our inquiry is our charter for the next Wales and borders franchise, which includes our recommendations. I do hope that Members will find time to read it. It is aimed at the Welsh Government, with the purpose of improving rail services for passengers and delivering better value for money for taxpayers. It sets out a clear set of actions that we want the Welsh Government to implement. I am encouraged that, in the Welsh Government's response to the committee's report, the Minister has welcomed our continuing engagement in this area. The Minister has already indicated that she accepts eight of our recommendations outright and one in principle. However, I am disappointed that the 14 issues outlined in our recommendation 10 have not been responded to individually, but have been accepted en bloc. We believe that the Government should have addressed each point, as we clearly requested in paragraph 140 of our report. We are left with no clue as to how those 14 issues will be addressed.

In summary, I feel that the Minister's response has perhaps laboured the fact that the Welsh Government is not currently the franchising authority. While that may be a fair enough response at this stage, I would suggest that if and when the necessary functions relating to rail franchising are transferred to the Welsh Government, we will want to invite the Minister to discuss our recommendations in much greater depth. We will certainly require a better understanding of the timelines for the work that the Government needs to undertake to prepare for the next franchise. Finally, may I thank my fellow committee members for travelling on this journey? We may still be far off our final destination, but we have clearly identified the right route and the milestones that need to be reached.

15:08

### Joyce Watson [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

First, I would like to thank Nick Ramsay, the former Chair of the committee, and to put on record my appreciation for his efforts in producing this report. I would also like to put on record my disappointment, for I felt personally embarrassed by the situation that we faced in Brussels last week, where it seemed that we did not have a committee Chair to accompany us, and I would like to set the record straight on that.

Anyway, moving on swiftly to the report in front of us, as part of the committee inquiry, we took an awful lot of evidence. I recognise that the Welsh Government is not, at the moment, the franchising authority for Wales and borders, but I welcome the Government's acceptance of the report. The committee does recognise your commitment to improving services and the desire to do that. It is clearly the case that a no-growth franchise did have a significant adverse effect in several areas, not least funding. Everything, ultimately, will fall from lack of funding.

Ffrwyth ein hymchwiliad yw ein siarter ar gyfer masnachfrait nesaf Cymru a'r gororau, sy'n cynnwys ein hargymhellion. Gobeithio y bydd yr Aelodau'n cael amser i'w darllen. Mae wedi'i hanelu at Lywodraeth Cymru, gyda'r nod o wella gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd i deithwyr a rhoi gwell gwerth am arian i drethdalwyr. Mae'n nodi cyfres glir o gamau gweithredu yr ydym am i Lywodraeth Cymru eu cymryd. Mae'n galonogol bod y Gweinidog, yn ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i adroddiad y pwyllgor, wedi croesawu ein hymwneud parhaus yn y maes hwn. Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi nodi ei bod yn derbyn wyth o'n hargymhellion yn llawn ac un mewn egwyddor. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n siomedig nad yw wedi ymateb yn unigol i'r 14 o faterion a amlinellir yn argymhelliad 10 gennym, ond wedi eu derbyn yn eu cyfanrwydd. Credwn y dylai'r Llywodraeth fod wedi ymdrin â phob pwynt, fel y gofynnwyd gennym yn glir ym mharagraff 140 o'n hadroddiad. O ganlyniad, nid oes gennym unrhyw syniad ynghylch sut y bwriedir ymdrin â'r 14 mater hynny.

I grynhoi, teimlaf fod ymateb y Gweinidog wedi rhoi gormod o bwyslais o bosibl ar y ffaith nad Llywodraeth Cymru yw'r awdurdod masnachfreinio ar hyn o bryd. Er bod hynny'n ymateb digon teg o bosibl ar hyn o bryd, awgrymaf, os a phryd y bydd y swyddogaethau angenrheidiol sy'n ymwneud â masnachfreinio'r rheilffyrdd yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Lywodraeth Cymru, y byddwn am wahodd y Gweinidog i drafod ein hargymhellion yn llawer manylach. Yn sicr, bydd angen gwell dealltwriaeth o'r amserlen ar gyfer y gwaith y mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ei wneud er mwyn paratoi ar gyfer y fasnachfrait nesaf. Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i'm cyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor am deithio ar y daith hon. Efallai ein bod yn dal i fod ymhell o gyrraedd pen y daith, ond rydym wedi nodi'n glir y llwybr cywir a'r cerrig milltir y bydd angen eu cyrraedd.

Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddiolch i Nick Ramsay, cyn-Gadeirydd y pwyllgor, a nodi'n gyhoeddus fy ngwerthfawrogiad o'i ymdrechion wrth baratoi'r adroddiad hwn. Hoffwn hefyd nodi fy siom, gan fod y sefyllfa a gododd ym Mrwsel yr wythnos diwethaf gennym, lle yr ymddangosai nad oedd gennym Gadeirydd pwyllgor i ymuno â ni, wedi peri embaras personol imi, a hoffwn roi'r ffeithiau gerbron.

Beth bynnag, gan symud ymlaen yn gyflym at yr adroddiad ger ein bron, fel rhan o ymchwiliad y pwyllgor, cymerwyd llawer iawn o dystiolaeth gennym. Rwy'n cydnabod nad Llywodraeth Cymru yw awdurdod masnachfreinio Cymru a'r gororau ar hyn o bryd, ond croesawaf y ffaith fod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn yr adroddiad. Mae'r pwyllgor yn cydnabod eich ymrwymiad i wella gwasanaethau a'r awydd i wneud hynny. Mae'n amlwg yn wir i fasnachfaint dim twf gael effaith niweidiol sylweddol mewn sawl maes, yn bennaf cyllid. Bydd popeth, yn y pen draw, yn methu os bydd diffyg cyllid.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I want to focus particularly on rolling stock. I think that any new and additional carriages in Wales have to be seen to better the rolling stock, which is somewhat antiquated at the moment and frequently overcrowded. I think that that would be something that everybody would welcome when travelling on the railway. I live, as you know, in west Wales. At holiday times, you find yourself standing from Swansea to Fishguard. That is unacceptable in today's world. The other thing, when we are talking about modernising rolling stock, is that there are key features that people expect to have. They expect to be able to plug in appliances, for example, so that they might be able to work on the train. You will find those sadly missing on the current stock. We need modern stock for a modern age, but we need capacity within that.

Keeping with the theme of rolling stock and a strategy that has to be followed through, we were told by witnesses that the time frame to look at rolling stock is now, but these things take time to work through. To be engaged as an active player in acquiring rolling stock, you have to think well ahead and think how you are going to do that. It was made clear to us that that work needs to start now. That comes back to our position in that market, or at least our influence within that market, happening very much now.

The third point, related to the ones above, is that we have seen a massive expansion of people using the railway. That can be only good news. It is good news because it helps people get around and it helps us, as a Government, to reduce our carbon footprint. In order to keep that reduction and keep people off the road, if we meet the two things, namely funding and rolling stock, we will only ever see an expansion of people using the rail network. I look forward to your reply.

Rwyf am ganolbwyntio'n benodol ar gerbydau. Credaf fod yn rhaid i unrhyw gerbydau newydd ac ychwanegol yng Nghymru gael eu gweld yn gwella'r cerbydau presennol, sydd ychydig yn hen ffasiwn ar hyn o bryd ac yn aml yn orlawn. Credaf y byddai hynny'n rhywbeth y byddai pawb yn ei groesawu wrth deithio ar y rheilffordd. Fel y gwyddoch, rwy'n bwy yn y gorllewin. Ar adeg gwyliau, byddwch yn cael eich hun yn sefyll o Abertawe i Abergwaun. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol yn y byd sydd ohoni. Y mater arall, pan soniwn am foderneiddio cerbydau, yw bod nodweddion allweddol y mae pobl yn disgwyl eu cael. Maent yn disgwyl y bydd modd cysylltu cyfarpar, er enghraifft, fel y gallent weithio ar y trên. Nid yw'r rheini ar gael yn y cerbydau presennol, yn anffodus. Mae angen cerbydau modern ar gyfer oes fodern, ond mae angen inni gael y gallu o fewn hynny.

Gan barhau â thema cerbydau a strategaeth y mae'n rhaid ei dilyn, dywedodd tystion wrthym mai'r dyma adeg i edrych ar gerbydau, ond bod y pethau hyn yn cymryd amser i ddwyn ffrwyth. Er mwyn chwarae rhan weithredol yn y gwaith o gaffael cerbydau, rhaid ichi feddwl ymhell ymlaen llaw a meddwl sut y byddwch yn gwneud hynny. Fe'i gwnaed yn glir inni fod angen i'r gwaith hwnnw ddechrau yn awr. Mae hynny yn golygu y dylai ein safle yn y farchnad honno, neu o leiaf ein dylanwad yn y farchnad honno, fod ar waith yn awr i raddau helaeth.

Y trydydd pwynt, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r rhai uchod, yw ein bod wedi gweld cynnydd enfawr yn nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio'r rheilffordd. Mae hynny'n newyddion da. Mae'n newyddion da oherwydd ei fod yn helpu pobl i fynd o un lle i'r llall ac mae'n ein helpu ni, fel Llywodraeth, i leihau ein hól troed carbon. Er mwyn i'r gostyngiad hwnnw barhau ac er mwyn cadw pobl oddi ar y ffordd, os cyflawnwn y ddau beth, sef cyllid a cherbydau, dim ond cynyddu a wna nifer y bobl sy'n defnyddio'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd. Edrychaf ymlaen at eich ateb.

15:12

## Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Nid oeddwn yn aelod o'r pwyllgor cynhyrfus hwn—cynhyrfus yn wleidyddol erbyn hyn, yn ogystal ag o ran y gwaith sy'n cael ei astudio—pan baratowyd yr adroddiad penodol hwn ar ddyfodol masnachfaint rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r gororau, neu Cymru a'r Mers, fel mae'n well gennyf ddweud. Ond, roeddwn yn aelod pan baratowyd yr adroddiad ar drafnidiaeth integredig, ac rwy'n meddwl bod y themâu sydd gennym heddiw yn themâu y mae'n rhaid i ni eu dilyn gyda'i gilydd. Ni fydd modd i ni, oherwydd natur ranedig y math o ddatganoli sydd gennym ar gyfer trafnidiaeth—ac ni fydd byth modd, yn fy marn i—greu system drafnidiaeth integredig effeithlon. Felly, fy uchelgais yw ceisio gwthio—neu lusgo, efallai—Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a gwthio Llywodraeth Cymru gyda ni i gyrraedd mor bell ag y medrwn ar y daith honno.

I was not a member of this exciting committee—both politically exciting, as we have seen in recent days, and exciting in terms of the work in question—when this report on the Wales and borders rail franchise was prepared, or Wales and the Marches, as I prefer to describe it. However, I was a member when the report on integrated transport was prepared, and I believe that the themes we are addressing today are themes that we must address in concert. We cannot, due to the divided nature of transport devolution—and never will, in my opinion—create an efficient integrated transport system. Therefore, my ambition is to try to push—or perhaps drag—the UK Government and to push the Welsh Government with us in order to go as far as can on that journey of devolution.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)



Mae fy niddordeb mewn rheilffyrdd yn hysbys i bawb sydd wedi gorfod gwranddo arnaf yn mynd drwy fy mhethau. Rwy'n llawen iawn fy mod yn cynrychioli mwy o reilffyrdd stêm hanesyddol nag unrhyw Aelod arall yn y Cynulliad hwn—ar wahân i Joyce Watson, sy'n cynrychioli'r rheini, a'r gweddill yng Nghymru mae'n siŵr gen i. Ar ben hynny, rwy'n ddigon hen i gofio gwasanaeth stêm ar fy rheilffordd leol o Flaenau Ffestiniog i Landudno a dyfodiad y DMU—y disel—cyntaf. Er mwyn dangos creadur mor ryfedd ydwyf, mae gennyf yn y bwthyn sydd gennym ddim yn bell iawn o'r rheilffordd ym Metws-y-coed, atgynhyrchiad o'r posteri enwog hynny sy'n dangos y cerbydau gwreiddiol a'r fersiwn fwy diweddar o'r cerbydau disel ar y rheilffordd.

Rwy'n ddefnyddiwr cyson o'r trêrn rhwng y de a'r gogledd, ac yn llawenau yn y gwasanaeth rydym yn ei gael, sydd yn eithaf safonol a chyson, o ystyried amodau'r tywydd. Tra'r wyf yn sôn am y tywydd, diolchaf yn arbennig i weithwyr Arriva ac i weithwyr Network Rail am eu hymateb i'r argyfwng yr ydym wedi'i gael ar reilffordd Cambrian, a'r argyfwng a gafwyd cyn y Nadolig ar y rheilffordd, yn enwedig ar lannau Dyfrdwy, yn dilyn y llifogydd.

Er mwyn cael gwasanaeth cyhoeddus effeithiol, rwy'n meddwl bod yn rhaid inni fod yn barod i fynnu cael masnachfaint i Gymru a'r Mers. Rwy'n gobeithio y gallwn gael ymateb deallus gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn dilyn adroddiad y comisiwn ar ddatganoli dan gadeiryddiaeth Paul Silk, sydd i fod i ateb yn weddol fuan. Heb ddatganoli'r pwerau penodol ynglŷn â rheilffyrdd, a heb berthynas newydd a chreadigol rhwng Network Rail, deiliad y fasnachfaint, y ddwy Lywodraeth a'r gwasanaethau bysus, ni fydd hyn yn bosibl.

Rwy'n gwerthfawrogi'n fawr, ac yn cymeradwyo, y modd y mae Network Rail, fel cwmni heb ddiidend, yn gwmni sydd bellach wedi'i ddatganoli ei hun i uned ag iddi reolaeth yma o Gaerdydd, a chadeirydd ardderchog, wrth gwrs—mae'n rhaid imi ddweud hynny, gan ei fod yn gyfaill ac yn etholwr imi, yn byw yn y Bermo—Richard Parry-Jones. Mae'n dda cael rhywun o'i brofiad mewn maes arall o drafnidiaeth i fod yng ngofal y rheilffyrdd. Yn ystod y flwyddyn neu ddwy nesaf, mae'n allweddol ein bod yn ennill y ddatganiad ynglŷn â datganoli rheilffyrdd. Efallai y dylem gryfhau'r eirfa sydd yn yr adroddiad hwn—dyna'r unig awgrym sydd gennyf i'w wneud i wella'r hyn sydd yn yr adroddiad. Mewn pedwar argymhelliad, mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am 'lobio' Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig er mwyn ceisio cael y fasnachfaint. Nid lobio yw ein gwaith; nid yw Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn lobio neb. Mynnu yr ydym ni yr hawl i drefnu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru yn briodol. Yn yr ysbryd hwnnw, rwy'n falch iawn o groesawu a chefnogi'r adroddiad hwn, a gwnaf bopeth y gallaf ei wneud i'w hyrwyddo, ar y trêrn, ar y bws, ac ym mhob man arall.

My interest in the railways is known to all who have been forced to listen to me going on about these issues. I am thrilled that I represent more historic steam railways than any other Member of this Assembly, with the exception of Joyce Watson, of course, who also represents those along with, I am sure, all of the others in Wales. In addition, I am old enough to recall the steam service on my local line from Blaenau Ffestiniog to Llandudno, and the advent of the first DMU, or diesel engine. Just to demonstrate how odd I am as an individual, in the cottage that we have not too far from the railway in Betws-y-coed, I have a reproduction of those famous posters that show the original steam engines and the more recent diesel engines.

I am a regular user of the north-south train link, and I am delighted by the service available, which is of relatively high quality and consistent, given the weather conditions. While I am discussing the weather, I particularly thank the staff of Arriva and Network Rail for their response to the crisis that we have faced on the Cambrian railway, and the crisis before Christmas on the railway on Deeside, as a result of flooding.

In order to have an effective public service, I believe that we must be prepared to insist on a franchise for Wales and the Borders. I hope that we will get an intelligent response from the UK Government following the report on devolution, chaired by Paul Silk, which is to report relatively soon. Without the devolution of specific powers on our railways, and without a new and creative relationship between Network Rail, the franchise-holder, the two Governments involved and the bus services, this simply will not be possible.

I am very appreciative of, and applaud, the way in which Network Rail, as a not-for-dividend company, has devolved itself to a unit that is controlled from Cardiff, with an excellent chair, of course—I have to say that because he is a friend and constituent of mine, living in Barmouth—Richard Parry-Jones. It is good to have someone of his experience in another area of transport now responsible for our railways. During the next year or two, it is crucial that we win the argument on the devolution of the railways. Perhaps we should strengthen the wording contained in this report—that is the only suggestion that I have in terms of improving its content. In four recommendations, the report refers to 'lobbying' the UK Government in order to try to gain the franchise. It is not our job to lobby; the National Assembly for Wales does not lobby anyone. We insist on the right to arrange public services appropriately in Wales. In that spirit, I am very pleased to welcome and support this report, and I will do all that I can to promote it, on the train, on the bus and everywhere else.

15:17

## **Byron Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yet again, it is a real pleasure to speak this afternoon regarding the committee's report on the future of the Wales and Borders rail franchise. It was a most rewarding report to be involved with, and I wish to thank the witnesses and the committee staff for their contribution to our efforts. As you can see, we formed 10 recommendations, and the Government accepted them all.

Unwaith eto, mae'n bleser mawr cael siarad y prynhawn yma am adroddiad y pwyllgor ar ddyfodol masnachfaint rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r Gororau. Bu'n adroddiad hynod fuddiol i fod yn rhan ohono, a hoffwn ddiolch i'r tystion a staff y pwyllgor am eu cyfraniad at ein hymdrechion. Fel y gwelwch, lluniwyd 10 o argymhellion gennym, a derbyniodd y Llywodraeth bob un ohonynt.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

It would be remiss of me not to personally thank the outgoing chairman of the Enterprise and Business Committee, Nick Ramsay who brought his usual style and great enthusiasm to this report, as he has every other inquiry and report.

We launched the report in Hereford, emphasising the problem with our national franchise: the fact that it is a cross-border issue. I am sure that every Member is aware that we do not have a Welsh railway—we have a shared cross-border service, and the challenges around that bear out in the report. In fact, some of our witnesses, including Professor Stuart Cole, joined us for the launch, emphasising the cross-industry buy-in of our recommendations.

I will just tease out a couple of the recommendations, and I will start with the one recommendation that has already been mentioned by Joyce Watson. I also feel that it really is one of the most important ones: recommending that the Welsh Government develops and publishes a rolling stock strategy as a matter of urgency, not only to ensure that pressing decisions on rolling stock compatibility for electrification and accessibility and legislation are taken in good time to avoid the increased cost and disruption associated with delay, but also to enhance the future capacity and quality of trains for the long term.

The Government response, while welcome, was only accepted in principle. I do accept the problem with the Welsh Government not being the franchising authority for the Wales and Borders franchise at present. It is important to recognise the huge challenges that we face, however, without rolling stock. We need an urgent upgrade. Electrification will bring huge rolling stock upgrade, but flagship services, such as north to south Wales lines, cannot be seen as second-class services. I wanted to re-emphasise that point and I am pleased to have had the opportunity to have done that.

Secondly, recommendation 3 is also key. We recommended that the Welsh Government should ensure that it has the right staff with the required experience and specialist skills to develop and deliver the new franchise and the necessary rolling stock. Again, the Government has accepted the recommendation and I wanted to welcome, in particular, the recognition that there is a need to strengthen the Government's commercial, technical, legal and procurement skills. The detailed study visit to Transport Scotland seemed to echo that and I am delighted that you have taken all our comments on board.

Lastly, recommendation 8 concerns communication with our colleagues in Westminster. The committee recommends that the Welsh Government should

'work with the UK Department for Transport to ensure Welsh interests are reflected in the procurement of new franchises more widely, not least the Great Western and West Coast Franchises'.

Byddwn ar fai pe na baem yn diolch yn bersonol i gadeirydd ymadawol y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes, Nick Ramsay a ymdriniodd â'r adroddiad hwn yn ei ffordd arferol a chyda'i frwdfrydedd mawr, fel y gwnaeth ym mhob ymchwiliad ac adroddiad arall.

Lansiwyd yr adroddiad yn Henffordd, er mwyn pwysleisio'r broblem gyda'n masnachfaint genedlaethol: sef y ffaith ei bod yn fater trawsffiniol. Rwy'n siŵr bod pob Aelod yn ymwybodol nad oes gennym reilffordd i Gymru— gwasanaeth trawsffiniol a rennir sydd gennym, ac mae'r heriau sy'n deillio o hynny wedi'u hamlygu yn yr adroddiad. Yn wir, gwnaeth rhai o'n tystion, gan gynnwys yr Athro Stuart Cole, ymuno â ni yn y lansiad, gan bwysleisio'r gefnogaeth draws-diwydiant i'n hargymhellion.

Hoffwn dynnu sylw at un neu ddau o'r argymhellion, a dechreuaf gyda'r argymhelliad sydd eisoes wedi cael ei grybwyll gan Joyce Watson. Teimlaf hefyd ei bod yn un o'r rhai pwysicaf mewn gwirionedd: sef argymell bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn datblygu ac yn cyhoeddi strategaeth cerbydau ar fyrder, nid yn unig er mwyn sicrhau bod penderfyniadau pwysig ynglŷn ag addasrwydd cerbydau ar gyfer trydaneiddio a hygyrchedd a deddfwriaeth yn cael eu gwneud mewn da bryd er mwyn osgoi'r gost a'r tarfu ychwanegol sy'n gysylltiedig ag oedi, ond hefyd er mwyn gwella adnoddau yn y dyfodol ac ansawdd y trenau yn yr hirdymor.

Nid oedd ymateb y Llywodraeth, er i'w groesawu, ond wedi'i dderbyn mewn egwyddor. Derbyniaf fod problem yn yr ystyr nad Llywodraeth Cymru yw'r awdurdod masnachfreinio ar gyfer masnachfaint Cymru a'r Gororau ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod yr heriau enfawr sy'n ein hwynebu, fodd bynnag, heb gerbydau. Mae angen ymarfer uwchraddio ar frys. Bydd ymarfer uwchraddio cerbydau enfawr yn sgil trydaneiddio, ond ni all gwasanaethau blaenllaw, megis y rheilffyrdd rhwng y gogledd a'r de, gael eu gweld fel gwasanaethau ail ddsbarth. Roeddwn am ailbwysleisio'r pwynt hwnnw ac rwy'n falch fy mod wedi cael y cyfle i wneud hynny.

Yn ail, mae argymhelliad 3 hefyd yn allweddol. Argymhellwyd y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru sicrhau bod ganddi'r staff cywir sydd â'r profiad a'r sgiliau arbenigol angenrheidiol i ddatblygu a chyflwyno'r fasnachfaint newydd a'r cerbydau angenrheidiol. Unwaith eto, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad ac roeddwn am groesawu, yn arbennig, y gydnabyddiaeth bod angen atgyfnerthu sgiliau masnachol, technegol, cyfreithiol a chaffael y Llywodraeth. Ategwyd hynny i bob golwg gan yr ymweliad astudio manwl â Transport Scotland ac rwy'n falch eich bod wedi derbyn ein holl sylwadau.

Yn olaf, mae argymhelliad 8 yn ymwneud â chyfathrebu â'n cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan. Mae'r pwyllgor yn argymell y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru

'Gweithio gydag Adran Drafnidiaeth y DU i sicrhau bod buddiannau Cymru yn cael eu hadlewyrchu wrth gaffael masnachfreintiau newydd yn ehangach, yn arbennig Masnachfreintiau Great Western a West Coast'.

We recognise that, under current legislation, the Secretary of State for Transport is required to consult Welsh Ministers before inviting bids for rail franchises providing Welsh services—that is to say, services that begin, end or at least make one stop in Wales. I would like to see a much more proactive approach from the Welsh Government, ensuring that Welsh interests are heard loud and clear. There is a key role here for the Secretary of State for Wales and I would hope to see much more active lobbying from the Welsh Government, following its acceptance of these recommendations.

In closing, I will say to the Chamber, as a member of the committee, that I commend this report to you. We want the next franchise to work for Wales. I hope that, because all our recommendations have been accepted, we have helped in some small way to ensure improvements in train travel for the people of Wales.

15:21

## **Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I, too, would like to pay my own tribute to the outgoing chair of this committee, Nick Ramsay, for his leadership of the committee over the last three years and also the great good humour with which he led our committee through this inquiry and others as well, as I am sure you can all believe. I would also like to take this opportunity to thank the committee staff and the witnesses who helped us through this inquiry.

If one theme emerged for us all as we listened to the evidence, it was that the process for developing a new Wales and borders franchise is extremely complex. There are cross-border issues, as have been discussed. There are long time frames across the piece with regard to scheduling for tracks, infrastructure and rolling stock. There is the impact of the welcome electrification of the south Wales main line and Valleys lines and the possible electrification in north Wales. While we welcome that investment, it adds a layer of complexity and a new, fixed time pressure to discussions on the franchise and the rolling stock to operate on it, which I will return to shortly. There is the growth in passenger numbers, predicting where that growth is likely to be and the need to futureproof our transport system in a way that the previous franchise did not allow for. There are also new opportunities and initiatives, such as the metro concept and discussions on possible new models of governance for the train operating companies and regional transport planning. It is a hugely complex area and we are grateful to the staff for steering us through this.

Rydym yn cydnabod, o dan y ddeddfwriaeth gyfredol, ei bod yn ofynnol i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth ymgynghori â Gweinidogion Cymru cyn gwahodd ceisiadau am fasnachfreintiau rheilffyrdd sy'n darparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru—hynny yw, gwasanaethau sy'n dechrau, sy'n gorffen neu sy'n stopio o leiaf unwaith yng Nghymru. Hoffwn weld dull llawer mwy rhagweithiol gan Lywodraeth Cymru, gan sicrhau bod buddiannau Cymru yn cael eu clywed yn glir. Mae rôl allweddol yn hyn o beth i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a byddwn yn gobeithio gweld lobiö llawer mwy gweithredol gan Lywodraeth Cymru, ar ôl iddi dderbyn yr argymhellion hyn.

Wrth gloi, hoffwn ddweud wrth y Siambr, fel aelod o'r pwyllgor, fy mod yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad hwn ichi. Rydym am i'r fasnachfrait nesaf weithio i Gymru. Gobeithio, am i'n holl argymhellion gael eu derbyn, ein bod wedi helpu mewn rhyw ffordd fach i sicrhau gwelliannau i deithio ar y trê'n i bobl Cymru.

Hoffwn innau hefyd dalu fy nheyrnged fy hun i gadeirydd ymadawol y pwyllgor hwn, Nick Ramsay, am y ffordd y mae wedi arwain y pwyllgor dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, a hefyd am ei radlonrwydd wrth arwain ein pwyllgor drwy'r ymchwiliad hwn ac eraill hefyd, fel y gallwch chi i gyd gredu, mae'n siŵr gennyf. Hoffwn hefyd fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i staff y pwyllgor ac i'r tystion a'n helpodd drwy'r ymchwiliad hwn.

Os daeth un thema i'r amlwg inni i gyd wrth inni wrando ar y dystiolaeth, y thema honno oedd bod y broses o ddatblygu masnachfrait newydd i Gymru a'r Gororau yn hynod gymhleth. Cyfyd materion trawsffiniol, fel y'u trafodwyd. Ceir terfynau amser hir yn gyffredinol o ran amserlennu ar gyfer cletrau, seilwaith a cherbydau. Ceir effaith trydaneiddio prif linell y de a llinellau Cymoedd, sydd i'w groesawu, a thrydaneiddio posibl yn y gogledd. Er ein bod yn croesawu'r buddsoddiad hwnnw, mae'n ychwanegu cymhlethdod a phwysau newydd o ran amser mewn perthynas â thrafodaethau ar y fasnachfrait a'r cerbydau a fydd yn gweithredu fel rhan ohoni, a dychwelaf at hynny yn y man. Ceir twf yn nifer y teithwyr, mae angen rhagweld lle bod twf yn debygol o fod ac mae angen diogelu ein system drafnidiaeth yn y dyfodol mewn ffordd nad oedd y fasnachfrait flaenorol yn caniatáu ei wneud. Ceir cyfleoedd a mentrau newydd hefyd, megis cysyniad y metro a thrafodaethau ar fodolau newydd posibl o lywodraethu ar gyfer y cwmnïau trenau a chynllunio trafndiaeth rhanbarthol. Mae'n faes hynod gymhleth ac rydym yn ddiolchgar i'r staff am ein tywys drwy hyn.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I do not think that we should be focusing too heavily on processes and procedures. We need to remember that at the very heart of this is what passengers need and value. It was very disappointing that research published by 'Which?' yesterday showed very high levels of dissatisfaction with Wales's own rail service providers. Only 45% of passengers were happy with First Great Western; 48% with Arriva Trains Wales. We need to understand the reasons why that is the case. When Transport Scotland came to the committee, it told us about the public consultation exercise that it carried out in 2011-12, which consisted of 23 separate stakeholder events, involving 160 organisations, and another 16 station events. It informs them in terms of understanding what passengers value and need. I would welcome the Welsh Government giving consideration to doing the same, in order to prepare the ground for the needs that we have out of the new Wales and Borders franchise. We need to put passenger priorities right at the heart of our transport planning, and I believe that it can be done. Perhaps we cannot always get what everybody wants—that is a given—but that is no reason not to use that kind of assessment process as a starting point for designing services.

Drilling further into that 'Which?' survey, we see that the priority factor that was identified by the most passengers was the capacity of the train services: 35% said that the most significant influence on their satisfaction level was their ability to get a seat or, sadly, in many cases, enough room to stand up in without invading the personal space of their neighbours to the point where, if they got any closer, they would frankly have to get married. Surprisingly, this factor was more important than reliability and punctuality, even among commuters using that service specifically to access work. The comfort rating of our trains was very much more valued by leisure users, who are hugely important to Wales's economy in terms of the tourists that our rail services bring to us.

This is where a rolling stock strategy really comes into its own. First, it is critical to address those issues with capacity, future capacity and comfort for our passengers, but it is also critical to respond to that changing environment that I mentioned, with electrification due to be completed in 2021. The Rail Vehicle Accessibility (Non-Interoperable Rail System) Regulations (RVAR) 2010 are due to come into force in 2020, which, in plain English, means that the Pacers running on our Valleys lines not being accessible to disabled people. They will not be able to run those services. So, we will have a problem, and we have to ask whether we will be required to upgrade our rolling stock for a single year's use. I am wondering whether the Minister could tell us whether she has had any discussions with the UK Government and the EU on whether it is possible to phase our approach to those regulations so that we do not have to waste money in that way.

Another debate, which I am sure others will speak about, is the debate about whether we should prefer a not-for-profit model over a profit-making model.

Ni chredaf y dylem fod yn canolbwyntio gormod ar brosesau a gweithdrefnau. Mae angen inni gofio mai'r hyn sydd ei angen ar deithwyr a'r hyn y maent yn ei werthfawrogi sydd wrth wraidd y cyfan. Bu'n siomedig iawn bod ymchwil a gyhoeddwyd gan 'Which?' ddoe wedi dangos cryn anfodlonrwydd gyda darparwyr gwasanaeth trenau Cymru ei hun. Dim ond 45% o deithwyr oedd yn fodlon ar First Great Western; 48% ar Drenau Arriva Cymru. Mae angen inni ddeall y rhesymau dros hynny. Pan ddaeth Transport Scotland i'r pwyllgor, dywedodd wrthym am yr ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus a gynhaliwyd ganddo yn 2011-12, a oedd yn cynnwys 23 o ddiwyddiadau gwahanol i randdeiliaid, yn cynnwys 160 o sefydliadau, a 16 o ddiwyddiadau eraill ar orsafoedd. Bu'n ei lywio o ran deall yr hyn y mae teithwyr yn ei werthfawrogi a'r hyn sydd ei angen arnynt. Byddwn yn croesawu pe bai Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried gwneud yr un fath, er mwyn braenaru'r tir ar gyfer yr anghenion sydd gennym o ran masnachfrait newydd Cymru a'r Gororau. Mae angen inni roi blaenoriaethau teithwyr wrth wraidd ein gwaith cynllunio trafniadaeth, a chredaf y gellir gwneud hynny. Efallai na allwn bob amser lwyddo i gael yr hyn sydd ei eisiau ar bawb—wrth reswm—ond nid yw hynny'n rheswm ychwaith dros beidio â defnyddio'r math hwnnw o broses asesu fel man cychwyn ar gyfer cynllunio gwasanaethau.

Gan edrych yn fanylach ar arolwg 'Which?', gwelwn mai'r ffactor pennaf a nodwyd gan y rhan fwyaf o deithwyr oedd y lle a oedd ar gael mewn gwasanaethau trên: dywedodd 35% mai'r ffactor pwysicaf a ddylanwadodd ar eu bodlonrwydd oedd eu gallu i gael sedd neu, yn anffodus, mewn llawer o achosion, ddigon o le i sefyll ar eu traed heb dresmasu ar le personol eu cymdogion nes y byddai'n rhaid iddynt briodi, a dweud y gwir, pe baent wedi bod yn agosach. Yn rhyfedd iawn, roedd y ffactor hwn yn bwysicach na dibynadwyedd a phrydlondeb, hyd yn oed ymhlith pobl a oedd yn defnyddio'r gwasanaeth hwnnw yn benodol i fynd i'r gwaith. Rhoddwyd llawer mwy o werth ar gysur ein trenau gan ddefnyddwyr hamdden, sy'n hynod bwysig i economi Cymru o ran y twristiaid a gludir i Gymru ar ein gwasanaethau rheilffordd.

Dyma union ddiben strategaeth cerbydau mewn gwirionedd. Yn gyntaf, mae'n hanfodol er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hynny o ran capasiti, capasiti yn y dyfodol a chysur ein teithwyr, ond mae hefyd yn hanfodol er mwyn ymateb i'r amgylchedd newidiol y cyfeiriais ato, gyda'r ymarfer trydaneiddio a fydd yn cael ei gwblhau yn 2021 yn ôl yr arfaeth. Daw Rheoliadau Hygyrchedd Rheilffyrdd (System Rheilffordd Diryngweithredol) 2010 i rym yn 2020, sydd, mewn Saesneg clir, yn golygu nad yw'r trenau sy'n rhedeg ar gledrau'r Cymoedd yn hygyrch i bobl anabl. Ni fyddant yn gallu rhedeg y gwasanaethau hynny. Felly, cawn broblem, a rhaid inni ofyn a fydd angen inni uwchraddio ein cerbydau i'w defnyddio am flwyddyn yn unig. Tybed a allai'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthym a yw wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y DU a'r UE ynghylch a fydd modd cyflwyno'r rheoliadau hynny fesul cam fel na fydd yn rhaid inni wastraffu arian felly.

Dadl arall, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd eraill yn sôn amdani, yw'r ddadl ynghylch a ddylem ffafrio model nid er elw yn lle model gwneud elw.

15:26

**Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I wonder if the Minister could respond to that, too.

Tybed a allai'r Gweinidog ymateb i hynny, hefyd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:27

**Keith Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Braint a phleser oedd bod yn rhan o'r pwyllgor hwn. Fel y mae sawl un wedi dweud yn barod, hoffwn longyfarch y cyn Gadeirydd ar ei waith. Roedd mor dda bod yr adroddiad hwn wedi cael ei dderbyn bron yn gyfan gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Croesawaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog ei bod yn gweld lle i newid y setliad datganoli a'i bod yn ymchwilio i'r opsiynau.

It was a pleasure and a privilege to be a member of this committee. As many have already done, I would like to congratulate the former Chair on his work. He was so good that this report has been accepted more or less in its entirety by the Welsh Government. I welcome the Minister's comments that she sees scope for changing the devolution settlement and that she is looking at the options.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae fy nghyd Aelodau wedi sôn yn barod am rai o'r pethau y mae'n rhaid inni wynebu yn y dyfodol. Eto, roeddwn yn falch o gael cymaint o gyfle i ymgysylltu â'r rhanddeiliaid trwy ein hymchwiliad—mae hynny'n cryfhau ein hymchwiliad a'r adroddiad terfynol. Wrth gwrs, mae cynnal ymgynghoriad llawn yn rhywbeth a adlewyrchir yn yr argymhellion, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld yr hyn a ddaw ohono. Nid ydym yn euog o fod yn gaeth i'n cadeiriau yma ym mae Caerdydd, gan ein bod wedi teithio ar y trên o Gaerdydd i Henffordd ar gyfer lansio ein hadroddiad.

My fellow committee members have already talked about some of what we must face in the future. Again, I was pleased to have so many opportunities to meet stakeholders during our inquiry—that strengthens the inquiry and the final report. Of course, holding a full consultation is something that is reflected in the recommendations, and I look forward to seeing what comes of that. We are not guilty of being tied to our chairs here in Cardiff bay, as we travelled by train to Hereford for the launch of our report.

Un pwnc pennaf yr hoffwn ei godi heddiw: ymwneud cymunedol, a hynny oherwydd y trafodaethau rwyf wedi eu cael gyda Rheilffordd Calon Cymru. Wrth ddechrau o'r orsaf yn Abertawe, gallwch deithio'r holl ffordd i Amwythig, drwy Llanelli, gan fwynhau golygfeydd 'splendid' drwy galon Cymru. Ond nid golygfa arbennig yn unig sydd ar gynnig; mae'r lein yn unigryw. Goroesodd doriadau Beeching yn y 1960au, ac erbyn hyn rydym yn gorfoleddu yn ei phrydfertwch, ac yn y ffordd y mae'n cysylltu sawl cymuned anghysbell a chymunedau eraill cefn gwlad Cymru. Rwyf wedi bod yn trafod gyda fforwm Rheilffordd Calon Cymru, sydd wedi gweithio ar astudiaeth dichonoldeb ac adroddiad. Yr hyn a ddywed yw y lluniwyd yr amserlen gyfredol yn sgîl ystyriaethau adnodd yn hytrach nag anghenion teithwyr neu reolaeth. Mae'r fforwm wedi bod yn gweithio ar amserlenni newydd a'u hintegreiddio gyda thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus arall.

I want to raise one main point today: community links, because of the discussions that I have been having with the Heart of Wales line. Travelling from Swansea station, you can travel all the way the Shrewsbury, through Llanelli, enjoying the splendid scenery of the heart of Wales. However, there is more than just the views on offer; the line is unique. It survived the Beeching cuts in the 1960s, and we now rejoice in its beauty and in the way it links various communities—remote and otherwise—in rural Wales. I have been in discussions with the Heart of Wales line forum, which has worked on a feasibility study and report. It says that the current timetable was drawn up as a result of resource considerations rather than passenger or management requirements. The forum has been working on new timetables, integrating them with other modes of public transport.

Mae hefyd wedi cynnal trafodaethau ar greu trên dwristiaeth. Awgrymodd cymdeithas partneriaethau rheilffyrdd cymunedol y gallai ymwneud cymunedol leihau costau, ac mae profiad yn dangos gostyngiad costau cyson gyda chynnydd yn nifer y teithwyr. Rwy'n croesawu sylwadau'r Gweinidog ei bod yn cryfhau'r berthynas gyda'r partneriaethau rheilffyrdd cymunedol er mwyn helpu gyda datblygiad polisi. Rwy'n gwybod ei bod wedi cwrdd â hwy i drafod camau nesaf. Gyda barn y pwyllgor yn gefnogol, a bwriad y Llywodraeth i weithio gyda'r sector, edrychaf ymlaen at weld y camau nesaf ar waith.

It has also held discussions about introducing a tourist train. The community rail partnership association suggested that community links could reduce costs, and experience shows a constant cost reduction with an increase in passenger numbers. I welcome the Minister's comments that she is strengthening the relationship with community rail partnerships in order to help with policy development. I know that she has met with the partnerships to discuss next steps. With the committee's support, and with the Government's intention to work with the sector, I look forward to seeing the next steps being implemented.

15:29

**Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I also pay tribute to Nick Ramsay for his chairing of this inquiry, and to all the clerks and researchers. I will not go into much detail now. There is no need to repeat much of what has already been said by my committee colleagues.

Hoffwn innau hefyd dalu teyrnged i Nick Ramsay am y ffordd y mae wedi cadeirio'r ymchwiliad hwn, ac i'r holl glercod ac ymchwilwyr. Nid ymhelæthaf ragor. Nid oes angen ailadrodd llawer o'r hyn sydd eisoes wedi cael ei ddweud gan fy nghyd-Aelodau ar y pwyllgor.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

This has been a very timely report. Some may have asked, 'Why report now on an issue that, on the face of it, may have appeared to be relating to the change of franchise several years down the line, as it were?' However, it is clear from other responses that we had that this was the time to face up to the challenges, but also the very real opportunities that we have with the next franchise, which could, of course, tie us up in Wales well into the 2030s.

Now is the time certainly to highlight the important decisions that we need to take on the next generation of rolling stock. No longer should we be willing to accept second, third or fourth-rate rolling stock, cascaded down from other parts of the UK, which are able to enjoy twenty-first century rolling stock, when we are still in the 1970s in some parts of Wales. The Government, I know, is already taking on board that challenge and we, as a committee, were able to spell out more clearly still the need to make sure that we build up the expertise that we need to be able to make the right decisions on specifications and on levels of investment in the future.

Now is also the time, of course, to state the case for ensuring that the next franchise is decided in Wales. The fact that we do not even know yet if the Welsh Government will be the franchising authority is a real handicap in itself to putting together the strategy we need for the next generation of Welsh train services. Yes, we know that, at the very least, there will be a role for Welsh Government in terms of co-specifying the franchise, but how can Government decide on specification without being able to know now the scope for ambition within the new franchise? How can long-term planning take place if the Minister still does not know what we need to plan for? Remember that the last franchise was built with no growth in mind at all. We need to increase rail use. We need to be able to attract passengers.

I am pleased to have been involved in this, which was my first inquiry. I hope that the report that we have published helps to form a firm foundation for what will, hopefully, be a Welsh-led franchise from 2018.

15:32

## **Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Presiding Officer, you will be pleased to know that I only intend to make a short contribution to this debate. For me as an Assembly Member representing rural mid Wales, a constituency that relies heavily on integrated public transport services, improving and enhancing the next franchise is going to be critical to encourage more people to use the rail networks serving the region, namely the Cambrian rail line. I agree with the committee's findings that early preparation is vital if we are going to see our desired outcome properly delivered.

Bu hwn yn adroddiad amserol iawn. Efallai y bydd rhai wedi gofyn, 'Pam cyhoeddi adroddiad yn awr ar fater a allai, ar yr olwg gyntaf, ymddangos fel petai'n ymwneud â newid masnachfrait rai blynyddoedd yn y dyfodol?' Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg o ymatebion eraill a gawsom mai dyma'r adeg i wynebu'r heriau, ond hefyd y cyfleoedd gwirioneddol iawn sydd gennym o ran y fasnachfrait nesaf, y gallwn, wrth gwrs, fod ynghlwm wrthi yng Nghymru tan ganol y 2030au.

Dyma'r adeg yn sicr i dynnu sylw at y penderfyniadau pwysig y mae angen inni eu gwneud ar y genhedlaeth nesaf o gerbydau. Ni ddylem fod yn barod i dderbyn cerbydau ail radd, trydedd radd neu bedwaredd radd mwyach, sy'n dod o rannau eraill o'r DU, sydd wedi cael cerbydau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, a ninnau'n dal i fod yn y 1970au mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Mae'r Llywodraeth, fe wn, eisoes yn derbyn yr her honno ac roeddem ni, fel pwyllgor, yn gallu nodi'n gliriach yr angen o hyd i sicrhau ein bod yn adeiladu ar yr arbenigedd sydd ei angen arnom er mwyn gallu gwneud y penderfyniadau cywir ar fanylebau ac ar lefelau buddsoddi yn y dyfodol.

Dyma'r adeg hefyd, wrth gwrs, i gyflwyno'r achos dros sicrhau bod y fasnachfrait nesaf yn cael ei phenderfynu yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffaith nad ydym hyd yn oed yn gwybod eto ai Llywodraeth Cymru fydd yr awdurdod masnachfreinio yn anfantais wirioneddol ynddi'i hun o ran llunio'r strategaeth sydd ei hangen arnom ar gyfer y genhedlaeth nesaf o wasanaethau trên yng Nghymru. Gwyddom, o leiaf, y bydd rôl i Lywodraeth Cymru o ran cyd-ragnodi'r fasnachfrait, ond sut y gall y Llywodraeth benderfynu ar y fanyleb heb allu gwybod yn awr beth fydd maint yr uchelgais yn y fasnachfrait newydd? Sut y gellir gwneud gwaith cynllunio hirdymor os nad yw'r Gweinidog yn gwybod o hyd beth mae angen inni gynllunio ar ei gyfer? Cofiwch fod y fasnachfrait ddiwethaf wedi cael ei llunio heb unrhyw dwf mewn golwg o gwbl. Mae angen inni gynyddu'r defnydd o'r rheilffyrdd. Mae angen inni allu denu teithwyr.

Rwy'n falch imi fod yn rhan o hyn, sef fy ymchwiliad cyntaf. Gobeithio y bydd yr adroddiad yr ydym wedi'i gyhoeddi yn helpu i ffurfio sylfaen gadarn ar gyfer yr hyn a fydd, gobeithio, yn fasnachfrait a arweinir gan Gymru o 2018.

Lywydd, byddwch yn falch o wybod mai cyfraniad byr yn unig y bwriadaf ei wneud yn y ddadl hon. I mi fel Aelod Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli canolbarth gwledig Cymru, sef etholaeth sy'n dibynnu'n fawr ar wasanaethau trafniadaeth gyhoeddus integredig, bydd y broses o wella ac ychwanegu at y fasnachfrait nesaf yn hanfodol er mwyn annog mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio'r rhwydweithiau rheilffyrdd sy'n gwasanaethu'r rhanbarth, sef rheilffordd llinell y Cambrian. Cytunaf â chanfyddiadau'r pwyllgor bod gwaith paratoi cynnar yn hanfodol os ydym am weld yr hyn a ddymunwn yn cael ei gyflawni'n briodol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)



The Cambrian line contributes significantly to the regional economy of mid Wales, providing vital links to hospitals, leisure facilities, and educational institutions and so on. The current services provided by Arriva Trains Wales undoubtedly bring valuable benefits to the people of mid Wales. As the UK economy recovers, the Cambrian line will have a vital role in boosting employment, growth and job prospects by connecting people in mid Wales to emerging and growing hubs in Wales and England. I know that the Minister has had the report from the Shrewsbury and Aberystwyth liaison committee, and I hope that perhaps she will be able to make some comment on that. That report, no doubt, will show what we already know that there is a great demand for the service.

I will just comment on recommendation 5 a little bit and highlight other developments beyond the hourly service. I particularly want to talk about this because I think that the hourly service—I think that the Minister would agree—is going to be a given and should be implemented sooner rather than later. First, I would like to see the reopening of Carno station. I know that the Minister has been engaged with the action group and is examining this proposal, which I welcome. I believe the addition of Carno station on the line to Aberystwyth will not profoundly affect journey times or passenger expectations of the service. Of course, there will be capital and running costs to be found, but I believe that those will be minimal.

However, there is the potential of additional services in other villages across mid Wales as well. An example that I would highlight is Abermule, which would be a new stop between Welshpool and Newton. There is a large, and growing, population in Abermule, which I believe could benefit significantly from a new rail service. I know that the Government has invested a lot of money into the business park there, which is served at the moment only by road, and it is significantly—and I emphasise the word ‘significantly’—under-utilised.

Therefore, I think that there is a strong economic case to examine other proposals in more detail, and I would be interested to hear the Minister’s initial comments on that, as well as on the Carno station, when she responds to the debate.

15:35

### **Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thought that it was only appropriate to say a few words on today’s motion, and on the report of the Enterprise and Business Committee into the future of the Wales and borders franchise, given that, for procedural reasons, it was tabled in my name, and my picture is in the report. So, there are just a few things that I wanted to say.

Mae llinell y Cambrian yn cyfrannu’n sylweddol at economi ranbarthol y canolbarth, gan gynnig cysylltiadau hanfodol i ysbytai, cyfleusterau hamdden, a sefydliadau addysgol ac yn y blaen. Mae’r gwasanaethau presennol a ddarperir gan Drenau Arriva Cymru, yn ddi-os, yn dod â manteision gwerthfawr i bobl y canolbarth. Wrth i economi’r DU adfer, bydd llinell y Cambrian yn chwarae rhan hanfodol i hybu cyfogaeth, twf a rhagolygon swyddi drwy gysylltu pobl yn y canolbarth â chanolfannau sy’n datblygu ac yn tyfu yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi cael yr adroddiad gan bwyllgor cyswilt Amwythig ac Aberystwyth, a gobeithio y bydd yn gallu gwneud rhai sylwadau ar hynny o bosibl. Bydd yr adroddiad hwnnw, yn ddiu, yn dangos yr hyn a wyddom eisoes sef bod galw mawr am y gwasanaeth.

Gwnaf ychydig o sylwadau ar argymhelliaid 5 yn unig a thynnu sylw at ddatblygiadau eraill y tu hwnt i’r gwasanaeth bob awr. Rwy’n awyddus iawn i sôn am hyn gan fy mod yn credu y bydd y gwasanaeth bob awr—credaf y byddai’r Gweinidog yn cytuno—yn rhywbeth sy’n siŵr o ddigwydd ac y dylid ei roi ar waith cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn weld gorsaf Carno yn ailagor. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi bod yn ymwneud â’r grŵp gweithredu a’i fod yn edrych ar y cynnig hwn, a chroesawaf hynny. Yn fy marn i, ni fydd ychwanegu gorsaf Carno ar y llinell i Aberystwyth yn effeithio rhyw lawer ar amseroedd teithio na disgwyliadau teithwyr o’r gwasanaeth. Wrth gwrs, bydd costau cyfalaf a rhedeg ynghlwm wrth hynny, ond credaf y bydd y symiau’n fach iawn.

Fodd bynnag, mae’r posibilrwydd o wasanaethau ychwanegol mewn pentrefi eraill ar draws y canolbarth hefyd. Un enghraifft y byddwn yn tynnu sylw ati yw Aber-miwl, sef arhosfan newydd rhwng y Trallwng a’r Drenewydd. Mae poblogaeth fawr a chynyddol yn Aber-miwl, y credaf y gallai gwasanaeth rheilffordd newydd fod o fudd mawr iddi. Gwn fod y Llywodraeth wedi buddsoddi llawer o arian yn y parc busnes yno, sy’n cael ei wasanaethu ar hyn o bryd ar y ffordd yn unig, ac sy’n cael ei danddefnyddio’n sylweddol—a phwysleisïaf y gair ‘sylweddol’.

Felly, credaf fod achos economaidd cryf dros archwilio cynigion eraill yn fanylach, a hoffwn glywed sylwadau cychwynnol y Gweinidog ar hynny, yn ogystal â’i sylwadau ar orsaf Carno, pan fydd yn ymateb i’r ddadl.

Meddyliais ei bod yn gwbl briodol dweud ychydig eiriau ar y cynnig heddiw, ac ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar ddyfodol masnachfaint Cymru a’r gororau, o gofio iddo gael ei gyflwyno yn fy enw i, am resymau trefniadol, a bod fy llun yn yr adroddiad. Felly, mae ychydig o bethau yr oeddwn am eu nodi.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I would like to thank all the people who contributed to the report. There were very many of them, and there were very many stakeholders. It is true to say—as other speakers have done—that it was a very complex subject to deal with, but a hugely important one. What became apparent during the course of the enterprise committee's inquiry was the huge—well, overwhelming—need to get this process going as soon as possible, to ensure that, when the existing franchise comes to an end, there is a franchise ready to go, and, more than that, that that franchise is free from the flaws of the last franchise.

Now, those flaws were not due to the Welsh Government. How many times does the Government hear my side saying that it was the Government's fault? Well, in this case it was not the Government's fault, because it was not involved in the last franchise. As we hear, there is potential now for the Welsh Government to have a considerable influence on the development of the next franchise, and that can only be a good thing.

Now, I must admit that there was disagreement, or discussion, or debate—however you want to frame it—in the committee around whether you should go for a profit model or a not-for-profit model, or a not-for-dividend model, which was the other term that was used. Other speakers have mentioned those. I must admit that we steered clear of that; we did not want to go down that road—or rail—to discuss which model we wanted. We did not think that that was the role of the committee. The role of the committee was to make sure that the Welsh Government looks at outcomes, and that the UK Government looks at outcomes, and looks at where we want to go.

The passenger must be central in all of this. At the moment, the passenger is not central in it, in any way. If the passenger had been central, then some of the flaws that we have at the moment would not exist. One of the most extraordinary things about the current franchise is that there is no obligation for continuous improvement, no obligation really for effective monitoring, and no obligation for effective monitoring that listens to what the passenger is actually saying. Therefore, that needs to change—that is clear—and that is in the recommendations.

Rolling stock has been mentioned. This is a huge aspect of where we go from now, and we do not have much time. The current franchise is on its way out, and, in a few years' time, there will have to be something really adequate to replace it. Do you go for cascaded rolling stock? That means second-hand rolling stock, for those who are not in the know. We heard good evidence, actually, that cascaded rolling stock would be very effective. You can actually upgrade existing rolling stock, which may be made free from changes to the rail network in other parts of the country. You can change it in a way that would mean that the public would not really notice that it was second hand. So, that can be done. However, are there then value-for-money issues in doing that? Maybe it is better to go for new stock at the start.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r holl bobl a gyfrannodd at yr adroddiad. Bu nifer fawr ohonynt, a bu nifer fawr iawn o randdeiliaid. Mae'n wir dweud—fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill—ei fod yn bwnc cymhleth iawn i'w drafod, ond yn un hynod bwysig. Yr hyn a ddaeth yn amlwg yn ystod ymchwiliad y pwyllgor menter oedd yr angen enfawr—wel, dybryd—i roi cychwyn ar y broses hon cyn gynted ag y bo modd, er mwyn sicrhau, pan ddaw'r fasnachfrait bresennol i ben, fod masnachfrait yn barod i'w chyflwyno, ac, yn fwy na hynny, nad yw'r fasnachfrait honno yn cynnwys diffygion y fasnachfrait ddiwethaf.

Nawr, nid Llywodraeth Cymru fu'n gyfrifol am y diffygion hynny. Sawl gwaith y mae'r Llywodraeth yn clywed fy ochr i yn dweud mai'r Llywodraeth sydd ar fai? Wel, yn yr achos hwn, nid y Llywodraeth oedd ar fai, am nad oedd yn ymwneud â'r fasnachfrait ddiwethaf. Fel y clywn, mae posibilrwydd bellach i Lywodraeth Cymru gael cryn ddylanwad ar y broses o ddatblygu'r fasnachfrait nesaf, a rhaid mai peth da yw hynny.

Nawr, rhaid imi gyfaddef bod anghytundeb, neu drafodaeth, neu ddadl—pa air bynnag y mynnoch—yn y pwyllgor ynghylch a ddylid dewis model er elw neu fodel nid er elw, neu fodel diddiddid, sef y term arall a ddefnyddiwyd. Cyfeiriodd siaradwyr eraill at hynny. Rhaid imi gyfaddef inni osgoi hynny; nid oeddem am ddilyn y ffordd—neu'r llinell—honno a thrafod pa fodel yr oeddem am ei gael. Nid oeddem yn meddwl mai dyna oedd rôl y pwyllgor. Rôl y pwyllgor oedd sicrhau bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn edrych ar ganlyniadau, a bod Llywodraeth y DU yn edrych ar ganlyniadau, ac yn ystyried i ba gyfeiriad yr ydym am fynd.

Rhaid i deithwyr fod yn ganolog yn hyn i gyd. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw teithwyr yn ganolog, ar unrhyw gyfrif. Pe bai'r teithwyr wedi bod yn ganolog, yna ni fyddai rhai o'r diffygion sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yn bodoli. Un o'r pethau mwyaf hynod am y fasnachfrait bresennol yw nad oes unrhyw rwymedigaeth ar gyfer gwelliant parhaus, nac unrhyw rwymedigaeth mewn gwirionedd ar gyfer gwaith monitro effeithiol, nac unrhyw rwymedigaeth ar gyfer gwaith monitro effeithiol sy'n gwrandao ar yr hyn sydd gan deithwyr i'w ddweud mewn gwirionedd. Felly, mae angen i hynny newid—mae hynny'n amlwg—ac mae hynny yn yr argymhellion.

Soniwyd am gerbydau. Mae hyn yn agwedd fawr iawn o ran i ble y byddwn yn mynd o hyn ymlaen, ac nid oes gennym lawer o amser. Mae'r fasnachfrait gyfredol yn dirwyn i ben, ac, ymhén ychydig flynyddoedd, bydd yn rhaid cael rhywbeth digonol yn ei lle. A ydych yn dewis cerbydau wedi'u rhaedru? Mae hynny'n golygu cerbydau ail-law, i'r rhai hynny na wyddant beth yw ystyr y term. Clywsom dystiolaeth dda y byddai cerbydau wedi'u rhaedru yn effeithiol iawn, mewn gwirionedd. Gallwch uwchraddio'r cerbydau presennol mewn gwirionedd, a gellir gwneud hynny heb newidiadau i'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd mewn rhannau eraill o'r wlad. Gallwch newid cerbydau mewn ffordd a fyddai'n golygu na fyddai'r cyhoedd yn wir yn sylwi mai rhai ail-law oeddent. Felly, gellir gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, a oes materion o ran gwerth am arian yn codi o wneud hynny? Efallai ei bod yn well dewis cerbydau newydd o'r cychwyn.

The Welsh Government has to look at it, and it needs to have a rolling stock strategy. If the Welsh Government is really clever, then it will actually have its own cascaded rolling stock strategy. That would involve the purchase of new stock to start with, but then, down the line, an idea of where that rolling stock is going to go when it itself is cascaded. That would be very clever, but it is also very, very difficult, and there is not much time. Therefore, these are all issues that the Minister needs to consider.

Eluned Parrott mentioned the Valleys lines, the metro, and electrification. There is no doubt at all that electrification and this process are very carefully tied together. If there is a delay in electrification, then, clearly, rolling stock issues are going to be paramount, and, if there is a delay in rolling stock, then the electrification issue is questionable as well.

There is also an issue of maintenance. Where do you actually put the maintenance obligation? Does it go on the Welsh Government? Does the maintenance obligation go on the leasing company or on the day-to-day running of the trains? All of these are big issues that have to be addressed.

I urge you all to take a look at the report if you can. It is a very comprehensive report and the most important aspect of it is to say to the Welsh Government, 'Get your act together now and let us get on with this as soon as possible because, in a few years' time, we don't want people waking up and discovering that there is not a franchise in place and those trains are not there'. That would be the ultimate nightmare scenario.

Finally, I thank everyone for their thanks for my chairing of the committee. May I thank all of you? I have had a wonderful time chairing the Enterprise and Business Committee and I know that you will do many good reports in the future.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru ystyried hynny, ac mae angen iddi lunio strategaeth cerbydau. Os yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn wirioneddol graff, yna bydd yn llunio ei strategaeth cerbydau wedi'u rhaedru ei hun. Byddai hynny'n golygu prynu stoc newydd i ddechrau, ond wedyn, yn nes ymlaen, gyda syniad o ble y bydd y cerbydau yn mynd pan fyddant yn cael eu rhaedru eu hunain. Byddai hynny'n graff iawn, ond yn anodd iawn, iawn hefyd, ac nid oes llawer o amser. Felly, mae'r rhain i gyd yn faterion y mae angen i'r Gweinidog eu hystyried.

Soniodd Eluned Parrott am gledrau'r Cymoedd, y metro, a thrydaneiddio. Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw trydaneiddio a'r broses hon ynghlwm wrth ei gilydd. Os bydd oedi wrth drydaneiddio, yna, yn amlwg, bydd materion o ran cerbydau yn hollbwysig, ac, os bydd oedi wrth ddarparu cerbydau, yna bydd cwestiynau ynglŷn â thrydaneiddio hefyd.

Cyfyd mater o ran cynnal a chadw hefyd. Ar bwy y byddwch yn rhoi'r rhwymedigaeth o ran cynnal a chadw mewn gwirionedd? Ar Lywodraeth Cymru? Ar y cwmni prydlesu ynteu ar y broses o redeg y trenau o ddydd i ddydd? Mae'r rhain i gyd yn faterion o bwys y mae'n rhaid rhoi sylw iddynt.

Hoffwn annog pob un ohonoch i edrych ar yr adroddiad os oes modd. Mae'n adroddiad cynhwysfawr iawn a'r agwedd bwysicaf iddi yw ei bod yn ddweud wrth Lywodraeth Cymru, 'Rhowch drefn ar bethau yn awr a gadewch inni fwrw ymlaen â hyn cyn gynted ag y bo modd oherwydd, mewn ychydig flynyddoedd, nid ydym am weld pobl yn deffro ac yn darganfod nad oes masnachfaint ar waith ac nad yw'r trenau hynny yn rhedeg'. Honno fyddai'r senario fwyaf hunllefus yn y pen draw.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a wnaeth ddiolch imi am y ffordd y gwneuthum gadeirio'r pwyllgor. Hoffwn ddiolch i bob un ohonoch. Rwyf wedi cael amser gwych yn cadeirio'r Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes a gwn y byddwch yn paratoui llawer o adroddiadau da yn y dyfodol.

15:40 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call on the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport to speak on behalf of the Government.

Galwaf ar Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth i siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:40 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth / The Minister for Economy, Science and Transport*

Thank you very much indeed, Presiding Officer. I would like to start my contribution by thanking the previous Chair of the Enterprise and Business Committee for the work that he has undertaken during his time as Chair, and also for this particularly excellent report. I am grateful to the Members for this. This report, as Byron Davies indicated, was interesting for Members to do, but it is very productive for us as a Government in terms of the guidance it sets out and its very realistic recommendations.

Diolch yn fawr iawn yn wir, Lywydd. Hoffwn ddechrau fy nghyfraniad drwy ddiolch i Gadeirydd blaenorol y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes am y gwaith y mae wedi'i wneud yn ystod ei gyfnod fel Cadeirydd, a hefyd am yr adroddiad arbennig o dda hwn. Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau am hyn. Roedd yr adroddiad hwn, fel y nododd Byron Davies, yn un ddiddorol i Aelodau ei baratoi, ond mae'n gynhyrchiol iawn i ni fel Llywodraeth o ran y canllawiau a noda a'i argymhellion realistig iawn.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

As I outlined in my response to the report, the Wales and borders franchise provides essential connectivity for the people it serves, and has the potential to further improve employment and social opportunities for many people. The report raises important matters for consideration and I am pleased to be able to accept, or accept in principle, all the recommendations in my formal response. I am also pleased that we have already addressed some of the committee's recommendations and in my scrutiny session in this morning's committee, we touched on some of the issues, particularly about the capacity and ability of staff in my department to do the work. On other issues as well, we need to recognise that there is real work to be done, and as Nick Ramsay indicated, the timescales are very short in terms of preparing the ground in order to have a successful discussion on the franchise.

Members will be aware that the Welsh Government is not the franchising authority. The current Chair of the committee, William Graham, is perhaps correct in saying that perhaps we have overlaboured that point, but that is the factual position. However, negotiations are under way with the UK Government on the future of the Wales and borders rail franchise and we do have close discussions with the Department for Transport because it is in all our interests, because it is a cross-border service, to ensure that, in the future, the franchise arrangements are correct.

With the new franchise due to begin in 2018, we are taking action to ensure that it delivers improved services and value for money, and we are working to negotiate the devolution of the necessary powers and funding—the funding point is very important on this—so that we are in a position to specify and procure the next franchise, enabling us to get the best options. I can assure Lord Elis-Thomas that I will not be dragging my feet on the journey to devolution of powers in this area, but I will also need the appropriate financial settlements so that we can get what we want from rail and so that we can have an integrated transport system in Wales. That is absolutely key to the development of our economy and our ability to ensure that we have what is fit for purpose in Wales, recognising both urban and rural.

In terms of the rural, the issues that were raised by Russell George are also very important in terms of what we could be looking at if we had the financial resource to do it; what areas we could open up; what services we could have; and how we could make the best of the investment that we have made in other areas to ensure that we have that connectivity. As part of this, it is essential that we have sufficient revenue and capital resources. Negotiations on resources are obviously an issue close to my heart, but we are being proactive in ensuring the best for rail services in Wales.

Fel yr amlinellais yn fy ymateb i'r adroddiad, mae masnachfaint Cymru a'r gororau yn darparu cysylltedd hanfodol i'r bobl y mae'n eu gwasanaethu, ac mae ganddo'r potensial i wella cyfleoedd cyflogaeth a chyfleoedd cymdeithasol i lawer o bobl. Mae'r adroddiad yn codi materion pwysig i'w hystyried ac rwy'n falch o allu derbyn, neu dderbyn mewn egwyddor, yr holl argymhellion yn fy ymateb ffurfiol. Rwyf hefyd yn falch ein bod eisoes wedi mynd i'r afael â rhai o argymhellion y pwyllgor ac yn fy sesiwn graffu yn y pwyllgor y bore yma, soniwyd am rai o'r materion, yn enwedig ynghylch gallu staff yn fy adran i wneud y gwaith. O ran materion eraill hefyd, mae angen inni gydnabod bod gwaith gwirioneddol i'w wneud, ac fel y nododd Nick Ramsay, mae'r terfynau amser yn fyr iawn o ran braenaru'r tir er mwyn cael trafodaeth lwyddiannus ar y fasnachfaint.

Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol nad Llywodraeth Cymru yw'r awdurdod masnachfreinio. Mae Cadeirydd presennol y pwyllgor, William Graham, yn iawn o bosibl wrth iddo ddweud ein bod wedi gorbwysleisio'r pwynt hwnnw, ond dyna'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni. Fodd bynnag, mae cyd-drafodaethau â Llywodraeth y DU ar ddyfodol masnachfaint rheilffyrdd Cymru a'r Gororau wedi dechrau ac rydym yn wir yn cael trafodaethau manwl â'r Adran Drafnidiaeth am fod hynny'n fuddiol inni i gyd, gan mai gwasanaeth drawsffiniol ydyw, er mwyn sicrhau bod trefniadau'r rhyddfaint, yn y dyfodol, yn gywir.

Gyda'r fasnachfaint newydd yn dechrau yn 2018 yn ôl y bwriad, rydym yn cymryd camau i sicrhau ei bod yn cynnig gwell gwasanaethau a gwerth am arian, ac rydym yn gweithio i gyd-drafod datganoli'r pwerau a'r cyllid angenrheidiol—mae'r pwynt o ran cyllid yn bwysig iawn o ran hyn—fel ein bod mewn sefyllfa i ragnodi a chaffael y fasnachfaint nesaf, gan ein galluogi i gael y dewisiadau gorau. Gallaf sicrhau'r Arglwydd Elis-Thomas na fyddaf yn llusgo fy nhraed ar y daith i ddatganoli pwerau yn y maes hwn, ond bydd angen hefyd imi gael y setliadau ariannol priodol fel y gallwn gael yr hyn sydd ei angen arnom ei gael gan y rheilffyrdd ac fel y gallwn gael system drafnidiaeth integredig yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n gwbl allweddol i ddatblygiad ein heconomi a'n gallu i sicrhau ein bod yn cael yr hyn sy'n addas at y diben yng Nghymru, gan gydnabod ardaloedd trefol a gwledig.

O ran ardaloedd gwledig, mae'r materion a godwyd gan Russell George hefyd yn bwysig iawn o ran yr hyn y gallem fod yn ei ystyried pe bai gennym adnoddau ariannol i wneud hynny; pa ardaloedd y gallem sicrhau gwell mynediad iddynt; pa wasanaethau y gallem eu cael; a sut y gallem wneud y gorau o'r buddsoddiad yr ydym wedi'i wneud mewn meysydd eraill er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn creu'r cysylltedd hwnnw. Fel rhan o hyn, mae'n hanfodol bod gennym ddigon o adnoddau refeniw a chyfalaf. Yn amlwg, mae cyd-drafodaethau ar adnoddau yn fater sy'n agos at fy nghalon, ond rydym yn rhagweithiol o ran sicrhau'r gorau dros wasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru.

I have had a number of meetings recently with Network Rail and the rail industry. I have been discussing with Mark Langman, the route managing director for Wales, about the electrification of the north Wales coast mainline, which also impacts on us here. I have also met with a range of different rail groups, including the Rail Delivery Group, Great Western, the heart of Wales partnership, the Shrewsbury to Aberystwyth rail liaison committee and Carno Station Action Group. There are a number of very substantial investments being made in rail infrastructure and rolling stock across the UK over the next 10 years and we want Welsh businesses to be in a position to benefit from these contracts wherever possible. In January this year, a rail industry supply event took place in Cardiff that was targeted at appropriate companies and procurement specialists were there to talk to Welsh SMEs about the opportunities.

I will turn back to the recommendations that I accepted in principle. On the committee's recommendation in relation to developing a rolling stock programme, I support that point, but I do have some difficulty with it because we are not the franchising authority. However, I thought that it was important for me to outline today some of the issues that we are looking at in terms of preparatory work on rolling stock. We are obviously aware now that we are looking on a whole-life basis at different rolling stock options from procuring, leasing or direct purchase of new trains and leasing a range of cascaded trains, which Nick Ramsay alluded to. The primary objectives are value for money over a 40-year period, direct purchase of a fleet, leasing enhanced models. So, we have to look at that; we also have to look at all of the issues about the links into electrification. This is extremely complex now. We very much welcome the UK Government's support for electrification and financial support to ensure electrification within Wales, which is wholly necessary for us to be able to get the complete picture.

Regardless of whether the Department for Transport or the Welsh Government is the franchising authority, I want to ensure that we use this opportunity to get considerable improvements for users. It is important that the franchise is designed to meet the expectations of the travelling public—that comes back to some of the points that have already been made by individuals, such as Eluned Parrott, about what rail users really want. We have looked with interest at the 'Which?' report, and sometimes all that rail users want is clean and tidy trains that do run on time. They understand that sometimes they do not, but that is what they want. I think that, as the Parliamentary Under Secretary of State for Transport, Stephen Hammond, said:

'As well as getting passengers to their destinations, operators should be working hard to improve the overall experience of their customers.'

'Passengers have every right to expect trains to arrive on time and be clean, and while this can be a challenge, I expect operators to do all they can.'

I think that that must totally underpin the discussions that we have in future on this.

Rwyf wedi cael nifer o gyfarfodydd yn ddiweddar â Network Rail a'r diwydiant rheilffyrdd. Rwyf wedi bod yn trafod â Mark Langman, rheolwr-gyfarwyddwr llwybrau Cymru, ynghylch trydaneiddio'r brif linell ar arfordir y gogledd, sydd hefyd yn effeithio arnom ni yma. Rwyf hefyd wedi cyfarfod â nifer o wahanol grwpiau rheilffyrdd, gan gynnwys Grŵp Cyflawni'r Rheilffyrdd, Great Western, partneriaeth calon Cymru, pwyllgor cyswllt rheilffordd Amwythig i Aberystwyth a Grŵp Gweithredu Gorsaf Carno. Mae nifer o fuddsoddiadau sylweddol iawn yn cael eu gwneud yn y seilwaith rheilffyrdd a'r cerbydau ledled DU dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf, ac rydym am i fusnesau yng Nghymru fod mewn sefyllfa i gael budd o'r contractau hyn lle bynnag y bo modd. Ym mis Ionawr eleni, cynhaliwyd digwyddiad i gyflenwyr yn y diwydiant rheilffyrdd yng Nghaerdydd a oedd wedi'i anelu at gwmnïau priodol ac roedd arbenigwyr caffael yno i siarad â busnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru am y cyfleoedd.

Trof yn ôl at yr argymhellion yr wyf wedi'u derbyn mewn egwyddor. O ran argymhelliad y pwyllgor mewn perthynas â datblygu rhaglen cerbydau, cefnogaf y pwynt hwnnw, ond caf rywfaint o anhawster ag ef gan nad ni yw'r awdurdod masnachfreinio. Fodd bynnag, meddyliais ei bod yn bwysig imi amlinellu heddiw rai o'r materion yr ydym yn eu hystyried o ran gwaith paratoi ar gerbydau. Rydym yn amlwg yn ymwybodol erbyn hyn ein bod yn edrych ar wahanol opsiynau o ran cerbydau ar sail oes gyfan o gaffael trenau newydd, eu prydlesu neu eu prynu'n uniongyrchol a phrydlesu ystod o drenau wedi'u rhaeadru, y cyfeiriodd Nick Ramsay atynt. Y prif amcanion yw sicrhau gwerth am arian dros gyfnod o 40 mlynedd, prynu fflyd yn uniongyrchol, prydlesu gwell modelau. Felly, rhaid inni edrych ar hynny; rhaid inni hefyd edrych ar yr holl faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r cysylltiadau â thrydaneiddio. Mae hyn yn hynod gymhleth erbyn hyn. Rydym yn croesawu cefnogaeth a chymorth ariannol Llywodraeth y DU i drydaneiddio'n fawr iawn er mwyn sicrhau trydaneiddio yng Nghymru, sy'n gwbl angenrheidiol inni allu cael y darlun cyflawn.

Waeth pa un ai'r Adran Drafnidiaeth ynteu Llywodraeth Cymru fydd yr awdurdod masnachfreinio, rwyf am sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio ar y cyfle hwn i sicrhau gwelliannau sylweddol i ddefnyddwyr. Mae'n bwysig bod y fasnachfrait wedi'i chynllunio i fodloni disgwyliadau'r cyhoedd sy'n teithio—mae hynny'n ymwneud â'r rhai o'r pwyntiau sydd eisoes wedi cael eu gwneud gan unigolion, fel Eluned Parrott, am yr hyn sydd ei wir eisiau ar ddefnyddwyr. Rydym wedi darllen adroddiad 'Which?' gyda diddordeb, ac weithiau y cyfan y mae defnyddwyr rheilffyrdd am ei gael yw trenau glân a thaclus sy'n brydlon. Maent yn deall nad felly y mae, weithiau, ond dyna'r hyn y maent am ei weld. Credaf, fel y dyweodd yr Is-ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth, Stephen Hammond:

Yn ogystal â chludo teithwyr i ben eu taith, dylai gweithredwyr weithio'n galed i wella profiad cyffredinol eu cwsmeriaid.

Mae gan deithwyr bob hawl i ddisgwyl i drenau gyrraedd ar amser ac iddynt fod yn lân, ac er y gall hyn fod yn her, disgwyliaf i weithredwyr wneud popeth o fewn eu gallu.

Credaf fod yn rhaid i hynny fod yn sail i'r trafodaethau a gawn ar hyn yn y dyfodol.

I would like to thank the committee very much for all of the work that it has put into this and the many and varied contributions today. I think that the important points for us in particular, in some of the points that were made, are on the rolling stock, which we will certainly have to look at. On the future model, I was relieved in many ways that the committee did not look at the appropriate future model, and that we did not have a discussion on whether we should have not-for-profit or not-for-dividend, because we have been informed by Scotland that, even when it went out to look for it, no-one came in to bid for it on that basis. So, it is very important that we understand what is out there and what is viable. I do not dismiss the fact that we will look at it, but we have to be careful that we get the right deal out of all of this in the long run.

Also, what must underpin all of this totally is our obligation to passengers, which I think has also come quite clearly out of the report. I was very interested in the contribution from Lord Elis-Thomas, who talked about his experiences with steam trains. I am afraid that I am old enough to remember going on the Mumbles train to Black Pill from a second station in Gowerton. I actually have a picture of me doing this with a crowd of other people. So, I think that all those of us of a certain generation here have our stories about trains and we all have very fond memories of how they may once have run. I am not sure that those memories are quite accurate—I think that when you are a child sometimes you do not mind waiting on a station for a bit longer because it is exciting to be going somewhere. When you are an adult and thinking, 'Am I going to get to the Assembly on time? Am I going to get to my meeting on time?', you are a tad more impatient with the service.

I thank the new Chair very much for his introductory remarks on this report. This report is very useful for us. I will be delighted to update this Assembly in due course and at regular intervals formally on how we are taking matters along. I might well ask across parties for your support in some areas if we are not making the relevant progress that we are required to make to ensure that we have the best deal on the next franchise and that we are not lumbered with the type of deal that we are lumbered with now. Thank you very much.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r pwyllgor yn fawr iawn am yr holl waith a wnaed ganddo ar hyn a'r cyfraniadau niferus ac amrywiol heddiw. Credaf mai'r pwyntiau pwysig i ni yn benodol, mewn rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed, yw'r rhai ynglŷn â cherbydau, y bydd yn rhaid inni eu hystyried, yn sicr. O ran y model yn y dyfodol, rwy'n falch mewn sawl ffordd nad ystyriodd y pwyllgor y model priodol yn y dyfodol, ac na chawsom drafodaeth ynghylch a ddylem gael model nid er elw neu fodel diddifidend, oherwydd cawsom wybod gan yr Alban, hyd yn oed pan aeth ati i geiso hynny, nad ymgeisiodd neb ar y sail honno. Felly, mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn deall yr hyn sydd ar gael a'r hyn sy'n hyfyw. Nid wyf yn diystyru'r ffaith y byddwn yn edrych arno, ond rhaid inni fod yn ofalus ein bod yn cael y cytundeb gorau o hyn i gyd yn yr hirdymor.

Hefyd, rhaid mai'r hyn sy'n sail i'r cyfan oll yw ein rhwymedigaeth i deithwyr, sydd hefyd, yn fy marn i, wedi cael ei nodi'n glir yn yr adroddiad. Roedd gennyf ddiddordeb mawr yng nghyfraniad yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas, a soniodd am ei brofiadau gyda threnau stêm. Rwy'n ddigon hen, mae arnaf ofn, i gofio mynd ar y trê'n o'r Mwmbwls i Black Pill o ail orsaf yn Nhref-gŵyr. A dweud y gwir, mae gennyf lun ohonof fy hun yn gwneud hyn gyda thorf o bobl eraill. Felly, credaf y bydd gan bob un ohonom o genhedlaeth benodol yma ein hanesion am drenau ac mae gennym oll atgofion melys iawn o'r ffordd yr oeddent yn arfer rhedeg o bosibl. Nid wyf yn siŵr bod yr atgofion hynny yn gwbl gywir—pan ydych yn blentyn weithiau nid oes ots gennyf aros yn yr orsaf am ychydig yn hwy, fe gredaf, am ei bod yn beth cyffrous mynd i rywle. Pan fyddwch yn oedolyn ac yn meddwl, 'A fyddaf yn cyrraedd y Cynulliad mewn pryd? A fyddaf yn cyrraedd fy nghyfarfod mewn pryd?', rydych ychydig yn fwy diamynedd gyda'r gwasanaeth.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Cadeirydd newydd yn fawr iawn am ei sylwadau rhagarweiniol ar yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ddefnyddiol iawn inni. Bydd yn dda gennyf roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad hwn maes o law ac yn ffurfiol o bryd i'w gilydd ynglŷn â sut rydym yn gweithredu ar faterion. Mae'n ddigon posibl y byddaf yn gofyn i bob plaid am eich cefnogaeth mewn rhai meysydd os na wnawn y cynnydd perthnasol y mae'n ofynnol inni ei wneud er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cael y cytundeb gorau o ran y fasnachfaint nesaf, ac nad ydym yn gorfod goddef y math o gytundeb yr ydym yn gorfod ei oddef yn awr. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

15:48 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call on the Chair of the Enterprise and Business Committee, William Graham, to reply to the debate.

Galwaf ar Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes, William Graham, i ymateb i'r ddadl.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

15:48 **William Graham** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you, Presiding Officer. May I just refer to some of the speakers this afternoon? Certainly, Joyce Watson reminded us very strongly that it was a no-growth franchise and that there was a definite need for adequate funding. She emphasised at the beginning our talk about rolling stock and how this must be compatible with electrical connections and that the capacity issue must not be overlooked. It is also necessary for our influence as a Welsh Government to be emphasised to the UK Government at this time, before preparations can be made.

Diolch ichi, Lywydd. A gaf gyfeirio at rai o'r siaradwyr y prynhawn yma? Yn sicr, gwnaeth Joyce Watson ein hatgoffau'n gryf iawn mai masnachfaint dim twf ydoedd a bod angen pendant am gyllid digonol. Pwysleisiodd ar y dechrau ein trafodaeth am gerbydau a sut y mae'n rhaid i hyn gydweddu â chysylltiadau trydanol ac na ddylid diystyru mater capasiti. Mae angen hefyd i'n dylanwad fel Llywodraeth Cymru gael ei bwysleisio i Lywodraeth y DU ar yr adeg hon, cyn y gellir gwneud paratodau.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)



It was interesting to hear what Dafydd Elis-Thomas had to say about railways being politically exciting. It is some 150 years, I think, since railways were really politically exciting. Certainly, there was an enormous discussion in Wales at that particular period when it was disclosed that it took 23 hours for a railway wagon loaded with coal from the Rhondda to come to Cardiff and 24 hours for it to go back. This may not seem very important to us now, but at that time it was absolutely critical. The importance of railways cannot be overlooked.

He also reminded us that the themes must be addressed in concert; they cannot be addressed by themselves. He paid tribute, quite rightly, to the way in which the staff of the railways, particularly Arriva, responded so magnificently in very difficult conditions, and how Network Rail, the franchise holder, required integration of its services with bus services. He also said that we are not a lobby and that the Government must be recognised on an equal footing in pressing for the franchise to be devolved.

Byron Davies reminded us of the challenges of a cross-industry buy-in. A theme throughout the debate this afternoon has been that of rolling stock. I think that I read somewhere that there is no rolling stock in Wales that is less than 20 years old, which is pretty poor and an indictment of the service that we presently get.

Specialist skills were remarked upon, and I know that the Minister is well aware that her department will need to be fully up to speed at the appropriate time.

The devolved nature of the settlement was shown, particularly how important it is for all those who represent Wales to fully come behind the Government in trying to get the franchise fully recognised and negotiated.

Eluned Parrott was very helpful in reminding us of the ScotRail consultation, which is far more than perhaps we would expect in Wales, but is certainly something that we can aim for. The complexity, reliability and punctuality of services were remarked upon, as was accessibility and whether there would be some failures in compliance with the law coming in very shortly.

Keith Davies reminded us of community engagement and the importance of that very beautiful line through the heart of Wales. That was very rightly said. Certainly, it needs far more, and, when we come to discuss tourism, that line could be included most particularly. Clearly, the emphasis must be on a timetable integrated with public transport, a matter which the Minister has already referred to.

Roedd yn ddiddorol clywed yr hyn a oedd gan Dafydd Elis-Thomas i'w ddweud bod rheilffyrdd yn wleidyddol gyffrous. Mae tua 150 o flynyddoedd, fe gredaf, ers i'r rheilffyrdd fod yn wirioneddol wleidyddol gyffrous. Yn sicr, cafwyd trafodaeth fawr yng Nghymru bryd hynny pan ddatgelwyd ei bod yn cymryd 23 awr i wagen reilffordd llawn glo o'r Rhondda gyrraedd Caerdydd a 24 awr iddi ddechwyn. Efallai na fydd hyn yn ymddangos yn bwysig iawn inni erbyn hyn, ond ar y pryd roedd yn gwbl hanfodol. Ni ellir gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd y rheilffyrdd.

Fe'n hatgoffodd hefyd fod yn rhaid ymdrin â'r themâu ar y cyd; ni ellir ymdrin â hwy ar eu pennau eu hunain. Talodd deyrnged, a hynny'n gwbl briodol, i'r ffordd yr ymatebodd staff y rheilffyrdd, yn enwedig Arriva, mor wych mewn amgylchiadau anodd iawn, a sut y bu angen i Network Rail, sef deiliad y fasnachfaint, integreiddio ei wasanaethau â gwasanaethau bws. Dywedodd hefyd nad lobiwyr ydym a bod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gael ei chydnabod ar sail gyfartal wrth bwysio am i'r fasnachfaint gael ei datganoli.

Gwnaeth Byron Davies ein hatgoffa am heriau cefnogaeth ar draws y diwydiant. Un thema drwy gydol y ddadl y prynhawn yma yw cerbydau. Credaf imi ddarllen yn rhywle nad oes unrhyw gerbydau yng Nghymru sy'n llai nag 20 oed, sy'n eithaf gwael ac yn arwydd damniol o'r gwasanaeth yr ydym yn ei gael ar hyn o bryd.

Cyfeiriwyd at sgiliau arbenigol, a gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol y bydd angen i'w hadran fod yn gwbl barod ar yr adeg briodol.

Dangoswyd natur ddatganoledig y setliad, yn enwedig pa mor bwysig ydyw bod pawb sy'n cynrychioli Cymru yn gwbl gefnogol i'r Llywodraeth o ran ceisio sicrhau bod y fasnachfaint wedi'i chydnabod ac wedi'i thrafod yn llawn.

Gwnaeth Eluned Parrott bwynt defnyddiol iawn wrth ein hatgoffa o ymgynghoriad ScotRail, sy'n llawer mwy nag y byddem yn ei ddisgwyl o bosibl yng Nghymru, ond mae'n sicr yn rhywbeth y gallwn anelu ato. Cyfeiriwyd at gymhlethdod, dibynadwyedd a phrydlondeb y gwasanaethau, a hefyd hygrychedd ac a fyddai rhai methiannau i gydymffurfio â'r gyfraith sy'n dod i rym yn fuan iawn.

Gwnaeth Keith Davies ein hatgoffa o'r angen i ymgysylltu â'r gymuned a phwysigrwydd y llinell hardd iawn drwy ganolbarth Cymru. Roedd y pwynt hwnnw'n briodol iawn. Yn sicr, mae angen iddi gael llawer mwy, a, phan awn ati i drafod twristiaeth, gellid cynnwys y llinell honno yn arbennig. Yn amlwg, rhaid i'r pwyslais fod ar amserlen integredig â thrafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, sef mater y mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi cyfeirio ato.

Rhun ap Iorwerth reminded us of the challenges, and that these are not just challenges but opportunities, and that really must be the way in which the committee must take this forward. He also reminded us about rolling stock, expertise on specification, the hope that the franchise will definitely be Welsh-led and that the scope for ambition requires that the investment and financing are properly prepared and the case made well in advance.

Russell George, in a short but valuable contribution, reminded us of the vital contribution of the railways to the economy of mid Wales. He also made a plea for an hourly service to Shrewsbury and the restoration of Carno railway station, and perhaps even another stop that he mentioned at Abermule. Certainly, one should consider greater proposals to enhance our railway system as the new franchise comes into being.

Nick Ramsay reminded us that the existing franchise was flawed, that the passenger must be central to the new arrangement that will be made, and that there is no obligation for effective monetary control. Clearly, that is wrong and that has to be addressed. I have great confidence that the Minister will be the first to address that one.

It is important that the new franchise is regarded as being value for money, and that there is upgrading of the cascaded rolling stock. I think that it is fairly clear that this Assembly will not accept rolling stock that is not fit-for-purpose. Fortunately, electrification makes it much more difficult to cascade stock that is not particularly correct. There was also a full and timely reminder of the maintenance obligation.

The Minister, as usual, gave a very courteous response to the committee's proposals. She remarked they were realistic recommendations and that, in principle, she was prepared to accept them all, as she had already said in her statement. She remarked that she is aware that capacity within her department needs to be strengthened, and, clearly, the negotiations under way with the Department for Transport will continue. She has promised to give us updates on that when it occurs. It is a matter of mutual interest to Wales and the United Kingdom Government that this should be a correctly devolved matter of mutual support, and adequate financing must be given to the Minister in this particular area. An integrated transport system is obviously vital for urban and rural interests, and she gave us an assurance that she would be proactive with our industry partners and that business would also benefit.

Clearly, this is a matter that is only beginning. I am grateful to those who have participated in our debate this afternoon, and I commend the report to the Assembly.

Gwnaeth Rhun ap Iorwerth ein hatgoffa am yr heriau, a'r ffaith nad heriau yn unig yw'r rhain ond cyfleoedd, ac mai yn y modd hwnnw mewn gwirionedd y mae'n rhaid i'r pwyllgor fwrw ymlaen â hyn. Gwnaeth hefyd ein hatgoffa am gerbydau, arbenigedd ar y fanyleb, y gobaith y bydd y fasnachfrait yn sicr o dan arweiniad Cymru a bod maint yr uchelgais yn gofyn am i'r buddsoddiad a'r cyllid gael eu paratoi'n briodol a bod yr achos yn cael ei gyflwyno ymhell ymlaen llaw.

Gwnaeth Russell George ein hatgoffa, mewn cyfraniad byr ond gwerthfawr, am gyfraniad hanfodol y rheilffyrdd i economi'r canolbarth. Gwnaeth hefyd ymbil am wasanaeth bob awr i Amwythig ac adfer gorsaf reilffordd Carno, ac efallai hyd yn oed arosfan arall a grybwyllwyd ganddo yn Aber-miwl. Yn sicr, dylid ystyried cynigion ehangach i wella ein system reilffyrdd wrth i'r fasnachfrait newydd ddod i fodolaeth.

Gwnaeth Nick Ramsay ein hatgoffa bod y fasnachfrait bresennol yn ddiffygiol, bod yn rhaid i'r teithwyr fod yn ganolog i'r trefniant newydd a gaiff ei lunio, ac nad oes unrhyw rwymedigaeth i reoli arian yn effeithiol. Yn amlwg, nid yw hynny'n iawn, a rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r mater. Rwy'n ffyddiog iawn mai'r Gweinidog fydd y gyntaf i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw.

Mae'n bwysig bod y fasnachfrait newydd yn cael ei hystyried yn werth am arian, a bod cerbydau wedi'u rhaedru yn cael eu huwchraddio. Credaf ei bod yn eithaf amlwg na fydd y Cynulliad hwn yn derbyn cerbydau nad ydynt yn addas at y diben. Yn ffodus, mae trydaneiddio yn ei gwneud yn llawer anos i rhaedru cerbydau nad ydynt yn arbennig o briodol. Cawsom ein hatgoffa hefyd yn llawn ac yn amserol am y rhwymedigaeth i gynnal a chadw.

Yn ôl ei harfer rhoddodd y Gweinidog ymateb cwrtais iawn i gynigion y pwyllgor. Dywedodd eu bod yn argymhellion realistig a'i bod yn barod, mewn egwyddor, i dderbyn pob un ohonynt, fel y dywedodd eisoes yn ei datganiad. Nododd ei bod yn ymwybodol bod angen cryfhau'r gallu o fewn ei hadran, ac, yn amlwg, y bydd y cyd-drafodaethau sydd wedi dechrau gyda'r Adran Drafnidiaeth yn parhau. Mae wedi addo rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am hynny pan ddaw i law. Mae o fudd i Gymru a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig fel ei gilydd bod y mater hwn yn fater o gyd-gefnogaeth a ddatganolwyd yn briodol, a rhaid i gyllid digonol gael ei roi i'r Gweinidog yn y maes penodol hwn. Mae system drafnidiaeth integredig, yn amlwg, yn hanfodol i fuddiannau trefol a gwledig, a rhoddodd sicrwydd y byddai'n rhagweithiol gyda'n partneriaid yn y diwydiant ac y byddai busnesau hefyd yn elwa.

Yn amlwg, mae hwn yn fater sydd megis cychwyn. Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r rhai sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn ein dadl y prynhawn yma, a chymeradwyaf yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad.

15:54

## Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

The proposal is to note the Enterprise and Business Committee's report. Does any Member object? There are no objections, therefore the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

Y cynnig yw y dylid nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Nac oes, felly, derbynnir y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.*

*Motion agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) i'r Gadair am 15:55.

The Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) took the Chair at 15:55.

## Dadl Plaid Cymru: Y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin

Detholwyd y gwelliannau canlynol: gwelliant 1 yn enw Aled Roberts, a gwelliant 2 yn enw Paul Davies.

Cynnig NDM5438 Elin Jones

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

- Yn nodi'r gostyngiad o 44% mewn incwm ffermydd ar draws pob math o ffermydd yng Nghymru y llynedd;
- Yn gresynu at benderfyniad Llywodraeth Cymru i drosglwyddo'r 15% yn llawn o Golofn 1 i Golofn 2 o'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin a'r gostyngiad dilynol o 23.4% o ran hawliau Cynllun y Taliad Sengl; a
- Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i roi ystyriaeth lawn i'r amgylchiadau heriol hyn ac amgylchiadau heriol eraill a wynebwr gan y diwydiant amaethyddol ar hyn o bryd wrth iddi gyflwyno diwygiadau i'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin, Cynllun Datblygu Gwledig newydd a mentrau polisi gwledig ehangach yng Nghymru.

## Plaid Cymru Debate: Common Agricultural Policy

The following amendments have been selected: amendment 1 in the name of Aled Roberts, and amendment 2 in the name of Paul Davies.

Motion NDM5438 Elin Jones

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

- Notes the 44% drop in farm incomes across all farm types in Wales last year;
- Regrets the Welsh Government's decision to transfer the full 15% from Pillar 1 to Pillar 2 of the Common Agriculture Policy and the subsequent 23.4% reduction to Single Payment Scheme entitlements; and
- Calls on the Welsh Government to give full regard to these and other challenging circumstances currently being faced by the agriculture industry as it introduces reforms to the Common Agriculture Policy, a new Rural Development Plan and wider rural policy initiatives in Wales.

15:55

## Llyr Gruffydd [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Cynigiad y cynnig.

Rwyf fel arfer yn cychwyn dadl drwy ddweud ei bod hi'n bleser gennyf ddod â'r cynnig gerbron y Cynulliad, ond nid dyna rwyf yn ei deimlo heddiw. Ydw, rwy'n codi i gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn ar y diwydiant amaeth yn enw Plaid Cymru, ond, mewn gwirionedd, rwy'n gwneud hynny â chalon drom. Rwy'n dweud hynny oherwydd fy mod yn gweld teulu, ffrindiau a chymdogion sy'n amaethwyr yn wynebu un o'r cyfnodau mwyaf anodd a heriol a welsant ers blyneddau mawr, a diwydiant sy'n wynebu cyfuniad o ffactorau ac amgylchiadau neilltuol sydd, gyda'i gilydd, yn creu storwm berffaith na welwyd mo'i thebyg, mae'n siŵr gen i, ers dyddiau du clwy'r traed a'r genau dros ddegawd yn ôl.

O'r haf gwlyb yn 2012 i'r eira mawr llynedd ac, wrth gwrs, y glaw diddiwedd y gaeaf hwn, mae'r achosion diweddar o dywydd eithafol wedi gadael eu hól ar y diwydiant. Achosodd y gwlypter ostyngiad yn ansawdd a nifer y cynydau, cynhyrchiant isel o laeth, colli anifeiliaid, a chanrannau wyna a lloia gwael. Roedd y rhain i gyd yn heriau a oedd yn wynebu'r diwydiant cyn yr eira erchyll a darodd llynedd ac a ychwanegodd at y colledion a'r costau ar draws Cymru, gan adael eu hól ar y diwydiant yn ariannol ac yn emosiynol. Bellach, y glaw diddiwedd a'r llifogydd sy'n peri gofid i nifer.

I move the motion.

As a rule, I open a debate by saying that it is a pleasure to bring the motion before the Assembly, but that is not how I feel today. Yes, I rise to move this motion on the agricultural industry in the name of Plaid Cymru, but I do so with a heavy heart. I say that because I see family, friends and neighbours who are farmers facing some of the most challenging and difficult times that they have experienced for many years, and an industry facing an exceptional set of circumstances that have combined to create a perfect storm the likes of which, I am sure, have not been experienced since the dark days of foot and mouth disease over a decade ago.

From the wet summer of 2012 to the heavy snows of last year and, of course, the seemingly endless rainfall of this winter, the recent incidents of extreme weather have left their mark on the industry. The wet weather led to a decline in crop quality and quantity, low milk yields, the loss of livestock, and low lambing and calving levels. These were all challenges facing the industry before the appalling snow that we experienced last year that added to the losses and costs across Wales, leaving their mark on the industry both financially and emotionally. Now, it is the endless rain and the floods that are causing concern to so many.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Ar ben hynny, wrth gwrs, daeth yr ystadegau sobreiddiol fis diwethaf am y cwymp sylweddol yn incwm ffermydd Cymru. Mae'r incwm net ar draws yr holl fathau o ffermydd yng Nghymru i lawr 44%. Mae incwm ffermydd defaid a gwartheg ar dir isel lawr 26%, incwm ffermydd llaeth yng Nghymru lawr 42%, ac incwm ffermydd gwartheg a defaid yn yr ardaloedd llai ffafriol lawr 53%. Cafodd yr ystadegau hynny, gyda llaw, eu casglu cyn yr achos o eira y llynedd, ac felly nid yw'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer y flwyddyn olynol.

Fel pe na bai hynny oll yn ddigon, rydym hefyd yn wynebu diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin—polisi a ffynhonnell incwm sydd wedi bod yn cynnal y diwydiant yng Nghymru yn wyneb methiannau'r farchnad. Heb y polisi hwnnw, byddai 80% o'n ffermydd ni yn anghynladwy, yn ôl y Llywodraeth. O ddiwygio'r polisi, bydd yn creu cyfnod anodd o ansicrwydd ac o addasu wrth i gymunedau gwledig geisio dygymod â'r newidiadau hynny.

Rwy'n siŵr y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn dadlau bod yr hyn yr wyf wedi'i amlinellu yn y munodau diwethaf yn tanlinellu'n union pam fod angen cyflwyno rhai o'r newidiadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi bod yn eu disgrifio mewn cyfres o ddatganiadau dros yr wythnosau diwethaf. Chi'n gwybod beth? I raddau helaeth, rwy'n cytuno. Nid oes amheuaeth bod rhaid i'r diwydiant amaeth newid os yw am oroesi. Bydd gwleidyddion ar bob ochr o'r Siambr, rwy'n siŵr, yn cytuno efo hynny. Mae'r weledigaeth am ddiwydiant hyfyw, mwy cydnerth yn weledigaeth tymor hir y mae pawb, rwy'n siŵr, yn medru ei chefnogi—yn wleidyddion, yn gymunedau gwledig, yn gymdeithas ehangach ac, yn fwy na dim, yn amaethwyr eu hunain. Dyna yn union rydym eisiau ei weld, ond—ac mae'n 'ond' pwysig—mae'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn mynd ati i geisio gwireddu'r weledigaeth honno yn digwydd mewn modd a fydd, yn fy marn i, yn dod â phris sy'n rhy uchel i'w dalu.

Tra bod y Llywodraeth yn gyrru newidiadau a fydd yn ailstrwythuro rhannau helaeth o'r diwydiant, mae yna deimlad allan yng nghefn gwlad bod rhai o'r newidiadau yn cael eu cyflwyno mewn modd ac ar adeg a fydd yn cael cymaint o effaith fel na fydd rhai o'r ffermydd hynny sydd ar hyn o bryd yn llai effeithlon ac yn llai cystadleuol yn goroesi. Mae ffermwyr yn dweud wrthyf eu bod nhw'n teimlo bod y Llywodraeth hon yn troi cefn arnynt a, bron iawn, yn mynd ati i greu'r amgylchiadau yn y tymor byr a fydd yn sicrhau mai dim ond math arbennig o amaethwyr a fydd yn goroesi ac yn cyrraedd pen y daith.

Mae Plaid Cymru am i bob ffarmer gael yr un cyfle i addasu a chryfhau eu busnes. Ni ddylai unrhyw un sydd am ddod ar y siwrnai honno gael ei adael ar ôl, dim ots o ba bynnag bwynt y mae eu busnes yn cychwyn, ond, er mwyn gwneud hynny, rhaid inni gyflwyno'r newidiadau angenrheidiol mewn modd sy'n rhoi'r amser a'r gefnogaeth i sicrhau na fydd gormod o golledion ar y ffordd.

On top of that, of course, came the sobering statistics published last month on the significant fall in farm incomes in Wales. Net income across all types of farming in Wales is down 44%. The income of cattle and sheep farms on the lowlands is down 26%, dairy farm incomes in Wales are down 42%, and the income of cattle and sheep farms in the less favoured areas is down 53%. Those statistics, by the way, were gathered before the snowfall of last year, and therefore it does not bode well for the following year.

As if all of that were not enough, we are also facing the reform of the common agricultural policy—a policy and income source that has sustained the industry in Wales in the face of market failure. Without that policy, 80% of our farms would be unsustainable, according to the Government. The reform of the policy will create a difficult period of uncertainty and adaptation as rural communities try to cope with those changes.

I am sure that the Government would argue that what I have outlined in the past few minutes highlights exactly why we need to introduce some of the changes that the Minister has been describing in a series of statements over the past few weeks. You know what? To a great extent, I agree. There is no doubt that the agricultural industry has to change if it is to survive. Politicians on all sides of the Chamber, I am sure, will agree with that. The vision of a viable, more resilient industry is a long-term vision that everyone, I am sure, could support—politicians, rural communities, wider society, and, above all, farmers themselves. That exactly what we all want to see, but—and it is an important 'but'—the way in which this Government is going about achieving that vision is happening in a way that will, in my opinion, exact too high a price.

While the Government is driving changes that will restructure large parts of the industry, there is a feeling out there in rural areas that some of the changes are being introduced in a way and at a time that will have such an effect that some of those farms that are currently less efficient and competitive will not survive. Farmers tell me that they feel that this Government is turning its back on them, and almost going about creating the circumstances in the short term that will ensure that only a particular kind of farmer will survive and reach the destination.

Plaid wants every farmer to have the same chance to adapt and strengthen their business. No-one who wishes to go on that journey should be left behind, no matter from which point their business actually starts, but, in order to do that, we need to introduce the necessary changes in a way that gives time and support in order to ensure that there are not too many losses on the journey.

Yng nghanol y rhyferthwy hwn, un o'r penderfyniadau sydd wedi brifo ffermwyr Cymru fwyaf yw'r un hunanachosedig—'self-inflicted'—sef penderfyniad y Llywodraeth i gymryd yr uchafswm o 15% o daliadau uniongyrchol piler 1 i ffermwyr a'i drosglwyddo i biler 2. O ganlyniad i'r toriad ar lefel yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yng nghyllideb CAP, a fyddai'n golygu llai o daliadau beth bynnag, y cwmp o 44% yn incwm ffermwyr a'r achosion diweddar o ddigwyddiadau tywydd eithafol, sydd wedi gadael rhai busnesau ar eu cliniau, ac er gwaethaf addewidion gan y Llywodraeth y byddai newidiadau i CAP yn cael eu cyflwyno mewn modd a fyddai'n osgoi'r 'disruption' a ofnwyd gymaint â phosibl, bydd ffermwyr Cymru yn colli tua £0.25 biliwn o'u taliadau sengl yng nghyfnod y CAP nesa—nid oherwydd bod y rheolau Ewropeaidd yn gorfodi hynny, ond oherwydd bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn dewis gwneud hynny. Fel canlyniad, bydd gwerth 'entitlements' ffermwyr Cymru i lawr bron i chwarter—23.4%—yn y cyfnod nesaf.

Dywedais fod ffermwyr wedi'u cythruddo a'u bod wedi'u brifo. Yn sicr, dyna yw'r teimlad erbyn hyn, ond mae'n siŵr mai sioc a oedd yn nodweddu'r ymateb pan fu ichi wneud y cyhoeddiad hwn ychydig cyn y Nadolig, Weinidog. Cafodd ei wneud mewn modd digon annisgwyl, fel rwyf wedi'i ddweud, ar ffurf llythyr i Gadeirydd pwyllgor yn hytrach nag mewn datganiad ffurfiol i'r Cynulliad hwn.

In the midst of this maelstrom, one of the decisions that have been most painful for Welsh farmers is the one that was self-inflicted, namely the decision by the Government to take the higher sum of 15% of pillar 1 direct payments to farmers and transfer it to pillar 2. As a result of the cut at an EU level in the CAP budget, which would lead to smaller payments in any case, the fall of 44% in farm incomes and the recent extreme weather events, which have left some businesses on their knees, and despite pledges made by the Government itself that changes to CAP would be introduced in a way that would avoid the disruption that was feared, Welsh farmers will lose around £0.25 billion from their single farm payment during the next CAP period—not because of European rules requiring that but because the Welsh Government has chosen to go down that route. As a result, the value of farm entitlements in Wales will be down by around a quarter—23.4%—in the ensuing period.

I said that farmers were incensed and that they were hurt. That is certainly the feeling now, but I think that shock was what characterised the response when you made this initial announcement a little before Christmas, Minister. It was done in an unexpected way, as I have said, in the form of a letter to a committee Chair rather than in a formal statement to this Assembly.

16:01 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Will the Member give way?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:01 **Llyr Gruffydd** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Wrth gwrs.

Of course.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:01 **Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Mae ef wedi dweud hyn o'r blaen, ac rwyf eisiau ei wneud yn hollol glir, yn yr achos hwn beth bynnag, nad oedd unrhyw gynllwyn rhyngof i â'r Gweinidog. Addawodd y Gweinidog mewn cyfarfod o'r pwyllgor y byddai'n rhannu gwybodaeth cyn gynted ag y byddai'n gallu gwneud penderfyniad. Rhoddodd wybod i mi ymlaen llaw ei fod yn bwriadu anfon llythyr, a dywedais y byddwn yn derbyn llythyr. Rwy'n derbyn llythyrau gan bob math o bobl. Rwyf wedi gyrru llythyrau cas iawn yn ôl at y Gweinidog, a byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny, ac efallai y cei di un hefyd os ei di ymlaen fel hyn. [Chwerthin.]

He has said this before, and I want to make it entirely clear that, in this instance at least, there was no plot between the Minister and me. The Minister promised in a meeting of the committee that he would share information as soon as he was able to make a decision. He let me know beforehand that he intended to send a letter, and I said that I would receive a letter. I receive letters from all sorts of people. I have sent very angry letters back to the Minister, and I will continue to do that, and perhaps you will receive one as well if you continue like this. [Laughter.]

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Rwy'n derbyn pwynt y Cadeirydd. Nid wyf yn awgrymu bod unrhyw dorri neu blygu rheol wedi digwydd—ni fyddem yn gwneud hynny—ond rwy'n meddwl bod cyhoeddiad gydag impact posibl o'r fath i'r diwydiant yn gwarantu datganiad ffurfiol i'r Cynulliad hwn. Ta waeth am hynny. Fel canlyniad i'r penderfyniad hwnnw, y realiti yw i ffermwyr Cymru fynd o fod ar y gyfradd isaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig o fodiwlleiddio i'r gyfradd uchaf yn Ewrop, a hynny ar adeg, fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud, pan fo incwm ffermwyr Cymru wedi dychwel a phan eu bod yn cael trafferth i dalu eu biliau. Canlyniad hyn fydd rhoi ffermwyr Cymru o dan anfantais gystadleuol o gymharu â ffermwyr yn rhannau eraill y Deyrnas Unedig ac, yn wir, ar draws yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yn yr Alban, byddant yn trosglwyddo 9.5% o biler 1 i biler 2. Yn Lloegr, er i'r Gweinidog yno ddweud y byddai'n debygol o drosglwyddo'r swm llawn, daeth i'r casgliad y byddai hynny'n ormodol, ac felly bydd yn trosglwyddo 12%. Nid oes trosglwyddiad o gwbl yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Yn Ffrainc, mae'n 3%. Yn yr Almaen, mae'n 4.5%. Mae'r penderfyniad hwn yng Nghymru wedi dangos bellach i mi pa mor anghyson ac anghyfartal yw'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin—nid yw'r gyffredin iawn erbyn hyn, mewn gwirionedd.

Tarodd Emyr Jones, llywydd Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru, yr hoelen ar ei phen, yn fy marn i, pan ddywedodd fod pawb yn deall ac yn cefnogi'r egwyddor o ddefnyddio'r cynllun datblygu gwledig i helpu busnesau i ailstrwythuro ac i fod yn fwy cystadleuol, ond bod y dull a fabwysiadwyd gan y Llywodraeth yn teimlo mwy fel ymosodiad uniongyrchol ar y diwydiant. Fe ymddengys mai'r meddylfryd yw bod cymryd mwy o arian i ffwrdd o ddiwydiant sydd eisoes yn gwegian ar ôl cwmp difrifol mewn incwm yn mynd i'w wneud yn fwy gwydn a chystadleuol. Ychwanegwch y ffaith ein bod yn gweithredu mewn marchnad gyffredin ac na fydd raid i'n prif gystadleuwyr weld eu hincwm nhw yn gostwng yn yr un ffordd, ac fe welwch cymaint o glec yw'r penderfyniad mewn gwirionedd.

Rydym yn gwybod bellach ei bod yn rhy hwyr i'r Llywodraeth newid ei meddwl ar drosglwyddo 15% i biler 1 i biler 2, gan fod Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig eisoes wedi gorfod hysbysu'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd o hynny. Er ei bod yn bosibl adolygu'r symiau hynny yn 2018, nid oes hawl i'w hadolygu i lawr, sy'n golygu na allwn ni yng Nghymru bellach adolygu na lleihau'r lefel hwn tan y CAP nesaf, ar ôl 2020. Fodd bynnag, mae'r opsiwn o drosglwyddo adnoddau o biler 2 i biler 1 dal yn agored i'r Llywodraeth. Nid oes angen hysbysu'r Comisiwn o unrhyw fwrriad i wneud hynny tan ddechrau Awst eleni.

Mae Plaid Cymru, felly, y prynhawn yma, Weinidog, yn gofyn i chi ystyried o ddifrif drosglwyddo rhywfaint yn ôl, yn enwedig fel mesur yn y tymor byr i gynorthwyo'r diwydiant yn wyneb y cyfuniad o ffactorau sydd wedi cael cymaint o effaith ar ei fusnesau yn ddiweddar. Mae'r opsiwn ar gael wedyn i chi adolygu'r trosglwyddiad hwnnw, wrth gwrs, yn ystod cyfnod y CAP presennol, ac fe fyddai hynny'n rhywbeth y gallech ei wneud ar yr adeg honno.

I accept the Chair's point. I am not suggesting in any way that there has been any breaking or bending of the rules here—I would not do that—but I believe that an announcement with such a possible impact on the industry would warrant a formal statement to this Assembly. Never mind about that. Given that decision, the reality is that Welsh farmers went from being on the lowest rate of modulation in the UK to the highest level in Europe, at a time, as I have said, when farm incomes have collapsed and when farmers are obviously having trouble paying their bills. The result of this will be to put Welsh farmers at a competitive disadvantage compared with farmers in other parts of the UK and, indeed, across the European Union. In Scotland, they will transfer 9.5% from pillar 1 to pillar 2. In England, although the Minister there said that he was likely to transfer the full sum, he came to the conclusion that that would be excessive, and, therefore, they will transfer 12%. There is no transfer at all in Northern Ireland. In France, it is 3%. In Germany, it is 4.5%. The decision taken here in Wales has demonstrated to me how inconsistent and inequitable the common agricultural policy is—in reality, it is not truly common at all by now.

Emyr Jones, the president of the Farmers Union of Wales, hit the nail on the head, in my opinion, when he said that everyone understood and supported the principle of using the RDP to assist businesses to restructure and to be more competitive, but that the means adopted by Government felt more like a direct attack on the industry. It appears that the thinking is that taking more money away from an industry that is already creaking following significant declines in income is going to make it more resilient and more competitive. Add to that the fact that we are working in a common market and that our main competitors will not see their income decline in the same way, and you will see how much of a blow the decision truly is to farmers.

We now know that it is too late for the Government to change its mind on transferring 15% from pillar 1 to pillar 2, as the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs has already had to inform the European Commission of that decision. Although it is possible to review those sums in 2018, there is no right to review them down, which will mean that we in Wales will not be able to reduce this level until the next CAP, after 2020. However, the option of transferring resources from pillar 2 to pillar 1 is still open to the Government. There is no need to inform the Commission of any intention to do that until the beginning of August this year.

Plaid Cymru, therefore, this afternoon, Minister, is asking you to seriously consider transferring some of that back, particularly as a short-term measure to assist the industry in the face of the combination of factors that have had such an impact on its businesses recently. The option is then available for you to review that transfer, of course, during the current CAP period, and that would be something that you could do at that time.



Ar ben hynny, Weinidog, byddwn yn erbyn arnoch chi i gyflwyno taliad arbennig i ffermwyr y rhostiroedd o dan biler 2 a'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer ardaloedd â chyfyngiadau naturiol. Fe wnaeth Kevin Roberts yn glir, yn ei adolygiad ar gydnerthedd y diwydiant, fod angen rhywfaint o gefnogaeth ar fferydd mynydd, yn enwedig y rheini yn y rhostir newydd. Fe allem weld, yn sgîl y diwygiadau CAP arfaethedig, ddad-stocio eang a'r difrod amgylcheddol dilynol.

Mae'n rhaid cydnabod bod 'land abandonment' hefyd yn bosiblwydd a bod goblygiadau ehangach i hynny, nid yn unig yn economaidd ac yn amgylcheddol, ond hefyd o ran ei effaith cymdeithasol yng nghefn gwlad, yn ogystal a'i effaith yn ddiwylliannol ac yn ieithyddol, wrth gwrs, mewn nifer o ardaloedd. Rwy'n nodi cyfeiriad yn eich cynllun datblygu gwledig arfaethedig, neu yn yr ymgynghoriad, at yr angen i ystyried hyn. Felly, gofynnaf yn blwmp ac yn blaen, Weinidog—a wnewch chi gyflwyno taliad o'r fath yn wyneb yr amgylchiadau neilltuol yr wyf wedi sôn amdanynt?

Byddwn yn cefnogi'r ddau welliant sydd wedi'u gosod, ac fe fydd fy nghyd-gyfranwyr yn ymhelaethu ar agweddau o'r pwnc hwn nad yw amser yn caniatáu imi sôn amdanynt.

Gadewch imi gloi, felly, wrth wneud un peth yn glir: nid y nod hirdymor yw testun y ddatl hon heddiw; mae pawb eisiau diwydiant mwy cydnerth, mwy effeithlon a mwy cystadleuol—diwydiant a fydd yn cynnig dyfodol i fy mhiant i a'r genhedlaeth nesaf o amaethwyr ar draws Cymru. Byrdwn y ddatl heddiw yw i drafod y modd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn dewis mynd o'i chwmpas hi. Fel y dywedodd rheolwr amaethyddol HSBC yn ddiweddar, mae gofid gwirioneddol na fydd y diwydiant yn medru ymateb yn ddigon cyflym i'r newidiadau a fydd yn dod yn sgîl y digwyddiadau hyn. Yn fy marn i, byddai goblygiadau peidio gallu ymateb yn ddigon cyflym yn bris rhy uchel i'w dalu. Rwy'n gofyn i fy nghyd-Aelodau yma y prynhawn yma i gefnogi'r cynnig.

*Gwelliant 1—Aled Roberts*

*Cynnwys pwynt 3 newydd ac ail-rifo yn unol â hynny:*

*Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ddefnyddio'r Cynllun Datblygu Gwledig i gyflwyno cynllun Ardaloedd â Chyfyngiadau Naturiol penodol i Weundiroedd.*

On top of that, Minister, I urge you to introduce a special payment to farmers in the moorlands under pillar 2 and the provisions for areas with natural constraints. Kevin Roberts made it clear, in his review of the resilience of the industry, that there needs to be some support for hill farmers, particularly those in the new moorland. We may see, as a result of the proposed CAP reforms, destocking and the subsequent damage.

It must be accepted that land abandonment is also a possibility and that there are wider implications for that, not only economically and environmentally, but also in terms of its social impacts within rural areas, as well as its cultural and linguistic impact, of course, in many areas. I note a reference in your proposed rural development plan, or in the consultation, to the need to consider this. Therefore, I ask you clearly, Minister—will you introduce such a payment in the light of the exceptional circumstances that I have outlined?

We will be supporting both amendments that are tabled, and my fellow contributors will expand on aspects of this issue that time does not allow me to cover.

Let me conclude, therefore, by making one thing clear: the long-term aim is not the topic of this debate; everyone wants to see a more resilient, efficient and more competitive industry—an industry that will offer a future for my children and the next generation of farmers across Wales. The purpose of this debate today is to discuss the way that the Government chooses to go about it. As the agricultural manager of HSBC said recently, there is real concern that the industry will not be able to respond swiftly enough to the changes that will come as a result of these events. In my opinion, the implications of not responding swiftly enough would be too high a price to pay. I urge me fellow Members here to support the motion.

*Amendment 1—Aled Roberts*

*Insert as new point 3 and renumber accordingly:*

*Calls on the Welsh Government to use the Rural Development Plan to bring forward a Moorland specific Areas of Natural Constraint scheme.*

16:07

**William Powell** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I move amendment 1.

I would like to thank Plaid Cymru very much for bringing forward this important debate today. It is essential that we take these matters forward and that we do so seriously.

Cynigaf welliant 1.

Hoffwn ddiolch yn fawr iawn i Blaid Cymru am gyflwyno'r ddatl bwysig hon heddiw. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn gweithredu mewn perthynas â'r materion hyn a'n bod yn gwneud hynny o ddifrif.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

From the very beginning of this current CAP reform period, I have consistently stressed the importance of the Welsh uplands to our wider farming industry. For decades, it has formed the background of our lamb industry in particular. I make no apology whatsoever for trying to safeguard its future in the face of cuts imposed by the Welsh Government. It is for this reason that we have focused on the moorland area in our amendment this afternoon.

Looking at the articles that govern the European Union's common agricultural policy, it is clear that the Welsh Labour Government has so far failed to use all of the tools available to it to recognise and to mitigate the increased cost of farming in some of Wales's most disadvantaged areas.

Under the new payment regime, these areas will get only one-tenth of the payment per hectare in comparison with the more profitable land elsewhere in Wales. While the Welsh Government believes that farmers can make up the difference through a series of agri-environment projects and efficiency saving measures, it remains evident to the farming industry that these will simply not be enough alone, especially when taken in tandem with the effects of the transition from historic to area-based payments, which is also causing real difficulty to the sector. This is without even mentioning the fact that the environmental constraints that many of these farms are under also limit their potential to participate fully in such agri-environment schemes. Taken together, it is understandable that many farmers fear that they will not be able to withstand the income cuts that have been imposed upon them.

As such, it is essential that the Welsh Government uses the new rural development plan to establish a moorland-specific scheme under the new areas of natural constraint definition. While the uplands forum suggested such a scheme, I am disappointed that the Welsh Government has, thus far, not been supportive in recent months.

O gychwyn cyntaf y cyfnod hwn o ddiwygio'r PAC, pwysleisiais yn gyson bwysigrwydd ucheldiroedd Cymru i'n diwydiant ffermio ehangach. Ers degawdau, darparodd gefndir ein diwydiant cig oen yn arbennig. Nid ymddiheuraf o gwbl am geisio diogelu eu dyfodol yn wyneb y toriadau a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Dyna pam rydym wedi canolbwyntio ar y rhostir yn ein gweliant y prynhawn yma.

O edrych ar yr erthyglau sy'n llywodraethu polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, mae'n amlwg bod Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru hyd yn hyn wedi methu â defnyddio'r holl adnoddau sydd ar gael iddi i gydnabod cost gynyddol ffermio yn rhai o ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru ac i liniaru'r gost honno.

O dan y drefn taliadau newydd, dim ond un rhan o ddeg o'r taliad fesul hectar y bydd yr ardaloedd hyn yn ei chael o gymharu â'r tir mwy proffidiol mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru. Er bod Llywodraeth Cymru o'r farn y gall ffermwyr wneud iawn am y gwahaniaeth drwy gyfres o brosiectau amaeth-amgylcheddol a mesurau effeithlonrwydd, mae'n amlwg o hyd i'r diwydiant ffermio na fydd y rhain ar eu pen eu hunain yn ddigon, yn enwedig o'u hystyried ar y cyd ag effeithiau'r broses o drosglwyddo o daliadau hanesyddol i daliadau ar sail arwynebedd, sydd hefyd yn achosi cryn anhawster i'r sector. Heb sôn am y ffaith bod y cyfyngiadau amgylcheddol y mae llawer o'r ffermydd hyn yn eu hwynebu hefyd yn cyfyngu ar eu potensial i gyfranogi'n llawn mewn cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol o'r fath. O ystyried yr holl elfennau hyn, mae'n ddealladwy bod llawer o ffermwyr yn ofni na fyddant yn gallu gwrthsefyll y toriadau incwm sydd wedi'u gorfodi arnynt.

Fel y cyfryw, mae'n hanfodol bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn defnyddio'r cynllun datblygu gwledig newydd i lunio cynllun penodol ar gyfer rhostiroedd yn unol â'r diffiniad newydd o ardaloedd â chyfyngiadau naturiol. Er bod y fforwm ucheldiroedd wedi awgrymu cynllun o'r fath, rwy'n siomedig na fu Llywodraeth Cymru, hyd yn hyn, yn gefnogol yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf.

However, I recognise the movement that has been shown by stating that, at long last, there is consideration of a transitional scheme as part of the RDP consultation, which was launched by the Minister earlier this week. I urge the Welsh Government to take full advantage of this consultation, and urge farmers across the length and breadth of Wales to respond and to do so in numbers to make sure that the u-turn that has been privately known to be necessary actually takes place. Such a scheme, especially if it is only a transitional one, will not place too much of a demand on the total RDP budget. Given the new moorland line, we know that it would cost significantly less than Tir Mynydd did, even if it was given a significant increase compared with the old, severely disadvantaged area rates. In real terms, we are talking about an annual cost of some £3 million or £4 million. I would argue that safeguarding the future of Welsh hill farming merits the introduction of such a scheme. This is especially so when we consider the added environmental benefits that managed moorland brings, especially in terms of ecosystem services, particularly relevant in the context of the recent flood events and when we compare that with the danger, also, which Llyr Gruffydd has correctly referred to, of mass abandonment of our uplands. As such, I would urge you to support the motion, incorporating our amendment, amendment 1, this afternoon.

*Gwelliant 2—Paul Davies*

*Cynnwys pwynt 3 newydd ac ailrifo yn unol â hynny:*

*Yn gresynu ymhellach at effaith TB buchol ar incwm ffermydd yng Nghymru a methiant Llywodraeth Cymru i fynd i'r afael â'r mater pwysig hwn.*

Fodd bynnag, rwy'n cydnabod y datblygiad a ddangoswyd drwy ddatgan, o'r diwedd, bod cynllun trosiannol yn cael ei ystyried fel rhan o'r ymgynghoriad ar y Cynllun Datblygu Gwledig, a lanswyd gan y Gweinidog yn gynharach yr wythnos hon. Anogaf Lywodraeth Cymru i fanteisio'n llawn ar yr ymgynghoriad hwn, ac anogaf ffermwyr ar hyd a lled Cymru i ymateb ac i wneud hynny yn eu niferoedd er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y tro pedol, y cydnabuwyd yn breifat sydd ei angen, ei roi ar waith. Ni fydd cynllun o'r fath, yn enwedig os mai dim ond cynllun trosiannol ydyw, yn rhoi gormod o bwysau ar gyfanswm cyllideb y CDG. O ystyried y llinell rhostiroedd newydd, gwyddom y byddai'n costio swm sylweddol lai nag y gwnaeth Tir Mynydd, hyd yn oed pe cyflwynwyd cynnydd sylweddol o gymharu â'r hen gyfraddau ar gyfer ardaloedd o dan anfantais ddirifrol. Mewn termau real, rydym yn sôn am gost flynyddol o tua £3 miliwn neu £4 miliwn. Byddwn yn dadlau bod cyfiawnhad dros gyflwyno cynllun o'r fath er mwyn diogelu dyfodol ffermio mynydd yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir o ystyried y buddiannau amgylcheddol ychwanegol sy'n gysylltiedig â rhostir rheoledig, yn enwedig o ran gwasanaethau ecosystem, sy'n arbennig o berthnasol yng nghyd-destun y llifogydd diweddar ac o gymharu hynny â'r perygl, hefyd, y cyfeiriodd Llyr Gruffydd yn briodol ato, sy'n gysylltiedig â throi cefn yn gyffredinol ar ein hucheldiroedd. Fel y cyfryw, fe'ch anogwn i gefnogi'r cynnig, gan gynnwys ein gwelliant, sef gwelliant 1, y prynhawn yma.

*Amendment 2—Paul Davies*

*Insert as new point 3 and renumber accordingly:*

*Further regrets the impact of Bovine TB on farm income in Wales and the Welsh Government's failure to tackle this important issue.*

16:11

**Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I move amendment 2.

I stated when you made your statement on CAP implementation in January that it was regrettable that you had decided to move ahead with the maximum modulation between pillar 1 and pillar 2. You have made your case, Minister, for why this transfer was important in relation to delivering the key recommendations of the Kevin Roberts work, as well as the new RDP proposals. However, may I ask why you decided to go for the maximum transfer straightaway? Why did you not look at an interim transfer, not only to soften the impact, but also to undertake proper analysis to see whether or not this change would make Welsh farming less competitive compared with not just other parts of the UK but other farms across Europe? Was that proposal ever looked at?

Cynigiad welliant 2.

Pan wnaethoch eich datganiad ar weithredu'r PAC ym mis Ionawr, datganais ei bod yn anffodus eich bod wedi penderfynu bwrw ati gyda'r lefel modiwlleiddio uchaf rhwng colofn 1 a cholofn 2. Rydych wedi cyflwyno eich achos, Weinidog, o ran pwysigrwydd y trosglwyddiad hwn mewn perthynas â chyflawni argymhellion allweddol gwaith Kevin Roberts, yn ogystal â chynigion newydd y Cynllun Datblygu Gwledig. Fodd bynnag, a gaf ofyn pam y gwnaethoch benderfynu rhoi'r trosglwyddiad uchaf ar waith ar unwaith? Pam na wnaethoch ystyried trosglwyddiad interim, nid yn unig er mwyn lliniaru'r effaith, ond hefyd er mwyn cynnal dadansoddiad priodol i weld pa un a fyddai'r newid hwn yn golygu y byddai ffermio yng Nghymru yn llai cystadleuol, nid dim ond o gymharu â rhannau eraill o'r DU, ond o gymharu â ffermydd eraill ledled Ewrop? A roddwyd unrhyw ystyriaeth i'r cynnig hwnnw?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

My second point is that you have made great play of both pillars supporting farming and that they must be looked at together to help to build both resilience and growth within the industry. However, if that is the case, why have you run the consultation processes separately? It is no wonder that there is confusion when you consulted on pillar 1 last year and that you are now running separate consultations on the RDP and Glastir.

Our amendment, amendment 2, is on the impact of bovine TB on the Welsh farming industry. When you ask farmers with infected herds how the outbreak has affected the running of their farm businesses, the impact on farm finances is the most frequently mentioned factor. It is no wonder when you look at some of the associated costs involved with that and you have an understanding of why farmers feel that they are shouldering the cost burdens of the Government's eradication plan.

I mentioned yesterday that I went to a meeting in Welshpool livestock market on Monday evening where there were over 100 farmers present and, being new in post, I made sure that I took my notebook with me and made lots of notes. The notes that I made were with regard to the extra costs involved for farmers who now have infected herds. They are as follows: TB movement restrictions directly affect the marketing of animals; there are increased costs for the extra feed, bedding and hosting of cattle on farms under TB movement restrictions; there are increased labour costs to cope with the additional cattle left on farms under TB movement restrictions; there are increased labour costs from gathering cattle together for TB testing due to increased amounts of testing for herds under restrictions; there are extra costs with regard to isolating TB reactors and inconclusive reactors from the remainder of the herd before removal to slaughter; there are extra costs incurred by farms with the additional paperwork and administration that result from being under TB restrictions; the removal of TB reactors from herds reduces milk yields on dairy farms and reduces the number of calves born on beef units; and the financial losses can be significant when large numbers of TB reactors are taken off the farm.

Milk producers will also lose out on volume bonuses and seasonally adjusted production payments if cattle are lost at specific times of the year. Finally, there are increased costs of obtaining bank loans and finance to alleviate cash flow difficulties. While there is a compensation process in place, you are now consulting on moving to a tabular system that will significantly reduce the amount individual cattle owners will get from their slaughtered stocks. That will have serious long-term consequences for the industry in Wales.

Fy ail bwynt yw eich bod wedi gwneud môr a mynydd o'r ffaith bod y ddwy golofn yn cefnogi ffermio a bod yn rhaid eu hystyried gyda'i gilydd er mwyn helpu i feithrin gwydnwch a thwff yn y diwydiant. Fodd bynnag, os felly, pam y gwnaethoch gynnal y prosesau ymgynghori ar wahân? Nid yw'n syndod bod dryswch pan wnaethoch ymgynghori ar golofn 1 y llynedd, a'ch bod yn awr yn cynnal ymgynghoriadau ar wahân ar y Cynllun Datblygu Gwledig a Glastir.

Mae a wnelo ein gwelliant, gwelliant 2, ar effaith TB mewn gwartheg ar y diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru. Pan ofynnwch i ffermwyr â buchasi wedi'u heintio sut y mae achosion o'r clefyd wedi effeithio ar y broses o redeg eu busnesau fferm, yr effaith ar gyllid y fferm yw'r ffactor a grybwyllir amlaf. Nid yw'n syndod o ystyried rhai o'r costau cysylltiedig a gallwch ddeall pam bod ffermwyr yn teimlo eu bod yn ysgwyddo baich cost cynllun dileu'r Llywodraeth.

Soniais ddoe fy mod wedi mynd i gyfarfod ym marchnad da byw'r Trallwng nos Lun lle roedd dros 100 o ffermwyr yn bresennol a, chan gofio fy mod yn newydd i'r swydd, gwneuthum yn siŵr fod gennyf lyfr nodiadau a gwneuthum lawer o nodiadau. Roedd y nodiadau hynny yn cyfeirio at y costau ychwanegol y mae ffermwyr y mae eu buchasi bellach wedi'u heintio yn eu hwynebu. Maent fel a ganlyn: mae cyfyngiadau symud TB yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar y broses o farchnata anifeiliaid; mae costau uwch o ran y bwyd ychwanegol, y gwair ychwanegol a chadw gwartheg ar ffermydd o dan gyfyngiadau symud TB; mae costau llafur uwch er mwyn ymdopi â'r gwartheg ychwanegol a gaiff eu gadael ar ffermydd o dan gyfyngiadau symud TB; mae costau llafur uwch o ran casglu gwartheg ynghyd i gynnal profion TB o ganlyniad i'r profion cynyddol y mae angen eu cynnal ar fuchasi sy'n destun cyfyngiadau; mae costau ychwanegol o ran ynysu adweithyddion ac adweithyddion amhendant mewn perthynas â TB o weddill y fuches cyn eu symud i'w lladd; mae ffermydd yn mynd i gostau ychwanegol yn sgil y gwaith papur a'r gwaith gweinyddol ychwanegol sy'n deillio o fod yn destun cyfyngiadau TB; mae symud adweithyddion TB o fuchasi yn lleihau cynnyrch llaeth ffermydd llaeth ac yn lleihau nifer y lloi a gaiff eu geni ar unedau cig eidion; a gall y colledion ariannol a wynebdir pan gaiff nifer uchel o adweithyddion TB eu symud oddi ar y fferm fod yn sylweddol.

Bydd cynhyrchwyr llaeth hefyd yn colli allan ar fonysau cyfaint a thaliadau cynhyrchu wedi'u haddasu yn ôl y tymor os collir gwartheg ar adegau penodol o'r flwyddyn. Yn olaf, ceir costau uwch yn sgil cael benthychiadau banc a chyllid i liniaru anawsterau llif arian. Er bod proses iawndal ar waith, rydych bellach yn ymgynghori ar gynigion i symud i system dablau a fydd yn lleihau'r swm y bydd perchenogion gwartheg unigol yn ei gael o'r stociau y byddant yn eu lladd yn sylweddol. Caiff hynny effaith hirdymor ddifrifol ar y diwydiant yng Nghymru.

You say that there will be winners and losers, but your analysis, as Kirsty Williams picked up on yesterday, suggests that the proposed tabular system would have resulted, on average, in a 30% reduction in compensation payments last year, with an 18% drop for pedigree animals and a 41% drop for commercial cattle. That is millions of pounds out of the pockets of hard-working families. In my constituency, the farming industry being the largest of all industries, that has knock-on effects and other consequences.

To say that the current system may not provide sufficient incentive for farmers to keep disease out of their herd is, in my opinion, disgraceful, considering the financial and emotional turmoil that besets farming families whose livestock become infected with TB. I believe that these proposals are wrong. I urged farmers I spoke to on Monday night at Welshpool market to challenge these proposals with strong and coherent arguments for the retention of the current TB compensation system. I hope that the Minister will have his listening wellies on.

16:16

## **Elin Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Rwy'n falch o gael siarad yn y ddaidl hon o blaid y cynnig. Rwy'n gwneud hynny gan ystyried bod y Gweinidog amaeth presennol yn berchen ar yr anrhydedd o fod yn Weinidog ar gyfnod cwbl allweddol yn y calendr polisi amaeth cyhoeddus, sef y cyfnod pan mae ei benderfyniadau ef ar weithredu'r polisi amaeth cyffredin yng Nghymru yn clymu dwylo unrhyw Weinidog a ddaw ar ei ôl am y saith mlynedd nesaf.

Gydag anrhydedd o'r math hwnnw fe ddaw cyfrifoldeb i gael penderfyniadau yn iawn ac i gynnal rhywfaint o gonsensws o gwmpas y penderfyniadau y mae'n eu cymryd. Ar y penderfyniad cyntaf a gymerodd, rwy'n credu ei fod wedi colli ar y prawf consensws, sef ei benderfyniad i fodiweiddio piler 1 ar y raddfa fwyaf o 15% ac i gyhoeddi hynny mor agos â phosibl at ddyddiad cau'r Comisiwn, ar y diwrnod olaf yn Rhagfyr. Bythefnos yn unig cyn hynny y gwnaethoch y cyhoeddiad, a hynny heb ddatganiad i'r Cynulliad. Mae rhai ohonom nad ydym yn ddigon ffodus i fod yn aelod o'r pwyllgor y mae Dafydd Elis-Thomas yn ei gadeirio, felly, drwy wneud cyhoeddiad i'r pwyllgor yn unig, arweiniodd at sefyllfa lle'r oedd rhywun fel fi, sydd â diddordeb yn y materion hyn, yn chwilio am ddatganiad llafar neu ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog ac yn methu â ffeindio un. Mae hynny'n fethiant ar ei ran ef.

Mae rheoliadau Ewrop yn dweud na all unrhyw Weinidog sy'n dilyn y Gweinidog hwn newid y penderfyniad y mae wedi ei gymryd ar fodiweiddio ar 15%. Mae'r lefel hon o fodiweiddio yn uwch na lefel unrhyw un o wledydd eraill Prydain, a hefyd yn uwch na gwledydd cystadleuol i Gymru o ran amaeth, fel Iwerddon, Ffrainc a'r Almaen.

Dywedwch y bydd rhai ar eu hennill ac y bydd rhai ar eu colled, ond mae eich dadansoddiad, fel y tynnodd Kirsty Williams sylw ato ddoe, yn awgrymu y byddai'r system dablau arfaethedig wedi arwain, ar gyfartaledd, at ostyngiad o 30% mewn taliadau iawndal y llynedd, gyda gostyngiad o 18% ar gyfer anifeiliaid pedigri a gostyngiad o 41% ar gyfer gwartheg masnachol. Mae hynny'n cyfateb i filiynau o bunnoedd allan o bocedi teuluoedd sy'n gweithio'n galed. Yn fy etholaeth i, lle mai'r diwydiant ffermio yw'r diwydiant mwyaf un, caiff hynny sgîl-effeithiau a chanlyniadau eraill.

Mae datgan nad yw'r system bresennol o bosibl yn darparu digon o gymhellant i ffermwyr i sicrhau nad oes gan eu gwartheg unrhyw glefydau, yn fy marn i, yn warthus, o ystyried y cythrwfl ariannol ac emosiynol sy'n bla ar deuluoedd ffermio y caiff eu buches ei heintio â TB. Credaf fod y cynigion hyn yn anghywir. Anogais ffermwyr y siaradais â hwy nos Lun ym marchnad y Trallwng i herio'r cynigion hyn gan ddefnyddio dadleuon cryf a chydlynol dros gadw'r system iawndal bresennol ar gyfer TB. Gobeithio y gwnaiff y Gweinidog wrando.

I am pleased to speak in this debate in favour of the motion, and I do so in the context of the current Minister for agriculture having the honour of being Minister at a crucial time in the public agriculture policy calendar, as the decisions that he now takes on the implementation of the common agriculture policy in Wales will tie the hands of his successors over the ensuing seven years.

With that kind of an honour comes the responsibility to make the right decisions and to maintain some consensus around the decisions that he takes. On his first decision, I believe that he has failed on the consensus test, as he decided to modulate pillar 1 on the highest rate of 15% and to make that announcement as close as possible to the Commission's closing date, which was the last day of December. The announcement was made just a fortnight before that, and it was done without bringing a statement to the Assembly. Some of us are not fortunate enough to be members of the committee that Dafydd Elis-Thomas chairs, therefore making an announcement only to the committee led to a situation where someone like me, who has an interest in these matters, was searching for a written or oral statement from the Minister but could not find one. That is a failure on his part.

European regulations state that no subsequent Minister will be able to overturn the decision that he has taken on modulating at 15%. This level of modulation is higher than that of any of the other British nations, and higher than the level in our competitor countries in agricultural terms, such as Ireland, France and Germany.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae Llyr Huws Gruffydd wedi tynnu sylw at bwynt diddorol iawn, sef y gallai'r Gweinidog wneud yn iawn am y penderfyniad hwn drwy edrych ar fodiwleiddio o biler 2 i biler 1, gan fod y dyddiad cau ar gyfer y penderfyniad hwnnw heb basio eto. Mae'r cyfnod i edrych ar hynny yn parhau tan ddiwedd mis Awst. Yn sicr, mae gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop yn defnyddio modiwleiddio o'r math hwnnw. Felly, pe byddai'r Gweinidog yn dymuno gwneud, ac yn barod i wrando yn helaethach na'i blaid ei hun ac i wrando ar y diwydiant, mae cyfle iddo adfer ei sefyllfa ar fodiwleiddio.

Yn ogystal â modiwleiddio, mae ffermwyr Cymru yn wynebu toriad i'r gyllideb amaeth yn gyffredinol. Mae'r penderfyniad i ddosrannu'r taliad sengl ar gyfer rhai o ffermwyr Cymru mewn ffordd benodol wedi bod yn gwbl ddrastig. Rwy'n siarad yn y fan hon am y ffermwyr hynny sy'n ffermio ar ein hucheldir ac ar ein rhostiroedd ac am y penderfyniad y bydd eu taliad nhw ar gyfer yr hectar yn ddim ond €20 erbyn 2019. Felly, bydd nifer ohonynt yn gweld gostyngiad o ryw 80% yn eu taliadau.

Mae'r ffermydd hynny sydd dros 400m uwchlaw lefel y môr yn aml iawn mewn ardaloedd sydd yn SSSI ac mae'n bosibl eu bod eisoes mewn cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol. Felly, mae eu gallu nhw i foderneiddio ac i ffermio mewn ffordd wahanol yn cael ei gyfyngu yn sylweddol gan reolau o ran gwella tir a mwyafswm stocio. Felly, mae achos dir a chryf iawn dros y taliad uniongyrchol i ffermwyr ar y rhostir ac mewn ardaloedd eraill o anfantais daearyddol. Rwy'n falch i glywed bod hwnnw'n opsiwn y bydd y Gweinidog o bosibl yn edrych arno o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Mae lle, wrth gwrs, ar gyfer taliad sengl cryf er mwyn sicrhau y gall ein ffermwyr ni gystadlu. Hefyd, nid yw'r farchnad rydd y mae ein ffermwyr ni'n gweithio ynddi yn gweithio. Nid yw'r farchnad rydd o ran y sector bwyd yn gweithio'n llwyddiannus, a dyna pam mae gennym ni bolisi amaeth cyffredin yn y lle cyntaf. Wrth gwrs, mae lle i daliadau amaeth-amgylcheddol a chynlluniau fel Glastir, am fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod y defnydd a wneir o'n tir yn rhoi buddiannau amgylcheddol ehangach.

Felly, rwy'n eich annog, Weinidog, i edrych eto ar rai o'r penderfyniadau yr ydych eisoes wedi'u cymryd ac i sicrhau y bydd y rhai a gymerwch yn y dyfodol yn rhai sy'n cynnal consensws gwleidyddol yn y lle hwn, gan wneud hynny er lles y diwydiant ac nid ar ei draul.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd drew attention to the very interesting point that the Minister could compensate for this decision by looking at modulation from pillar 2 to pillar 1, as the closing date for that decision has not yet passed. In fact, he has until the end of August to look at that. Certainly, other countries in Europe use this kind of modulation, and so, if the Minister so desired and if he was willing to listen to people beyond his own party and to people within the industry, then there is an opportunity for him to make redress for his position on modulation.

In addition to the modulation, Welsh farmers are facing a cut to the agriculture budget in general. The decision to allocate the single payment to some Welsh farmers in a specific way has been totally drastic. I am talking here about upland and moorland farmers and the decision that their payment per hectare will amount to only €20 by 2019. Therefore, many of them will see a cut of around 80% in their payments.

Those farms that are more than 400m above sea level are very often on SSSIs and are probably already in agri-environment schemes. Therefore, their ability to modernise and to farm in an alternative way is restricted substantially by rules on land improvement and the maximum that they can stock. There is a very clear and strong argument for the single farm payment for moorland areas and those other areas of geographical disadvantage. I am pleased to hear that that is an option that the Minister might consider under the rural development plan. There is scope, of course, for strong single payments to ensure that our farmers can remain competitive. Also, the free market in which our farmers are working does not work. The free market from the point of view of the food sector does not work successfully, which is why we have a common agricultural policy in the first place. Of course, there is scope for agri-environment payments and such schemes as Glastir because we must ensure that the way in which we use our land brings wider environmental benefits.

Therefore, I urge you, Minister, to look again at some of the decisions that you have already taken and to ensure that the ones that you take in future are ones that maintain a political consensus in this place, and to do that for the benefit of the industry rather than at its expense.



I welcome the opportunity to participate in this Plaid Cymru debate. I think that we should start by deciding on the type of agriculture, and the type of rural economy that we want to see at the end of the process for the current rural development plan that is out for consultation, and, indeed, the current envelope of cash that is contained in the reformed common agricultural policy. I have to say that we are not starting from the best of positions. We have had a significant fall in real terms of 44% for all types of farm income. When you look at how much primary product there is in Wales, you will see that we have had a diminished number in the national sheep flock, a diminished number of dairy cows, and a smaller number of arable acres. That is in relation to a very competitive world market that is pretty hungry, I would suggest, for food, and with food security becoming a greater and bigger issue around the globe. If you add in the factor of the diminishing numbers of processing plants that we have in Wales, you will see that there is a real concern about the ability to add real value to the primary product that we are producing in Wales. If you take liquid milk, for example, there is now only one processing plant—and I believe that that is in Wrexham—that processes liquid milk for supermarkets in Wales. We have just lost the Proper Welsh Milk brand from Wales, which was moved over to the Dairy Crest plant in Stonehouse. It was a competitive brand, I would suggest, with a real title behind it that told you where the milk had come from, yet the consumer did not buy into that product, hence it went into administration and Dairy Crest bought it out.

If you look at what is going on with our competitors across the rest of the European Union, particularly our most competitive competitor, if you like, which is the Republic of Ireland, you will see that we really do face some significant challenges. In particular, the document that the Government of the Irish Republic has as its blueprint for where it wants agriculture and the rural economy to be, entitled 'Food Harvest 2020', clearly maps out how it wants to see its primary agricultural industry develop with, obviously, the processing sector developing alongside it so that it can turn the primary product into the product that we as consumers buy and really return as much value as possible back to the farm gate. I have to say, from what I have heard from the Minister—and the Minister has talked about wanting a competitive agricultural industry in Wales, and we all would sign up to a more dynamic and innovative industry that will bring young people in—I cannot say that I am convinced by the blueprint that is put forward, as to whether he or indeed the Government as a whole knows where the industry and the rural economy will be in 2020-21 with the assistance that it is offering to that industry, unlike the Government of the Irish Republic, which is clearly setting out its stall and which is on its journey and making real process towards doubling the size of its dairy industry as an example of positive action.

Croesawaf y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddatl hon gan Blaid Cymru. Credaf y dylem ddechrau drwy benderfynu pa fath o amaethyddiaeth, a pha fath o economi wledig rydym am eu gweld ar ddiwedd proses y cynllun datblygu gwledig presennol sy'n destun ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd, ac, yn wir, yr amlen arian bresennol sy'n rhan o'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin diwygiedig. Rhaid imi gyfaddef nad ydym yn dechrau o'r sefyllfa orau. Mae incwm pob math o fferm wedi gostwng yn sylweddol mewn termau real, sef 44%. Os edrychwch faint o gynnyrch sylfaenol sydd yng Nghymru, gwelwch fod nifer y ddiadell ddefaid genedlaethol wedi lleihau, fod nifer y gwartheg godro wedi lleihau, a bod llai o erwau â. Mae hynny mewn perthynas â marchnad fyd-eang gystadleuol iawn sy'n awyddus iawn, ddywedwn i, i gael bwyd, a lle mae sicrwydd bwyd yn dod yn broblem fwy ac yn broblem gynyddol ledled y byd. Os ystyriwch hefyd y ffaith bod nifer y ffatrioedd prosesu yma yng Nghymru yn lleihau, fe welwch fod pryder gwirioneddol o ran y gallu i ychwanegu gwerth gwirioneddol i'r cynnyrch sylfaenol rydym yn ei gynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Os ystyriwch laeth hylif, er enghraifft, dim ond un ffatri prosesu—a chredaf mai yn Wrecsam y mae honno—sydd yma bellach sy'n prosesu llaeth hylif i archfarnadoedd yng Nghymru. Rydym newydd golli brand Proper Welsh Milk o Gymru, wrth iddo symud i ffatri Dairy Crest yn Stonehouse. Roedd yn frand cystadleuol, byddwn yn awgrymu, gyda theitl go iawn yn sail iddo yn eich hysbysu o darddiad y llaeth, ond ni chefnogodd defnyddwyr y cynnyrch hwnnw, felly aeth i ddwylo'r gweinyddwyr ac fe'i prynwyd gan Dairy Crest.

Os ystyriwch sefyllfa ein cystadleuwyr ledled gweddill yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, yn enwedig ein cystadleuwr mwyaf cystadleuol, os hoffech, sef Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, fe welwch ein bod o ddirif yn wynebu heriau sylweddol. Yn benodol, mae'r ddogfen y mae Llywodraeth Gweriniaeth Iwerddon yn ei dilyn fel ei glasbrint o ran ei nodau ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth a'r economi wledig, sef 'Food Harvest 2020', yn nodi'n glir sut y mae am weld ei diwydiant amaethyddol sylfaenol yn datblygu gyda'r sector prosesu, yn amlwg, yn datblygu ochr yn ochr er mwyn iddo allu troi'r cynnyrch sylfaenol yn gynnyrch y byddwn ni fel defnyddwyr yn ei brynu a dychwelyd cymaint o werth â phosibl i giât y fferm. Rhaid imi ddweud, o'r hyn a glywais gan y Gweinidog—ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi sôn am fod eisiau diwydiant amaethyddol cystadleuol yng Nghymru, a byddai pob un ohonom yn awyddus i weld diwydiant mwy deinamig ac arloesol a fydd yn denu pobl ifanc—nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi gan y glasbrint a gyflwynwyd, o ran pa un a yw'r Gweinidog neu'n wir y Llywodraeth gyfan yn gwybod ble y bydd yr economi wledig yn 2020-21 gyda'r cymorth y mae'n ei gynnig i'r diwydiant hwnnw, yn wahanol i Lywodraeth Gweriniaeth Iwerddon, sy'n nodi ei dyheadau yn glir ac sydd wedi dechrau ar ei thaith ac yn gwneud cynnydd gwirioneddol tuag at ddyblu maint ei diwydiant llaeth fel enghraifft o weithredu cadarnhaol.

There are also environmental considerations, the level of support that will be put into the rural development plan and how farmers will be able to access the environmental payments that might well be coming forward from the current RDP. In the good old days, when there was Tir Gofal and other schemes, if somebody really wanted to sign up to those schemes and embrace the environmental agenda, they could do so with gusto and enthusiasm and be beacons of excellence in that particular field. I have to say that the overall package of Glastir and the amount of time that has been spent on the debate on Glastir does not convince me that the Government—and I appreciate that the Minister inherited many of the schemes that he has to deal with and modify—has met the goal that the industry itself has set in having greater environmental credentials.

However, I save my deepest criticism for the announcement that the Minister made on modulation. It is the Government's right to set that rate if it so wishes, though I disagree with that rate. However, when you look at creating a competitive industry, you have to look at what the other players in the pool that you are swimming in are dealing with. The Republic of Ireland is on 0%, Northern Ireland is on 0%, England is on 12.5%, Scotland is on 9.5%, France is on 3%, Germany is on 4.5%—I could go on but I think that Chamber and those watching will get a sense of what I am trying to say. It is all well and good to say that we are going to have a 15% modulation rate, but how will we be competitive against other people when we are bidding to the supermarkets, the catering industry and the world markets to sell our produce at competitive prices when we are starting at such a disadvantage? When we are one of only six parts of the European Union that have brought that modulation rate forward, while all the others are waiting until this year, you really have to question what the Minister's actions are going to achieve for this industry.

Ceir ystyriaethau amgylcheddol hefyd, lefel y cymorth a gaiff ei gynnwys yn y cynllun datblygu gwledig a sut y bydd ffermwyr yn gallu cael gafael ar y taliadau amgylcheddol a all ddeillio o'r Cynllun Datblygu Gwledig presennol. Yn yr hen ddyddiau da, pan oedd Tir Gofal a chynlluniau eraill ar waith, os oedd rhywun yn wirioneddol awyddus i gofrestru ar gyfer y cynlluniau hynny a chofleidio'r agenda amgylcheddol, gallent wneud hynny ag afiaith a brwdfrydedd a bod yn esiamplau o ragoriaeth yn y maes penodol hwnnw. Rhaid imi ddweud nad yw pecyn cyffredinol Glastir a faint o amser a dreuliyd yn trafod Glastir yn fy argyhoeddi bod y Llywodraeth—a sylweddolaf fod y Gweinidog wedi etifeddu llawer o'r cynlluniau y mae'n rhaid iddo ymdrin â hwy a'u haddasu—wedi cyflawni'r nod a bennwyd gan y diwydiant ei hun, sef gwella ei gymwyseddau amgylcheddol.

Fodd bynnag, mae fy meirniadaeth ddyfnaf yn ymwneud â chyhoeddiad y Gweinidog ar fodiwleiddio. Mae gan y Llywodraeth hawl i bennu'r gyfradd honno, os dymuna, er nad wyf yn cytuno â'r gyfradd honno. Fodd bynnag, wrth ystyried creu diwydiant cystadleuol, rhaid ichi edrych ar eich cystadleuwyr. Mae Gweriniaeth Iwerddon ar 0%, mae Gogledd Iwerddon ar 0%, mae Lloegr ar 12.5%, mae'r Alban ar 9.5%, mae Ffrainc ar 3%, mae'r Almaen ar 4.5%—gallwn barhau ond credaf y bydd y Siambr a'r rheini sy'n gwylio wedi cael syniad o'r hyn rwy'n ceisio ei ddweud. Mae'n ddigon hawdd dweud ein bod yn mynd i gael cyfradd fodiwleiddio o 15%, ond sut y gallwn gystadlu yn erbyn pobl eraill pan fyddwn yn cyflwyno cynigion i'r archfarchnadoedd, y diwydiant arlwyio a marchnadoedd y byd i werthu ein cynnyrch am brisiau cystadleuol pan fyddwn yn dechrau o dan anfantais o'r fath? O gofio ein bod yn un o ddim ond chwe rhan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd sydd wedi cyflwyno'r gyfradd fodiwleiddio honno, gyda'r gweddill yn aros tan eleni, rhaid ichi wir ystyried beth y mae camau gweithredu'r Gweinidog yn mynd i'w gyflawni i'r diwydiant hwn.

16:27

## Rhun ap Iorwerth [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Rydym wedi clywed gan nifer o gyfranwyr i'r ddatl yn barod am yr ergydion y mae'r economi wledig yng Nghymru wedi'u dioddef un ar ôl y llall dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Ym myd amaeth yn benodol, fel yr ydym wedi clywed, mae incwm wedi gostwng ar gyfartaledd o dros 40%. Un rhan o'r stori yw honno: mae angen cefnogi a chynnal yr economi wledig ym mhob ffordd. Os caf i ddweud gair cyffredinol ar y dechrau am y dimensiwn Ewropeaidd, nid yw'n gredadwy i Aelodau honni eu bod yn cefnogi cefn gwlad tra bod eu pleidiau yn dal i bleidleisio dros dorri cyllidebau Ewropeaidd, neu hyd yn oed yn ystyried gadael yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Rydych chi naill ai'n wrth-Ewropeaidd ac felly'n cymryd safiad yn erbyn yr economi wledig, neu o blaid yr economi wledig ac felly'n gweld y cyswllt cwbl glir rhwng iechyd economaidd cefn gwlad Cymru a chymorth a chynhaliadau Ewropeaidd. Gwnawn ni, ym Mhlaid Cymru, bopeth y gallwn ni i brofi gwerth aelodaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a phwysigrwydd manteisio ar yr aelodaeth honno i'r eithaf.

We have heard from a number of contributors to this debate about the blows that the rural economy in Wales has suffered one after another over the past few years. In agriculture specifically, as we have heard, income has declined by more than 40% on average. However, that is only part of the story: we need to support and maintain the rural economy in all ways. If I may just say at the outset a few words in general terms on the European dimension, it is not credible for Members to claim that they support rural Wales while their parties continue to vote for a cut in European budgets or are even considering leaving the European Union. You are either anti-European and therefore take a stance against the rural economy, or are in favour of the rural economy and can see the clear link that exists between the health of Wales's rural economy and European support and assistance. We in Plaid Cymru will do everything we can to prove the value of membership of the European Union and the importance of taking full advantage of that membership.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Rydym yn falch fod y Llywodraeth wedi cyhoeddi ei hymgyngoriad ar y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Mae gan y cynllun datblygu gwledig rôl allweddol i'w chwarae yn awr mewn creu cymunedau gwledig cynaliadwy gyda seiliau economaidd, amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol cryf. Bydd y cynllun newydd yn y blynyddoedd i ddod yn gyfle inni fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion hynny sydd wedi bod yn dal Cymru wledig yn ôl. Rydym yn gwybod bod y Gweinidog wedi penderfynu modiwlleiddio'r 15% llawn. Rydym wedi ei gwneud yn glir ein bod yn meddwl mai camsyniad yw hynny a fydd yn achosi mwy o broblemau yn y diwydiant amaeth yn uniongyrchol, sydd, yn ei dro, yn rhan allweddol o'r economi wledig ehangach. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y Gweinidog wedi cymryd y cam hwnnw, ac os yw am wrthod ein sialens ni i ailystyried, yr her iddo fydd cyflwyno ei achos a chyfiawnhau'r hyn y mae wedi'i wneud.

Mae'n bwysig cofio bod y 15% yn cael ei symud—nid arian sy'n cael ei greu o'r newydd mohono. Mae'n bwysicach nag erioed, felly, ei fod yn cael ei ddefnyddio i helpu cymunedau'n uniongyrchol. Er enghraifft, nid yw talu yn agos at £1,000 y dydd i ymgynghorwyr yn mynd i wneud dim heblaw sugno arian allan o'r economi. Mae angen tynnu llawer o'r fiwrocratiaeth allan o systemau ac mae hefyd angen symleiddio'r broses o ddelifro. Nid wyf yn dychmygu y byddai'r Gweinidog yn anghytuno â'r angen am hynny. Un rhan allweddol o'r RDP, a rhan sy'n gwbl angenrheidiol, yn fy marn i, yw annog entrepreneuriaeth a mentergarwch. Y rhaglenni gorau yw'r rhai sydd wir yn gallu annog y diwylliant o fentro ymhlith pobl ifanc a'r boblogaeth ehangach.

Byddaf yn treulio ychydig amser yn sôn am Menter Môn. Fel mae'r enw yn ei awgrymu, corff sy'n annog entrepreneuriaeth a hybu busnes yw hwn—un o'r grwpiau LEADER ar draws Cymru. Os edrychwn ar rai o'r prosiectau y mae Menter Môn wedi bod yn eu harwain, rydym yn gweld sgôp ar gyfer gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i economi cefn gwlad. Mae nifer fawr iawn o brosiectau—arallgyfeirio ffermydd, helpu busnesau cynhyrchu bwyd, datblygu cynnyrch, hybu buddsoddiad mewn twristiaeth, a'r gwaith ymchwil sy'n cael ei wneud mewn ynni cymunedol hefyd. Mae'r posibilïadau'n ddiddiwedd, ond mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod yr arian yn cael ei wario'n effeithlon ac yn cael gwir effaith mewn cymunedau.

Soniaf am y pethau sy'n gallu effeithio ar allu busnesau i ffynnu yng nghefn gwlad. Nid oes gennyf amser i fynd i mewn i'r problemau yng Nghymru o beidio â chael cyfle i fanteisio ar y 'fuel rebate scheme'—rhywbeth mae'r gylmblaid yn Llundain wedi gadael Cymru i lawr arno yn llwyr. Cysylltiadau digidol—mae hynny'n hollbwysig. Mae Plaid Cymru, rwy'n gwybod, wedi bod yn llafar iawn ar yr angen i sicrhau bod—

We are pleased that the Government announced a consultation on the rural development plan. The RDP has a key role to play in creating sustainable rural communities that have strong economic, environment and social foundations. The new plan in years to come will be an opportunity for us to tackle some of those issues that have been holding rural Wales back. We know that the Minister has decided to modulate at the full 15%. We have made it clear that that is an error that will cause more problems in the agriculture industry directly, which, in turn, is a crucial part of the wider rural economy. However, now that the Minister has taken that decision, and if he is to reject our challenge to reconsider, the challenge for him is to make his case and to justify his actions.

It is important to bear in mind that that 15% is being vired—it is not new funding. It is more important than ever that it is used to assist communities directly. For example, paying nearly £1,000 a day to consultants will do nothing but suck money out of the economy. We need to remove much of the bureaucracy from systems and we also need to simplify the process of delivery. I doubt that the Minister could disagree with the need to do that. A crucial part of the RDP, and something that is completely necessary in my opinion is the encouragement of entrepreneurship and innovation. The best programmes are those that are truly able to encourage a culture of entrepreneurship among young people and the wider population.

I will spend some time talking about Menter Môn. As the name suggests, it is a body that encourages entrepreneurship and promotes business—it is one of the LEADER groups across Wales. If we look at some of the projects that Menter Môn has been leading, we will see the scope for making a very real difference to the rural economy. There are many projects—diversification of farms, helping food production businesses, developing products, encouraging investment in tourism, and research work undertaken in community energy. The possibilities are endless, but we must ensure that the funding is spent efficiently and that it has a real effect in communities.

I will mention the issues that can affect the ability of businesses to prosper in rural areas. I do not have time to go into the problems because of Wales's inability to take advantage of the fuel rebate scheme—on which the coalition in London has let Wales down. Digital connections are crucial. Plaid Cymru has, I know, been very vocal on the need to ensure that—

16:31 **Andrew R.T. Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I am surprised that the Member can say that the coalition Government has let Wales down. It is EU rules that stipulate that you have to be a certain distance away from the refinery to qualify for the concession.

Rwy'n synnu y gall yr Aelod ddweud bod y Llywodraeth gylmblaid wedi gadael Cymru i lawr. Rheolau'r UE sy'n mynnu bod yn rhaid ichi fod pellter penodol o'r burfa er mwyn bod yn gymwys i gael y gostyngiad.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:31 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

You will know full well that Danny Alexander did not even put a bid in for Wales, although he put several bids in for England and Scotland.

Byddwch yn gwybod yn iawn na wnaeth Danny Alexander hyd yn oed gyflwyno cais ar gyfer Cymru, er iddo gyflwyno sawl cais ar gyfer Lloegr a'r Alban.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Mae cysylltiadau digidol yn hollbwysig. Mae'n rhaid i ardaloedd gwledig gael yn union yr un manteision ag ardaloedd trefol. Mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod cysylltiadau band eang, 3G a 4G yn mynd i bob rhan o Gymru.

Bydd y Gweinidog, rwy'n siŵr, yn dadlau bod modiweiddio'n ffordd i fuddsoddi mwy mewn datblygu gwledig, ond nid yw mor syml â hynny. Pan ydych yn tynnu arian yn uniongyrchol oddi ar ffermwyr, sy'n rhan mor allweddol o'r economi wledig, rydych yn creu problemau o'r newydd. Yr her i'r Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidog yw profi'r hyn mae'n ei ddweud: sef y daw mwy o les nag o ddrwg o'r llwybr y mae wedi dewis ei ddilyn.

Digital connections are crucial. Rural areas must have exactly the same benefits as urban areas. We must ensure that broadband, 3G and 4G connections are available in all parts of Wales.

The Minister, I am sure, will argue that modulation is a way of investing more in rural development, but it is not that simple. When you take money directly away from farmers, who are such a crucial part of the rural economy, you create new problems. The challenge for the Government and the Minister is to prove what he says: that there will be greater benefit than harm from the route he has chosen to follow.

16:32

## **Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I want to address my remarks this afternoon in particular to the issue facing the moorlands. That is not to dismiss the widespread concern of the industry through Brecon and Radnorshire, which is a traditionally highly stocked area. The move away from historic payments was always going to be challenging enough without the maximum transfer from pillar 1 to pillar 2. However, the challenge facing the moorlands is literally tenfold.

I am blessed to represent some of the most spectacular upland countryside in Wales, but alongside that beauty comes a struggle—one that can only truly be understood by the generations who have lived on that land and worked it. The people who do that deserve our respect—respect for their skills and resilience, and, I would argue, they deserve our support.

The first point of clarification that I would like to hear from the Minister is: how will those individual farmers who have parcels of land that are bisected by the 400m mark be treated? There is some confusion as to how that land will be classified. In some cases, I have heard that 61% will be used to calculate the payments; in other cases, 50%. My understanding is that there is mapping and tools available that would allow for a perfectly accurate calculation of the land, so that that part of the field falling below 400m could be paid at the higher rate, and the land above could be paid at the lower rate. I hope that the Minister will clarify that that is what he intends to do.

It is not the only area of my constituency that finds itself above the moorland, but Members will be aware of my specific concerns regarding the Elan valley. Let us be absolutely clear: these are not farmers sitting on land that they own and on which they can capitalise. These are tenant farmers working on an estate. I would like to highlight the case of one of them.

Hoffwn gyfeirio fy sylwadau y prynhawn yma yn arbennig at y broblem sy'n wynebu'r rhostiroedd. Ond nid yw hynny ar draul pryder cyffredinol y diwydiant drwy Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, sy'n ardal lle ceir lefelau uchel o stoc yn draddodiadol. Roedd y penderfyniad i symud o daliadau hanesyddol bob amser yn ddigon heriol heb y trosglwyddiad uchaf o golofn 1 i golofn 2. Fodd bynnag, mae'r her sy'n wynebu'r rhostiroedd o ddifrif yn ddeg gwaith cymaint.

Rwy'n ffodus cael cynrychioli rhai o'r ardaloedd mwyaf trawiadol o ucheldir yng Nghymru, ond ochr yn ochr â'r harddwch hwnnw, ceir brwydr—un na ellir ond ei deall go iawn gan y cenedlaethau sydd wedi byw ar y tir hwnnw ac wedi gweithio arno. Mae'r bobl sy'n gwneud hynny yn haeddu ein parch—parch tuag at eu sgiliau a'u gwydnwch, ac maent yn haeddu ein cefnogaeth, byddwn yn dadlau.

Y pwynt cyntaf yr hoffwn i'r Gweinidog ei egluro yw: sut y caiff y ffermwyr unigol hynny y mae ganddynt barseli o dir a gaiff eu rhannu gan y marc 400m eu trin? Ceir rhywfaint o ddrwsych ynghylch sut y caiff y tir hwnnw ei ddsbarthu. Mewn rhai achosion, clywais y caiff 61% ei ddefnyddio i gyfrifo'r taliadau; mewn achosion eraill, 50%. Rwyf ar ddeall bod trefniadau mapio ac adnoddau ar gael a fyddai'n caniatáu i'r tir gael ei gyfrifo'n fanwl gywir, fel y gellid talu'r rhan honno o'r cae sydd islaw 400m ar y gyfradd uwch, a'r tir uwchben ar y gyfradd is. Gobeithio y gwnaiff y Gweinidog egluro mai dyna y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud.

Nid dyma'r unig ardal yn fy etholaeth sydd uwchben y rhostir, ond bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol o'm pryderon penodol ynghylch Cwm Elan. Gadewch inni fod yn hollol glir: nid yw'r ffermwyr hyn yn dal eu gafael ar dir y maent yn berchen arno ac y gallant fanteisio arno. Ffermwyr sy'n denantiaid ydynt sy'n gweithio ar ystâd. Hoffwn dynnu sylw at achos un ohonynt.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

The tenant farm that I am talking about has been there for generations, and for 120 years the land has been managed, and grazing has been constrained, to ensure that the water coming off the Elan valley is of the highest quality. This particular farmer—a woman farmer—employs skilled workers on a regular basis. In the winter, she rents lowland grazing. She buys feedstuffs, veterinary medicines and specialist equipment to ensure that she can keep her land in good working order. She also buys essentials—by essentials I mean generators, batteries, invertors, diesel fuel—because there is no mains electricity in the valley. The farm will now have only €20 per hectare, because the entire holding falls above the 400m mark. There is a very small slither of land that will fall below, but the vast majority of the farm will fall above the 400m mark.

The Minister tells my constituent that Glastir will replace her drop in income. However, Glastir was never intended to replace pillar 1 payments. It was intended to build upon previous agri-environment schemes. Indeed, this particular farmer is already in Glastir. Glastir requires her to winter her sheep away. She will now have only €20 per hectare to look for lowland winter grazing, compared to other farmers who will have €200 per hectare. If she cannot afford grazing, or cannot get it, she will be in breach of her Glastir contract and sheep remaining on the hill farm will become a welfare concern. In fact, her Glastir agreement prevents her from feeding sheep on the hill. If she does feed those sheep, she will be in breach of her Glastir agreement. Her lambing rates are 30% for those sheep that are left on the hill, compared to 105% for those that are wintered away.

Of course, there is also concern about whether the Minister's insistence that Glastir could be a mechanism by which income could be boosted is actually in line with EU rules and regulations. I would suspect, and the advice that I have been given is, that this constant assurance by the Minister that Glastir can be used as an income top-up will have the auditors of the EU descending upon him. I think that, potentially, there are complications there.

The only fair way to support hill farmers such as my constituent is to develop an ANC moorland scheme paid for out of pillar 2. In that way, those living in this environment will be able to continue to survive—and hopefully thrive—in these most unique of Welsh hill communities.

Mae'r fferm denant rwy'n sôn amdani wedi bod yno ers cenedlaethau, ac ers 120 o flynyddoedd, cafodd y tir ei reoli, a chyfyngwyd ar bori, er mwyn sicrhau bod y dŵr a ddaw o gwm Elan o'r ansawdd uchaf. Mae'r ffermwraig benodol hon yn cyflogi gweithwyr medrus yn rheolaidd. Yn y gaeaf, mae'n rhenti iseldir pori. Mae'n prynu porthiant, meddyginaethau milfeddygol ac offer arbenigol i sicrhau y gall gadw ei thir mewn cyflwr da. Mae hefyd yn prynu hanfodion—o ran hanfodion, rwy'n golygu generaduron, batris, gwrthdroyddion, tanwydd disel—gan nad oes prif gyflenwad trydan yn y cwm. Yn awr, dim ond €20 fesul hectar a gaiff y fferm, gan fod y daliad cyfan wedi'i leoli uwchben 400m. Mae ardal fach iawn o dir a fydd islaw'r marc hwnnw, ond bydd mwyafrif helaeth y fferm uwchben 400m.

Dywed y Gweinidog wrth fy etholwr y bydd Glastir yn gwneud iawn am y gostyngiad yn ei hincwm. Fodd bynnag, ni fwriadwyd erioed i Glastir wneud iawn am daliadau colofn 1. Bwriadwyd iddo adeiladu ar gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol blaenorol. Yn wir, mae'r ffermwraig hon eisoes yn rhan o Glastir. Mae Glastir yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddi symud ei defaid yn ystod y gaeaf. Bellach, dim ond €20 fesul hectar fydd ganddi i chwilio am iseldir pori ar gyfer y gaeaf, o gymharu â ffermwyr eraill y bydd ganddynt €200 fesul hectar. Os na all fforddio tir pori, neu os na all gael gafael ar dir o'r fath, bydd yn mynd yn groes i'w chontract Glastir a bydd unrhyw ddefaid sy'n parhau ar y fferm fynydd yn dod yn bryder lles. Yn wir, mae ei chytundeb Glastir yn ei hatal rhag bwydo defaid ar y mynydd. Os bydd yn bwydo'r defaid hynny, bydd yn mynd yn groes i'w chytundeb Glastir. Mae ei chyfraddau wyna yn cyfateb i 30% ar gyfer y defaid hynny a gaiff eu gadael ar y mynydd, o gymharu â 105% ar gyfer y rhai a gaiff eu symud dros y gaeaf.

Wrth gwrs, ceir pryder hefyd o ran pa un a yw haerid y Gweinidog y gellid defnyddio Glastir fel ffordd o hybu incwm mewn gwirionedd yn unol â rheolau a rheoliadau'r UE. Byddwn yn amau, a'r cyngor a gefais, yw y bydd y sicrwydd cyson hwn gan y Gweinidog y gellir defnyddio Glastir fel ffordd o ychwanegu at incwm yn denu sylw archwilyr yr UE. Credaf, o bosibl, fod yna gymhlethodau.

Yr unig ffordd deg i gefnogi ffermwyr mynydd fel fy etholwr yw datblygu cynllun rhostir AChN a thalu amdano gan ddefnyddio colofn 2. Fel y cyfryw, bydd y rheini sy'n byw yn yr amgylchedd hwn yn gallu parhau i oroesi—a ffynnu gobeithio—yn y cymunedau mwyafrif unigryw hyn yn ardaloedd mynyddig Cymru.

16:37

## Yr Arglwydd / Lord Elis-Thomas [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Mae'r drafodaeth hon yn allweddol bwysig, ac nid wyf yn siŵr a wyf yn cytuno â'r dôn sydd yn cael ei defnyddio yn gyffredinol. Clywch araith gymesur gennyf i, oherwydd rwyf wedi treulio llawer iawn o amser yn trafod gyda'r undebau amaethyddol a'r rhanddeiliaid, ac yn enwedig gyda fy nghymdogion, am y datblygiadau a'r posibiladau.

This debate is crucially important, and I am not sure whether I agree, in general, with the tone that is being used. You will hear a more balanced speech from me, because I have spent a great deal of time talking to the farming unions and to stakeholders, particularly my neighbours, about the developments and possibilities.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae'r newid aruthrol sydd yn digwydd unwaith eto o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn rhywbeth rydym wedi byw ag o ar hyd y blynyddoedd. Mae'r newid mewn cymhorthdal amaethyddol yn rhywbeth rydym ni wedi ei hyrwyddo yn y Cynulliad hwn mewn Llywodraeth o'r blaen. Yn ystod y cyfnod o drafod ynglŷn â'r newidiadau presennol, sydd wedi dod â ni i'r fan hon, rydym wedi gallu cael cyfle fel Aelodau Cynulliad—mae rhai pethau wedi cael eu dweud ynglŷn â'r Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd fel pe baem yn rhyw gangen o'r masyniaid—yn agored iawn i drafod yn glir gyda phawb, yn enwedig o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ei hun. Cawsom sawl cyfle i drafod gyda Brwsel drwy fideo-gynhadledd a hefyd yn uniongyrchol, a thrafod yn helaeth gyda'r gŵr disglair o Iwerddon a oedd yn gyfrifol am gyrraedd y cytundeb hwn. Mae'n dda i allu cydnabod cyfraniad arbennig y wladwriaeth honno.

Carwn hefyd dalu teyrnged i lefel eithriadol y math o arbenigeidd sydd gan ein rhanddeiliaid ni mewn materion gwledig. Cefais gyfle nodedig iawn yn ddiweddar i longyfarch Ed Bailey, sydd yn ymddeol fel Llywydd NFU Cymru—un o'n dwy undeb ni yng Nghymru; mae'n rhaid i Gymru gael dau gapel a dwy undeb ym mhob pentref. Wrth wneud hynny, roeddwn yn gallu cydnabod ei fod mewn olyniaeth o lefarwyr ar ran gwleidyddiaeth amaethyddiaeth sydd wedi dweud pethau caredig iawn am y cyn Gweinidog a phethau ddim cweit mor garedig, ond eithaf adeiladol, am y Gweinidog presennol. Felly, mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn cydnabod cyfraniad y bobl hyn.

Wrth inni ymwneud â nhw fel pwyllgor, ac wrth inni fynd i drafod â Senedd Ewrop, a cheisio bod yn gyfrwng i gyfleu barn ffermwyr ac amaethwyr Cymru i Senedd Ewrop, cawsom gyfle i siarad deddfwrfa wrth ddeddfwrfa. Carwn ddiolch am y math o gydweithrediad amhleidiol y mae Aelodau Seneddol Ewropeaidd Cymru wedi gallu ei gynnig i'r rhai sy'n ceisio cynrychioli buddiannau Cymru yn y fan honno. Bu'n allweddol iawn bod yr Aelodau Seneddol Ewropeaidd yn gallu gweithredu yn y ffordd honno. Heb fynd yn bleidiol ynglŷn â'r etholiad sydd ar ddod, rwy'n gobethio y bydd hynny yn parhau i fod yn bosibl.

Cawsom gyfle i drafod â 'rapporteurs' a dirprwy 'rapporteurs' gwahanol bwyllgorau, a chawsom ffordd o chwilio am dir cyffredin, sydd yn dod â fi at lle rydym erbyn heddiw yng Nghymru. Yr hyn a ddywedodd y pwyllgor oedd bod modiweiddio neu drosglwyddo rhwng colofnau yn rhywbeth roeddem yn credu a oedd yn bosibl, ac y dylai fod yn wirfoddol. Roeddem yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd troglwyddo cyllid rhwng colofn 1 a 2, ac fel sydd wedi cael ei ddweud yn barod yn y ddadl hon, mater i'r Gweinidog yn awr yw profi bod yr hyn mae wedi ei wneud yn mynd i fod yn ddefnyddiol. Mae'n gwybod beth rwyf i eisiau a lle rwyf eisiau gweld buddsoddiad, ac rwy'n sicr y bydd Aelodau eraill o'r lle hwn yn fodlon esbonio hynny iddo yn glir o fewn y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Mae ffurf y rhaglen honno yn mynd i fod yn allweddol iawn i ni at y dyfodol.

The massive change that is happening once again within the European Union is something that we have lived with throughout the years. The change in agricultural subsidies is something that we have promoted in this Assembly under a previous Government. During the period of discussion on the current changes, which have brought us to this point, we have had an opportunity as Assembly Members—some things have been said about the Environment and Sustainability Committee as if we were a branch of the masons—to have a very open discussion with everybody, particularly within the European Union itself. We have had a number of opportunities to have discussions with Brussels by video-conference and in person, and we have had great discussions with the brilliant man from Ireland who was responsible for this agreement. It is good to be able to acknowledge the particular contribution of that state.

I would also like to pay tribute to the exceptional level of the kind of expertise that our stakeholders have in rural issues. I had a notable opportunity recently to congratulate Ed Bailey, who is retiring as president of the NFU in Wales—one of the two unions that we have in Wales; Wales has to have two chapels and two unions in every village. In doing that, I could acknowledge his place in the succession of speakers on behalf of agricultural politics who have said very kind things about the previous Minister and not quite as kind, but quite constructive, things about the current Minister. So, it is very important that we acknowledge the contribution of these people.

As we engaged with them as a committee, and as we had discussions with the European Parliament, and tried to be a medium to convey the views of Welsh farmers to the European Parliament, we had an opportunity to speak legislature to legislature. I would like to express my thanks for the kind of non-partisan collaboration that our MEPs have been able to offer those attempting to represent the interests of Wales there. It has been crucially important that the MEPs were able to act in that way. Without being party political about the forthcoming election, I hope that it will be possible to continue with that.

We had an opportunity to meet with the rapporteurs and deputy rapporteurs of various committees, and we found a way of looking for common ground, which brings us to where we stand today here in Wales. What the committee said was that modulation or transferring between pillars is something that we believed was possible and that it should be voluntary. We acknowledged the importance of transferring funds between pillars 1 and 2, and as has already been said in this debate, it is now up to the Minister to prove that what he has done will be useful. He knows what I want and where I want to see investment, and I am certain that other Members of this place will be willing to explain that to him clearly within the rural development plan. The form of that programme will be key for us in future.



Rydym yn edrych fel pwyllgor ar ein gwaith presennol. Byddwn yn cymryd rhan yn hyn eto yfory ym Mhrifysgol Aberystwyth. Rheoli tir yn gynaliadwy yw ein nod, ac wrth wneud hynny rydym yn gweld cyfle i wario arian y rhaglen datblygu gwledig ar wydnwch a chydnerthedd amaethyddiaeth drwy Gymru—amaethyddiaeth y ffriddoedd, yr ucheldir a llawr gwlad. Rwy'n gobeithio bod y Gweinidog yn gweld y cyfle mawr sydd ganddo i adeiladu siediau ym mhob man, fel mae rhai ohonom wedi bod yn sôn amdano. Efallai nad dyna a fydd y datrysiad a fydd yn dderbyniol i bawb mewn parciau cenedlaethol, ond y nod yw creu amaethyddiaeth gynaliadwy a sicrhau busnesau ffermio i'r bobl ifanc brwdfrydig rydym yn siarad efo nhw—nad ydynt yn rhannu'r gwae a'r ofn a glywsom yn y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma—sy'n awyddus i fyw a gweithio a gwneud elw yn ein mynyddoedd ac ar ein tir isel.

As a committee, we are looking at our current workload. We will be participating in this again at Aberystwyth University tomorrow. Sustainable land management is our aim, and in doing that, we see an opportunity to spend the rural development programme money on the resilience and strength of farming across Wales—on the moorlands, highlands and lowlands. I hope that the Minister appreciates the great opportunity that he has to build sheds everywhere, as some of us have been talking about. That might not be the perfect solution for everybody in national parks, but the objective is to create sustainable agriculture and to secure farming businesses for the enthusiastic young people we talk to—who do not share the gloom and doom that we have heard in this debate this afternoon—and who are eager to live and work and make a profit on our mountains and lowlands.

16:42

## Alun Davies [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Y Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol a Bwyd / The Minister for Natural Resources and Food*

I was looking forward to the debate this afternoon. With the exception of Andrew R.T. Davies's contribution and Dafydd Elis-Thomas's contribution, I am not sure that the debate has enlightened many of us as much as it perhaps could have done. It was more of a lost opportunity than an opportunity.

The Government will be rejecting the motion this afternoon, and we will also be rejecting both amendments. The Tory amendment was clearly written before they had had the opportunity to read the statistics that we published on bovine TB reduction, as the amendment says that the Welsh Government's policy is a failure. Of course, the UK Government's policy has delivered reductions in bovine TB that are half the level of the Welsh Government's policies. So, I had assumed that you would withdraw your amendment this afternoon, rather than pressing it to a vote.

I will say at the same time to my very good friends in the Liberal Democrats—[Interruption.] Kirsty's contributions are always worth listening to, but it would be better sometimes if you took the opportunity to read the consultation documents before you get on your feet. Had you done so, the questions that you asked would have been answered. It is in the documents, and although I am not able here this afternoon to point you to the pages, I would suggest that, when you return to Brecon this evening or tomorrow, you take the documents and read them. That will perhaps help you more than any contribution that I can make this afternoon.

I also say this to Bill Powell: for two years, I asked for your views on CAP reform. For two years, I asked you to support me in campaigning against reductions in pillar 1 budgets, and I never heard an opinion. Not once was there a view expressed. Not once was there an opinion offered. Not once was an element of support offered. Since then, we have had pious speech after pious speech saying that we need to spend money here, there and everywhere. When we were arguing the case for pillar 1 payments, what was happening with the Liberal Democrats? Complete and utter silence.

Roeddwn yn edrych ymlaen at y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Ac eithrio cyfraniad Andrew R.T. Davies a chyfraniad Dafydd Elis-Thomas, nid wyf yn siŵr bod y ddadl wedi darparu cymaint o eglurder ag y gallai fod wedi gwneud i lawer ohonom. Roedd yn fwy o gyfle a gollwyd na chyfle.

Bydd y Llywodraeth yn gwrthod y cynnig y prynhawn yma, a byddwn hefyd yn gwrthod y ddau welliant. Yn amlwg, ysgrifennwyd gwelliant y Torïaid cyn iddynt gael y cyfle i ddarllen yr ystadegau a gyhoeddwyd gennym ar leihau TB mewn gwartheg, gan fod y gwelliant yn nodi bod bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi methu. Wrth gwrs, dim ond hanner y gostyngiadau mewn TB mewn gwartheg a gyflawnodd polisïau Llywodraeth Cymru y mae polisï Llywodraeth y DU wedi'u cyflawni. Felly, roeddwn wedi tybio y byddech yn tynnu eich gwelliant yn ôl y prynhawn yma, yn hytrach na phwyso am bleidlais.

Hoffwn ddweud ar yr un pryd wrth fy ffrindiau da iawn yn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—[Torri ar draws.] Mae cyfraniadau Kirsty bob amser yn werth gwranddo arnynt, ond byddai'n well weithiau pe byddech yn manteisio ar y cyfle i ddarllen y dogfennau ymgynghori cyn ichi godi ar eich traed. Pe byddech wedi gwneud hynny, byddai'r cwestiynau a ofynnoch wedi'u hateb. Mae'r atebion yn y dogfennau, ac er na allaf eich cyfeirio at y tudalennau yma y prynhawn yma, hoffwn awgrymu, pan ddychwelwch i Aberhonddu heno neu yfory, y dylech fynd â'r dogfennau gyda chi a'u darllen. Efallai y bydd hynny yn fwy buddiol ichi nag unrhyw gyfraniad y gallaf ei wneud y prynhawn yma.

Dywedaf hyn hefyd wrth Bill Powell: am ddwy flynedd, gofynnais am eich barn ar ddiwygio'r PAC. Am ddwy flynedd, gofynnais ichi fy nghefnogi wrth ymgyrchu yn erbyn gostyngiadau mewn cyllidebau colofn 1, ac ni chlywais farn erioed. Ni fynegwyd barn un waith. Ni chynigiwyd barn un waith. Ni chynigiwyd elfen o gymorth un waith. Ers hynny, rydym wedi cael yr un araith dduwiol dro ar ôl tro yn datgan fod angen inni wario arian yma, acw ac ymhob man. Pan oeddem yn dadlau o blaid taliadau colofn 1, beth oedd yn digwydd gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? Tawelwch llwyr.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:45	<p><b>Elin Jones</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Will you take an intervention?</p>	<p>A dderbyniwch ymyriad?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
16:45	<p><b>Alun Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Let me just make my point.</p> <p>I have been a bit too nice to our Conservative friends. Coming here and arguing for these matters, when I sat for two years listening to Conservative Ministers arguing fiercely for 'substantial reductions' in pillar 1 payments, frankly takes a bit of doing. I will give way to Elin Jones.</p>	<p>Gadewch imi wneud fy mhwynt yn gyntaf.</p> <p>Rwyf wedi bod braidd yn rhy garedig i'n cyfeillion Ceidwadol. Mae dod yma a dadlau dros y materion hyn, pan eisteddais am ddwy flynedd yn gwrando ar Weinidogion Ceidwadol yn dadlau'n ffyrnig dros 'ostyngiadau sylweddol' mewn taliadau colofn 1, a dweud y gwir, yn gam dewr. Ildiaf i Elin Jones.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
16:45	<p><b>Elin Jones</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Will you explain to me the contradiction in your policy? Having advocated the increase in budget in pillar 1 and asking the two coalition parties to do that, once they did not do that, you actually went further and then modulated by 15%. You did exactly what you were asking them not to do.</p>	<p>A wneuch egluro wrthyf y gwrth-ddweud yn eich polisi? Ar ôl argymhell y cynnydd yn y gyllideb ar gyfer colofn 1 a gofyn i'r ddwy blaid glymblaid wneud hynny, unwaith na wnaethant hynny, aethoch gam ymhellach mewn gwirionedd gan fodiwleiddio ar lefel o 15%. Gwnaethoch yn union yr hyn roeddech yn gofyn iddynt beidio â gwneud.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
16:45	<p><b>Alun Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>No. What I did was seek to protect the entire CAP budget. What I said was very clear—[Interruption.]</p>	<p>Naddo. Yr hyn a wneuthum oedd ceisio diogelu cyllideb gyfan y PAC. Roedd yr hyn a ddywedais yn glir iawn—[Torri ar draws.]</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
16:45	<p><b>Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Order. You have intervened, the Minister is now replying.</p>	<p>Trefn. Rydych wedi ymyrryd, mae'r Gweinidog yn awr yn ymateb.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
16:46	<p><b>Alun Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>If I have the opportunity. I said very clearly that I wanted to protect CAP budgets at current levels. It was a policy that I gave an undertaking to this Assembly that I would follow and it is a policy that I followed for two years. I did not have the support from those people who are now arguing for some of the support mechanisms that we could have delivered.</p> <p>May I say this? All too often, when we debate agriculture in this place, we have a disappointing and dispiriting debate. We list problems, but we do not list solutions. I am afraid that, with some exceptions this afternoon, that is again what has happened. We have had Members standing, listing problems, listing difficulties and saying where those difficulties lie, but not once have we seen solutions offered and neither have we had the debate—</p>	<p>Os caf y cyfle. Dywedais yn glir iawn fy mod yn awyddus i ddiogelu cyllidebau'r PAC ar y lefelau presennol. Roedd yn bolisi yr addewais i'r Cynulliad hwn y byddwn yn ei ddilyn ac roedd yn bolisi a ddilynais am ddwy flynedd. Ni chefais gefnogaeth y bobl hynny sydd bellach yn dadlau o blaid rhai o'r systemau cymorth y gallem fod wedi'u rhoi ar waith.</p> <p>A gaf ddweud hyn? Yn rhy aml o lawer, pan fyddwn yn trafod amaethyddiaeth yn y lle hwn, cawn ddadl siomedig a digalon. Rydym yn rhestru problemau, ond nid ydym yn rhestru atebion. Mae arnaf ofn, gyda rhai eithriadau y prynhawn yma, mai dyna sydd wedi digwydd eto. Mae Aelodau wedi sefyll, wedi rhestru problemau, wedi rhestru anawsterau ac wedi rhoi enghreifftiau o'r anawsterau hynny, ond ni chynigiwyd unrhyw atebion ac nid ydym wedi cael y ddadl—</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
16:46	<p><b>Andrew R.T. Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Will you take an intervention?</p>	<p>A dderbyniwch ymyriad?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
16:46	<p><b>Alun Davies</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>No, not this time.</p>	<p>Na wnaif, nid y tro hwn.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

Not once have we had the level of debate that rises to the challenges facing the industry. All too often we have a debate that is superficial with a striking lack of substance.

In terms of my decision to transfer from pillar 1 to pillar 2, 80% of pillar 2 funds go to pillar 1 recipients and 100% of pillar 2 funds stay in rural communities. To argue for a moment that, in some ways, if you transfer between pillars, you are taking money either out of the agriculture community or rural Wales is simply not to understand either one of those pillars—not to understand them for a moment.

Again, if you look at the data, the statistics and the numbers used to describe agriculture—Llyr did to some extent earlier today—you see an industry that has received public support for 70 years. Huge sums of money have been spent on individual businesses and the industry as a whole, and what have we seen? Have we seen an industry that has been able to emerge from public funding stronger, better, more efficient, able to face what the market needs and requires, or do we see an industry that remains fragile and vulnerable, unable to sustain itself? You look at those numbers, you look at those challenges and you look at where we are today, and what is your proposal? More of the same. More of the same. You somehow hope that, after 70 years of this policy, 70 years of public support and 70 years of different subsidy levels in different ways, somehow a new subsidy, a new fund here and a new fund there will somehow change what we see. Let me tell you now: that is not what you will see. It is a head-in-the-sand approach to the future of agriculture. This Government is taking the decisions. Sometimes they are tough decisions and sometimes they are hard decisions, but they are the right decisions to ensure that we can invest in agriculture for the future.

When we had the consultation, which ended at the end of last year, we did not have a consensus against the pillar transfer. In fact, there was no consensus at all. There were as many people in favour as there were against any transfer. The two independent groups that I asked to look at this matter both recommended a maximum transfer of 15%. So, to say that there is somehow a consensus on this is to ignore the views of people across Wales.

Nid ydym un waith wedi cael y lefel o ddadl sy'n briodol mewn ymateb i'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant. Yn rhy aml o lawer, rydym yn cael dadl arwynebol gyda diffyg sylwedd llwyr.

O ran fy mhenderfyniad i drosglwyddo o golofn 1 i golofn 2, mae 80% o arian colofn 2 yn mynd i dderbynwyr colofn 1 ac mae 100% o arian colofn 2 yn aros o fewn cymunedau gwledig. Mae dadlau am eiliad eich bod, mewn rhai ffyrdd, drwy drosglwyddo rhwng colofnau, yn tynnu arian o'r gymuned amaethyddol neu Gymru wledig yn golygu'n syml nad ydych yn deall y naill golofn na'r llall—nid ydych yn eu deall o gwbl.

Unwaith eto, os edrychwch ar y data, yr ystadegau a'r niferoedd a ddefnyddir i ddisgrifio amaethyddiaeth—gwnaeth Llyr hynny i ryw raddau yn gynharach heddiw—fe welwch ddiwydiant sydd wedi cael cymorth cyhoeddus ers 70 mlynedd. Gwariwyd symiau enfawr o arian ar fusnesau unigol a'r diwydiant yn gyffredinol, a beth a welsom? A welsom ddiwydiant sydd wedi llwyddo i ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus i greu diwydiant cryfach, gwell, mwy effeithlon, yn gallu wynebu'r hyn sydd ei angen ac sy'n ofynnol gan y farchnad, neu a welwn ddiwydiant sy'n parhau'n fregus ac yn ddiameddiffyn ac yn methu â chynnal ei hun? Edrychwch ar y ffigurau hynny, edrychwch ar yr heriau hynny ac edrychwch ar y sefyllfa sydd ohoni, a beth yw eich cynnig? Mwy o'r un peth. Mwy o'r un peth. Rydych yn gobeithio rywsut, ar ôl 70 mlynedd o'r polisi hwn, 70 mlynedd o gymorth cyhoeddus a 70 mlynedd o wahanol lefelau o gymhorthdal mewn gwahanol ffyrdd, rywsut y bydd cymhorthdal newydd, cronfa newydd fan hyn a chronfa newydd fan acw, yn newid yr hyn a welwn. Gadewch imi eich hysbysu yn awr: nid dyna a welwch. Rydych yn claddu eich pen yn y tywod wrth ystyried dyfodol amaethyddiaeth. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn gwneud y penderfyniadau. Weithiau maent yn benderfyniadau caled ac weithiau maent yn benderfyniadau anodd, ond dyma'r penderfyniadau cywir er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn fuddsoddi mewn amaethyddiaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Pan gawsom yr ymgynghoriad, a ddaeth i ben ddiwedd y llynedd, ni chafwyd consensws yn erbyn y cynnig i drosglwyddo'r pileri. Yn wir, ni chafwyd consensws o gwbl. Roedd cymaint o bobl o blaid unrhyw gynnig i drosglwyddo ag oedd yn ei erbyn. Argymhellodd y ddau grŵp annibynnol y gofynnais iddynt ystyried y mater hwn uchafswm trosglwyddo o 15%. Felly, mae dweud rywsut bod consensws ar hyn gyfwerth ag anwybyddu barn pobl ledled Cymru.

What is the challenge facing us today? The challenge facing us today is not to stage another demoralising and depressing debate this time next year, using numbers to say exactly the same thing as we could have said 10 years ago; it is to change that. It is to make change and it is to promote change and it is to lead change. That means that we do invest in the rural economy, that we do invest in the future of the agriculture industry, and that we do invest in the future of individual farm businesses—that we change the future and do not simply repeat the mistakes of the past. That is why I took the decision on the 15%. I announced on Monday the biggest rural development programme that Wales has ever seen with £953 million being spent overwhelmingly in the agriculture industry and entirely in rural Wales, investing in the future of the rural economy, investing in the future of our environment, and investing in the future of agriculture. You cannot wish for the future if you are not prepared to wish the means.

Beth yw'r her sy'n ein hwynebu heddiw? Nid cynnal dadl ddigalon a diflas arall yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf, gan ddefnyddio rhifau i ddweud yn union yr un peth ag y gallem fod wedi dweud 10 mlynedd yn ôl yw'r her sy'n ein hwynebu heddiw; ond newid hynny. Gwneud newid a hyrwyddo newid ac arwain newid yw'r her. Mae hynny'n golygu ein bod yn buddsoddi yn yr economi wledig, ein bod yn buddsoddi yn nyfodol y diwydiant amaethyddol, a'n bod yn buddsoddi yn nyfodol busnesau fferm unigol—ein bod yn newid y dyfodol yn hytrach nag ailadrodd camgymeriadau'r gorffennol. Dyna pam y gwneuthum y penderfyniad ar y lefel o 15%. Cyhoeddais ddydd Llun y rhaglen datblygu gwledig fwyaf a welwyd erioed yng Nghymru gyda £953 miliwn yn cael ei wario'n benodol yn y diwydiant amaethyddol a hynny'n gyfan gwbl yng Nghymru wledig, gan fuddsoddi yn nyfodol yr economi wledig, buddsoddi yn nyfodol ein hamgylchedd, a buddsoddi yn nyfodol amaethyddiaeth. Ni allwch ddymuno am y dyfodol onid ydych yn barod i ddymuno am y modd o gyflawni'r dyfodol hwnnw.

16:50 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar Llyr Gruffydd i ymateb i'r dadl.

I call Llyr Gruffydd to reply to the debate.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:50 **Llyr Gruffydd** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

A gaf ddiolch i bawb am gyfrannu at y dadl hon? Roeddwn i'n meddwl fy mod wedi gwneud y pwynt yn ddigon clir wrth agor y dadl, ac rwy'n ofni yn awr efallai nad oedd y Gweinidog yn gwranddo. Rydym yn rhannu eich gweledigaeth chi a dyna sut mae ffermwyr yn teimlo hefyd, os caf ddweud. Rydym yn rhannu eich gweledigaeth ynglŷn â chreu dyfodol mwy llewyrchus a hir dymor i'r diwydiant. Ein gofid ni yw bod y newidiadau yr ydych chi'n eu gyrru drwyddo—ac mae symud y 15% yn symbol o hynny—yn cael eu gwneud mewn modd a fydd yn ei gwneud hi'n anodd iawn i nifer o'r busnesau hynny sydd yn stryffaglo yn awr, heddiw, i oroesi. Dyna bwynt y dadl hon. Dywedais i: nid aiddadlau i ble yr ydym yn mynd, ond sut yr ydym yn mynd yno; dyna yr ydym yn trio ei wneud. Felly, byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi cydnabyddiaeth o hynny mewn ymatebion yn y dyfodol.

May I thank everyone who contributed to this debate? I had thought that I had made the point quite clearly in opening the debate, but I fear now that the Minister was not listening. We share your vision and that is how farmers feel too, if I may say so. We share your vision on creating a more prosperous long-term future for the industry. Our concern is that the changes that you are driving through—and vieriing the 15% is a symbol of that—are being done in a way that will make it extremely difficult for many of those businesses that are struggling now, today, to survive. That was the point of the debate. I said that we are not re-arguing about where we are going, but arguing about how we get to our final destination; that is what we are trying to do. So, I would welcome recognition of that in ministerial responses in future.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Wrth gwrs, yr ydych yn gwneud y pwynt y bydd canran helaeth o'r arian hwn sy'n mynd o biler 1 i biler 2 yn dod yn ôl i'r diwydiant—does dim amheuaeth y bydd hynny yn digwydd. Ond, mae economi Cymru yn cael ei chymharu'n aml â bwced a thyllau ynddo—mae gormod o arian yn llifo allan o'r economi—ac mae'r un peth yn wir am yr economi wledig. Os gadwch chi fwy o arian ym mhiler 1, bydd yr arian hwnnw yn cael ei wario mewn siopau lleol, mewn 'co-ops' amaethyddol ac ymhlith contractwyr lleol. Felly, peidiwch ag awgrymu ychwaith fod cadw'r arian ym mhiler 1 rhywsut yn golygu na fydd yr economi wledig yn cael budd. Mae'r arian hwnnw yn cryfhau'r economi wledig ac yn gwneud hynny heb fod cyrff, mudiadau ac ymgynghorwyr yn cymryd eu siâr nhw o'r pot hefyd, er bod eu cyfraniad nhw wrth gwrs, mewn sawl cyd-destun, yn gyfraniad pwysig.

Of course, you make the point that a large percentage of this money vieriied from pillar 1 to pillar 2 will return to the industry—there is no doubt that that will be the case. But, the Welsh economy is often compared to a bucket with a hole in it—there is too much flowing out—and the same is true of the rural economy. If you keep more money in pillar 1, that money will actually be spent in local shops, in agricultural co-operatives and among local contractors. So, do not suggest either that retaining the money in pillar 1 somehow or other does not lead to benefits for the rural economy. That money does strengthen the rural economy and it does so without the need for bodies, organisations and consultants to take their share of that pot, although their contribution, of course, in many contexts is a very important contribution.

A couple of Members have referred to the fact that this debate has reminded us of the clear value of Wales's membership of the European Union, and the Minister and others—and I, I suppose—will never miss an opportunity to reiterate the point that actions speak louder than words. There are parties here who are telling us here one thing, but doing a very different thing when it comes to the EU budget, the CAP budget—

Cyfeiriodd ambell i Aelod at y ffaith bod y ddadl hon wedi ein hatgoffa o werth amlwg aelodaeth Cymru o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, ac ni fydd y Gweinidog nac eraill—na minnau, o bosibl—fyth yn colli cyfle i ailbwysleisio'r pwynt bod gweithredu yn well na llefaru. Mae yma bleidiau sy'n dweud un peth wrthym, ond sy'n gwneud rhywbeth gwahanol iawn o ran cyllideb yr UE, cyllideb y PAC—

16:53 **Andrew R.T. Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Will you give way?

A iildiwch?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:53 **Llyr Gruffydd** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
I only have three minutes and I have 30 seconds left, I am afraid. I feel that people need to be mindful that actions do speak louder than words. Labour, Tory and UKIP MEPs failed to join Plaid Cymru in opposing some of these cuts in the European Parliament. Labour and the coalition Government in Westminster failed to support Plaid Cymru in opposing some of these cuts, so I think that I will leave it there and urge you all to support the motion.

Dim ond tri munud sydd gennyf a dim ond 30 eiliad sy'n weddill, yn anffodus. Teimlaf fod angen i bobl fod yn ymwybodol bod gweithredu yn well na llefaru. Methodd ASEau o'r blaid Lafur, y Toriaid ac UKIP ag ymuno â Phlaid Cymru wrth wrthwynebu rhai o'r toriadau hyn yn Senedd Ewrop. Methodd y blaid Lafur a'r Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan â chefnogi Plaid Cymru wrth wrthwynebu rhai o'r toriadau hyn, felly credaf y dof i ben fan yna gan eich annog bob un i gefnogi'r cynnig.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:53 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Y cwestiwn yw y dylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad. Felly, gohiriaf bob pleidlais ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? There are objections. I will defer all voting on this item until voting time.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.*

*Voting deferred until voting time.*

## Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Gofal Plant

*Detholwyd y gwelliannau canlynol: gwelliannau 1, 3, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Elin Jones, gwelliannau 2 ac 8 yn enw Lesley Griffiths, a gwelliant 4 yn enw Paul Davies. Os derbynir gwelliant 2, bydd gwelliant 3 yn cael ei ddad-ddethol. Os derbynir gwelliant 7, bydd gwelliant 8 yn cael ei ddad-ddethol.*

Cynnig NDM5439 Aled Roberts

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. Yn cydnabod y gall gofal plant fforddiadwy, hygyrch ac o safon uchel fod yn allweddol i economi gryfach a chymdeithas decach, gan alluogi rhieni i ddychwelyd i'r gwaith, lleihau tlodi plant a rhoi'r dechrau gorau mewn bywyd i blant.

2. Yn croesawu'r camau gweithredu cadarnhaol sy'n cael eu cymryd gan Lywodraeth y DU gan gynnwys buddsoddi £1 biliwn mewn gofal plant i gynyddu addysg gynnar am ddim i bob plentyn tair a phedair oed a'i ymestyn i blant dwy oed o deuluoedd ar incwm isel, cyflwyno gofal plant di-dreth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio a hawliau newydd ar rannu cyfnodau absenoldeb rhieni.

3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i:

## Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: Childcare

*The following amendments have been selected: amendments 1, 3, 5, 6 and 7 in the name of Elin Jones, amendments 2 and 8 in the name of Lesley Griffiths, and amendment 4 in the name of Paul Davies. If amendment 2 is agreed, amendment 3 will be deselected. If amendment 7 is agreed, amendment 8 will be deselected.*

Motion NDM5439 Aled Roberts

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Recognises that affordable, accessible and high quality childcare can be the key to a stronger economy and fairer society, enabling parents to return to work, reducing child poverty and giving children the best start in life.

2. Welcomes the positive action being taken by the UK Government including £1 billion investment in childcare to increase free early education for all 3 and 4 year olds and extended to 2 year olds from low income families, the introduction of tax free childcare for working families and new rights on shared parental leave.

3. Calls on the Welsh Government to:

a) adolygu'r system o hawl gofal plant cyn-ysgol yng ngoleuni'r ddarpariaeth well yn Lloegr;

b) archwilio effeithiolrwydd Dechrau'n Deg ar rianta a deilliannau datblygu plant a'r anghydraddoldeb yn narpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg y blynyddoedd cynnar;

c) asesu a yw awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio cyllid i'r eithaf ar gyfer darpariaeth statudol o ran lleoedd addysg y blynyddol cynnar ar gyfer plant 3-4 oed;

d) archwilio ffyrdd o wella'r cyflenwad gofal plant ar draws pob oedran, yn arbennig cynlluniau gofal cofleidiol a gofal plant yn ystod y gwyliau;

e) rhoi eglurder i rieni o ran cymhwysedd am gynlluniau gofal plant yng Nghymru yng ngoleuni datblygiadau polisi diweddar Llywodraeth y DU; ac

f) cyflwyno un ffynhonnell unigol o wybodaeth ar-lein i helpu rhieni newydd gyda gwybodaeth am wasanaethau gofal plant a hawliau a sut i fanteisio arnynt.

a) review the system of pre-school childcare entitlement in light of enhanced provision in England;

b) examine the effectiveness of Flying Start on parenting and child development outcomes and the inequality in Welsh medium early years provision;

c) assess whether local authorities are fully utilising funding for the statutory provision of an early years education place for 3-4 year olds;

d) examine ways to improve childcare supply across all ages, in particular wraparound and holiday childcare schemes;

e) provide clarity for parents on eligibility for childcare schemes in Wales in light of recent UK Government policy developments; and

f) introduce a single online source of information to help new parents with information about childcare services and entitlements and how to access them.

16:54

## Aled Roberts [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I move the motion.

We have tabled this motion because of the difficulties we believe that many parents face in accessing affordable and quality childcare. Two thirds of families in Wales currently use some form of childcare, and yet the cost of childcare is widely recognised as a barrier to take-up, particularly for lone parents, often forcing them to choose between returning to work or staying at home. Research published last week for the Good Care Guide revealed that almost one in three parents with young children spend 30% or more of their available earnings on childcare. Often, this cost is greater than even a mortgage or rent payments.

Not only do parents struggle with the burden of high costs, but there are major gaps in provision in Wales. The childcare costs survey in 2013 highlighted that significantly fewer local authorities in Wales than in England felt that there was sufficient childcare across a range of ages. No local authority in Wales felt that there was sufficient provision for 12 to 14-year-olds, disabled children or those working atypical work patterns such as shift workers. Only 25% of Welsh local authorities felt that there was sufficient provision for children aged two and under. There is also a significant difference in the number of children who access Flying Start through the medium of Welsh and those who go on to study in Welsh at school.

Cynigiaf y cynnig.

Rydym wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn oherwydd yr anawsterau y credwn fod llawer o rieni yn eu hwynebu o ran cael gafael ar ofal plant fforddiadwy o safon. Mae dwy ran o dair o deuluoedd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd yn defnyddio rhyw fath o ofal plant, ac eto cydnabyddir yn eang fod cost gofal plant yn rhwystro nifer o bobl rhag manteisio arno, yn enwedig rhieni unigol, gan olygu bod yn rhaid iddynt yn aml ddewis rhwng dychwelyd i'r gwaith neu aros gartref. Dangosodd ymchwil a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf ar gyfer Good Care Guide fod bron un o bob tri o rieni â phlant ifanc yn treulio 30% neu fwy o'u henillion sydd ar gael ar ofal plant. Yn aml, mae'r gost hon yn fwy na thaliadau morgais neu rent.

Nid yn unig y mae rhieni yn cael trafferth ymdopi â baich costau uchel, ond ceir bylchau mawr mewn darpariaeth yng Nghymru. Nododd yr arolwg o gostau gofal plant yn 2013 fod nifer sylweddol lai o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr o'r farn bod gofal plant digonol ar gael ar draws amrywiaeth o oeddrannau. Nid oedd unrhyw awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru o'r farn bod darpariaeth ddigonol ar gael ar gyfer pobl ifanc rhwng 12 a 14 oed, plant anabl na'r rhai sy'n gweithio patrymau gwaith annodweddiadol megis gweithwyr sifft. Dim ond 25% o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru oedd o'r farn bod darpariaeth ddigonol ar gael ar gyfer plant dwy oed ac iau. Ceir gwahaniaeth sylweddol hefyd yn nifer y plant sy'n cael gofal drwy raglen Dechrau'n Deg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a'r rhai sy'n mynd ymlaen i astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn yr ysgol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)



This debate today gives us an opportunity to examine the childcare provision that we offer in Wales and to question whether the time has come to assess whether it meets the needs of families looking for a balanced work and family life. The cost of childcare is not a new phenomenon. In 2011, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development revealed that, at 26.6% of the family income, UK parents faced the highest childcare costs in the world except for those faced in Switzerland. It was a problem under the previous Labour UK Government and remains so under the current UK Government.

However, the coalition Government has implemented a number of key policies to support those who wish to combine a career with starting a family. The UK Government has raised the income tax threshold to £10,000 by April this year, which will mean a tax cut of £700 for over 1.1 million people in Wales. In England, from September 2013, 20% of two-year-olds from the most deprived backgrounds have been entitled to 15 hours of free childcare and this will rise to 40% of that cohort in September this year.

Early figures show that within just one month of the scheme being introduced, around 70% of the 130,000 children identified were already benefiting. That is a huge increase on the 20,000 children accessing free provision in 2010. The coalition Government has also increased the number of hours of free early years education for three and four-year-olds to 15 hours a week. That is up from 12.5 hours, previously. More importantly, parents have flexibility in how they split their 15 hours, and are able to take them in blocks over two or three days if they want to, rather than the three hours per day for five days, as was required previously.

The coalition has also introduced a new right through the Children and Families Bill for eligible employees to take shared parental leave from 2015, which will be a huge help for working parents in Wales, helping them to achieve a better work-life balance. It is also investing nearly £1 billion in additional support for childcare by 2016-17, with £750 million earmarked for the new tax-free childcare scheme and £200 million in expanded support through universal credit.

This will be worth up to £1,200 per year for every child under 12, eventually benefiting 2.5 million working families across the UK, including 110,000 families in Wales. That is why we cannot support the Conservative amendment today that ignores the benefits that the tax-free childcare and shared parental leave policies will have for Welsh families. It is also why we will not be supporting Labour's amendment 2, which ignores the positive steps that have been taken.

Mae'r ddadl hon heddiw yn rhoi cyfle inni ystyried y ddarpariaeth gofal plant a gynigir gennym yng Nghymru ac i ofyn a yw'n bryd inni asesu a yw'n diwallu anghenion teuluoedd sy'n chwilio am gydbwysedd rhwng gwaith a bywyd teuluol. Nid yw cost gofal plant yn ffenomen newydd. Yn 2011, datgelodd y Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd mai rhieni yn y DU sy'n wynebu'r costau gofal plant uchaf yn y byd ac eithrio'r rhai a wynebir yn y Swistir, a'u bod yn gwario 26.6% o incwm y teulu ar ofal plant. Roedd yn broblem o dan Lywodraeth Lafur flaenorol y DU ac mae'n parhau i fod yn broblem o dan Lywodraeth bresennol y DU.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r Lywodraeth glymblaid wedi rhoi nifer o bolisiau allweddol ar waith i gefnogi'r rhai sy'n dymuno dilyn gyrfa a dechrau teulu. Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi codi'r trothwy treth incwm i £10,000 erbyn mis Ebrill eleni, a fydd yn golygu toriad treth o £700 i fwy na 1.1 miliwn o bobl yng Nghymru. Yn Lloegr, ers mis Medi 2013, mae hawl gan 20% o blant dwy oed o'r cefndiroedd mwyaf difreintiedig i gael 15 awr o ofal plant am ddim, a bydd hyn yn cynyddu i 40% o'r garfan honno ym mis Medi eleni.

Dengys ffigurau cynnar fod tua 70% o'r 130,000 o blant a nodwyd eisoes yn cael budd, a hynny fis yn unig ers cyflwyno'r cynllun. Mae hynny'n gynydd enfawr ar y 20,000 o blant a gafodd ddarpariaeth am ddim yn 2010. Mae'r Llywodraeth glymblaid hefyd wedi cynyddu nifer yr oriau o addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar am ddim sydd ar gael i blant tair a phedair oed i 15 awr yr wythnos, yn hytrach na 12.5 awr yn flaenorol. Yn bwysicach, mae gan rieni hyblygrwydd o ran sut y maent yn rhannu eu 15 awr, a gallant ddefnyddio'r oriau mewn blociau dros ddau neu dri diwrnod os ydynt yn dymuno gwneud hynny, yn hytrach na thair awr bob dydd am bum diwrnod, fel yr oedd yn ofynnol yn flaenorol.

Mae'r glymblaid hefyd wedi cyflwyno hawl newydd drwy'r Bil Plant a Theuluoedd i gyflogaion cymwys gymryd absenoldeb rhiant a rennir o 2015, a fydd yn gymorth mawr i rieni sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru, ac yn eu helpu i sicrhau cydbwysedd gwell rhwng bywyd a gwaith. Mae hefyd yn buddsoddi bron £1 biliwn mewn cymorth ychwanegol ar gyfer gofal plant erbyn 2016-17, gyda £750 miliwn wedi'i glustnodi ar gyfer y cynllun gofal plant di-dreth newydd a £200 miliwn o gymorth estynedig drwy greddyd cynhwysol.

Bydd hyn yn werth hyd at £1,200 y flwyddyn i bob plentyn dan 12 oed, gan roi budd yn y pen draw i 2.5 miliwn o deuluoedd sy'n gweithio ledled y DU, gan gynnwys 110,000 o deuluoedd yng Nghymru. Dyna pam na allwn gefnogi gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr heddiw sy'n anwybyddu'r manteision y bydd y polisiau gofal plant di-dreth ac absenoldeb rhiant a rennir yn eu cynnig i deuluoedd yng Nghymru. Dyna pam hefyd na fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 Llafur, sy'n anwybyddu'r camau cadarnhaol a gymerwyd.

In comparison to the provision in England, there is a danger that families in Wales will be left behind with only limited childcare provision. I want to make it clear that we support the aims of Flying Start, although, the recent evaluation has highlighted some concerns in terms of progress on outcomes. There is still no available and affordable childcare for parents of nought to two-year-olds, which can often be the most expensive time for parents. If you are lucky enough to live in a Flying Start area, you may be eligible, but only for the inflexible 2.5 hours a day, five days a week, 39 weeks a year, which is identified in the evaluation report as a barrier to take-up in certain areas.

Meanwhile, statutory provision for three to four-year-olds in Wales will still be for only 10 hours per week. Not only is affordable and accessible childcare important for parents, but numerous studies have highlighted the advantages to a child of a high-quality early education. Early intervention in social and learning disabilities has been proven to be more cost-effective than later detection and treatment. Early years education can also have a huge impact on cognitive, emotional and social development, as well as improving academic achievement. It is therefore vital that we, as a country, re-examine the system of pre-school childcare entitlement and early years provision in our education system in Wales to look again at whether our priorities are helping to achieve the best outcomes for families. However, we also need to take the opportunity to look again at provision for all ages, including wraparound and holiday care.

Finally, we need to ensure that parents are guided through the complex array of services and entitlements. We recognise that local authorities have a duty to provide information on local services, but this varies and is often confusing or incomplete. That is why our motion calls for an online source of information for families about childcare services, school provision, leisure facilities and health services, while also providing links to external support, such as Mumsnet, which help to identify which forms of childcare support parents are entitled to, and a guide to understanding the new changes introduced by the UK Government on tax-free childcare and shared parental leave, which I am sure will benefit families in Wales.

O gymharu â'r ddarpariaeth yn Lloegr, mae risg y bydd teuluoedd yng Nghymru yn cael eu gadael ar ôl heb ddim ond darpariaeth gofal plant gyfyngedig. Rwyf am ei gwneud yn glir ein bod yn cefnogi nodau Dechrau'n Deg, er bod y gwerthusiad diweddar wedi nodi rhai pryderon am gynydd o ran canlyniadau. Nid oes unrhyw ofal plant fforddiadwy ar gael i rieni plant hyd at ddwy oed o hyd, sef y cyfnod drutaf i rieni yn aml. Os ydych yn ddigon ffodus i fyw mewn ardal Dechrau'n Deg, efallai y byddwch yn gymwys, ond dim ond ar gyfer y ddarpariaeth 2.5 awr, bum diwrnod yr wythnos, 39 wythnos y flwyddyn anhbylyg, a nodir yn yr adroddiad gwerthuso fel rhwystr i gael gofal plant mewn ardaloedd penodol.

Yn y cyfamser, dim ond 10 awr yr wythnos fydd y ddarpariaeth statudol ar gyfer plant rhwng tair a phedair oed yng Nghymru o hyd. Nid yn unig y mae gofal plant fforddiadwy a hygyrch yn bwysig i rieni, ond mae nifer o astudiaethau wedi nodi manteision addysg gynnar o ansawdd uchel i blentyn. Profwyd bod ymyrryd yn gynnar mewn perthynas ag anableddau cymdeithasol a dysgu yn fwy costeffeithiol na'u canfod a'u trin yn ddiweddarach. Gall addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar hefyd gael effaith enfawr ar ddatblygiad gwybyddol, emosiynol a chymdeithasol, yn ogystal â gwella cyrhaeddiad academiaidd. Felly, mae'n hanfodol ein bod, fel gwlad, yn ailystyried y system hawl i ofal plant cyn oed ysgol a darpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar yn ein system addysg yng Nghymru er mwyn ailystyried a yw ein blaenoriaethau yn helpu i gyflawni'r canlyniadau gorau i deuluoedd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni hefyd achub ar y cyfle i ailystyried y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer pob oedran, gan gynnwys gofal cofleidiol ac yn ystod y gwyliau.

Yn olaf, mae angen inni sicrhau bod rhieni yn cael eu harwain drwy'r amrywiaeth cymhleth o wasanaethau a hawliau. Cydnabyddwn fod gan awdurdodau lleol ddyletswydd i roi gwybodaeth am wasanaethau lleol, ond mae hyn yn amrywio ac yn aml yn ddryslyd neu'n anghyflawn. Dyna pam mae ein cynnig yn galw am ffynhonnell ar-lein o wybodaeth i deuluoedd am wasanaethau gofal plant, darpariaeth ysgolion, cyfleusterau hamdden a gwasanaethau iechyd, sydd hefyd yn cynnig cysylltiadau â chymorth allanol, megis Mumsnet, sy'n helpu i nodi pa fathau o gymorth gofal plant y mae gan rieni yr hawl i'w cael, a chanllaw ar ddeall y newidiadau newydd a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU ar ofal plant di-dreth ac absenoldeb rhiant a rennir, a fydd, rwy'n siŵr, o fudd i deuluoedd yng Nghymru.

17:01

## Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I have selected the eight amendments to the motion. If amendment 2 is agreed, amendment 3 will be deselected. If amendment 7 is agreed, amendment 8 will be deselected. I call on Simon Thomas to move amendments 1, 3, 5, 6 and 7, tabled in the name of Elin Jones.

*Gwelliant 1—Elin Jones*

*Ym mhwynt 1 dileu popeth ar ôl 'tlodi plant a' a rhoi yn ei le 'helpu plant i gael y dechrau gorau mewn bywyd.'*

*Gwelliant 3—Elin Jones*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Rwyf wedi dethol wyth gwelliant i'r cynnig. Os derbynir gwelliant 2, caiff gwelliant 3 ei ddad-ddethol. Os derbynir gwelliant 7, caiff gwelliant 8 ei ddad-ddethol. Galwaf ar Simon Thomas i gynnig gwelliannau 1, 3, 5, 6 a 7, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Elin Jones.

*Amendment 1—Elin Jones*

*In point 1 delete all after 'child poverty and' and replace with 'helping children to get the best start in life.'*

*Amendment 3—Elin Jones*

*Yn mhwynt 2, dileu 'Yn croesawu'r camau gweithredu cadarnhaol' a rhoi yn ei le 'Yn nodi'r camau gweithredu'.*

Gwelliant 5—Elin Jones

*Dileu is-bwynt 3a) a rhoi yn ei le 'asesu'r system hawl i ofal plant cyn-ysgol'.*

Gwelliant 6—Elin Jones

*Yn is-bwynt 3e), dileu popeth ar ôl 'yng Nghymru'.*

Gwelliant 7—Elin Jones

*Dileu is-bwynt 3f).*

*In point 2 delete 'Welcomes the positive' and replace with 'Notes the'.*

Amendment 5—Elin Jones

*Delete sub-point 3a) and replace with 'assess the system of pre-school childcare entitlement'.*

Amendment 6—Elin Jones

*In sub-point 3e) delete all after 'Wales'.*

Amendment 7—Elin Jones

*Delete sub-point 3f).*

17:02

**Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Cynigiau welliannau 1, 3, 5, 6 a 7.

Rwy'n croesawu'r cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl heddiw. Mae'n hollol briodol mai dau dad sydd yn agor y ddadl. Cawn ateb, rwy'n siŵr, gan dadau eraill, achos mai hwn yn gwestiwn ar gyfer cymdeithas gyfan. Gobeithiaf ein bod wedi mynd heibio'r pwynt lle nad ydym yn meddwl bod hwn yn gwestiwn sylfaenol i'r economi a chwestiwn sylfaenol i gyrrhaeddiad plant hefyd.

Mae'r sefyllfa bresennol yn ddiffygiol, nid oes 'doubt' gennyf am hynny, ond hoffwn i ddweud ar y cychwyn ein bod yn credu bod y ffaith ei bod hi'n ddiffygiol yn ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'r fath o gymdeithas yr ydym yn byw ynddi a'r chwyldro diwydiannol, os liciwch chi, dros ddwy ganrif sydd wedi rhoi rôl ganolog i anghenion cyfalaf tu fewn i'r system economaidd, yn hytrach nag anghenion y plentyn. Mae'n drist o beth felly bod gofal plant erbyn hyn yn cael ei fesur a'i farnu yn ôl ei werth economaidd a'i gost, yn hytrach nag yn ôl yr hyn sydd orau i blant a'r hyn sydd yn arwain at y deilliannau gorau. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'n wir i ddweud bod gofal plant yng Nghymru ymysg y mwyaf drud sydd ar gael yn y byd datblygedig, ond yr hyn sydd o fwy o bryder i mi ar hyn o bryd yw'r ffaith bod diffyg penodol ym maes gofal plant mewn nifer o sectorau yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys rhieni gyda phlant anabl, rhieni sydd yn dewis gofal plant cyfrwng Cymraeg ym mhob rhan o Gymru, a rhieni sydd yn gweithio oriau shift neu oriau anarferol. Nid wyf ychwaith yn mynd i ddadlau nad yw gofal plant tu allan i'r cartref yn llwyddiannus. A dweud y gwir, mae'r holl dystiolaeth yn dangos nad oes gwahaniaeth rhwng gofal plant yn y cartref a gofal plant mewn cyd-destun gwahanol. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw bod y datblygiad yno ar gyfer datblygu sgiliau deallusol a chymdeithasol y plant, ac, wrth gwrs, bod pwy bynnag sydd yn gofalu am y plentyn yn deall sut mae dod â'r ymlaen. Mae hynny'n wir gartref ac mewn cyd-destun arall.

I move amendments 1, 3, 5, 6 and 7.

I welcome the opportunity to participate in this afternoon's debate. It is quite appropriate that there are two fathers opening the debate. I am sure that we will also receive a response from other fathers, because this is an issue for society as a whole. I hope that we have got past the point where we do not believe that this is a fundamentally important question for the economy and also a fundamental question for the attainment of children.

The current situation is deficient, I have no doubt about that, but I would like to say at the outset that we believe that it is deficient as a direct result of the kind of society that we live in and the industrial revolution, if you like, over two centuries, that has given a central role to the needs of capital within the economic system, rather than the needs of the child. The sad fact is that childcare is now measured and judged according to its economic value and its cost, rather than what is best for children and what leads to the best outcomes for them. That said, it is true to say that childcare in Wales is among the most expensive in the developed world, but what is of more concern to me at present is the fact that there is a specific shortage in terms of childcare in a number of sectors in Wales, including parents with disabled children, parents who choose Welsh-medium childcare in all parts of Wales, and parents who work shift patterns or unusual hours. I am not going to argue that childcare outwith the home is not successful. In truth, all the evidence shows that there is no difference between childcare within the home and childcare in a different context. What is important is that the development is there in order to develop the intellectual and social skills of children, and that whoever looks after the child understands how to develop the child. That is true at home and in other contexts.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae budd economaidd i ofal plant. Mae helpu mamau yn benodol i fynd yn ôl i'r gweithle yn gallu bod gwerth cymaint â £20,000 dros bedair blynedd, nid ond i'r teulu, ond i'r Trysorlys hefyd o ran trethi a gasglir ac ati. Felly, mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod hynny. Yn y cyddestun hwnnw, rwy'n meddwl bod rhaid i ni gydnabod bod y prif yrwyr o ran yr hyn sydd ar gael ym maes gofal plant yw'r economi a'r rhai o'r penderfyniadau macro economaidd a gymerir yn San Steffan, a bod Llywodraeth Cymru, yn ei ffordd, yn ceisio gwneud yr hyn sydd orau i ateb i'r galw a'r diffyg sydd yn deillio o hynny.

Mae gan y Llywodraeth strategaeth ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant. Fel y cyfeiriodd Aled Roberts ato, mae Dechrau'n Deg, ond mae'n wir i ddweud mai bratiog yw'r ddarpariaeth ar draws Cymru gyfan ac nid yw'n ymateb i ofynion personol teuluoedd unigol. Rwyf eisiau gweld mwy o ymwneud ac ymgysylltu rhwng gofal plant ac addysg. Mae'n drist o beth i weld, yn y llefydd hynny yng Nghymru lle mae addysg ar gyfer plant dwy a thair oed a lle mae mwy o addysg feithrin ar gael, bod hynny'n cael ei dorri wrth inni geisio cael polisiau sy'n gosod y gofal hwnnw yn ôl drwy Dechrau'n Deg ac ehangu yn hynny o beth.

Fel sydd wedi cael ei ddweud yn barod, mae costau yn uchel iawn ar gyfer gofal plant yng Nghymru fel rhan o'r Deyrnas Gyfunol. Mae'n gallu bod cymaint â 18% o'r cyflog ar gyfartaledd, sy'n uchel iawn o fewn y gwledydd OECD. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni i hefyd yw bod amrywiaeth sylfaenol yng nghostau gofal plant ar draws Cymru a bod argaeledd yn amrywio'n fawr iawn hefyd. Dim ond chwarter o'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n dweud bod digon o ofal plant yn eu cylch ar gyfer plant o dan ddwy oed. Mae dyletswydd o dan Ddeddf Gofal Plant 2006 i sicrhau bod darpariaeth i bawb, ond nid oes un awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru sy'n dweud bod digon o ofal plant ar gyfer plant sydd ag anghenion arbennig a phlant anabl, er enghraifft. Mae'n amlwg bod diffyg sylfaenol yn hynny o beth.

In conclusion, our approach to this has to figure around the fact that childcare at the moment is a factor of the market. The market has created the problems and, in the same way, the market will not answer those problems. We need Government intervention to ensure that the childcare market—I use that term, although I do not necessarily agree with it—works for working families, women who want to return to the workplace, and society as a whole. I do not think that we have got it right yet. I think that some of the things that have been done within the childcare system and the child tax system are helpful, but there is a lot more work and a lot more strategy needed on this.

There is an economic benefit to childcare. Assisting mothers specifically to return to the workplace can be worth as much as £20,000 over four years, not just for the family, but also to the Treasury in terms of the taxes gathered and so on. Therefore, it is vital that we acknowledge that. In that context, I think that we must recognise that the main drivers of what is available in terms of childcare are the economy that we have and some of the macroeconomic decisions taken in Westminster, and that the Welsh Government, in its own way, is trying to do what is best to respond to the demand and the problems that emerge from that.

The Government has a strategy in place for early years and childcare. As Aled Roberts mentioned, there is Flying Start, but it is also true that the provision is patchy across the whole of Wales and it does not respond to the personal needs of individual families. I want to see more engagement between childcare and education. It is a sad fact that we are seeing, in those areas in Wales where there is education for two and three year olds and where there is more nursery school provision available, that that is being cut while we are trying to implement policies that provide that childcare through Flying Start and expanding in that area.

As has already been said, the cost of childcare is very high in Wales as part of the UK. It can be as much as 18% of the average wage, which is very high within the OECD countries. What also concerns me is that there is a fundamental variation in the cost of childcare across Wales and that availability also varies a great deal. Only a quarter of local authorities say that there is adequate childcare provision in their areas for children under the age of two. There is a duty in the Childcare Act 2006 to ensure provision for all, but there is not a single local authority in Wales that says that there is adequate childcare provision for children with special needs and disabled children, for example. Clearly, there is a fundamental weakness in that regard.

I gloi, rhaid i'n hymagwedd at hyn ganolbwyntio ar y ffaith bod gofal plant ar hyn o bryd yn ymwneud â'r farchnad. Y farchnad sydd wedi creu'r problemau ac, yn yr un modd, ni fydd y farchnad yn ateb y problemau hynny. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ymyrryd er mwyn sicrhau bod y farchnad gofal plant—defnyddiaf y term hwnnw, er nad wyf o reidrwydd yn cytuno ag ef—yn gweithio er budd teuluoedd sy'n gweithio, menywod sydd am ddychwelyd i'r gwaith, a'r gymdeithas gyfan. Mae gennym ragor o waith i'w wneud o hyd. Credaf fod rhai o'r pethau a wnaed o fewn y system gofal plant a'r system treth plant yn ddefnyddiol, ond mae angen llawer mwy o waith a llawer mwy o strategaeth yn hyn beth.

17:07

## Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

I call on the Deputy Minister for Tackling Poverty to move amendments 2 and 8, tabled in the name of Lesley Griffiths.

*Gwelliant 2—Lesley Griffiths*

*Dileu pwynt 2 arhoi yn ei le:*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Galwaf ar y Dirprwy Weinidog Trechu Tlodi i gynnig gwelliannau 2 a 8, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Lesley Griffiths.

*Amendment 2—Lesley Griffiths*

*Delete point 2 and replace with:*

*Yn nodi methiant Llywodraeth y DU i weithredu ynghylch credydau treth ar gyfer gofal plant yr ochr hon i'r etholiad cyffredinol, yn mynegi pryder bod adnoddau'n cael eu cymryd oddi ar deuluoedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf ac yn nodi ymhellach bod y rhaglen Cychwyn Cadarn wedi'i dinistrio yn Lloegr, gyda dros 500 o ganolfannau wedi'u cau.*

Gwelliant 8—Lesley Griffiths

*Dileu is-bwynt 3f arhoi yn ei le:*

*ystyried beth yw'r ffordd orau o ddarparu gwybodaeth i rieni am wasanaethau gofal plant, eu hawl iddynt a sut i'w cael.*

*Notes the failure of the UK Government to take action on tax credits for childcare this side of the general election, expresses serious concern at their shift of resources away from families in greatest need and further notes the decimation of the Sure Start programme in England with the closure of over 500 centres.*

Amendment 8—Lesley Griffiths

*Delete sub-point 3f and replace with:*

*consider how best to provide parents with information about childcare services and entitlements and how to access them.*

17:07

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Y Dirprwy Weinidog Trechu Tlodi / The Deputy Minister for Tackling Poverty*

I move amendments 2 and 8.

Cynigiad welliannau 2 ac 8.

*Ymddangosodd gwelliant 4 ar yr agenda fel a ganlyn.*

*Amendment X appeared on the agenda as follows.*

Gwelliant 4—Paul Davies

Amendment 4—Paul Davies

*Cynnwys pwynt 3 newydd ac ailrifo yn unol â hynny:*

*Insert as new point 3 and renumber accordingly:*

*Yn nodi mai ar gyfer Lloegr yn unig y mae'r £1 biliwn o fuddsoddiad mewn gofal plant, gan fod gofal plant yng Nghymru wedi'i ddatganoli.*

*Notes that the £1 billion investment in childcare is only for England, as childcare in Wales is devolved.*

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:07

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Angela Burns, you have indicated to me that you might not be minded to move amendment 4. I will call you in the body of the debate if that is your intention. Do you intend to move amendment 4?

Angela Burns, rydych wedi dweud wrthyf efallai na fyddwch yn cynnig gwelliant 4. Fe'ch galwaf yn ystod prif ran y ddadl os mai dyna yw eich bwriad. A ydych yn bwriadu cynnig gwelliant 4?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:07

**Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

No, I do not.

Na, nid wyf yn bwriadu gwneud hynny.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

17:07

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call Eluned Parrott.

Galwaf ar Eluned Parrott.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I want to talk about the economic impact of childcare for Wales. Good access to affordable and quality childcare is vital to enabling parents to work. It is about the quality of that childcare too, if we want parents to feel confident in being able to leave their children in another place and help them to feel confident in making a contribution to our economy. The rising cost of childcare not only hurts parents financially but is also preventing people from accessing work and that is damaging to the structure of our economy fundamentally. Figures released today show that the rate of employment has grown, with over 7,000 more people in work across Wales, which is wonderful news. However, if we want to sustain that kind of growth, we must ensure that parents who wish to return to work have the support to enable them to do so. The world of work is changing. In 60% of two-parent families in the OECD countries, both parents now work. The concept of work is becoming more flexible and the new rights on shared parental leave being introduced by the coalition Government will be a key determinant in the ability of women to balance childcare needs and returning to work. Sadly, in Wales, the childcare sector is relatively underdeveloped and there is limited support for childcare from employers. The cost of childcare is therefore extremely high and prohibitive for all but professional couples. We heard Aled Roberts describe how it might cost you more than your mortgage to send two children into full-time childcare. I can confirm that that was certainly the case for my husband and I when our children were before school age. In fact, it was double the cost of our mortgage. That means that many people in Wales, if they are able to, rely on family, friends and neighbours to allow them to access work. We need to make sure that, where that is the case, those people also feel supported in providing that childcare.

As I have said, one of the most expensive times is the first two to three years when you have potentially two or even three children under the age of five. There is very little provision to support parents with childcare during this time. While we welcome the aims of Flying Start, as my colleague Aled has said, the recent evaluation report shows that, despite the scheme having been in operation since 2007, there are still opportunities for it to be improved. That very honest evaluation report will, I hope, be very helpful in shaping it and helping it in the future. Turning to the specific things that I want to mention in that evaluation, the fact that, in terms of outcomes for children, there is no significant difference between those in Flying Start areas in terms of cognitive, language, social and emotional development, is interesting. In terms of the wider family objectives of the Flying Start programme, the parent outcomes, the evaluation showed that there was no difference between parents in Flying Start and those in comparison areas in terms of their self-confidence as parents, their mental health or their home environment measures. Those are things that we would like to perhaps learn a little bit more about.

Hoffwn siarad am effaith economaidd gofal plant yng Nghymru. Mae'r gallu i gael gafael ar ofal plant fforddiadwy o safon yn hollbwysig er mwyn galluogi rhieni i weithio. Mae a wnelo ag ansawdd y gofal plant hwnnw hefyd, er mwyn sicrhau bod rhieni yn teimlo'n hyderus y gallant adael eu plant mewn lle arall a'u helpu i gael yr hyder i gyfrannu at ein heconomi. Mae cost gynyddol gofal plant nid yn unig yn rhoi pwysau ariannol ar rieni ond hefyd yn atal pobl rhag gweithio ac mae hynny'n niweidio strwythur ein heconomi yn sylfaenol. Dengys ffigurau a ryddhawyd heddiw fod y gyfradd gyflogaeth wedi cynyddu, gyda thros 7,000 yn fwy o bobl mewn gwaith ledled Cymru, sy'n newyddion gwyb. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn cynnal twf o'r fath, rhaid inni sicrhau bod rhieni sy'n dymuno dychwelyd i'r gwaith yn cael y cymorth i'w galluogi i wneud hynny. Mae byd gwaith yn newid. Yn achos 60% o deuluoedd dau riant yn y gwledydd sy'n rhan o'r Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd, mae'r ddau riant bellach yn gweithio. Mae'r cysyniad o waith yn dod yn fwy hyblyg a bydd yr hawliau newydd o ran absenoldeb riant a rennir a gyflwynir gan y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn ffactor allweddol o ran galluogi menywod i gydbwysu anghenion gofal plant a dychwelyd i'r gwaith. Yn anffodus, yng Nghymru, mae'r sector gofal plant yn gymharol annatblygedig a phrin yw'r cymorth a roddir gan gyflogwyr ar gyfer gofal plant. Felly, mae cost gofal plant yn eithriadol o uchel ac afresymol i bawb heblaw am gyplau proffesiynol. Clywsom Aled Roberts yn dweud y gallai gostio mwy na'ch morgais i ddau blentyn gael gofal plant llawn amser. Gallaf gadarnhau bod hynny'n sicr yn wir yn achos fy ngŵr a minnau pan oedd ein plant cyn oed ysgol. Yn wir, roedd yn costio ddwywaith ein taliadau morgais. Mae hynny'n golygu bod llawer o bobl yng Nghymru, os gallant wneud hynny, yn dibynnu ar deulu, ffrindiau a chymdogion i'w galluogi i weithio. Mae angen inni sicrhau, lle y bo hynny'n digwydd, bod y bobl hynny hefyd yn teimlo eu bod yn cael cymorth i ddarparu'r gofal plant hwnnw.

Fel y dywedais, un o'r cyfnodau drutaf yw'r ddwy neu dair blynedd gyntaf pan fydd gennych o bosibl ddau neu hyd yn oed dri o blant o dan bump oed. Ychydig iawn o ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael i gynorthwyo rhieni gyda gofal plant yn ystod y cyfnod hwn. Er ein bod yn croesawu nodau Dechrau'n Deg, fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod, dengys yr adroddiad gwerthuso diweddar, er gwaetha'r ffaith bod y cynllun ar waith ers 2007, fod lle i'w wella o hyd. Bydd yr adroddiad gwerthuso gonest iawn hwnnw, gobeithio, yn ddefnyddiol iawn wrth ei lywio a'i helpu yn y dyfodol. Gan droi at y pethau penodol yr wyf am sôn amdanynt yn y gwerthusiad hwnnw, mae'r ffaith, mewn perthynas â chanlyniadau i blant, nad oes llawer o wahaniaeth rhwng y rhai mewn ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg o safbwynt datblygiad gwybyddol, ieithyddol, cymdeithasol ac emosïynol, yn ddiddorol. O ran amcanion teuluol ehangach rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg, a'r canlyniadau i rieni, dangosodd y gwerthusiad nad oedd unrhyw wahaniaeth rhwng rheini mewn ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg a'r rhai mewn ardaloedd cymharu o ran eu hunanhyder fel rhieni, eu hiechyd meddwl neu eu mesurau amgylchedd y cartref. Mae'r rheini'n bethau yr hoffem o bosibl ddysgu ychydig mwy amdanynt.



Also, with targeting limited to certain geographical areas, it is a bit of a postcode lottery for parents, meaning that families who are on low incomes but who live outside of those particular urban deprived communities—or, frankly, anyone living in a rural area—cannot access the Flying Start provisions and therefore do not have the kind of support that they might want. I wonder whether the Welsh Government is looking at ways in which it can make the way that it is targeted more sophisticated.

I want to talk about the quality of care and the opportunity that I think we have to build childcare as a profession within Wales, because the quality of childcare, and not only its affordability, is key. We need to look at the ways in which we support the child-minding profession, which is a very important part of our economy, and can provide a more flexible and affordable option for parents seeking childcare than nursery provision or nanny provision, which is potentially much more expensive. According to a survey by the National Child-minding Association Cymru in 2011 on the economic impact of the child-minding sector in Wales, the sector supports around 9,500 jobs and is worth an estimated £122 million to the Welsh economy on an annual basis. That is an extraordinary contribution by a sector that often feels that it is forgotten by regulators. The registered childcare sector employs a further 18,000 people, which is 2.6% of all businesses in Wales. So, we need to think about how we can work with the regulatory authorities to make things easier for them. Do we still have problems with planning permission around altering homes, for example, for child-minding purposes? Are there ways in which we can review and remove some of those burdens to make more people consider child-minding and childcare as a career option?

17:12

### **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I would like to thank the Liberal Democrats for bringing this debate forward today, because it is so incredibly important. It is interesting, having listened to Simon, Aled and Eluned so far, that much of what you say is beginning to be really reflected in the work that we are finding through our childcare commission. We are hearing the same stories again and again from people all over Wales—from parents and from childcare providers—about how difficult it is to access it, particularly the rural elements, and the cost. People feel that there is an enormous need to have more childcare than is on offer, because they want to go out there to get full-time jobs or jobs that are more than a couple of hours a day. I am very glad to be able to clarify the non-moving of our amendment, because the investment that you talk about in your motion is not pan-UK. There is an awful lot of it that is just for places like London councils, which are getting £8 million to £10 million and so on. What I really want to try to drill down to—and I accept totally what you had to say; there is a lot of investment out there—is that the delivery of so much childcare is a completely devolved responsibility and we must look to the Welsh Government to step up to the mark and start making some of these radical changes that you have already talked about.

Hefyd, gan fod y rhaglen wedi'i chyfyngu i ardaloedd daearyddol penodol, mae'n dipyn o loteri cod post i rieni, sy'n golygu na all teuluoedd sydd ar incwm isel ond sy'n byw y tu allan i'r cymunedau trefol difreintiedig penodol hynny—neu, a dweud y gwir, unrhyw un sy'n byw mewn ardal wledig—gael gafael ar ddarpariaethau Dechrau'n Deg ac felly nid ydynt yn cael y math o gymorth y gallent fod am ei gael. Tybed a yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried ffyrdd o sicrhau bod y rhaglen yn cael ei thargedu mewn modd mwy soffistigedig.

Hoffwn siarad am ansawdd gofal a'r cyfle sydd gennym, yn fy marn i, i ddatblygu gofal plant fel proffesiwn yng Nghymru, gan fod ansawdd gofal plant, ac nid yn unig ei fforddiadwyedd, yn allweddol. Mae angen inni ystyried y ffyrdd yr ydym yn cefnogi'r proffesiwn gwarchod plant, sy'n rhan bwysig iawn o'n heconomi, a sut y gallwn gynniig opsiwn mwy hyblyg a fforddiadwy i rieni sy'n chwilio am ofal plant na darpariaeth meithrinfa neu nani, a all fod yn llawer mwy costus. Yn ôl arolwg gan Gymdeithas Genedlaethol Gwarchod Plant Cymru yn 2011 ar effaith economaidd y sector gwarchod plant yng Nghymru, mae'r sector yn cefnogi tua 9,500 o swyddi ac mae'n werth tua £122 miliwn i economi Cymru bob blwyddyn. Mae hynny'n gyfraniad eithriadol gan sector sy'n aml yn teimlo ei fod yn mynd yn angof ymhlith rheoleiddwyr. Mae'r sector gofal plant cofrestredig yn cyflogi 18,000 ychwanegol o bobl, sef 2.6% o'r holl fusnesau yng Nghymru. Felly, mae angen inni ystyried sut y gallwn weithio gyda'r awdurdodau rheoleiddio er mwyn gwneud pethau'n haws iddynt. A oes gennym broblemau o hyd o ran caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer addasu cartrefi, er enghraifft, at ddibenion gwarchod plant? A oes ffyrdd y gallwn adolygu a dileu rhai o'r beichiau hynny er mwyn sicrhau bod mwy o bobl yn ystyried gwarchod plant a gofal plant fel gyrfa?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyflwyno'r ddatl hon heddiw, oherwydd mae'n eithriadol o bwysig. Mae'n ddiddorol, ar ôl gwrandao ar Simon, Aled ac Eluned hyd yn hyn, bod llawer o'r hyn a ddywedwch yn dechrau cael ei adlewyrchu yn y gwaith rydym yn dod ar ei draws drwy ein comisiwn gofal plant. Rydym yn clywed yr un straeon dro ar ôl tro gan bobl ledled Cymru—gan rieni a darparwyr fel ei gilydd—ynglŷn â pha mor anodd ydyw i gael gafael ar ofal plant, yn enwedig yr elfennau gwledig, a'r gost. Mae pobl yn teimlo bod angen dybryd am fwy o ofal plant nag sydd ar gael, am eu bod yn awyddus i fynd allan i gael swyddi llawn amser neu swyddi sy'n fwy nag ychydig oriau y dydd. Rwy'n falch iawn o allu egluro pam nad ydym yn cynniig ein gwelliant, oherwydd nid yw'r buddsoddiad y cyfeiriwch ato yn eich cynniig ar gyfer y DU gyfan. Mae llawer iawn ohono ar gyfer lleoedd fel cynghorau yn Llundain yn unig, sy'n cael £8 miliwn a £10 miliwn ac ati. Yr hyn yr wyf am fynd i'r afael ag ef—a derbyniad yn llwyr yr hyn a oedd gennych i'w ddweud; mae llawer iawn o arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi—yw'r ffaith bod y broses o ddarparu cymaint o ofal plant yn gyfrifoldeb cwbl ddatganoledig a rhaid inni droi at Lywodraeth Cymru i ymateb i'r her a dechrau gwneud rhai o'r newidiadau radical hyn yr ydych eisoes wedi sôn amdanynt.

It is funny, is not, that word 'care'? Whether it is care for our elderly, our children, or our disabled people, it is inevitably an area where we seem to pay the least money and yet it is the most important. I have two children who are my life, my soul, and my heart and yet I scrimp around trying to find care that I can afford to entrust my children to these people. When they were babies, it was even worse. All you see, when you are a hard-pressed parent, is the numbers at the end of it. You think, 'Oh my goodness, that is going to be £50 for six or seven hours and that is going to be day after day.' I think that you touched very briefly, Simon, on this cultural change. We do not have the Scandinavian model that is held up where we are all completely homogenised individuals. We have a very robust society, but we do have a society that simply does not put caring for anybody up there. We need to do an awful lot of work to improve the profession of caring, the training for carers, the self-respect that they get, and the value that they get. It is incredibly important to all of us, whatever our job, that people believe that when they say, 'I'm a childminder' or 'I care for elderly people', people will look at them with respect and say, 'Goodness, that's an absolutely outstanding job.'

My first question to you, Deputy Minister, would be—. I have read your 'Building a Brighter Future: Early Years and Childcare Plan', you go part of the way, but you do not really address how we can effect these fundamental changes. You sit next door to the Deputy Minister for Skills and Technology, and some of the issues lie in the fact that things like childcare are seen as something that people will do as a last resort rather than as a first resort. I think that we should talk about how we are going to upskill and give skills and how we are going to give the skills-based professions the parity and credibility within the education system. That is one of the areas where we can drill down and say, 'What do we do to ensure that people who enter into childcare as a first-choice profession really feel that value?'

The other thing that I picked up from your 'Building a Brighter Future: Early Years and Childcare Plan' was that there is an awful lot of talk through it about doing some planning, doing research and trying to assess need. I have looked at quite a few of the childcare sufficiency assessments that county councils are obliged to provide to Welsh Government. It is a three-year plan that is reviewed on a yearly basis—councils have to submit a yearly progress report, and, to be fair, the ones that I have seen have been very good. There is a real map of the gaps and a real understanding that we have to extend our hours, look at Welsh-language provision for childcare and that we need to engage with small and medium-sized businesses.

Deputy Minister, I would like to finish by saying this: please do not waste any more time, or spend too much time, on planning, planning, planning. That is also code for inaction, inaction, inaction. You do have the information available to you.

Onid yw'r gair 'gofal' hwnnw'n un doniol? P'un a yw'n cyfeirio at ofal i'n henoed, ein plant, neu ein pobl anabl, mae'n anochel yn faes lle yr ymddengys ein bod yn buddsoddi'r swm lleiaf o arian ac eto, dyma'r maes pwysicaf. Mae gennyf ddau blentyn a nhw yw fy mywyd, fy enaid, a'm calon ac eto, rwy'n gynnwl wrth geisio dod o hyd i ofal y gallaf ei fforddio er mwyn rhoi fy mhiant yng ngofal y bobl hyn. Pan oeddent yn fabanod, roedd y sefyllfa hyd yn oed yn waeth. Y cyfan a welwch, fel rhiant dan bwysau, yw'r gost. Rydych chi'n meddwl, 'Bobl bach, mae hynny'n mynd i gostio £50 am chwech neu saith awr, a hynny ddydd ar ôl dydd.' Credaf eich bod wedi cyffwrdd yn gyflym, Simon, â'r newid diwylliannol hwn. Nid oes gennym y model Sgandinafaidd y cyfeirir ato lle rydym yn unigolion cwbl homogenaidd. Mae gennym gymdeithas gadarn iawn, ond mae honno'n gymdeithas nad yw'n rhoi blaenoriaeth i ofalu am unrhyw un. Mae angen inni wneud llawer iawn o waith i wella'r proffesiwn gofalu, yr hyfforddiant a roddir i ofalwyr, yr hunanbarch y maent yn ei feithrin, a'r gwerth y maent yn ei gael. Mae'n hynod bwysig i bob un ohonom, beth bynnag fo'n gwaith, bod pobl yn credu pan fyddant yn dweud, 'Rwy'n warchodwr plant' neu 'Rwy'n gofalu am bobl oedrannus', y bydd pobl yn edrych arnynt gyda pharch ac yn dweud, 'Bobl bach, mae'n swydd wych.'

Fy nghwestiwn cyntaf ichi, Ddirprwy Weinidog, fyddai—. Rwyf wedi darllen 'Adeiladu Dyfodol Gwell: Cynllun y Blynyddoedd Cynnar a Gofal Plant' a gyhoeddwyd gennyf, ac rydych yn mynd ran o'r ffordd, ond nid ydych mewn gwirionedd yn mynd i'r afael â sut y gallwn wneud y newidiadau sylfaenol hyn. Rydych yn eistedd wrth ymyl y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau a Thechnoleg, ac mae rhai o'r problemau'n ymwneud â'r ffaith bod pethau fel gofal plant yn cael eu hystyried yn rhywbeth y bydd pobl yn ei wneud fel y dewis olaf yn hytrach na'r cam cyntaf. Credaf y dylem drafod sut y gallwn wella sgiliau a meithrin sgiliau a sut y gallwn roi cydraddoldeb a hygredded i'r proffesiynau sy'n seiliedig ar sgiliau yn y system addysg. Mae hwnnw'n un o'r meysydd y gallwn fynd i'r afael ag ef a dweud, 'Beth y gallwn ei wneud i sicrhau bod pobl sy'n dewis diyn gyrfa ym maes gofal plant yn wirioneddol yn teimlo'r gwerth hwnnw?'

Y peth arall a nodais yn 'Adeiladu Dyfodol Gwell: Cynllun y Blynyddoedd Cynnar a Gofal Plant' oedd bod llawer iawn o sôn ynddo am wneud rhywfaint o waith cynllunio, ymchwilio a cheisio asesu angen. Rwyf wedi ystyried nifer o'r asesiadau o ddigonolrwydd gofal plant y mae'n ofynnol i gynghorau sir eu darparu i Lywodraeth Cymru. Cynllun tair blynedd ydyw a gaiff ei adolygu'n flynyddol—rhaid i gynghorau gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol ar gynnydd ac, a bod yn deg, mae'r rhai yr wyf wedi'u gweld wedi bod yn dda iawn. Ceir map gwirioneddol o'r bylchau a dealltwriaeth wirioneddol fod yn rhaid inni ymestyn ein horiau, ystyried darpariaeth gofal plant Gymraeg a bod angen inni ymgysylltu â busnesau bach a chanolig.

Ddirprwy Weinidog, hoffwn orffen drwy ddweud hyn: peidiwch â gwastraffu rhagor o amser, na threulio gormod o amser, yn cynllunio, cynllunio, cynllunio. Mae hynny'n gyfystyr â diffyg gweithredu, diffyg gweithredu, diffyg gweithredu. Mae gennyf y wybodaeth.

Flexible childcare that offers mothers the option of continuing to work will be a key way of reducing levels of child poverty in Wales, which is greater than in any other area of the UK, with around one in three children living in poverty. The Institute for Fiscal Studies showed recently that female employment has been the key driver of increases on wealth among low and middle-income families. In the last 50 years, 78% of all the growth in gross employment income in low and middle-income households has come from women. This means that investment in childcare is a vital tool in helping families out of poverty, by making employment a realistic option for working parents.

Sadly, there is a lack of co-ordination between Welsh Government departments on childcare and early years provision, and a clear difference in the rhetoric from the Welsh Government and delivery by local authorities. The Welsh Government has a range of policy statements and policies relating directly and indirectly to childcare—the 'Tackling Poverty Action Plan 2012-2016'; the 'Building a Brighter Future: Early Years and Childcare Plan' from July 2013; 'Building Resilient Communities' from July 2013; the 'Strategic Equality Plan and Equality Objectives 2012-16'; Flying Start; the foundation phase; and Communities First, to name just a few. We have a Minister for Education and Skills who is responsible for the early years and childcare plan, a Minister for Communities and Tackling Poverty and now a Deputy Minister in charge of Flying Start. There seems to be a lack of co-ordination or focus. While progressive policies have been introduced to expand childcare provision in England that will help millions of parents struggling to reach that work-life balance, in Wales childcare provision has remained stagnant.

We have seen the failure of some key policies such as Genesis Wales 2, which had a specific focus on childcare by helping female lone parents who were economically inactive. This £36 million project failed to meet its target, supporting only 800 people out of the 20,000 originally aimed for. Despite all the warm words and rhetoric from the Welsh Government, it is becoming clear that these are often not translating into action at local authority level. So Part 3(c) of our motion calls on the Government to assess whether local authorities are fully utilising funding for the statutory provision of an early years education place for three to four-year-olds. Despite the statutory requirement for the provision of a free part-time education place for all children from the term following their third birthday, local authority figures reveal that cuts have been made to early years provision. In my region, in Neath Port Talbot, for example, figures from the council show that from its budget of £447,000 this year, it plans to cut £213,000 in 2014-15 and a further £152,000 in 2015-16 by phasing out additional in-year funding for early years development.

Bydd gofal plant hyblyg sy'n cynnig yr opsiwn i famau barhau i weithio yn ffordd allweddol o leihau lefelau tlodi plant yng Nghymru, sy'n uwch nag mewn unrhyw ardal arall yn y DU, gyda thua un o bob tri phlentyn yn byw mewn tlodi. Dangosodd y Sefydliad Astudiaethau Cyllid yng ddiweddar mai cyflogaeth ymhlith menywod yw'r ffactor allweddol sy'n ysgogi cynnydd mewn cyfoeth ymhlith teuluoedd incwm isel a chanolig. Yn ystod y 50 mlynedd diwethaf, mae 78% o'r holl dwf mewn incwm cyflogaeth gros mewn cartrefi incwm isel a chanolig wedi deillio o fenywod. Mae hyn yn golygu bod buddsoddi mewn gofal plant yn ffordd allweddol o helpu teuluoedd allan o dlodi, drwy sicrhau bod cyflogaeth yn opsiwn realistig i rieni sy'n gweithio.

Yn anffodus, ceir diffyg cydgysylltu rhwng adrannau Llywodraeth Cymru ym maes gofal plant a darpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar, a gwahaniaeth clir rhwng rhethreg Llywodraeth Cymru a dulliau cyflawni awdurdodau lleol. Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru amrywiaeth o ddatganiadau polisi a pholisïau sy'n ymwneud yn uniongyrchol ac yn anuniongyrchol â gofal plant—'Cynllun Gweithredu ar gyfer Trechu Tlodi 2012-2016', 'Adeiladu Dyfodol Gwell: Cynllun y Blynyddoedd Cynnar a Gofal Plant' o fis Gorffennaf 2013; 'Adeiladu Cymunedau Gwydn' o fis Gorffennaf 2013; 'Cynllun Cydraddoldeb Strategol ac Amcanion Cydraddoldeb 2012-16; Dechrau'n Deg; y cyfnod sylfaen; a Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, i enwi dim ond rhai. Mae gennym Weinidog Addysg a Sgiliau sy'n gyfrifol am gynllun y blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant, Gweinidog Cymunedau a Threchu Tlodi a bellach Ddirprwy Weinidog sy'n gyfrifol am Dechrau'n Deg. Ymddengys bod diffyg cydgysylltu neu ffocws. Er bod polisïau blaengar wedi'u cyflwyno i ehangu darpariaeth gofal plant yn Lloegr a fydd yn helpu miliynau o rieni sy'n ei chael hi'n anodd sicrhau'r cydbwysedd hwnnw rhwng bywyd a gwaith, yng Nghymru mae darpariaeth gofal plant wedi aros yn ei hunfan.

Gwelsom fethiant rhai polisïau allweddol megis Genesis Cymru 2, a oedd yn cynnwys ffocws penodol ar ofal plant drwy helpu rhieni unigol benywaidd a oedd yn economaidd anweithgar. Methodd y prosiect £36 miliwn hwn â chyrraedd ei darged, gan gynorthwyo dim ond 800 o bobl allan o'r 20,000 yr anelwyd at eu cynorthwyo yn wreiddiol. Er gwaethaf holl eiriau cefnogol a rhethreg Llywodraeth Cymru, mae'n dod yn amlwg nad yw'r rhain yn aml yn troi'n gamau gweithredu ar lefel awdurdod lleol. Felly, mae Rhan 3(c) ein cynnig yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i asesu a yw awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud defnydd llawn o arian er mwyn darparu lleoedd addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar statudol i blant 3-4 oed. Er gwaethaf y gofyniad statudol i ddarparu lle addysg rhan amser am ddim i bob plentyn o'r tymor yn dilyn ei ben-blwydd yn dair oed, dengys ffigurau awdurdodau lleol fod toriadau wedi'u gwneud i ddarpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar. Yn fy rhanbarth i, yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, er enghraifft, dengys ffigurau gan y cyngor, o ran ei gyllideb o £447,000 eleni, ei fod yn bwriadu torri £213,000 yn 2014-15 a £152,000 ychwanegol yn 2015-16 drwy gael gwared yn raddol ar arian ychwanegol yn ystod y flwyddyn ar gyfer datblygu'r blynyddoedd cynnar.

Local councils have a statutory duty to offer a minimum of 10 hours a week of free education to all three and four-years-old, funded through the Welsh local government settlement. However, again in Neath Port Talbot, schools have been told that they will now have to find this funding from their own resources, and that the extra money that they were receiving for this entitlement is effectively being stopped and not being given to them.

Another area where the Government fails to turn rhetoric into reality is its commitment to the Welsh language. Figures revealed by Rhieni dros Addysg Gymraeg last year highlighted the significant disparity in Welsh-medium provision through Flying Start and the number of pupils continuing their education in Welsh. In Neath Port Talbot, for example, only 1.5% of children were receiving Welsh-medium Flying Start provision, while over 17% of children went on to Welsh-medium education. In Swansea, 1.8% of children received Flying Start provision through the medium of Welsh, while over 13% of children continue their education in Welsh. While we welcome Flying Start's focus on the development needs of the child, this does not have to be at the expense of the Welsh language, which is why our motion calls on the Welsh Government to examine this inequality in Welsh-medium early years provision.

Flying Start and Welsh-medium education sit in separate portfolios, which does not help in creating a joined-up approach. If Welsh-medium education is to become an integral part of education, not just a bolt-on, there needs to be a more clear and transparent relationship between Flying Start and the now statutory Welsh in education strategic plans, so that Flying Start supports the aims of the Welsh-medium education strategy.

17:22

## Jenny Rathbone [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I agree with paragraph 1 of the motion, but paragraph 2 is incredibly muddled, given that one of the top-line results of the UK Government that came in in 2010 was to close 500 Sure Start centres, which has had a pretty detrimental effect on children and their development.

All the evidence, as established by the effective pre-school, primary and secondary education study demonstrates that children's development is pretty much set in stone by the age of two. That is because if you are in a family where language skills are poor, your language development is stunted. That means that it is very difficult for you to catch up after that. That is why the Flying Start programme is not just about doubling the number of children in areas of deprivation who get free nursery places from the age of two—it is about supporting the child's language development and the attachment to parents from birth, because that is what is really going to make the difference. I appreciate that that is the way in which a lot of Flying Start parents are engaged, given that everybody is very keen on getting those nursery places at the age of two.

Mae gan gynghorau lleol ddyletswydd statudol i gynnig o leiaf 10 awr yr wythnos o addysg am ddim i bob plentyn tair a phedair oed, wedi'i hariannu drwy setliad llywodraeth leol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, eto yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, mae ysgolion wedi cael gwybod y bydd yn rhaid iddynt bellach ddod o hyd i'r arian hwn o'u hadnoddau eu hunain, a bod yr arian ychwanegol yr oeddent yn ei gael ar gyfer yr hawl hon yn ei hanfod yn cael ei dynnu'n ôl ac na fydd ar gael iddynt.

Maes arall lle mae'r Llywodraeth yn methu â throï rhyethreg yn realiti yw ei ymrwymiad i'r iaith Gymraeg. Dangosodd ffigurau a ddatgelwyd gan Rhieni dros Addysg Gymraeg y llynedd y gwahaniaeth sylweddol o ran darpariaeth cyfrwng Gymraeg drwy raglen Dechrau'n Deg a nifer y disgyblion sy'n parhau â'u haddysg yn Gymraeg. Yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, er enghraifft, dim ond 1.5% o blant oedd yn cael darpariaeth Dechrau'n Deg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, tra bod dros 17% o blant yn mynd ymlaen i addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg. Yn Abertawe, roedd 1.8% o blant yn cael darpariaeth Dechrau'n Deg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, tra bod dros 13% o blant yn parhau â'u haddysg yn Gymraeg. Er ein bod yn croesawu ffofws Dechrau'n Deg ar anghenion datblygu'r plentyn, nid oes rhaid i hyn fod ar draul y Gymraeg, a dyna pam mae ein cynnig yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ystyried yr anghydraddoldeb hwn mewn darpariaeth blynyddoedd cynnar cyfrwng Gymraeg.

Mae Dechrau'n Deg ac addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg yn rhan o bortffolios ar wahân, ac nid yw hynny'n helpu i greu dull gweithredu cydgyssylltiedig. Er mwyn sicrhau bod addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg yn rhan annatod o addysg, yn hytrach na dim ond ychwanegiad iddo, mae angen sicrhau cydberthynas gliriach a mwy tryloyw rhwng Dechrau'n Deg a'r cynlluniau strategol Gymraeg mewn addysg sydd bellach yn rhai statudol, fel bod Dechrau'n Deg yn cefnogi nodau'r strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Gymraeg.

Cytunaf â pharagraff 1 y cynnig, ond mae paragraff 2 yn hynod ddryslud, o gofio mai un o'r prif bethau a ddeilliodd o Lywodraeth y DU yn 2010 oedd cau 500 o ganolfannau Cychwyn Cadarn, sydd wedi cael effaith andwyol ar blant a'u datblygiad.

Mae'r holl dystiolaeth, a nodwyd gan yr astudiaeth effeithiol o addysg cyn ysgol, cynradd ac uwchradd yn dangos bod datblygiad plant wedi'i bennu'n derfynol i raddau helaeth erbyn iddynt gyrraedd dwy oed. Y rheswm am hynny yw os ydych yn perthyn i deulu â sgiliau iaith gwael, mae eich datblygiad iaith yn gyfyngedig. Mae hynny'n golygu ei bod hi'n anodd iawn ichi ddal i fyny ar ôl hynny. Dyna pam mae a wnelo rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg â mwy na dim ond dyblu nifer y plant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig sy'n cael lleoedd meithrin am ddim pan fyddant yn ddwy oed—mae a wnelo â chefnogi datblygiad iaith y plentyn ac ymgysylltu â'i rieni o adeg ei enedigaeth, gan mai hynny sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth mewn gwirionedd. Gwerthfawrogaf mai dyna'r ffordd y mae llawer o rieni Dechrau'n Deg yn cael eu cynnwys, o gofio bod pawb yn awyddus iawn i gael y lleoedd meithrin hynny i blant dwy oed.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Childcare is not just about nursery places, childminders or tax credits, although all of those are very important to make it affordable. It is also about the breakfast club, the after-school club and the holiday play provision that are crucial to help working mums and dads hold down a job. The problem is that some of the above provision is at risk because of reductions in local government funding. Children do not have a big voice, and they certainly do not have a vote.

Last week, I visited the Llanedeyrn play group in my constituency, which is a beacon service for five to 15-year-olds who look out for each other. It serves about 50 children after school during the week and up to 60 or 70 children in the school holidays. For many children, this is their summer holidays. Among its many attractions is a mud slide, cookery classes and a family atmosphere where children learn to mix with others of different ages. Some of these children would fall into the view of social services if it were not for the play group, so I cannot be more emphatic about the importance of these non-traditional childcare options for preventing children from getting into difficulties.

The Wales Audit Office report highlighted the importance of councils having to robustly assess the potential impact of proposed changes, as otherwise services run the risk of achieving fewer or different outputs and outcomes to those originally anticipated. That could not be more strongly stressed than in the case of that sort of out-of-school provision. Fortunately, Wales was the first country ever to acknowledge the right of the child to be able to play and local authorities have a statutory duty to assess and plan play provision. Organisations like Play Wales confirm that many local authorities have embraced this challenge and that is to be welcomed.

Given that money is tight and it is no good saying, 'We must have all this', we need to explore what we can realistically do to increase the availability of childcare without braking the bank. So, breakfast-club provision is specifically designed to ensure that all children have a breakfast before school. I would like to pose this question: this is not a childcare provision for working families, but should it be? Many breakfast clubs are oversubscribed and if that was an additional criterion for headteachers, it could help working families on low incomes that would otherwise find it incredibly difficult to get to work by 9 a.m. It could be possible to charge such people on a sliding income scale, so that those on low wages would pay less than those on higher wages. What more could community-focused schools do to meet the needs of families on their publicly funded sites? Not all local authorities allow families to choose where they get their nursery entitlement for their three and four-year-olds. Does it really matter whether it is local education authority funded or run by the voluntary or private sector, as long as it meets the quality provision of having a teacher involved in the curriculum? That might also stimulate more wraparound care, which is essential.

Mae a wnelo gofal plant â mwy na dim ond lleoedd meithrin, gwarchodwyr plant neu greydau treth, er bod y pethau hynny i gyd yn bwysig iawn er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn fforddiadwy. Mae a wnelo hefyd â'r clwb brecwast, y clwb ar ôl ysgol a'r ddarpariaeth chwarae yn ystod gwyliau sy'n hanfodol i helpu mamau a thadau sy'n gweithio i gadw swydd. Y broblem yw bod rhywfaint o'r ddarpariaeth uchod yn wynebu risg oherwydd toriadau mewn cyllid llywodraeth leol. Nid oes gan blant lais cryf, ac yn sicr nid oes ganddynt bleidlais.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, ymwelais â chylch chwarae Llanedeyrn yn fy etholaeth, sy'n wasanaeth gwych i blant a phobl ifanc rhwng pump a 15 oed sy'n cefnogi ei gilydd. Mae'n gwasanaethu tua 50 o blant ar ôl ysgol yn ystod yr wythnos a hyd at 60 neu 70 o blant yn ystod gwyliau'r ysgol. I lawer o blant, gwyliau'r haf yw hyn. Ymhlith ei atyniadau niferus mae sleid mwd, dosbarthiadau cogenio ac awyrgylch teuluol lle mae plant yn dysgu sut i gymysgu ag eraill o oedrannau gwahanol. Byddai rhai o'r plant hyn yn disgyn i ddwylo'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol pe na bai'r grŵp chwarae ar gael, felly ni allaf bwysleisio ddigon bwysigrwydd yr opsiynau gofal plant anrhaddodiadol hyn o ran atal plant rhag mynd i drafferthion.

Nododd adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru bwysigrwydd ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gynghorau asesu'n gadarn effaith bosibl y newidiadau arfaethedig, gan fod risg fel arall y bydd gwasanaethau'n cyflawni llai o allbynnau a chanlyniadau neu rai gwahanol i'r rheini a ragwelwyd yn wreiddiol. Ni ellid pwysleisio hynny'n fwy nag yn achos y math hwnnw o ddarpariaeth y tu allan i'r ysgol. Yn ffodus ddigon, Cymru oedd y wlad gyntaf erioed i gydnabod hawl y plentyn i allu chwarae ac mae gan awdurdodau lleol ddyletswydd statudol i asesu a chynllunio darpariaeth chwarae. Mae sefydliadau fel Chwarae Cymru yn cadarnhau bod llawer o awdurdodau lleol wedi croesawu'r her hon ac mae hynny i'w groesawu.

O gofio bod arian yn brin ac nad oes diben dweud 'Rhaid inni gael hyn i gyd', mae angen inni ystyried beth y gallwn ei wneud yn ymarferol i ddarparu mwy o ofal plant heb dorri'r banc. Felly, mae darpariaeth clwb brecwast wedi'i chynllunio'n arbennig i sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn cael brecwast cyn i'r ysgol ddechrau. Hoffwn ofyn y cwestiwn hwn: nid darpariaeth gofal plant ar gyfer teuluoedd sy'n gweithio yw hon, ond a ddylai fod yn ddarpariaeth o'r fath? Mae gormod o blant yn mynychu llawer o glybiau brecwast a phe bai hynny'n faen prawf ychwanegol i benaethiaid, gallai helpu teuluoedd sy'n gweithio sydd ar incwm isel a fyddai fel arall yn ei chael hi'n anodd iawn cyrraedd y gwaith erbyn 9 am. Gallai fod modd codi tâl ar bobl o'r fath ar raddfa incwm symudol, fel bod y rhai ar gyflogau isel yn talu llai na'r rhai ar gyflogau uwch. Beth arall y gallai ysgolion bro ei wneud i ddiwallu anghenion teuluoedd ar eu safleoedd a rienir yn gyhoeddus? Nid yw pob awdurdod lleol yn caniatáu i deuluoedd ddewis y feithrinfa lle mae eu plant tair a phedair oed yn cael gofal. A oes ots p'un a yw'n cael ei hariannu gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol neu ei rhedeg gan y sector gwirfoddol neu breifat, cyn belled â'i bod yn bodloni'r gofynion o ran ansawdd darpariaeth drwy fod ag athro sy'n addysgu'r cwricwlwm? Gallai hynny hefyd ysgogi mwy o ofal coffeidiol, sy'n hanfodol.

I am very pleased that we are having this debate about childcare today. This is one of the key issues, as has already been said by most of the speakers, that we must address to ensure that we move towards a society where every child and every adult is able to have a fulfilled childhood and a fulfilled life. That is fundamental for children themselves, for the economy and for the family.

I was very impressed by the launch yesterday in the Wales Millennium Centre of 'the Wales we want'. I am sure that many other Members were there. I thought that it was a very inspiring event with the Minister, Jeff Cuthbert, speaking, backed up by Michael Sheen. It was a very inspiring occasion. Michael Sheen highlighted the issues of living in poverty in his home town of Port Talbot, saying that one in four children in Port Talbot were living in poverty. He spoke of his pride in the fact that the Welsh Government is pushing forward the children's rights agenda. I was very impressed in what he said about there being a lot of ways in which you can become negative about things, but that we can all become day-to-day visionaries. We need a vision of where we need to get with childcare and children's rights, and then work towards that vision.

I certainly think that we have made progress in Wales. Even in these difficult times, the doubling of Flying Start for pre-school children in disadvantaged areas is a great step forward. I personally wish that we could extend it wider, to all areas. If you look at the map of deprivation for the constituencies in Wales—the child poverty map of Wales—you will see that my constituency, Cardiff North, along with a few other constituencies, actually have the lowest number of children living in poverty. I think it is 11%. However, we also have children in areas of Cardiff North who are in need of the help that is given by Flying Start. Somehow, I think that we have to try to extend Flying Start beyond the boundaries it covers at the moment. I do believe that, at the beginning of this Assembly term, that was something that was said—that we would try to extend it, to get it spread out. So, I think that we have made progress.

Jenny Rathbone has mentioned breakfast clubs and all the provision that we have put in. It is very encouraging to note that the Joseph Rowntree Foundation points out that Wales has the best strategy for dealing with child poverty compared with any other country in the UK. However, I think it is very important that we put more impetus generally behind providing childcare—and I think that that is what the Minister is doing with his plan—and that we see it as the important element of provision it is.

Rwy'n falch iawn ein bod yn cael y ddadl hon am ofal plant heddiw. Mae hwn yn un o'r prif faterion, fel y dywedwyd eisoes gan y rhan fwyaf o'r siaradwyr, y mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag ef er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn symud tuag at gymdeithas lle mae pob plentyn a phob oedolyn yn gallu cael plentyndod cyflawn a bywyd bodlon. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig i blant eu hunain, i'r economi ac i deuluoedd.

Gwnaeth lansiad 'Y Gymru a Garem' ddoe yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru gryn argraff arnaf. Rwy'n siŵr bod llawer o'r Aelodau eraill yn bresennol. Roedd yn ddigwyddiad ysbrydoledig iawn, yn fy marn i, gyda'r Gweinidog, Jeff Cuthbert, yn siarad, ac yn cael ei gefnogi gan Michael Sheen. Roedd yn achlysur ysbrydoledig iawn. Nododd Michael Sheen y problemau o ran byw mewn tldi yn ei dref enedigol, Port Talbot, gan ddweud bod un o bob pedwar plentyn ym Mhort Talbot yn byw mewn tldi. Siaradodd am ei falchder o'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn bwrw ymlaen â'r agenda hawliau plant. Gwnaeth yr hyn a ddywedodd am y ffaith bod llawer o ffyrdd y gallwch deimlo'n negyddol am bethau, ond y gallwn i gyd ddoed yn weledyddion o ddydd i ddydd, gryn argraff arnaf. Mae angen gwledigaeth arnom o ran yr hyn sydd angen inni ei gyflawni ym maes gofal plant a hawliau plant, ac mae angen inni wedyn weithio tuag at y weledigaeth honno.

Credaf yn sicr ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd yng Nghymru. Hyd yn oed yn y cyfnod anodd hwn, mae dyblu nifer y lleoedd Dechrau'n Deg sydd ar gael i blant cyn ysgol mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig yn gam mawr ymlaen. Yn bersonol, hoffwn pe gallem ymestyn y ddarpariaeth honno'n ehangach, i bob ardal. Os edrychwch ar y map amddifadedd ar gyfer yr etholaethau yng Nghymru—map tldi plant Cymru—fe welwch mai fy etholaeth i, Gogledd Caerdydd, ynghyd â rhai etholaethau eraill, mewn gwirionedd sydd â'r nifer leiaf o blant sy'n byw mewn tldi. Credaf mai 11% yw'r ffigur cywir. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym hefyd blant mewn ardaloedd o Ogledd Caerdydd y mae angen y cymorth Dechrau'n Deg arnynt. Rywsut, credaf fod yn rhaid inni geisio ymestyn Dechrau'n Deg y tu hwnt i'w ffiniau presennol. Credaf fod hynny'n rhywbeth a ddywedwyd ar ddechrau tymor y Cynulliad hwn—y byddem yn ceisio ymestyn y ddarpariaeth honno, a'i lledaenu. Felly, credaf ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd.

Mae Jenny Rathbone wedi crybwyll clybiau brecwast a'r holl ddarpariaeth a gyflwynwyd gennym. Mae'n galonogol iawn nodi bod Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree yn nodi mai Cymru sydd â'r strategaeth orau ar gyfer ymdrin â thlodi plant o gymharu ag unrhyw wlad arall yn y DU. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn ein bod yn rhoi mwy o bwyslais cyffredinol ar ddarparu gofal plant—a chredaf mai dyna y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud gyda'i gynllun—ac yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y ddarpariaeth honno.



I agree with what Simon Thomas said at the beginning of the debate, that it is very important that the dad spoke first and it is very important that men are involved in this very important issue. When I first went to the House of Commons in 1997, if any of us raised the issue of childcare, it was always a woman and the opposition benches tittered. That was what always happened whenever anything like childcare was raised, so I think that it is a great move forward that we all here, women and men, accept that childcare is an issue that is important to all of us. That is very important and it is very important that we try to encourage men to be involved as workers in the childcare field because it is dominated by women and, for children growing up—I think it was Angela or Jenny who said this—in the first two years of their lives, their views are formed and expectations are set. So, if you do not have male figures there, that is an awful shame. So, that is an area we could certainly look at.

Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd Simon Thomas ar ddechrau'r ddadl, ei bod yn bwysig iawn bod y tad yn siarad gyntaf a'i bod yn bwysig iawn bod dynion yn rhan o'r mater pwysig iawn. Pan euthum i Dŷ'r Cyffredin am y tro cyntaf yn 1997, pe bai unrhyw un ohonom yn codi mater yn ymwneud â gofal plant, menyw fyddai'n gwneud hynny bob amser a byddai meinciau'r wrthblaid yn piffian chwerthin. Dyna fyddai'n digwydd bob tro y cai unrhyw beth fel gofal plant ei godi, felly credaf ei bod yn gam mawr ymlaen ein bod i gyd yma, yn fenywod ac yn ddynion, yn derbyn bod gofal plant yn fater sy'n bwysig i bob un ohonom. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn ac mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn ceisio annog dynion i gymryd rhan fel gweithwyr ym maes gofal plant gan ei fod yn faes a ddominyddir gan fenywod ac, i blant sy'n tyfu i fyny—credaf mai Angela neu Jenny a ddywedodd hyn—maent yn ffurfio eu barn ac yn pennu disgwyliadau yn ystod dwy flynedd cyntaf eu bywyd. Felly, os nad oes gennych ddynion yno, mae hynny'n drueni mawr. Felly, mae hynny'n faes y gallm yn sicr ei ystyried.

I can see that I have almost used up my time, so I just want to say quickly that, when my children were small, I helped to set up a playgroup and, when I was a councillor, we set up an after-school club for children in the school where I was the governor. Then, with the Minister for Finance, we worked together to set up the County Hall day nursery, which is just across the road there. All of those experiences showed me that it is so important that you provide quality childcare, that you work with the community and with parents to try to provide the sort of facilities that are—

Gallaf weld bod fy amser bron ar ben, felly, hoffwn ddweud yn gyflym, pan oedd fy mhlant yn fach, helpais i sefydlu cylch chwarae a, phan oeddwn yn gynghorydd, gwnaethom sefydlu clwb ar ôl ysgol i blant yn yr ysgol lle roeddwn yn llywodraethwr. Yna, gyda'r Gweinidog Cyllid, gwnaethom gydweithio i sefydlu meithrinfa ddydd Neuadd y Sir, sydd yr ochr draw i'r ffordd. Dangosodd yr holl brofiadau hynny imi ei bod mor bwysig eich bod yn darparu gofal plant o safon, eich bod yn gweithio gyda'r gymuned a chyda rhieni er mwyn ceisio darparu'r math o gyfleusterau sydd—

- 17:32 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
The Member's time is up. Mae amser yr Aelod ar ben.
- 17:32 **Julie Morgan** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
[Continues.]—so important for children and their families. [Parhau.] —mor bwysig i blant a'u teuluoedd.
- 17:32 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Thank you. I call the Deputy Minister for Tackling Poverty, Vaughan Gething. Diolch. Galwaf ar y Dirprwy Weinidog Trechu Tlodi, Vaughan Gething.
- 17:32 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*Y Dirprwy Weinidog Trechu Tlodi / The Deputy Minister for Tackling Poverty*  
Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. I thank everyone who has contributed to the debate today, discussing the importance of childcare both for the development of children and in supporting parents to train and work. In relation to the amendments tabled, we will support amendment 1, which adds some clarity. We tabled amendment 2 as the Welsh Government does not consider the action taken by the UK Government in relation to welfare reform and the closure of more than 500 Sure Start centres to be positive. We support amendments 3, 5, 6, 7 and 8. Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl heddiw, gan drafod pwysigrwydd gofal plant o ran datblygiad plant ac wrth gefnogi rhieni i hyfforddi a gweithio. O ran y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 1, sy'n ychwanegu rhywfaint o eglurder. Gwnaethom gyflwyno gwelliant 2 gan nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru o'r farn bod y camau a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU mewn perthynas â diwygio lles a chau mwy na 500 o ganolfannau Cychwyn Cadarn yn gadarnhaol. Cefnogwn welliannau 3, 5, 6, 7 ac 8.

We should say at the outset that we value the information and advice service we already have for families in Wales. The family information service is based in every local authority and offers free, impartial information and advice for parents and carers of children and young people. It provides information on childcare and advice for parents and carers on how they can access help with the costs of childcare itself. Improving access to affordable, high-quality childcare is a priority for this Government. It is a key part of our tackling poverty agenda here in Wales. A range of evidence tells us that employment provides the most sustainable route out of poverty, but for many families with children childcare is essential in enabling and supporting parents to work or take up opportunities to train and acquire skills. We understand that, to meet this challenge, we need to address the cost, the flexibility, the quality and the access to childcare. We also acknowledge that we do not control all of the levers, especially around helping parents with the cost of childcare.

I do understand that quality and not simply the quantity of early education and childcare makes a critical difference to a child's life chances. That is especially so for children from our more disadvantaged families. However, I welcome the fact that many Members are taking an interest in Flying Start and the difference it makes to families. It is unashamedly a targeted programme focused on the areas of highest poverty and disadvantage. I am encouraged in the recent evaluations to see that the highest need parents are reporting improvements in their children's language, cognitive, social and emotional development. These are all key outcome measures for Flying Start—

Dylem ddechrau drwy ddweud ein bod yn gwerthfawrogi'r gwasanaeth gwybodaeth a chyngor sydd gennym eisoes ar gyfer teuluoedd yng Nghymru. Ceir gwasanaeth gwybodaeth i deuluoedd ym mhob awdurdod lleol ac mae'n cynnig gwybodaeth a chyngor diduedd i rieni a gofalwyr plant a phobl ifanc am ddim. Mae'n darparu gwybodaeth am ofal plant a chyngor i rieni a gofalwyr ar sut y gallant gael help gyda chostau gofal plant ei hun. Mae gwella'r gallu i gael gafael ar ofal plant fforddiadwy o ansawdd uchel yn flaenoriaeth i'r Llywodraeth hon. Mae'n rhan allweddol o'n hagenda trechu tlodi yma yng Nghymru. Dywed amrywiaeth o dystiolaeth wrthym mai cyflogaeth sy'n cynnig y llwybr mwyaf cynaliadwy allan o dlodi, ond i lawer o deuluoedd â phlant, mae gofal plant yn hanfodol i alluogi a chefnogi rhieni i weithio neu achub ar gyfleoedd i hyfforddi a meithrin sgiliau. Deallwn, er mwyn ateb yr her hon, fod angen inni fynd i'r afael â chost, hyblygrwydd, ansawdd a'r gallu i gael gafael ar ofal plant. Cydnabyddwn hefyd nad ydym yn rheoli pob un o'r ffactorau sbarduno, yn enwedig o ran helpu rhieni gyda chostau gofal plant.

Deallaf fod ansawdd ac nid yn unig nifer y lleoedd addysg gynnar a gofal plant sydd ar gael yn gwneud gwahaniaeth hollbwysig i gyfleoedd plentyn mewn bywyd. Mae hynny'n arbennig o wir i blant yn ein teuluoedd mwy difreintiedig. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf y ffaith bod llawer o Aelodau yn cymryd diddordeb yn Dechrau'n Deg a'r gwahaniaeth y mae'n ei wneud i deuluoedd. Mae'n rhaglen wedi'i thargedu sy'n canolbwyntio ar yr ardaloedd o dlodi ac anfantais fwyaf, a hynny'n ddiedifar. Câf fy nghalonogi gan y gwerthusiadau diweddar sy'n dangos bod y rhieni sydd â'r angen mwyaf yn nodi gwelliannau yn natblygiad ieithyddol, gwybyddol, cymdeithasol ac emosïynol eu plant. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn fesurau canlyniadau allweddol ar gyfer Dechrau'n Deg—

17:35 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Will you take an intervention?

A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

17:35 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yes.

Gwnaf.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

17:35 **Angela Burns** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you for that, Deputy Minister. I wonder whether you could clarify why the same report says that there is no statistically significant difference between Flying Start and non-Flying Start areas in terms of child cognitive and language skills, their social and emotional development and their independence and self-regulation. The two comments seem to run contrary to each other.

Diolch am hynny, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Tybed a allech egluro pam bod yr un adroddiad yn dweud nad oes unrhyw wahaniaeth ystadegol arwyddocaol rhwng ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg ac ardaloedd nad ydynt yn rhan o Dechrau'n Deg o ran sgiliau gwybyddol ac iaith plant, eu datblygiad cymdeithasol ac emosïynol a'u hannibyniaeth a'u sgiliau hunanreoleiddio. Ymddengys bod y ddau sylw yn gwrthdweud ei gilydd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

17:35 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I do not accept that they are. The wider Flying Start evaluation to which you are referring shows that Flying Start children have similar language, cognitive and social development to those children living in the less disadvantaged comparison areas. We understand that there is a direct correlation between disadvantage and achievement at present.

Ni dderbyniaf hynny. Dengys y gwerthusiad ehangach o Dechrau'n Deg y cyfeirir ato fod gan blant Dechrau'n Deg ddatblygiad ieithyddol, gwybyddol a chymdeithasol tebyg i'r plant hynny sy'n byw yn yr ardaloedd cymharu llai difreintiedig. Deallwn fod cysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng anfantais a chyflawniad ar hyn o bryd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

This Welsh Government is proud to be investing in support for families in our most deprived communities. Despite the £1.7 billion funding cut that we received from Westminster, we will double the number of Flying Start places. In direct contrast, the UK Government has overseen the closure of more than 500 Sure Start centres. We recognise the important relationship between childcare and education. This is particularly so with Welsh-medium education. We understand that for children from English speaking homes, childcare and playgroups are often a child's first contact with the Welsh language and the start of a journey through to Welsh-medium education. Welsh-language provision is an integral part of Flying Start, with a requirement on local authorities to promote the availability of Welsh-medium provision. There is a need for organisations that provide Welsh-medium childcare to respond to the more specific Flying Start requirements relating to its efficiency, the quality of settings and appropriate levels of training and qualifications of the workforce.

The foundation phase plays a crucial role in supporting a child's development. We want all children to have the opportunity to access the foundation phase. That is why there is a statutory duty on all local authorities to provide a free part-time education place in the term following a child's third birthday. We understand that all local authorities provide the required foundation phase offer. The current stock take and evaluation will help to inform us on how we improve outcomes.

We recognise that some parents make a case that the foundation phase could be of greater use with increased flexibility. The Minister for Education and Skills has commissioned pilot schemes to explore ways to improve flexibility for the foundation phase, to give us a better understanding of whether that flexibility makes a real difference for parents to access the foundation phase for their child, but, also to better plan their own work and training commitments.

The Welsh Government is looking at a number of ways to improve the childcare supply for children of all ages across Wales. We recognise that we cannot do all of this within the maintained sector. We have already undertaken some research into the needs of parents who work atypical hours and have additional support needs. We are working to increase the number of childcare businesses, particularly in areas where there are gaps in provision by providing advice, support and some funding. Plans are already in place for three pilot childcare businesses in Communities First areas.

Financial help is already given to support local authorities in addressing gaps in childcare provision with the out-of-school childcare grant. Since 2012, £2.3 million a year has been made available through the grant, which helps to provide wrap-around childcare for out-of-school hours and during holiday periods.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn falch o fuddsoddi mewn cymorth i deuluoedd yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig. Er gwaethaf y toriad o £1.7 biliwn a gawsom gan San Steffan, byddwn yn dyblu nifer y lleoedd Dechrau'n Deg. Mewn cyferbyniad uniongyrchol, mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi goruchwyllo'r broses o gau mwy na 500 o ganolfannau Cychwyn Cadarn. Cydnabyddwn y gydberthynas bwysig rhwng gofal plant ac addysg. Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir o ran addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. I blant o gartrefi Saesneg eu hiaith, deallwn mai gofal plant a chyloedd chwarae yn aml yw cyswllt cyntaf plentyn â'r Gymraeg a dechrau'r daith i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae darpariaeth Gymraeg yn rhan annatod o Dechrau'n Deg, ac mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol hyrwyddo argaeledd darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae angen i sefydliadau sy'n darparu gofal plant cyfrwng Cymraeg ymateb i ofynion mwy penodol o ran rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg sy'n ymwneud â'i heffeithlonrwydd, ansawdd y lleoliadau a lefelau priodol o hyfforddiant a chymwysterau'r gweithlu.

Mae'r cyfnod sylfaen yn chwarae rôl hanfodol wrth gefnogi datblygiad plentyn. Rydym am i bob plentyn gael y cyfle i gael addysg cyfnod sylfaen. Dyna pam y mae dyletswydd statudol ar bob awdurdod lleol i ddarparu lle addysg rhan amser am ddim i blentyn yn y tymor yn dilyn ei ben-blwydd yn dair oed. Deallwn fod pob awdurdod lleol yn darparu'r arlwy cyfnod sylfaen angenrheidiol. Bydd yr arolwg a'r gwerthusiad presennol yn helpu i ddangos inni sut yr ydym yn gwella canlyniadau.

Cydnabyddwn fod rhai rhieni yn dadlau y gallai'r cyfnod sylfaen fod yn fwy defnyddiol pe bai'n fwy hyblyg. Mae'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau wedi comisiynu cynlluniau peilot i ystyried ffyrdd o wella hyblygrwydd y cyfnod sylfaen, er mwyn ein helpu i ddeall yn well a yw'r hyblygrwydd hwnnw'n gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i rieni wrth gael gafael ar addysg cyfnod sylfaen ar gyfer eu plentyn, ond, hefyd wrth gynllunio eu hymrwymadau gwaith a'u hyfforddiant eu hunain yn well.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried nifer o ffyrdd o wella'r cyflenwad gofal plant i blant o bob oedran ledled Cymru. Cydnabyddwn na allwn wneud hyn i gyd o fewn y sector a gynhelir. Rydym eisoes wedi gwneud peth ymchwil i anghenion rhieni sy'n gweithio oriau annodweddiadol ac sydd ag anghenion cymorth ychwanegol. Rydym yn gweithio i gynyddu nifer y busnesau gofal plant, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd lle mae bylchau mewn darpariaeth drwy roi cyngor, cymorth a rhywfaint o gyllid. Mae cynlluniau eisoes ar waith ar gyfer tri busnes gofal plant peilot mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Mae cymorth ariannol eisoes yn cael ei roi i gefnogi awdurdodau lleol i fynd i'r afael â bylchau mewn darpariaeth gofal plant drwy'r grant gofal plant y tu allan i'r ysgol. Ers 2012, dyrannwyd £2.3 miliwn y flwyddyn drwy'r grant, sy'n helpu i ddarparu gofal plant cofleidiol y tu allan i oriau ysgol ac yn ystod gwyliau.

The childcare sufficiency assessments that were mentioned earlier are completed every three years to help identify gaps in childcare provision. The most consistent challenge that parents report in these assessments is the cost of childcare. The main financial support available to parents for childcare comes from tax credits, which, of course, are not devolved. It is a sad but telling fact that one of the earliest actions of the UK Government was to cut the help available to working parents for the cost of childcare. That deliberate choice to cut tax credits has made paying for childcare an even greater struggle for parents on low and middle incomes. According to the Children's Society, under universal credit, the UK Government will substantially reduce the amount of support for low-income working families. The loss of support with childcare costs through housing benefit is set to cost 100,000 of the lowest income working families across Britain up to £4,000 a year in childcare support. Tax-free childcare will not help now. It will not come in until six months after the next general election.

As a Government, we are committed to investing in the early years. We set this out in the early years and childcare plan. To support us in taking that plan forward, the Minister for education and I have established an early years partnership board. It draws together members from the voluntary sector, health, childcare businesses, local government, education and social care. Together, we will develop an early years outcomes framework to help drive quality and consistency, and deliver our 10-year workforce plan to deliver on our ambitions for a high-quality early years workforce in Wales.

I welcome today's debate. This Government recognises the importance of childcare both for parents and children. That is why we are already working with partners in the private, third and public sectors to deliver the improved outcomes for the future of childcare in Wales that all of us should wish to see.

Mae'r asesiadau o ddigonolrwydd gofal plant y soniwyd amdanynt yn gynharach yn cael eu cwblhau bob tair blynedd er mwyn helpu i nodi bylchau mewn darpariaeth gofal plant. Yr her fwyaf cyson a nodir gan rieni yn yr asesiadau hyn yw cost gofal plant. Daw'r prif gymorth ariannol sydd ar gael i rieni ar gyfer gofal plant o gredydau treth nad ydynt, wrth gwrs, wedi'u datganoli. Mae'n ffaith drist ond dadlennol mai un o gamau cyntaf Llywodraeth y DU oedd torri'r cymorth sydd ar gael i rieni sy'n gweithio gyda chost gofal plant. Mae'r dewis bwriadol hwnnw i dorri credydau treth wedi golygu bod talu am ofal plant hyd yn oed yn fwy anodd i rieni ar incwm isel a chanolig. Yn ôl Cymdeithas y Plant, o dan y credyd cynhwysol, bydd Llywodraeth y DU yn lleihau'n sylweddol faint o gymorth sydd ar gael i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio sydd ar incwm isel. Mae colli cymorth gyda chostau gofal plant drwy fudd-dal tai yn debygol o gostio hyd at £4,000 y flwyddyn mewn cymorth gofal plant i 100,000 o'r teuluoedd sy'n gweithio sydd ar yr incwm isaf ledled Prydain. Ni fydd gofal plant di-dreth yn helpu nawr. Ni chaiff ei gyflwyno tan chwe mis ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf.

Fel Llywodraeth, rydym yn ymrwymedig i fuddsoddi yn y blynyddoedd cynnar. Nodwn hyn yng nghynllun y blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant. Er mwyn ein helpu i fwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun hwnnw, mae'r Gweinidog addysg a minnau wedi sefydlu bwrdd partneriaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar. Mae'n dwyn ynghyd aelodau o'r sector gwirfoddol, iechyd, busnesau gofal plant, llywodraeth leol, addysg a gofal cymdeithasol. Gyda'n gilydd, byddwn yn datblygu fframwaith canlyniadau'r blynyddoedd cynnar er mwyn helpu i wella ansawdd a chysondeb, ac yn cyflwyno ein cynllun gweithlu 10 mlynedd i gyflawni ein huchelgeisiau ar gyfer gweithlu'r blynyddoedd cynnar yng Nghymru.

Croesawaf y ddadl heddiw. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gofal plant i rieni a phlant. Dyna pam yr ydym eisoes yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid yn y sector preifat, y trydydd sector a'r sector cyhoeddus i gyflawni'r canlyniadau gwell ar gyfer dyfodol gofal plant yng Nghymru y dylai pob un ohonom fod am eu gweld.

17:41 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call on Kirsty Williams to reply to the debate.

Galwaf ar Kirsty Williams i ymateb i'r ddadl.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

17:41 **Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you very much, Deputy Presiding Officer. I begin by thanking all of those who have contributed to this afternoon's debate. It certainly was a lot better tempered and more thoughtful than perhaps the last one. I begin by thanking Simon Thomas, speaking on behalf of Plaid Cymru, who stressed the importance to the family, child development and the economy of getting this policy area right. He also highlighted the current deficiencies and gaps that we have in Wales that need to be filled. He acknowledged, as we all do, that this area of policy cannot be left to the market alone. There is a legitimate role for Government to intervene and to help to ensure that there is adequate provision.

Diolch yn fawr iawn, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Roedd yn sicr dipyn yn llai blin ac yn fwy ystyrlon o bosibl na'r un ddiwethaf. Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Simon Thomas, llefarydd Plaid Cymru, a bwysleisiodd bwysigrwydd gwneud pethau'n iawn yn y maes polisi hwn o ran y teulu, datblygiad plant a'r economi. Tynnodd sylw hefyd at y diffygion a'r bylchau presennol sydd gennym yng Nghymru y mae angen eu llenwi. Cydnabu hefyd, fel y gwna pob un ohonom, na ellir gadael y maes polisi hwn yn nwylo'r farchnad yn unig. Mae gan y Llywodraeth rôl ddilys i ymyrryd ac i helpu i sicrhau bod darpariaeth ddigonol ar gael.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

My colleague, Eluned Parrott, focused on the economic impact of not having sufficient childcare available to allow women—and this is about creating choices for women, and for fathers—who want to go back to work to be able to do so, and on the need to focus on quality provision that gives parents the confidence to access the workplace and to leave their children safe in the knowledge that they are being cared for properly. She also referred to the need to look at stimulating the different sectors to give parents choice in the type of provision that they can access. Child minding is a classic example—it is a very different environment in which to leave your children than perhaps a traditional nursery setting.

I am grateful to Angela for not moving the amendment. What that demonstrates is the complexity of this issue and the fact that there are roles for the Government in Westminster and the Welsh Government in this particular policy area. We need both Governments taking action to actually deliver for families. The Westminster Government can do that, as we have seen with the issue of parental leave and with tax breaks, and the Welsh Government has the direct responsibility for childcare provision itself.

I am not sure how we crack the issue of changing society to value the caring professions more, but we, as political leaders across the political spectrum, have to do more to raise the profile and to lead that debate in making sure that we esteem people who work in these fields more than perhaps society does.

Turning to Peter Black's contribution, Julie Morgan said that it was good to have dads talking, but it is good to have a non-parent contributing to this debate. I would hate to think that people were thinking that we were all being self-interested—those of us who are parents—in driving a call for better, affordable childcare. For non-parents, of course, there are benefits to the wider Welsh economy by getting this right. Peter acknowledged that the Government does indeed have lots of documents and lots of policy, but, as always, the challenge is in translating that policy into good-quality delivery on the ground. That is something that we all need to acknowledge. Sometimes, having the good policy document does not, in itself, lead to the high-quality provision that we are looking for. As Peter said, that is especially true of Welsh-medium provision given the paucity of choice that there is for parents who are looking for care via the Welsh medium. I know that I failed miserably in Brecon to find Welsh-medium provision for my children when they were young enough to be in nursery or child minding provision.

There was some very radical thinking indeed from Jenny Rathbone, which is to be welcomed. That is why we are calling on the Welsh Government to have a review—so that ideas such as the ones that were put forward by Jenny can be included in that review, and we can have a debate about how we can make some of these changes.

Canolbwyntiodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Eluned Parrott, ar effaith economaidd peidio â chael digon o ofal plant i alluogi menywod—ac mae hyn yn ymwneud â chreu dewisiadau i fenywod, ac i dadau—sydd am ddychwelyd i'r gwaith i allu gwneud hynny, ac ar yr angen i ganolbwyntio ar ddarpariaeth o safon sy'n rhoi'r hyder i rieni ddychwelyd i'r gweithle a gadael eu plant gan fod yn dawel eu meddwl eu bod yn cael gofal priodol. Cyfeiriodd hefyd at yr angen i ystyried annog y sectorau gwahanol i roi dewis i rieni o ran y math o ddarpariaeth y gallant gael gafael arno. Mae gwarchod plant yn enghraifft glasurol—mae'n amgylchedd gwahanol iawn i adael eich plant ynddo na meithrinfa draddodiadol o bosibl.

Rwy'n ddiolchgar i Angela am beidio â chynnig y gwelliant. Mae hynny'n dangos cymhlethdod y mater hwn a'r ffaith bod gan y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan a Llywodraeth Cymru rolau i'w chwarae yn y maes polisi penodol hwn. Mae angen i'r ddwy Lywodraeth gymryd camau er budd teuluoedd. Gall Llywodraeth San Steffan wneud hynny, fel y gwelsom gyda'r mater yn ymwneud ag absenoldeb rhiant a seibiannau treth, ac mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol am ddarparu gofal plant yn benodol.

Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y gallwn fynd i'r afael â'r mater yn ymwneud â newid cymdeithas i werthfawrogi'r proffesiynau gofalu yn fwy, ond rhaid inni, fel arweinwyr gwleidyddol o bob rhan o'r sbectrwm gwleidyddol, wneud mwy i godi proffil ac arwain y ddadl honno er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi'r hyder i'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn y meysydd hyn wneud mwy nag y mae cymdeithas yn ei wneud o bosibl.

Gan droi at gyfraniad Peter Black, dywedodd Julie Morgan ei bod yn beth da bod tadau yn siarad, ond mae'n dda cael rhywun nad yw'n rhiant yn cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Byddai'n gas gennyf feddwl bod pobl yn teimlo ein bod i gyd yn hunanlesol—y rhai ohonom sy'n rhieni—wrth alw am ofal plant gwell a fforddiadwy. I'r rhai nad ydynt yn rhieni, wrth gwrs, mae gwneud pethau'n iawn yn hyn o beth yn cynnig manteision i economi ehangach Cymru. Cydnabu Peter fod gan y Llywodraeth yn wir lawer o ddogfennau a llawer o bolisiau, ond, yr her, bob amser, yw troi'r polisi hwnnw yn ddarpariaeth o ansawdd da ar lawr gwlad. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae angen i bob un ohonom ei gydnabod. Weithiau, nid yw dogfen bolisi dda, ynddi'i hun, yn arwain at y ddarpariaeth o ansawdd uchel yr ydym yn chwilio amdani. Fel y dywedodd Peter, mae hynny'n arbennig o wir am ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg o ystyried y prinder dewis sy'n bodoli i rieni sy'n chwilio am ofal drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Gwn fy mod wedi methu'n druenus yn Aberhonddu â dod o hyd i ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg i'm plant pan oeddent yn ddigon ifanc i fynychu meithrinfa neu ddarpariaeth gwarchod plant.

Cyflwynodd Jenny Rathbone rai syniadau radical iawn yn wir, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Dyna pam rydym yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gynnal adolygiad—fel y gellir cynnwys syniadau fel y rhai a gyflwynwyd gan Jenny yn yr adolygiad hwnnw, a gallwn gael dadl ynglŷn â sut y gallwn wneud rhai o'r newidiadau hyn.

Jenny, like the Minister, raised the issue of Sure Start centres. Just because you say it, that does not mean it is true. Figures actually show that, yes, there have been closures of Sure Start centres, but not the numbers that you have quoted. There have been 65 closures. What the Labour Party likes to do is double count the closure of backroom functions when, actually, they have been merged. The number of parents using Sure Start, accessing Sure Start and benefiting from the service has risen to record levels in England. Over 1 million parents are now accessing those services, according not to Government sources, not to Liberal Democrat sources, but to independent, charitable sources—higher numbers than there have ever been—and 73% of children's centres have reported an increase in the number of children that they are dealing with.

Julie, I am devastated. Having listened to your description of the event yesterday, I am really sorry that I was not able to attend. After all, who could resist the opportunity to listen to and to gaze upon our colleague Jeff Cuthbert? Who could resist the opportunity? [Laughter.] Jeff, Michael Sheen has got nothing on you. I could not agree more with you on the constraints that currently exist within the Flying Start programme. That is why we are calling for the Government to review this, and to look at what can be done to ensure that those constraints can be overcome. You are quite right—we need to look at a greater diversity within the workplace so that we have men working in these caring professions.

I would like to thank the Deputy Minister for his response to the debate. As I said, the Welsh Liberal Democrats support very much the principle of Flying Start, but I was slightly concerned to hear your response to Angela Burns about the evaluation report. An evaluation report should be used as a tool to improve the policy. Your gut instinct should not be to suddenly say that what is in the evaluation report does not matter. There are good things within that evaluation report, but it does give us the opportunity to improve the policy that your Government is delivering.

Cododd Jenny, fel y Gweinidog, y mater yn ymwneud â chanolfannau Cychwyn Cadarn. Nid yw'r ffaith eich bod yn dweud hynny yn golygu ei fod yn wir. Mewn gwirionedd, dengys ffigurau fod rhai canolfannau Cychwyn Cadarn yn wir wedi'u cau, ond nid i'r graddau a ddyfynnwyd gennych. Caewyd 65 o ganolfannau. Yr hyn y mae'r Blaid Lafur yn hoffi ei wneud wrth gyfrif nifer y swyddogaethau ystafell gefn a gaewyd yw eu dyblu, er eu bod, mewn gwirionedd, wedi eu huno. Mae nifer y rhieni sy'n defnyddio Cychwyn Cadarn ac yn cael budd o'r gwasanaeth wedi cynyddu i'r lefelau uchaf erioed yn Lloegr. Mae dros filiwn o rieni bellach yn manteisio ar y gwasanaethau hynny, yn ôl ffynonellau elusennol annibynnol, yn hytrach na rhai'r Llywodraeth a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—y niferoedd uchaf erioed—ac mae 73% o ganolfannau plant wedi nodi cynnydd yn nifer y plant y maent yn delio â hwy.

Rwy'n siomedig, Julie. Ar ôl gwranddo ar eich disgrifiad o'r digwyddiad ddoe, mae'n wir ddrwg gennyf na allwn fod yn bresennol. Wedi'r cyfan, pwy allai wrthod y cyfle i wrando a syllu ar eich cyd-Aelod, Jeff Cuthbert? Pwy allai wrthod y cyfle? [Chwerthin.] Jeff, nid oes cymhariaeth rhyngoch chi a Michael Sheen. Ni allwn gytuno â chi'n fwy o ran y cyfyngiadau sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd o fewn rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg. Dyna pam rydym yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i adolygu hyn, ac i ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei wneud i sicrhau y gellir goresgyn y cyfyngiadau hynny. Rydych yn llygad eich lle—mae angen inni ystyried mwy o amrywiaeth yn y gweithle er mwyn annog dynion i weithio yn y proffesiynau gofal hyn.

Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am ei ymateb i'r ddadl. Fel y dywedais, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'n fawr iawn egwyddor Dechrau'n Deg, ond roeddwn ychydig yn bryderus wrth glywed eich ymateb i Angela Burns am yr adroddiad gwerthuso. Dylid defnyddio adroddiad gwerthuso fel modd i wella'r polisi. Ni ddylech wrth reddf ddweud yn sydyn nad yw'r hyn sydd yn yr adroddiad gwerthuso yn bwysig. Ceir pethau da yn yr adroddiad gwerthuso, ond mae'n rhoi'r cyfle inni wella'r polisi y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei gyflwyno.

17:47

## Vaughan Gething [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

To be fair, I think that it is a point about understanding what the evaluation report is saying. I am not dismissing the evaluation report, and it is being used to help drive improved quality within Flying Start. It is simply about the understanding of the difference in the comparison groups.

A bod yn deg, credaf ei bod yn ymwneud â deall beth mae'r adroddiad gwerthuso yn ei ddweud. Nid wyf yn diystyru'r adroddiad gwerthuso, ac mae'n cael ei ddefnyddio i helpu i wella ansawdd darpariaeth Dechrau'n Deg. Mae'n ymwneud yn syml â deall y gwahaniaeth yn y grwpiau cymharu.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)



**Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you for that clarification. As I said, what is the point of carrying out an evaluation report if the Government does not take the opportunity to learn from that and improve the policy and the services? As we have just heard from Julie Morgan, your colleague, there are things that are constraining within the current Flying Start policy. You said that you are glad that it is unashamedly targeted, but there are children who could benefit from that provision who find themselves living in poverty, in need of that service, but because they do not live in an area of greater levels of deprivation, such as in Cardiff North, they are missing out. That is why we want that review—to make sure that we can pick up and capture as many children within that programme as we possibly can, and to make it the best programme that it possibly can be.

Diolch ichi am yr eglurhad hwnnw. Fel y dywedais, beth yw diben cynnal adroddiad gwerthuso os nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn manteisio ar y cyfle i ddysgu a gwella'r polisi a'r gwasanaethau? Fel rydym newydd glywed gan Julie Morgan, eich cyd-Aelod, mae agweddau ar y polisi Dechrau'n Deg cyfredol sy'n ei rwystro. Dywedasoeh eich bod yn falch ei fod yn cael ei dargedu'n ddiedifgar, ond mae plant a allai gael budd o'r ddarpariaeth honno sy'n byw mewn tlodi, ac y mae angen y gwasanaeth hwnnw arnynt, ond am nad ydynt yn byw mewn ardal o lefelau uwch o amddifadedd, fel yng Ngogledd Caerdydd, maent yn colli allan. Dyna pam yr ydym yn galw ar yr adolygiad hwnnw—er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn nodi a chynnig y rhaglen i gynifer o blant â phosibl, a sicrhau ein bod yn darparu'r rhaglen orau bosibl.

Information services are currently not accessible. I am glad that you talked about Welsh. If you are interested in expanding Welsh provision, and good-quality Welsh provision, then perhaps you could ensure that level 5 qualifications in caring for children through the medium of Welsh could be delivered in Wales. They are currently not.

Nid yw gwasanaethau gwybodaeth yn hygyrch ar hyn o bryd. Rwy'n falch eich bod wedi sôn am y Gymraeg. Os oes gennych ddiddordeb mewn ehangu darpariaeth Gymraeg, a darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg o ansawdd da, yna efallai y galloch sicrhau bod modd darparu cymwysterau lefel 5 mewn gofalu am blant drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yng Nghymru. Nid ydynt ar gael ar hyn o bryd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? There is objection, so I defer voting until voting time, which now follows. Are there three Members who wish for the bell to be rung? There are not.

Y cynnig yw cytuno ar y cynnig heb ei wella. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Ceir gwrthwynebiad, felly gohiriaf y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio, sy'n dilyn nawr. A oes tri Aelod sy'n dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Nid oes.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.*

*Voting deferred until voting time.*

**Cyfnod Pleidleisio****Voting Time**

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar gynnis NDM5438.](#)

[Result of the vote on motion NDM5438.](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig: O blaid 10, Yn erbyn 43, Ymatal 0.*

*Motion not agreed: For 10, Against 43, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 1 i gynnis NDM5438.](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 1 to motion NDM5438.](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 27, Yn erbyn 27, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment not agreed: For 27, Against 27, Abstain 0.*

*Fel sy'n ofynnol o dan Reol Sefydlog 6.20, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw drwy bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant.*

*As required by Standing Order 6.20, the Deputy Presiding Officer exercised his casting vote by voting against the amendment.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 2 i gynnis NDM5438.](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 2 to motion NDM5438.](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 26, Yn erbyn 27, Ymatal 1.*

*Amendment not agreed: For 26, Against 27, Abstain 1.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar gynnis NDM5439.](#)

[Result of the vote on motion NDM5439.](#)

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig: O blaid 16, Yn erbyn 38, Ymatal 0.*

*Motion not agreed: For 16, Against 38, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 1 i gynnis NDM5439.](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 1 to motion NDM5439.](#)

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 37, Yn erbyn 17, Ymatal 0.

Amendment agreed: For 37, Against 17, Abstain 0.

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 2 i gynnis NDM5439.](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 2 to motion NDM5439.](#)

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 27, Yn erbyn 17, Ymatal 10.

Amendment agreed: For 27, Against 17, Abstain 10.

Cafodd gwelliant 3 ei ddad-ddethol.

Amendment 3 deselected.

Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 4.

Amendment 4 not moved.

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 5 i gynnis NDM5439.](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 5 to motion NDM5439.](#)

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 37, Yn erbyn 17, Ymatal 0.

Amendment agreed: For 37, Against 17, Abstain 0.

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 6 i gynnis NDM5439.](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 6 to motion NDM5439.](#)

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 37, Yn erbyn 17, Ymatal 0.

Amendment agreed: For 37, Against 17, Abstain 0.

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 7 i gynnis NDM5439.](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 7 to motion NDM5439.](#)

Derbyniwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 49, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.

Amendment agreed: For 49, Against 5, Abstain 0.

Cafodd gwelliant 8 ei ddad-ddethol.

Amendment 8 deselected.

Cynnig NDM5439 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Motion NDM5439 as amended:

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn cydnabod y gall gofal plant fforddiadwy, hygyrch ac o safon uchel fod yn allweddol i economi gryfach a chymdeithas decach, gan alluogi rhieni i ddychwelyd i'r gwaith, lleihau tiodi plant a helpu plant i gael y dechrau gorau mewn bywyd.

1. Recognises that affordable, accessible and high quality childcare can be the key to a stronger economy and fairer society, enabling parents to return to work, reducing child poverty and helping children to have the best start in life.

2. Yn nodi methiant Llywodraeth y DU i weithredu ynghylch credydau treth ar gyfer gofal plant yr ochr hon i'r etholiad cyffredinol, yn mynegi pryder bod adnoddau'n cael eu cymryd oddi ar deuluoedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf ac yn nodi ymhellach bod y rhaglen Cychwyn Cadarn wedi'i dinistrio yn Lloegr, gyda dros 500 o ganolfannau wedi'u cau.

2. Notes the failure of the UK Government to take action on tax credits for childcare this side of the general election, expresses serious concern at their shift of resources away from families in greatest need and further notes the decimation of the Sure Start programme in England with the closure of over 500 centres.

3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i:

3. Calls on the Welsh Government to:

a) asesu'r system hawl i ofal plant cyn-ysgol;

a) assess the system of pre-school childcare entitlement;

b) archwilio effeithiolrwydd Dechrau'n Deg ar rianta a deilliannau datblygu plant a'r anghydraddoldeb yn narpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg y blynyddoedd cynnar;

b) examine the effectiveness of Flying Start on parenting and child development outcomes and the inequality in Welsh medium early years provision;

c) asesu a yw awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio cyllid i'r eithaf ar gyfer darpariaeth statudol o ran lleoedd addysg y blynyddol cynnar ar gyfer plant 3-4 oed;

c) assess whether local authorities are fully utilising funding for the statutory provision of an early years education place for 3-4 year olds;

d) archwilio ffyrdd o wella'r cyflenwad gofal plant ar draws pob oedran, yn arbennig cynlluniau gofal cofleidol a gofal plant yn ystod y gwyliau; ac

e) rhoi eglurder i rieni o ran cymhwysedd am gynlluniau gofal plant yng Nghymru.

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar gynnig NDM5439 fel y'i diwygiwyd.](#)

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig: O blaid 37, Yn erbyn 12, Ymatal 5.*

d) examine ways to improve childcare supply across all ages, in particular wraparound and holiday childcare schemes; and

e) provide clarity for parents on eligibility for childcare schemes in Wales.

[Result of the vote on motion NDM5439 as amended.](#)

*Amendment agreed: For 37, Against 12, Abstain 5.*

17:54

## Dadl Fer: Agor y Porth i Gymru

### Mohammad Asghar [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The title of this debate is 'Opening the Gateway to Wales', and I have agreed that Eluned Parrott may have time to contribute. Thank you, Eluned.

I have great pleasure in opening this debate this afternoon. South Wales East is a gateway to Wales. The purpose of a gateway is to allow the passage of goods and services inwards and outwards. It follows, therefore, that good transport links are vital in creating a growing and thriving economy.

The Conservative-led Government at Westminster has embarked on the biggest rail investment programme since the Victorian era. It is committed to completing the electrification of the main Swansea to London line, thereby reducing journey times, and to electrifying the Valleys Lines. Valleys Lines electrification represents the best value for money that can be made in Wales. It will have a significant effect on the economy of Cardiff and the Valleys—deepening labour markets, improving connectivity and significantly enhancing the attractiveness of the area to investors. It will also reduce the barriers to employment, by helping people access jobs. This investment is in stark contrast to the last Labour Government, which did not electrify one single mile of track in Wales in its 13 years in power at Westminster. We also need to look at increasing the frequency of trains so as to maximise economic benefit to the full.

I am a strong believer in the need to enhance the rail service between Ebbw Vale and Newport. Minister, your predecessor promised well before the Ryder Cup to have that line opened; sadly, that never happened. I very much welcome the announcement of plans for a new railway station at Pye corner in Newport which I have called for in the past few years. I hope that these plans can be progressed as soon as possible.

## Short Debate: Opening the Gateway to Wales

Teitl y ddadl hon yw 'Agor y Porth i Gymru', ac rwyf wedi cytuno y gall Eluned Parrott gael amser i gyfrannu. Diolch ichi, Eluned.

Mae'n bleser mawr agor y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma. Mae Dwyrain De Cymru yn borth i Gymru. Diben porth yw galluogi nwyddau a gwasanaethau i symud i mewn ac allan. Felly, mae'n dilyn bod cysylliadau trafndiaeth da yn hollbwysig i greu economi sy'n tyfu a ffynnu.

Mae'r Llywodraeth a arweinir gan y Ceidwadwyr yn San Steffan wedi cychwyn ar y rhaglen buddsoddi mewn rheilffyrdd fwyaf ers y cyfnod Fictoraidd. Mae wedi ymrwymo i gwblhau'r gwaith o drydaneiddio'r brif linell reilffordd rhwng Abertawe a Llundain, gan leihau'r amser teithio, a thrydaneiddio Rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd. Trydaneiddio Rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd yw'r gwerth gorau mewn arian y gellir ei wneud yng Nghymru. Bydd yn cael effaith fawr ar economi Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd—gan ddyfnhau marchnadoedd llafur, gwella cysylltedd a gwella atyniad yr ardal i fuddsoddwyr yn sylweddol. Bydd hefyd yn lleihau'r rhwystrau i gyflogaeth, drwy helpu pobl i gael gafael ar swyddi. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn mewn gwrthygyferbyniad llwyr â Llywodraeth ddiwethaf y Blaid Lafur, na thrydaneiddiodd un filltir o drac yng Nghymru yn ystod y 13 blynedd y bu mewn grym yn San Steffan. Mae angen inni hefyd edrych ar gynyddu amllder y trenau er mwyn sicrhau'r fantais economaidd fwyaf.

Credaf yn gryf yn yr angen i wella'r gwasanaeth rheilffordd rhwng Glynebwy a Chasnewydd. Weinidog, addawodd eich rhagflaenydd ymhell cyn Cwpan Ryder y byddai'r llinell honno ar agor; yn anffodus, ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Croesawaf yn fawr y cyhoeddiad ynghylch cynlluniau ar gyfer gorsaf reilffordd newydd yn Pye Corner yng Nghasnewydd, yr wyf wedi galw amdani dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Gobeithio y gellir datblygu'r cynlluniau hyn cyn gynted â phosibl.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

It is also welcome that the Conservative-led coalition has acted to facilitate the construction of an M4 relief road to ease pressure around Newport. Successive traffic incidents in recent weeks have demonstrated that the M4 is not fit for purpose. The Welsh Labour Government must now hurry up with plans to start building the M4 relief road to prevent the regular harm and inconvenience that this gridlock causes for businesses, tourists and commuters in the Newport area and the gateway to Wales.

Tolls on the Severn bridge add to the costs facing Welsh businesses. I would urge the Minister to investigate, along with Ministers at Westminster, ways to see what can be done to reduce this burden at the Severn bridges.

Deputy Presiding Officer, I welcome the Welsh Government's commitment to provide an enterprise zone for Ebbw Vale. Enterprise zones are designed to boost a local economy by providing firms with incentives to invest, such as tax breaks. I would ask, however, that the Minister provide a progress report on establishing an enterprise zone in Ebbw Vale. In previous answers, the Minister has indicated the possibility of further sites for enterprise zones being considered. Again, I would ask that the possibility of providing an enterprise zone for Newport be considered. This would enable South Wales East to compete with the zone just across the border in Bristol.

It is very important to allow our businesses to compete by providing high-speed broadband, Minister. Last month the managing director of a Merthyr auction company that employs 40 people selling vehicles to more than 100 countries warned that broadband speeds are too slow for him to keep up with international competition. He fears having to move his internet auction business to England unless high-speed fibre broadband becomes available. Wales cannot afford to lose companies such as this and I would ask the Minister to see what can be done to speed up the commercial roll-out of the Superfast Cymru programme.

Central to growing the economy of South Wales East is the regeneration of the city of Newport. Newport lost 3,400 private sector jobs in 2011-12. Jobs were lost at companies such as Yell, Cassidian, Carpetright and Panasonic. However, new businesses still face too many obstacles when they try to grow. Zone Promotions UK Ltd is a Newport-based company that aims to improve the communication skills of young and disadvantaged people. Its director contacted Newport City Council and Business Wales for advice and support, but he described their response as 'unhelpful' and 'dismissive'. Small businesses such as this must be helped to grow and thrive to offset job losses in the public and private sectors.

Croesewir hefyd y ffaith bod y glymblaid dan arweiniad y Ceidwadwyr wedi gweithredu i hwyluso'r gwaith o adeiladu ffordd liniaru'r M4 i leddfu pwysau o amgylch Casnewydd. Mae digwyddiadau traffig olynol dros yr wythnosau diwethaf wedi dangos nad yw'r M4 yn addas at y diben. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru frysio yn awr gyda chynlluniau i ddechrau adeiladu ffordd liniaru'r M4 er mwyn atal y difrod a'r anghyfleustra cyson y mae'r dagfa hon yn eu hachosi i fusnesau, twristiaid a chymudwyr yn ardal Casnewydd a'r porth i Gymru.

Mae tollau ar bont Hafren yn ychwanegu at y costau sy'n wynebu busnesau Cymru. Byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog i ymchwilio, ynghyd â Gweinidogion yn San Steffan, i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i leihau'r baich hwn ar bontydd Hafren.

Ddirprwy Lywydd, croesawaf ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i ddarparu ardal fenter ar gyfer Glynebwy. Cynllunnir ardaloedd menter i hybu economi leol drwy roi cymhellion i gwmnïau fuddsoddi, megis seibiannau treth. Byddwn yn gofyn, fodd bynnag, i'r Gweinidog ddarparu adroddiad cynnydd ar sefydlu ardal fenter yng Nglynebwy. Mewn atebion blaenorol, mae'r Gweinidog wedi nodi'r posibilrwydd o ystyried safleoedd pellach ar gyfer ardaloedd menter. Unwaith eto, byddwn yn gofyn i'r posibilrwydd o ddarparu ardal fenter i Gasnewydd gael ei ystyried. Byddai hyn yn galluogi Dwyrain De Cymru i gystadlu â'r ardal ychydig dros y ffin ym Mryste.

Mae'n bwysig iawn er mwyn galluogi ein busnesau i gystadlu drwy ddarparu band eang cyflym, Weinidog. Fis diwethaf, rhybuddiodd rheolwr gyfarwyddwr cwmni arwerthiant ym Merthyr sy'n cyflogi 40 o bobl sy'n gwerthu cerbydau i fwy na 100 o wledydd fod cyflymderau band eang yn rhy araf iddo ac na all gystadlu â chwmnïau rhyngwladol. Mae'n ofni y bydd yn gorfod symud ei fusnes arwerthiant ar y rhyngwrwd i Loegr oni bai bod band eang ffeibr cyflymder uchel ar gael. Ni all Cymru fforddio colli cwmnïau fel hyn a byddwn yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog weld beth y gellir ei wneud i gyflymu'r broses fasnachol o gyflwyno rhaglen Cyflymu Cymru.

Mae adfywio dinas Casnewydd yn ganolog i dyfu economi Dwyrain De Cymru. Collodd Casnewydd 3,400 o swyddi yn y sector preifat yn 2011-12. Collwyd swyddi mewn cwmnïau fel Yell, Cassidian, Carpetright a Panasonic. Fodd bynnag, mae busnesau newydd yn dal i wynebu gormod o rwystrau wrth geisio tyfu. Cwmni yng Nghasnewydd yw Zone Promotions UK sy'n ceisio gwella sgiliau cyfathrebu pobl ifanc a phobl dan anfantais. Cysylltodd ei gyfarwyddwr â Chyngor Dinas Casnewydd a Busnes Cymru i gael cyngor a chymorth, ond disgrifiodd eu hmateb fel 'da i ddim' a 'diystyriol'. Rhaid helpu busnesau bach fel hyn i dyfu a ffynnu er mwyn gwrthbwyso colledion swyddi yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat.

Over the last decade, a number of issues have caused parts of the city centre to become dilapidated. At present, Newport has the second-highest shop vacancy rate of all city and town centres in the United Kingdom. That is a sad fact. Nearly 29% of shops are unoccupied in Newport according to the Local Data Company's latest report. The construction of the Friars Walk complex is greatly needed. The plans require the removal of the Capitol car park, shops in John Frost Square and Newport bus station. This will benefit businesses in the city in the long term. However, the current demolition work associated with this regeneration has caused disruption to bus routes and pedestrian access. This has resulted in a fall in the number of shoppers in the city. I fully support the chamber of trade in its efforts to get business rates reduced for those city centre traders adversely affected by this redevelopment work.

Minister, on this side of the Chamber we have been saying for a long time that business rates must be considered; relief for businesses with a rateable value of under £12,000 is not good enough. I think that we have to increase that band, especially for those businesses that want to set up in the Newport area. Not a single shop in the high street has a rateable value of below £20,000. That is a fact. Why can you not create a band where people can start a business, pay lower bands of rates and gradually increase those rates when the business establishes in due course?

I hope that the Valuation Office Agency acts to ensure that those existing traders receive the support that they need at this difficult time.

Finally, I very much welcome the announcement by the Prime Minister that the 2014 National Atlantic Treaty Organisation summit is to be held in the United Kingdom for the first time since 1990. I am delighted that the Celtic Manor Resort in Newport has been chosen as the venue for this summit. We know very well that the Ryder Cup came there a few years ago. I do not think that we have, in a true sense, banked the popularity of that great sporting event to build up Newport's economy. Sadly, we missed that opportunity, but we should not miss this NATO opportunity to improve the place of south-east Wales on the world map.

Last year, Sir Terry Matthews announced a £160 million development plan for the Celtic Manor Resort over the next 10 years, which is very good news. That will create more than 200 new permanent jobs on the site, which is more good news. This announcement of plans for a major extension of the hotel will further enhance the Celtic Manor Resort with its first-class facilities as a venue for major events worldwide.

Dros y degawd diwethaf, mae nifer o faterion wedi achosi i rannau o ganol y ddinas ddirywio. Ar hyn o bryd, Casnewydd sydd â'r gyfradd uchaf ond un o'r siopau gwag o blith holl ganol trefi a dinasoedd y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hynny'n ffaith drist. Mae bron i 29% o siopau yn wag yng Nghasnewydd yn ôl adroddiad diweddaraf y Local Data Company. Mae dirfawr angen adeiladu canolfan siopa Friars Walk. Yn ôl y cynlluniau mae angen cael gwared ar faes parcio'r Capitol, siopau yn Sgwâr John Frost a gorsaf fysiau Casnewydd. Bydd hyn o fudd i fusnesau yn y ddinas yn y tymor hir. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gwaith dymchwel presennol sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gwaith adfywio hwn wedi tarfu ar lwybrau bysiau a mynediad i gerddwyr. Mae hyn wedi arwain at ostyngiad yn nifer y siopwyr yn y ddinas. Rwy'n llwyr gefnogi'r siambr fasnach yn ei hymdrechion i leihau ardrethi buses i'r masnachwyr canol y ddinas hynny y mae'r gwaith ailddatblygu hwn yn effeithio'n andwyol arnynt.

Weinidog, ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr rydym wedi bod yn sôn ers cryn amser bod yn rhaid i ardrethi busnes gael eu hystyried; nid yw rhyddhad i fusnesau sydd â gwerth ardrethol o lai na £12,000 yn ddigon da. Credaf fod yn rhaid inni gynyddu'r band hwnnw, yn enwedig i'r busnesau hynny sydd eisiau ymsefydlu yn ardal Casnewydd. Nid oes gan un siop ar y stryd fawr werth ardrethol o lai nag £20,000. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Pam na allwch greu band lle y gall pobl ddechrau busnes, talu bandiau ardrethi is a chynyddu'n raddol yr ardrethi hynny pan fydd y busnes yn ymsefydlu maes o law?

Gobeithio y bydd Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio yn gweithredu i sicrhau bod y masnachwyr hynny'n cael y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt ar yr adeg anodd hon.

Yn olaf, croesawaf yn fawr y cyhoeddiad gan y Prif Weinidog y caiff uwchgynhadledd NATO 2014 ei chynnal yn y Deyrnas Unedig am y tro cyntaf ers 1990. Rwyf wrth fy modd bod Gwesty'r Celtic Manor yng Nghasnewydd wedi cael ei ddewis fel y lleoliad ar gyfer yr uwchgynhadledd hon. Gwyddom yn dda i Gwpan Ryder fynd yno rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Ni chredaf ein bod wedi bancio poblogrwydd y digwyddiad chwaraeon gwych hwnnw er mwyn hybu economi Casnewydd. Yn anffodus, collwyd y cyfle hwnnw, ond ni ddylem goll'i'r cyfle hwn o ran uwchgynhadledd NATO i wella lle de-ddwyrain Cymru ar fap y byd.

Y llynedd, cyhoeddodd Syr Terry Matthews gynllun datblygu gwerth £160 miliwn ar gyfer Gwesty'r Celtic Manor dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf, sy'n newyddion da iawn. Bydd hynny'n creu mwy na 200 o swyddi parhaol newydd ar y safle, sy'n rhagor o newyddion da. Bydd y cynlluniau a gyhoeddwyd ar gyfer estyniad enfawr i'r gwesty yn gwella Gwesty'r Celtic Manor ymhellach gyda'i gyfleusterau gwych fel lleoliad ar gyfer digwyddiadau o bwys ledled y byd.

For some time, I have been aware of the need for a Welsh international convention centre. Two years ago, when I proposed my enterprise Bill, Minister, you will remember that I said that if we are to improve our economy, we have to improve not only the airport, but also the convention centres, hospitality areas and tourist areas, with all these areas virtually coming from south-east Wales. The M4 and the high-speed train come from England towards Swansea. We have to look very seriously at this. Newport is in one of the most prime positions in Wales, because it is between two of the best cities—Cardiff and Bristol. We are not utilising that for the best opportunity that we can produce. We have the most scenic views in that area, such as the Severn bridge, Tintern abbey and Raglan castle. The dual-carriageway Heads of the Valleys road is one of the most scenic roads. There is also the A467 dual carriageway, which comes from Brynmawr to Newport. Three tracks of road, one railway and the river go side by side. It is a breath-taking sight when you travel along that route, especially late evening in the summertime. It is the most beautiful area. However, sadly, there are no services on those roads and the lighting system needs to be taken care of. Those are the best parts of the United Kingdom. We should promote them, as south-east Wales can create a lot of great economic benefit for the whole of Wales in the long term.

South Wales needs a world-class conference venue to attract conference delegates, who can provide a significant financial boost to the retail and hospitality sectors. I hope that Newport will be the location for the Wales international convention centre, although I am aware that plans are progressing for this to be located in Cardiff. I am quite happy with that, as long as the Celtic Manor in Newport also develops.

I have chosen to make Newport my home for many years; I have been living there for 44 years. I believe that Newport and South Wales East have the potential to become the economic powerhouse of the whole of Wales. By a combination of vision, leadership and action, we can create the conditions that will allow the economy here to grow and thrive, and I am sure that the Conservatives will deliver on that one day.

Ers peth amser, rwyf wedi bod yn ymwybodol o'r angen am ganolfan gonfensiwn ryngwladol i Gymru. Ddwly flynedd yn ôl, pan gynigiais fy Mil menter, Weinidog, fe gofwich imi ddweud, er mwyn inni wella ein heconomi, fod yn rhaid inni, nid yn unig wella'r maes awyr, ond hefyd y canolfannau confensiwn, yr ardaloedd lletygarwch a thwristiaid, ac mae bron pob un o'r ardaloedd hyn yn y de-ddwyrain. Daw'r M4 a'r trêen cyflym o Loegr tuag at Abertawe. Rhaid inni edrych o ddirif ar hyn. Mae Casnewydd yn un o'r lleoliadau gorau yng Nghymru, gan ei bod rhwng dwy o'r dinasoedd gorau—Caerdydd a Bryste. Nid ydym yn defnyddio'r lleoliad er mwyn sicrhau'r cyfle gorau posibl. Mae gennym olygfeydd hardd yn yr ardal honno, megis Pont Hafren, Abaty Tyndyrn a Chastell Rhaglan. Mae ffordd ddeuol Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn un o'r ffyrdd golygfaol gorau. Ceir hefyd ffordd ddeuol yr A467, sy'n dod o Fryn-mawr i Gasnewydd. Mae tair ffordd, un rheilffordd a'r afon yn cyd-redeg. Mae'n olygfa wych wrth deithio ar hyd y ffordd honno, yn enwedig ym min y nos yn ystod yr haf. Mae'n ardal hynod o brydferth. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, nid oes unrhyw wasanaethau ar y ffyrdd hynny ac mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r system goleuo. Yr ardaloedd hyn yw rhannau gorau'r Deyrnas Unedig. Dylem eu hyrwyddo, oherwydd gall y de-ddwyrain greu llawer o fuddiannau economaidd mawr i Gymru gyfan yn yr hirdymor.

Mae angen lleoliad cynadledda o'r radd flaenaf yn y de i ddenu cynadleddwyr, a all roi hwb ariannol sylweddol i'r sectorau manwerthu a lletygarwch. Gobeithio mai Casnewydd fydd y lleoliad ar gyfer canolfan gonfensiwn ryngwladol Cymru, er fy mod yn ymwybodol bod cynlluniau'n mynd rhagddynt i leoli'r ganolfan yng Nghaerdydd. Rwy'n ddigon bodlon ar hynny, cyhyd â bod Gwesty'r Celtic Manor yng Nghasnewydd yn datblygu hefyd.

Rwyf wedi dewis byw yng Nghasnewydd ers blynyddoedd lawer; rwyf wedi bod yn byw yno ers 44 o flynyddoedd. Credaf fod gan Gasnewydd a Dwyrain De Cymru y potensial i fod yn bwerdy economaidd i Gymru gyfan. Drwy gyfuniad o weledigaeth, arweinyddiaeth a gweithredu, gallwn greu'r amodau a fydd yn caniatáu i'r economi yma dyfu a ffynnu, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd y Ceidwadwyr yn cyflawni hynny un diwrnod.

18:07

## Eluned Parrott [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Member for bringing forward the debate today. As an Abergavenny girl, it is always a pleasure to hear people praise the beauties of the local area. We will even forgive you for appropriating the town's slogan, 'gateway to Wales', as well on this occasion. I thank you especially for your focus on rail and infrastructure and the opportunity that that new investment that we are seeing now is going to bring to south-east Wales, not only the immediate investment in terms of the jobs that that can bring in and of itself, but the long-term benefits of bringing south-east Wales within that magic two hours of London and the south-east. It is one of the world's great megacities and a wonderful opportunity for us in terms of bringing inward investment and trading with the great foreign entity that is England.

Diolch i'r Aelod am gyflwyno'r ddatlled hddiw. Fel merch o'r Fenni, mae bob amser yn bleser clywed pobl yn canmol harddwch yr ardal leol. Fe wnawn hyd yn oed faddau i chi am ddwyn slogan y dref, 'porth i Gymru', hefyd ar yr achlysur hwn. Diolch ichi yn arbennig am ganolbwyntio ar y rheilffyrdd a'r seilwaith a'r cyfle y bydd y buddsoddiad newydd hwnnw, a welwn bellach, yn ei roi i'r de-ddwyrain, nid yn unig y buddsoddiad uniongyrchol o ran y swyddi y gall y buddsoddiad ei hun eu denu a'r swyddi y bydd yn eu creu ei hun, ond buddiannau hirdymor dod â'r de-ddwyrain o fewn y ddwy awr hudolus hynny o Lundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr. Hon yw un o ddinasoedd mawr mwyaf y byd ac mae'n gyfle gwych inni o ran denu mewnfuddsoddiad a masnachu â'r endid mawr dros y ffin, sef Lloegr.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)



Of course, transport is not only about moving people. It is also about moving things. As we seek to develop a manufacturing base for Wales, we need to look at freight infrastructure as well. I think that there is a need to create greater capacity in our rail network. We also have untapped potential in our forgotten ports, for things like short sea shipping for some of our freight.

Finally, I am very concerned, as you are, about the plight of retailers in Newport city centre, who have seen a catastrophic crash in footfall through the high streets there and are now facing business rate bills that are even more expensive than their rental bills. That is a tragic situation. We see, just by visiting Newport, the impact that that is having on businesses there. You mentioned the Ryder Cup and the opportunity it presented us to bring investment into Newport particularly. I wonder whether the Minister can, perhaps, talk to us about the lessons that the Welsh Government learnt from the experience of hosting the Ryder Cup and how it thinks that it will be able to harness the benefits of hosting the NATO summit, for the people of Newport specifically.

Wrth gwrs, nid oes a wnelo trafndiaeth â symud pobl yn unig. Mae a wnelo hefyd â symud pethau. Wrth inni geisio datblygu sylfaen weithgynhyrchu i Gymru, mae angen inni edrych ar y seilwaith cludo nwyddau hefyd. Credaf fod angen creu mwy o gapasiti yn ein rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd. Mae gennym hefyd botensial heb ei gyffwrdd yn ein porthladdoedd anghofiedig, ar gyfer pethau fel morgludiant byr i rai o'n nwyddau.

Yn olaf, rwy'n bryderus iawn, fel chithau, am y sefyllfa ofnadwy i fanwerthwyr yng nghanol dinas Casnewydd, sydd wedi gweld lleihad trychinebus yn nifer y siopwyr ar y stryd fawr ac sydd bellach yn wynebu biliau ardrethi busnes sydd hyd yn oed yn ddrutach na'u biliau rhent. Mae hynny'n sefyllfa enbyd. Gwelwn, drwy ymweld â Chasnewydd, yr effaith y mae hynny'n ei chael ar fusnesau yno. Soniasoch am Gwpan Ryder a'r cyfle a gawsom i ddenu buddsoddiadau i Gasnewydd yn benodol. Tybed a all y Gweinidog, efallai, siarad â ni am y gwersi a ddysgodd Llywodraeth Cymru o ganlyniad i'r profiad o gynnal Cwpan Ryder a sut y mae'n credu y bydd yn gallu defnyddio buddiannau cynnal uwchgynhadledd NATO, ar gyfer pobl Casnewydd yn benodol.

18:09 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport to speak—Edwina Hart.

Galwaf ar Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth i siarad—Edwina Hart.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

18:09 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth / The Minister for Economy, Science and Transport*

Indeed, we do live in a beautiful country. The entry into Wales, whether it is in the north or the south, is exceptionally beautiful in every direction you come. It is very important that we harness the opportunities that that gives us in terms of tourism, business and investment opportunities. It is, indeed, a great honour for Wales, in terms of Newport, to be hosting the NATO summit. It will mean an awful lot of work, not just for those directly involved from the Foreign and Commonwealth Office in the UK Government, but for us in terms of how matters will be dealt with in terms of rail, the use of the airport and all those matters. What we can safely say about it is that events that might happen after it will certainly put Wales on the map. We have to build on the excellent experience that we had with the Ryder Cup, which put Wales on the map. With regard to the comments about the Celtic Manor, we of course have been very supportive of the Celtic Manor, as you are aware, and Sir Terry Matthews's proposals, but that does not stop us from being supportive of developments elsewhere, as long as we have the appropriate business plans presented to us in many areas.

Yn wir, rydym yn byw mewn gwlad brydferth. Mae'r daith i mewn i Gymru, boed yn y gogledd neu'r de, yn eithriadol o hardd i bob cyfeiriad. Mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn defnyddio'r cyfleoedd a rydd hynny inni o ran cyfleoedd twristiaeth, busnes a buddsoddi. Yn wir, mae'n anrhydedd mawr i Gymru, o ran Casnewydd, gynnal uwchgynhadledd NATO. Bydd yn golygu llawer iawn o waith, nid yn unig i'r rheini sy'n uniongyrchol gysylltiedig â'r Swyddfa Dramor a Chymanwlad yn Llywodraeth y DU, ond hefyd i ni o ran sut yr ymdrinnir â materion o ran rheilffyrdd, y defnydd o feysydd awyr a'r holl faterion hynny. Yr hyn y gallwn ei ddweud yn bendant am hyn yw y gallai digwyddiadau ar ôl hyn yn sicr roi Cymru ar y map. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar y profiad rhagorol a gawsom gyda Chwpan Ryder, a roddodd Gymru ar y map. O ran y sylwadau ar Westy'r Celtic Manor, rydym yn gwrs wedi bod yn gefnogol iawn i'r Celtic Manor, fel y gwyddoch, a chynigion Syr Terry Matthews, ond nid yw hynny'n ein hatal rhag bod yn gefnogol i ddatblygiadau mewn mannau eraill, cyhyd ag y cyflwynir y cynlluniau busnes priodol inni mewn sawl ardal.

I am very much taken by the issue of infrastructure projects. Obviously, we are delighted across the Chamber with the proposals for rail electrification from London to Swansea and the Valleys lines. As the Prime Minister said, this is exciting. It is going to be done, and it is going to be paid for, and the knock-on effects of Valleys electrification, I think, will certainly ensure that we have good infrastructure for the future. The work then on the metro, which is also being undertaken around that, is a very worthwhile development.

Mae'r mater ynghylch prosiectau seilwaith o ddi-ddordeb mawr i mi. Yn amlwg, mae pob un ohonon wrth ein boddau gyda'r cynigion ar gyfer trydaneiddio'r rheilffyrdd o Lundain i Abertawe a rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd. Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, mae hyn yn gyffrous. Caiff ei wneud, a thelir amdano, a bydd effeithiau canlyniadol trydaneiddio rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd, fe gredaf, yn sicr yn gwneud yn siŵr bod gennym seilwaith da i'r dyfodol. Mae'r gwaith wedyn ar y metro, sydd hefyd yn cael ei wneud, yn ddatblygiad gwerth chweil iawn.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

In terms of south-east Wales, we obviously have the city region approach now, and one of the key projects is the metro, in terms of transport infrastructure and how we get people to and from work, which is also key within this environment. When you look at the links, particularly from London, I was very taken by Eluned Parrott's point that London is the gateway to our world as well, and it is very important that we recognise that London is a centre in terms of cash coming in, but we want that cash to go further than the south-east, so our links are very important in that particular area.

Obviously, some of the discussion has focused around Newport city centre, which I am not responsible for. Issues have obviously been raised around business rates, and of course we are very pleased to have had those devolved. It does give us the opportunity to look at the business rate regime. It is very interesting to see the calls for a wholesale review of business rates now across the UK that have come across our desks. In terms of Newport, we did support, as you know, a private sector group, the Newport Business Development Task Force, to look at some of the issues. That was chaired by Simon Gibson, the chief executive of Wesley Clover Corporation, and it highlighted what Newport could become, which is an innovation place. We are now giving money for feasibility as to how we can manage those issues within Newport.

O ran y de-ddwyrain, mae'n amlwg bod gennym y dull dinas-ranbarth o weithredu bellach, ac un o'r prosiectau allweddol yw'r metro, o ran seilwaith trafnidiaeth a sut i sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu teithio yn ôl ac ymlaen i'r gwaith, sydd hefyd yn allweddol yn yr amgylchedd hwn. Pan edrychych ar y cysylltiadau, yn enwedig o Lundain, cefais fy mhlesio'n fawr gan bwynt Eluned Parrott mai Llundain yw'r porth i'n byd ni hefyd, ac mae'n bwysig iawn ein bod yn cydnabod bod Llundain yn ganolfan o ran arian yn dod i mewn, ond rydym am i'r arian hwnnw fynd ymhellach na de-ddwyrain Lloegr, felly mae ein cysylltiadau yn bwysig iawn yn yr ardal benodol honno.

Yn amlwg, mae rhywfaint o'r drafodaeth wedi canolbwyntio ar ganol dinas Casnewydd, nad wyf yn gyfrifol amdani. Codwyd materion yn amlwg ynghylch ardrethi busnes, ac wrth gwrs rydym yn falch iawn bod y rheini wedi'u datganoli. Rhydd gyfle inni edrych ar y gyfundrefn ardrethi busnes. Mae'n ddiddorol iawn gweld y galwadau a gawsom am adolygiad cyffredinol o ardrethi busnes bellach ledled y DU. O ran Casnewydd, gwnaethom, fel y gwyyddoch, gefnogi grŵp yn y sector preifat, Tasglu Datblygu Busnes Casnewydd, i ystyried rhai o'r materion. Fe'i cadeiriwyd gan Simon Gibson, prif weithredwr Wesley Clover Corporation, a thynnodd sylw at yr hyn y gallai Casnewydd anelu ato, sef lleoliad arloesol. Rydym bellach yn rhoi arian ar gyfer dichonoldeb o ran sut y gallwn reoli'r materion hynny yng Nghasnewydd.

18:12 **Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Will you give way?

A wnewch chi ildio?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

18:12 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

It is very important to recognise that Newport, given where it is in relation to England, has the opportunity in terms of attracting businesses across from Bristol, but also providing homes, dare I say, for people who might work in Bristol. So, there is that. We are very keen to be supporting the work that was undertaken by Simon Gibson.

Mae'n bwysig iawn cydnabod bod gan Gasnewydd, o ystyried ei lleoliad mewn perthynas â Lloegr, gyfle i ddenu busnesau o Fryste, ond hefyd i ddarparu cartrefi, mentraf ddweud, i bobl sy'n gweithio efallai ym Mryste. Felly, mae hynny i'w ystyried. Rydym yn awyddus iawn i gefnogi'r gwaith a wnaed gan Simon Gibson.

There are also issues around the Severn crossing.

Mae problemau hefyd ynghylch croesfan Hafren.

18:12 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Do you want to take an intervention?

A ydych eisiau derbyn ymyriad?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

18:12 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

No, may I just carry on and finish on the Severn crossing? The Severn crossing is an issue that constantly gets raised with all of us. At present, we have no control over the amount charged for the Severn tolls, as Members will be aware. Although part of the Severn crossing lies within Wales, it is of course the UK Government's strategic road network and the Department for Transport is responsible for it. We do have concerns about the economic impact of tolls, and we have published research that quantified that in November 2012. We have made our position as a Government quite clear: we would want to have a say on the future of tolls after the end of the current concession agreement and, in future, the revenue raised should be used to fund infrastructure that benefits Wales and would benefit Welsh businesses, which I think would be very important.

Na, a gaf i barhau a gorffen drwy sôn am groesfan Hafren? Mae croesfan Hafren yn fater a godir gyda ni drwy'r amser. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gennym reolaeth dros y swm a godir ar gyfer tollau Croesfan Hafren, fel y gwyr yr Aelodau. Er bod rhan o groesfan Hafren yng Nghymru, rhwydwaith ffyrdd strategol Llywodraeth y DU ydyw a'r Adran Drafnidiaeth sy'n gyfrifol amdani. Mae gennym bryderon am effaith economaidd y tollau, ac rydym wedi cyhoeddi ymchwil a feintiolodd hynny ym mis Tachwedd 2012. Rydym wedi mynegi ein safbwynt fel Llywodraeth yn eithaf clir: byddem am ddylanwadu ar ddyfodol tollau ar ôl diwedd y cytundeb consesiwn cyfredol ac, yn y dyfodol, dylai'r referniw a godir gael ei ddefnyddio i ariannu seilwaith sydd o fudd i Gymru ac a fyddai o fudd i fusnesau yng Nghymru, a fyddai'n bwysig iawn yn fy marn i.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I will give way.

Ildiaf.

18:13 **Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Going back to the Newport issue, would you agree with me that basic mistakes have been made in Newport, such as not putting the bus station next to the railway station? If you actually did that and had a proper integrated public transport system in somewhere like Newport, as the Enterprise and Business Committee has recommended, then you would find that people would find it a lot easier to get around and that would boost the town centre economy.

Gan ddechwyn at fater Casnewydd, a fydddech yn cytuno â mi bod camgymeriadau sylfaenol wedi'u gwneud yng Nghasnewydd, fel peidio â rhoi'r orsaf fysiau wrth ymyl yr orsaf reilffordd? Pe baech yn gwneud hynny ac yn cael system trafniadaeth gyhoeddus integredig briodol yn rhywle fel Casnewydd, fel yr argymhellwyd gan y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes, yna bydddech yn gweld bod pobl yn teithio o gwmpas yn haws a byddai hynny'n rhoi hwb i economi canol y dref.

18:13 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

It is important to recognise that I think that we can look historically at what has happened in a whole range of areas and apportion blame politically, but that is not the point. What we are trying to do now is take a holistic approach to how we deal with transport infrastructure, and that is why I am so keen on looking at the links between buses and trains and trying to take a rather more centralised approach. That is important for us to recognise for the future.

Mae'n bwysig cydnabod y gallwn edrych yn hanesyddol ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd mewn amrywiaeth eang o ardaloedd a rhoi'r bai yn wleidyddol ar rywun, ond nid dyna'r pwynt. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio ei wneud yn awr yn awr mabwysiadu dull cyfannol o ymdrin â seilwaith trafniadaeth, a dyna pam yr wyf mor awyddus i edrych ar y cysylltiadau rhwng bysiau a thramiau a cheisio mabwysiadu dull wedi'i ganoli yn fwy. Mae hynny'n bwysig inni ei gydnabod ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Also, in terms of job losses, there have been job losses across the piece, but there have also been many successes. We have only got to look at Pinewood this week, and the success we have had with other jobs, and what we are doing in that regard. I will be absolutely honest with you that, in terms of regeneration, we have taken the lead in Government here, for example, in looking at the broadband agenda. You will always find somebody who is not happy, but then you will find people who are very happy with the support that they get. Unfortunately, without a magic wand I cannot do it all in one fell swoop, in one day, in one month or even in one year. Also, in terms of the support that we give to business, it has been quite clear that most businesses have been very happy with the level of support that they have had.

Hefyd, o ran colli swyddi, collwyd swyddi yn gyffredinol, ond cafwyd llawer o lwyddiannau hefyd. Rhaid ond edrych ar Pinewood yr wythnos hon, a'r llwyddiant a gawsom gyda swyddi eraill, a'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yn hynny o beth. Byddaf yn hollol onest â chi, o ran adfywio, rydym wedi arwain y blaen yn y Llywodraeth yma, er enghraifft, drwy edrych ar yr agenda band eang. Bydd rhywun bob amser yn anfodlon, ond bydd eraill yn fodlon iawn â'r gefnogaeth a gânt. Yn anffodus, heb ffon hud ni allaf wneud y cyfan ar unwaith, mewn diwrnod, mewn mis na hyd yn oed mewn blwyddyn. Hefyd, o ran y gefnogaeth a roddwn i fusnesau, mae wedi bod yn eithaf clir bod y rhan fwyaf o fusnesau yn fodlon iawn ar lefel y gefnogaeth a gawsant.

On the point on enterprise zones, it is quite clear that they are still developing. I have not made up my mind about any future enterprise zones. If I am absolutely convinced—. At the moment I almost feel that I have enterprise zones that are working through very difficult situations in very different scenarios. However, I am always open to ideas in terms of what more we can do.

O ran y pwynt ynghylch ardaloedd menter, mae'n eithaf amlwg eu bod yn dal i ddatblygu. Nid wyf wedi dod i benderfyniad am unrhyw ardaloedd menter yn y dyfodol. Os wyf yn hollol argyhoeddedig—. Ar hyn o bryd, teimlaf bron fod gennyf ardaloedd menter sy'n wynebu sefyllfaoedd anodd iawn mewn sefyllfaoedd gwahanol iawn. Fodd bynnag, rwyf bob amser yn agored i syniadau o ran beth arall y gallwn ei wneud.

To finish, in terms of south-east Wales, it is the gateway to Wales and the south. What happens in south-east Wales is very important, and, on the point about the M4, which I cannot be drawn too much on, it has been made clear to me by business that if we get the M4 right in south-east Wales we benefit the whole of south Wales in terms of the transport links. I think that it is very important that, when people talk about these matters, they realise the knock-on effect, because, if you get a lot of good employment in the south-east of Wales, it goes further and further west. That is very important for the economy.

I orffen, o ran y de-ddwyrain, y porth i Gymru ydyw ac i'r de. Mae'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y de-ddwyrain yn bwysig iawn, ac, o ran y pwynt ynghylch yr M4, na allaf ddweud llawer amdano, mae busnesau wedi dweud wrthyf yn bendant, os llwyddwn i ddatrys y broblem ar yr M4 yn y de-ddwyrain, y bydd ardal y de i gyd ar ei hennill o ran cysylltiadau trafniadaeth. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn, pan fydd pobl yn sôn am y materion hyn, eu bod yn sylweddoli beth yw'r effaith ganlyniadol, oherwydd, os cewch llawer o gyflogaeth dda yn y de-ddwyrain, bydd yn mynd ymhellach ac yn fwy i'r gorllewin. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn i'r economi.

So, I thank you very much for the opportunity to respond very briefly to what has been a very interesting short debate in terms of the issues that have been raised. However, I assure you that I do not require many lessons in regeneration and jobs, because I think that as a Government we have got our act together in terms of all the schemes we run, and our commitment to ensure prosperity and jobs.

Felly, diolch yn fawr iawn am y cyfle i ymateb yn fyr iawn i'r hyn a fu'n ddadl fer ddiddorol iawn o ran y materion a godwyd. Fodd bynnag, gallaf eich sicrhau nad oes angen llawer o wersi arnaf o ran adfywio a swyddi, oherwydd credaf ein bod ni fel Llywodraeth wedi llwyddo o ran yr holl gynlluniau a gynhelir gennym, a'n hymrwymiad i sicrhau ffyniant a swyddi.

18:16

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you, Minister. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Diolch ichi, Weinidog. Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 18:16.*

*The meeting ended at 18:16.*